
HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE INQUIRY

being heard before:

SIR ANTHONY HART (Chairman)

MR DAVID LANE

MS GERALDINE DOHERTY

held at
Banbridge Court House
Banbridge

on Wednesday, 9th March 2016

commencing at 10.00 am

(Day 190)

MS CHRISTINE SMITH, QC and MR JOSEPH AIKEN appeared as
Counsel to the Inquiry.

1

Wednesday, 9th March 2016

2 (10.00 am)

3

(Proceedings delayed)

4 (11.00 am)

5

WITNESS HIA124 (called)

6

CHAIRMAN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. Can I just

7

remind everyone please to ensure that if you have

8

a mobile phone, it has either been turned off or placed

9

on "Silent"/"Vibrate", and remind anyone who hasn't been

10

here before that photography is not permitted either in

11

the chamber or anywhere on the premises.

12

Yes, Mr Aiken?

13

Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

14

MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, good morning.

15

The first witness today is HIA124 (now HIA124), who is

16

"HIA124". HIA124 gave evidence to the Inquiry on Day 96

17

of its public hearings. That was 23rd February of 2015.

18

The relevant portion is from pages 29 to 78 of the

19

transcript, which can be otherwise found in the Good

20

Shepherd bundle at 23055 to 23104. On that occasion

21

HIA124 took the oath and is aware she remains under oath

22

this morning. She wanted to preserve her anonymity and

23

that remains her position today.

24

On that occasion she confirmed to the Inquiry that

25

she was born on and is now 58, and she

1 adopted the contents of her witness statement as part of
2 her evidence to the Inquiry.

3 We will just put it on the screen, HIA124, so you
4 can see it. It is at 001 is where it begins. You
5 confirmed that you had signed it on the last occasion
6 and wanted to adopt it.

7 So if we move to 006, we have the section that deals
8 with your time in the Good Shepherd just at the bottom
9 of the page and moving on to the next page.

10 Now you explained on the last occasion you were the
11 third of siblings.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And you came from a very difficult family background,
14 including sexual abuse from your , and the
15 relevance of that is clear in the Good Shepherd records
16 --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- which we have been talking about this morning. You
19 now have children of your own.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And you are supported here by your oldest daughter,
22 , this morning.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. If I can summarise the position publicly this way,
25 HIA124. You and I have had an opportunity to look at

1 a number of important documents --

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. -- that address issues that you had about certain
4 aspects of your time in care --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- as far as they related to around your period with the
7 Good Shepherd, and looking at those documents has
8 assisted you in understanding and helpfully --

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. -- helped you be aware of certain things that perhaps
11 you had not remembered over the course of the years --

12 A. Very much so this morning, yes.

13 Q. -- in between.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. I will try and summarise those for you now --

16 A. Okay.

17 Q. -- for the next short while.

18 Just bear with me for a moment so I confirm where
19 other material can be found.

20 HIA124 did make a statement to the police about her
21 treatment. That related to Nazareth House. For the
22 record that is at -- it's in the SNB bundle at 61454 to
23 61457. That didn't include any allegations against the
24 Good Shepherd.

25 The Health & Social Care Board have filed

1 a statement in this module, which is at 100 to 101, but
2 it refers back to the detailed statement lodged in
3 Module 4, which runs from 102 to 160, and it's a lot of
4 that material that HIA124 and I have been talking about
5 this morning.

6 HIA124, you brought to my attention that on the last
7 occasion there was an exchange in the chamber involving
8 the Chairman and the Health & Social Care Board about
9 discussing with you about your records.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. I confirmed with Ms Smyth that those arrangements are in
12 place and, as I said to you, I have a telephone number
13 that you will be able to get in touch if and when you
14 are ready to do that.

15 A. Thank you.

16 Q. So hopefully that's another question that arose being
17 answered.

18 In relation to HIA124's time in the Adolescent
19 Centre with the Good Shepherd between 18th June 1971,
20 when she was 13, and March 1974, when she was 16, there
21 are four statements from Sister **SR 282**, which
22 is at 287 to 290, and I was discussing with HIA124 you
23 don't remember Sister **SR 282** cooking. You remember
24 Sister **SR 197** and you remember GSC21.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Sister **SR 282** , as I explained to you, was one who was
2 there and was cooking amongst other things. Then Sister
3 **SR 295** , who again you don't remember. She was
4 there sporadically during the time of the Adolescent
5 Centre. That statement is at 566 to 569.

6 Then there are two former residents that the Panel
7 are aware of, who weren't there in your time, but who
8 speak of their time in the Adolescent Centre. They are
9 at 291 to 297 and 570 to 577.

10 Now by means of summarising this, HIA124, you had
11 been in Nazareth House and we talked about that during
12 Module 4, and you then went back, and there were various
13 issues arose again at home, including the behaviour of
14 your father towards you.

15 You were admitted to the Good Shepherd on 18th
16 June 1971 through then Social Services, which was the
17 Belfast County Welfare Authority. That was because your
18 mother had come to Social Services and made further
19 allegations about what your had done to you. That
20 being the case, the social work record that we were
21 looking at -- and I am just going to -- we were looking
22 at it this morning. I am going to show it, because it
23 talks about GSC21 and what she did.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. If we look, please, at 127, the second

1 paragraph contains your mum coming to the social worker
2 and saying what had happened, and then the social worker
3 records that you were -- after him speaking to his --
4 , and you remember coming at times
5 to the house, he directed you were to be taken into care
6 and you went to the Good Shepherd Convent.

7 Then three days later the social worker contacts the
8 Good Shepherd and:

9 "GSC21 agreed to keep HIA124 and I explained the
10 information situation. GSC21 said she would see what
11 she could get out of HIA124 and let me know. After
12 talking to her", so after GSC21 talking to you, "she
13 said that although HIA124 would not come out and accuse
14 her , nevertheless from her behaviour the Sister
15 felt that there was something in the allegations."

16 Now the discussion you and I were having this
17 morning then, I was drawing to your attention -- you
18 don't remember this involving GSC21, but it seems --
19 this is early -- this is 1971, and although she is
20 talking to you about it and you are not telling her the
21 detail about it, she takes the view from your behaviour
22 that something did happen to you at the hands of your
23 and then reports that back to Social Services.
24 So she has believed you, even though you are not
25 actually telling her.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. You were saying to me you don't have a memory of that
3 interaction at all.

4 A. No.

5 Q. I was also drawing to your attention that -- and you
6 were telling me you don't remember this either -- that
7 ten days later on 28th June the social worker arranged
8 for you to go back to a place in Nazareth Lodge, and you
9 don't remember that, but you didn't settle there. It is
10 recorded that that did not work out.

11 If we look at 128, please, down towards the bottom
12 of the page we can see:

13 "HIA124 did not settle at all in Nazareth Lodge and
14 Sister **SR 184** asked that she should be removed before
15 she disrupted the entire group."

16 That's what's recorded. You have no memory of that,
17 HIA124.

18 A. No.

19 Q. If we look at 135, we can see it is being recorded at
20 the top of the page that:

21 "I went to Nazareth to talk to HIA124, who would
22 like to return to the Good Shepherd. She had already --
23 she seemed already attached to GSC21."

24 CHAIRMAN: "... seems to have already become attached to
25 GSC21."

1 MR AIKEN: Yes. I am grateful for that, Chairman.

2 So what's being recorded -- and you don't have
3 a memory of this at this remove, HIA124 -- but they had
4 taken you back to Nazareth. It is not clear why. It
5 may have been because that's the place you had been
6 generally before, albeit it was Nazareth House, but you
7 wanted to stay at The Good Shepherd because of the
8 attachment you had already formed with GSC21.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And the records that are available from Social Services
11 show that the social workers were seeing you regularly
12 during your period in the Good Shepherd and generally
13 speaking you are described as being content there and
14 especially once arrangements are put in place for you to
15 be in contact with your family, and you would have gone
16 to your granny's on Sunday and it is recorded then
17 stayed with her at various holidays, and it is there
18 that you would have seen the other members of your
19 family, because you weren't allowed to be around your

20

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. You express the view in your statement that your mum
23 didn't come perhaps as often as you would have liked to
24 your granny's, but you were saying to me that you --
25 your recollection was that the Good Shepherd did foster

1 contact between families. You could remember other
2 families --

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. -- coming up to the Good Shepherd --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- to see other --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- teenagers who were in the Adolescent Unit, which was
9 about ten girls perhaps --

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. -- or slightly more at times, but in your case you went
12 out -- the arrangement was you went out to your granny's
13 --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- and that was something you did regularly.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. There's a record, for instance, of 4th October 1972,
18 which is one of the three-monthly reviews -- I will just
19 give the Panel the reference: it is at 140 -- that
20 records you as being:

21 "... happy at the convent and seems to appreciate
22 the kindness of the nuns. Weekly visits to the
23 grandmother."

24 I was saying to you you were there for a three-year
25 period and you don't have any bad memories --

1 A. No.

2 Q. -- of your treatment at the hands of the nuns --

3 A. No.

4 Q. -- who were in the Good Shepherd.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. So it's a very different memory you have to that for
7 Nazareth, which you talked about during Module 4.

8 A. Miles apart.

9 Q. One of the -- you talk in paragraph 19 of your statement
10 at 006, if we could look at it, please, about you have
11 a memory of GSC21 saying to you in some context that you
12 had been bold. You remember her using those words to
13 you.

14 A. I had asked her why -- I had asked her why I was in the
15 Good Shepherd. I was starting to learn sexual education
16 in school and starting to filter through things and
17 I think somebody said, "That's why you are in a home" or
18 something like that in school. So I asked GSC21 and she
19 told me it was because I was bold, but I took that to be
20 that I was bold to let my do the things.

21 Q. Yes, and I was explaining to you --

22 A. She didn't say that. I took that from her saying to me
23 that I was bold.

24 Q. Yes. That's your memory of the exchange and the context
25 of it.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. I was discussing with you earlier that obviously various
3 people can comment based on their knowledge of GSC21.
4 So Sister **SR 295** has said to the Inquiry she does not
5 think that's the type of language that GSC21 would use.
6 I was drawing to your attention the record seems to
7 record her expressing the view that you had been
8 mistreated by your that you had been abused by
9 him, and therefore to call you bold for that wouldn't
10 necessarily sit well, but that was your recollection of
11 how that conversation had gone.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. But you never had any -- you know, you were never hit by
14 GSC21.

15 A. No.

16 Q. You were never anything other than treated well while
17 you were there.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. One of the issues that you in your statement felt hadn't
20 been dealt with well was the issue of bedwetting. You
21 talk about that in paragraph 21, but we were discussing
22 this this morning and you have come to a different
23 position about that based on the discussion we were
24 having --

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. -- because Social Services record, if we look, please,
2 at 147 -- and this is a record that's from January 1973,
3 so it's about two years into your stay in the Good
4 Shepherd -- and if we just scroll down, please, the
5 social worker is recording that you had gone off -- it
6 seems you had run off with a few others for a few days
7 and as far as you were concerned there was no particular
8 reason for the escapade and you very quickly settled
9 down again on your return. You go off to your
10 grandmother on a Sunday and for longer periods at
11 holiday times, and on these occasions you were able to
12 meet your mum and your siblings. You like school and
13 continue to do well there.

14 "However, HIA124 still has many emotional
15 difficulties to contend with and is disheartened by her
16 occasional enuresis."

17 So the discussion we were having is that this record
18 seems to suggest the social worker has become aware of
19 that, however that has come about, and it seems to be
20 an officer by the name of

21 Then if we look at 159, please, which is the next
22 three-monthly review report from April 1973, if we
23 scroll down, please, we can see you have received
24 an excellent school report. Your academic work and
25 general school behaviour were highly praised by

1 teachers.

2 "Continues to have regular contact with most of her
3 family members. Generally content with her lot, but her
4 continuing enuresis, for which she is attending Belfast
5 City Hospital for treatment, does depress her at times."

6 You were saying to me you have no memory of getting
7 the treatment at Belfast City Hospital.

8 A. No.

9 Q. The discussion we were having, the danger I was
10 explaining of reading too much into how something is
11 written, but the implication of the document is that the
12 social worker is finding this out.

13 A. Uh-huh.

14 Q. There is nothing in the record that I have seen that
15 suggests the social worker organised it. So it may be
16 it was organised by the Good Shepherd, but there's no
17 documents either way that let me be sure about that to
18 bring that evidence before the Panel.

19 A. Uh-huh.

20 Q. But whatever the right way of it, it seems that during
21 your time in the Good Shepherd you are getting some
22 medical help for this issue.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. On reflection you were wondering this morning then
25 whether, because it was such a bad issue for you in

1 Nazareth House, you've perceived it, conflated it across
2 to the Good Shepherd as well, where, in fact, perhaps it
3 was dealt with better in the Good Shepherd than you
4 remember.

5 A. Yes. Definitely. Well, if they were -- obviously if
6 I was going to hospital, then somebody had tried to help
7 me with that, because it was an extremely big issue for
8 me, you know, and as you say, it was dealt with so badly
9 in Nazareth House that, you know, thinking about it now
10 as an older woman, it just -- telling me to do the
11 normal things, but I seen that as singling me out, you
12 know, because it was such a big issue for me --

13 Q. Yes.

14 A. -- you know, when in actual fact I see that somebody was
15 trying to help me, and probably GSC21.

16 Q. I think you were surprised from the records, and I think
17 your daughter was helping you think this through, the
18 amount of help that perhaps was going on in the
19 background that you wouldn't necessarily have been aware
20 of.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. I am right in saying that what you talk about in your
23 statement about the coming down late for breakfast, your
24 perception was that, "Oh, they must have known I wet the
25 bed", but when we were talking about it, you were

1 explaining to me that nobody ever said to you, "Oh, you
2 wet the bed" --

3 A. No.

4 Q. -- or seemed to be aware of you wetting the bed.

5 A. No.

6 Q. That was just how you assumed they would know.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Sister **SR 295** said to the Inquiry that her knowledge
9 of GSC21 was such that she believed the issue would have
10 been dealt with discreetly and with great sympathy.
11 I was saying to you there was no occasion in the three
12 years you were there that you could remember anyone
13 teasing you about having wet the bed.

14 A. No.

15 Q. So it may be it was dealt with more sympathetically that
16 you remembered at the time of your statement. Is that
17 a fair way of summarising it?

18 A. Yes, and the fact that somebody had got me to see
19 a specialist, obviously somebody had seen it as
20 a problem for me as well, you know, which -- I don't
21 remember going to the specialist, but obviously somebody
22 did --

23 Q. Yes.

24 A. -- you know.

25 Q. The other issue that you talk about in your statement,

1 paragraph 22, 007, is your admission to Purdysburn, if
2 we just scroll down to 22 and 23. Your concern about
3 that at the time based on your recollection as it then
4 was was that this had something to do with GSC21 not
5 liking you and you being essentially put out to
6 Purdysburn.

7 You and I have had the opportunity to look at the
8 record this morning and see that that's not what
9 occurred.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. You could remember and you were describing to me having
12 taken an overdose of tablets at your brother's --

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. -- but you couldn't remember that happening in the Good
15 Shepherd.

16 A. No.

17 Q. And I was discussing -- if we look at 149, please, you
18 and I were able to talk through what the record as far
19 as the Social Services' records record having happened.
20 It seems that Sister **SR 297** has got in touch with Social
21 Services because there were a number of issues that you
22 were upset about and depressed about, which included,
23 for instance, you weren't going to get to your brother's
24 wedding because your father was going to be there, and
25 you weren't happy in your job at that point in time, as

1 it is described here. There had been an altercation
2 over wanting to get your file. The congregation will
3 probably point to this record and say, "Well, that means
4 there at least was a file, albeit it is not available at
5 this remove". It says:

6 "Someone, possibly one of the other girls, has
7 probably said something to HIA124 about her file.
8 Sister **SR 297** tried to put her off, saying it only
9 contained her date of birth and other minor details.
10 This didn't satisfy her. Later she broke into
11 a cupboard containing a number of different types of
12 pills."

13 If we scroll down, please. You took those pills,
14 and then they were very concerned about you and called
15 the doctor and you were admitted to Purdysburn.

16 Now you had no recollection of any of that.

17 A. No.

18 Q. That has helped you see how you left Good Shepherd in
19 a different light.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. We were discussing that the records show, if we look at
22 153, please, you were in the Graham Clinic in Purdysburn
23 for about three weeks. The records indicate that on 5th
24 April you are released from Purdysburn and you go back
25 to the Good Shepherd. I am not going to bring up --

1 there is also a report from one of the doctors and I am
2 not going to bring that up, but the Panel will be aware
3 of it -- I am just going to give the reference -- at
4 15014. It explains that when you went back on 5th,
5 there were a number of things that occurred in the next
6 24 hours. You weren't communicating with the staff in
7 The Good Shepherd. You weren't eating. There was
8 another issue involving I think other residents, and the
9 concern of taking another overdose, and the result of
10 that was you were readmitted on 6th. You didn't have
11 a memory of that sequence of events.

12 A. No.

13 Q. The discussions we were having, if I summarise it
14 correctly, is you could understand how they hadn't just
15 put you out and not taken you back. In fact, they had
16 taken you back on one occasion, but, as your daughter
17 was pointing out, they weren't a psychiatric unit --

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. -- and weren't -- they were nuns. Therefore they
20 couldn't take you back a third time.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. That has helped you come to terms much better with that
23 particular point in your life --

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. -- to do with what would have been a very difficult

1 experience that you don't have a clear memory of.

2 A. Uh-huh.

3 Q. You were then ultimately released a third time and you
4 go to your brother, and you could remember taking the
5 overdose there, and then Social Services from their
6 records applied to take you to Middletown --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- to the St. Louis Order.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You were saying you had great memory of your time in the
11 training school.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. If I summarise it all to this, HIA124: the issues that
14 you felt you had with the Good Shepherd have been
15 answered by much of the material, and I think you
16 pointed out to me this morning that you wanted to come
17 and say the bad things when the bad things had happened,
18 but you also wanted then to say the good things --

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. -- whenever you had had time to look at this material.

21 A. Yes. Well, it is like everybody is ready to come and
22 tell of their bad times, but, in seeing my files,
23 I realised that GSC21 had put a lot into me and, I mean,
24 I had no big general complaints. It was just that part
25 about Purdysburn. Why had they put me in there? And

1 the bedwetting too, to me that was a big -- you know,
2 I just -- but in seeing my files, I realised that
3 that's -- you know, it's cleared up a lot for me this
4 morning, do you know, as regards -- I had no big issues
5 with the Good Shepherd, but Purdysburn Hospital was
6 quite big for me and the wetting of the bed. That
7 was -- but I am happy enough to say that obviously the
8 Good Shepherd had cared about me, do you know. So I'm
9 here to say that, yes, as much as there's bad, there's
10 good as well, and the Good Shepherd were the good as
11 well as St. Louis, you know. So I would just like to
12 say that.

13 Q. You wanted to put that on the record.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Well, HIA124, when we -- when I took you through your
16 evidence the last time we talked about the
17 recommendations on that occasion. I am not going to ask
18 you about that now.

19 I ask the last question to every witness, as you
20 know, about whether there is anything else -- we are
21 looking at the Good Shepherd -- whether there is
22 anything else about your time there that either maybe
23 I have not covered accurately, or in sufficient detail,
24 or otherwise haven't drawn out to the Panel's attention.
25 Now is your time to mention that if you want to say

1 anything more than I have already covered with you.

2 A. No. I'm -- it's cleared up a lot of things for me this
3 morning in seeing my records, you know, and I'm -- it's
4 filled a lot of gaps in my life that I didn't -- you
5 know, either couldn't remember or couldn't see the way
6 it was, do you know, but the records have set that
7 straight for me, and I'm happy to come here and say
8 that, and thank you.

9 Q. HIA124, I am not going to ask you any more questions.
10 If you bear with us for a moment, the Panel Members may
11 want to ask you something.

12 A. Okay.

13 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA124, you will be glad to hear that we
14 don't, in fact, have any questions for you.

15 A. Thank you.

16 Q. As I understand what you have been saying, if I can boil
17 it all down, you were in three separate places and the
18 last two were the Good Shepherd and then St. Joseph's.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. As far as the last two are concerned, you don't have any
21 complaints about them.

22 A. No.

23 Q. You now understand from having seen the records that the
24 Good Shepherd did a lot to help you.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Thank you very much for coming.

2 A. Thank you.

3 Q. I'm sorry we had to bring you back again --

4 A. That's okay. No.

5 Q. -- but, as we try and explain, it is difficult for us to

6 cope with the detail of different places all mixed in

7 together, which is why we have asked you to come back --

8 A. That's okay.

9 Q. -- but thank you for coming back again.

10 A. Thank you. Thank you.

11 (Witness withdrew)

12 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, I am dealing with

13 the next witness, who I understand is here, but perhaps

14 if we could start as and when I am able to do that.

15 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We will rise now and resume in due course

16 hopefully later this morning.

17 (11.30 am)

18 (Lunch break)

19 (1.45 pm)

20 WITNESS HIA175 (called)

21 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

22 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Aiken?

23 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, good afternoon.

24 The next witness today is HIA175, who is "HIA175".

25 HIA175 gave evidence to the Inquiry on Day 100 of our

1 public hearings, which was on 10th March 2015, and her
2 evidence runs from pages 105 to 136 of the transcript,
3 where it can be found in the Good Shepherd bundle at
4 23105 to 23136.

5 On the last occasion HIA175 took the oath and she is
6 aware she remains under oath today.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. She wanted to keep her anonymity and that remains her
9 position. On the last occasion she adopted her witness
10 statement, and you confirmed, HIA175, for the Inquiry
11 Panel that you wanted to adopt the contents as part of
12 your evidence to the Inquiry, and that remains the case
13 today.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You were born on

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. You received from me a very fulsome apology earlier when
18 I said that made you 60 years of age and you pointed out
19 that you had a few months left.

20 A. I did.

21 Q. So you are a mere slip of 59.

22 A. 59.

23 Q. You explained on the last occasion that you have or were
24 part of siblings, although there are only four of
25 you still alive, and you have children of your own.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And grandchildren.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And that has not changed --

5 A. No.

6 Q. -- from we met last. From our discussion, HIA175, we
7 were talking about your time in what -- you describe it
8 by a different name, but Roseville Hostel --

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. -- appears to be the name of it. If we just can pop
11 page 018 on the screen, please, and leave that there.
12 Your time in the Roseville Hostel appears to have been
13 between 30th November 1971, when you were 15, until
14 potentially 20th April, although for reasons I was
15 discussing with you it looks like it may have been as
16 early as February 1972, when one parses the detail of
17 the social work records that we were talking about.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Then there was a suggestion that you might have been
20 back a second time between May and August 1972, but, in
21 fact, from the records and our discussion about it it
22 looks like it was only one day between 5th and 6th April
23 of 1972, and we will talk a little bit about that. In
24 fact, I may be wrong about the last part. It maybe does
25 go as far as August. So it may be May to August 1972

1 for the last part.

2 But the Roseville Hostel was, as the Inquiry has
3 become aware, something that opened in 1967 and was open
4 until 1975. The congregation have said to the Inquiry
5 that it was part of an aftercare transition unit for
6 older adolescent teenagers, some of whom had come
7 through Good Shepherd and some of whom might have come
8 in to have bed and board there as part of maybe working.
9 The discussion that you and I were having is that's the
10 background from which you came --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- in the sense that you had been to Nazareth, had lived
13 there, and you have explained to the Panel your
14 experiences there. You were making it clear to me
15 earlier that the Good Shepherd Convent and the Roseville
16 Hostel was nothing like your time in Nazareth --

17 A. No.

18 Q. -- and -- in that it was much better.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And the Roseville Hostel, I was saying to you the
21 congregation have explained to the Panel it was
22 an accommodation for about eight individuals in that
23 there were two rooms for nuns to sleep in and then there
24 were two dormitories that had four beds in each.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. You could remember having a bed and a curtain that would
2 have --

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. -- been round to segregate your particular area --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- to live in. The congregation have said the residents
7 paid for their bed and board. You don't necessarily
8 remember having income --

9 A. No.

10 Q. -- but you can see from the records --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- that we were speaking about that it appears you may
13 have --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- had employment that went on for a little longer than
16 you recollected.

17 Sister Eithne, on behalf of the congregation, has
18 explained that SR196 was the nun who was in charge of
19 the Roseville Hostel during its existence, and she was
20 also a qualified nun in childcare. She carried on that
21 task between 1969 and 1975, and it is her that you
22 remember --

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. -- being in charge during your time.

25 In addition to the witness statement which is on the

1 screen and is available and has been considered by the
2 Panel, you made police statements that we looked at in
3 the previous module, which just related to the Nazareth
4 complex.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. You were not making any complaint about the Good
7 Shepherd.

8 A. No.

9 Q. Those records are now available at 21033 to 21035 --
10 that's the one from May '95 -- and then from June 2011
11 from 21036 to 21037.

12 Also, as we talked about on the last occasion,
13 HIA175, Dr Best's psychiatric report as part of your
14 civil claim is available. That can now be found in the
15 Good Shepherd bundle at 3293 to 3307. There is just
16 one -- most of that report is all about your time in
17 Nazareth.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. There is just one paragraph that relates to SR196 and
20 the application of the ointment or substance --

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. -- whatever it was. That's on page 3305. We will come
23 back to that shortly.

24 The Health & Social Care Board statements can be
25 found at 162 to 167, with exhibits from 168 to 232. It

1 is those social work papers, HIA175, that you and I were
2 spending a considerable amount of time with earlier.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. You were concerned that because your recollection does
5 not match the content of the records, that you were
6 wasting people's time and so on.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. I have assured you that's not the case. The records say
9 what they say and over time people's recollections can
10 alter or change or be different.

11 The second Health & Social Care Board statement can
12 be found at 161.

13 In terms of Good Shepherd response statements, SR196
14 has passed away, and that was explained by Sister Eithne
15 in her statements of 4th February, 298 to 300 and also
16 from 556 to 559. Sister Eithne, on behalf of the
17 congregation, has provided a statement about SR196.
18 That can be found at 966 to 968.

19 HIA175, you had been in the care of Down County
20 Welfare, placed in Nazareth House, been out on foster
21 placement in and then came out of Nazareth to
22 work in St. Joseph's, and you lived in St. Joseph's
23 Babies' Home and were described in the social work
24 papers as a nursery assistant during that period.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Then we looked at the records, and I am not going to
2 spend a lot of time bringing those up. The Panel have
3 had the opportunity to consider the detail of them and
4 those who need to see them have access to them. You
5 could see from those records in discussion with me that
6 your recollection in your statement as to the sequence
7 of events didn't necessarily match --

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. -- what's in the records in that you thought you were
10 put out of St. Joseph's --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- and then lived in The Good Shepherd and worked in the
13 laundry.

14 A. Yes, yes.

15 Q. We could see from the records that you had absconded
16 from St. Joseph's. The result of that was they couldn't
17 control you to let you live there any longer. The
18 Social Services place you in Roseville Hostel --

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. -- in the care of the Good Shepherd, but you continue to
21 work in St. Joseph's Babies' Home up until essentially
22 Christmas of 1971.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. So that first month where you are with The Good Shepherd
25 you are actually out working at St. Joseph's, part of

1 the Nazareth complex.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. I described them earlier with you. There were various
4 blips along the way. So you get into a bit of
5 difficulty --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. -- over some chairs as it turned out --

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. -- and brought before the court, and then things would
10 settle down. You would be settled in the hostel
11 working, and then there would be another blip, and
12 ultimately essentially in the Social Services' material
13 it records you having left your job in St. Joseph's,
14 deemed to be on Christmas Eve, as it were, 1971.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Then we've got a period where you are supposed to come
17 to the hostel in the Good Shepherd but stay at home, and
18 ultimately throughout all of the story -- and you have
19 explained to me, and I know it causes difficulties, and
20 I am going to summarise it for you -- you wanted to be
21 back living with your mum, and as difficult as those
22 home circumstances were and the reasons -- just take
23 your time and I will help you through it, HIA175 -- as
24 difficult as those circumstances were, that's what you
25 wanted, and even though others thought that wasn't in

1 your best interests, she was still your mum and that is
2 what you preferred. That would cause you to be back to
3 her, and that would cause friction then with Social
4 Services and the hostel, because you are supposed to be
5 there and you are not there.

6 The Social Services' record records that you appear
7 to have worked in the Good Shepherd laundry potentially
8 for a three-week period in January/February 1972 and
9 then you don't come back from one of your home visits
10 out of the hostel.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. The result of that is -- if we look at 219, please, I am
13 just going to show the Panel, so that what I am saying
14 makes sense. In the top section we will see a reference
15 to 22nd February '72. So we have had about potentially
16 after the return from your mum on extended home leave,
17 if I can call it that, or home without leave, you
18 refused to go back to Roseville and you said you were
19 not going back to slave in the laundry as you had been
20 doing.

21 "This was the first indication", according to the
22 social worker, "that she felt like this about her work
23 there. Nor would she consider going back and working
24 outside. I explained it was impossible for her to
25 remain at home, but if she wouldn't return, we'd have to

1 take action."

2 So that was the threat of training school, and you
3 are said at the time -- things began to unravel a little
4 bit with rebellion, as it's described through the
5 documents, if I summarise it as that. You ignored this
6 threat from the social worker and said to the social
7 worker they could do what they liked, as you saw it at
8 the time.

9 Now then why I say that your spell in The Good
10 Shepherd seems to come to an end in February is when one
11 looks at the next portion that you and I were
12 discussing, it looks like the Social Services explored
13 a new concept where they were advertising for lodgings
14 for adolescent girls in their care to go and live as
15 part of -- so they rent the accommodation. You live
16 there. You go on to work, and it seems from the last
17 line of the next paragraph:

18 "While that was being considered on this basis
19 her temporary stay at home was tolerated."

20 Then on 11th April there's an examination of the
21 potential lodgings and not satisfactory as far as you
22 are concerned, and you agree to go back to the Roseville
23 Hostel. Then that doesn't happen, and ultimately there
24 is a decision taken to remove you to the training
25 school. That application is brought and you go to

1 Middletown.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. There are detailed documents, which I am not going to
4 open now, but you and I have talked through them, and
5 the Panel have access to them, and they show how the
6 social worker records the history of events during your
7 time in The Good Shepherd. It is not necessarily how
8 you remember it being.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. The central issue that you remembered, HIA175, was the
11 application of this stingy stuff on your body by SR196.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. You talk about that in paragraph 26 of your statement,
14 if we look at 019. You remember this procedure
15 happening a number of times, and in the psychiatric
16 report we were talking about it refers to it being done
17 in the laundry, but you are clear it was not the laundry
18 --

19 A. No.

20 Q. -- whatever that report says. It was in the dormitory.

21 A. It was in the dormitory.

22 Q. You were also clear in speaking to me that you were not
23 for a moment suggesting there was anything sexual --

24 A. No.

25 Q. -- to this --

1 A. No.

2 Q. -- or indeed, you know, it wasn't to physically punish
3 you either, but you just in your mind couldn't
4 understand why this was --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- being done at this remove. I was explaining to you
7 that there is a Social Services' report, if we look at
8 223, and what that suggests is that there was a medical
9 condition. You and I were talking about this earlier.
10 It is at the bottom of the page that we can see. You
11 were given medication. You had had this recent attack
12 of as it is described:

13 "... for which she had attended the doctor."

14 What the congregation have said to the Inquiry is if
15 anyone needed medical treatment, then they went out to
16 The Ormeau Health Centre. That's where they saw -- you
17 don't have any memory of that --

18 A. I don't, no.

19 Q. -- and you don't have any memory of the medical
20 condition either that's recorded.

21 A. No.

22 Q. I was discussing with you, doing the best I could, based
23 on the documents, if there was nothing sexual or
24 physical --

25 A. No.

1 Q. -- about what SR196 was doing --

2 A. No.

3 Q. -- but it was happening, might it have been in
4 connection with helping you put on whatever the
5 treatment was for the condition?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You don't remember it at all.

8 A. No.

9 Q. All you remember is that you have a bad memory of the
10 manner in which it was applied.

11 A. It was just the manner, yes.

12 Q. But you had no other complaint about SR196 --

13 A. No, no.

14 Q. -- during your time there.

15 A. No.

16 Q. Certainly what the congregation have said is they don't
17 think anyone would have been giving you medical
18 treatment, because the local doctor did that, and
19 certainly this seems to be the local doctor, but if she
20 did it, it might have been in connection with this, but
21 you just have no memory.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. There are a couple of points that arise out -- in your
24 statement you talk about not seeing your brother. He
25 was in Nazareth Lodge, but it is right that you went

1 home regularly --

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. -- to -- according to the Social Services' records. So
4 you were certainly facilitated in going out to visit
5 your family.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Is that -- that's fair?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. You mention in paragraph 29 of your statement, if we go
10 back to 019 -- in fact, if we just leave that where it
11 is -- in 019 you talk about not seeing a social worker
12 while you were in Roseville Hostel with The Good
13 Shepherd. I was explaining to you -- in fact, we used
14 this record when we were talking about it --

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. -- because it records and I think there is some 37-odd
17 visits in the six months, but you just don't remember
18 that --

19 A. I don't remember.

20 Q. -- at this remove.

21 You talk in paragraph 28 of your statement, if we go
22 back to 019, about you have this memory of coming in --
23 other girls came in as well. It was a small unit of
24 girls --

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. -- older girls who were living here -- coming in and
2 being spoken to by a priest.

3 A. Yes. I can't remember his name.

4 Q. There's reference to SR196 being in the room, but you
5 were saying to me that it was a priest --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. -- that you had the conversation with. It wasn't with
8 SR196.

9 A. It wasn't SR196, no.

10 Q. You don't really remember the context of it.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Because what the congregation have said, I was
13 explaining to you earlier, one of their various rules
14 was not to pry into someone's personal circumstances.
15 Rightly or wrongly, that was said to be their approach,
16 and therefore asking you about your sexual history
17 wouldn't have been on their radar, if I can put it like
18 that, but it was more a conversation with a priest that
19 you remember --

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. -- rather than with SR196. Is that fair?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Hopefully -- have I summarised most of the --

24 A. Yes, you have.

25 Q. -- issues? You were very concerned that you would

1 appear as a troublemaker --

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. -- from the records. Hopefully we have done it in a way
4 that makes it clear that is -- nobody is describing you
5 in that way. Does that help?

6 A. It does, yes.

7 Q. There's one issue that you wanted to cover, HIA175,
8 which is that you were sent on foot of a Training School
9 Order to St. Joseph's --

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. -- in Middletown.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And you have really positive memories about two
14 particular members of staff who were there.

15 A. Yes, I do, yes.

16 Q. Can you tell the Panel who they were and why you
17 remember them in that way?

18 A. SR240 and SJM4. I was -- when I had gone to Middletown,
19 it was like a big house with dormitories and that, and
20 then we were -- they were getting houses built at that
21 time and I was shifted over to House 1, and it was --

22 Q. Which was SJM4's house.

23 A. -- SJM4 and SR240, and for the first time in my life
24 I feel as if people had treated me like I was a person,
25 like I mattered, you know, that I was somebody. They

1 just made you feel at home. It wasn't like a home. It
2 was like being in your own home, just sitting round and
3 you watched TV, and they were involved in it, SR240 and
4 SJM4.

5 SR240 was the type where, if she had to go
6 somewhere, to Armagh or wherever she was going, you
7 know, she would have just come in -- not just me, other
8 girls -- would have come in and just said, "Right,
9 HIA175. I'm going to such and such. Do you want to
10 come with me?" So you went like just -- you know, you
11 were just asked, "Do you want to go for a spin in the
12 car?" So you went like wherever, you know, and it just
13 -- it felt really, you know, as if you were important.

14 Q. You wanted the opportunity just to put that on the
15 record.

16 A. I did, yes, because that was -- I really -- I actually
17 cried when I was leaving Middletown, you know.

18 Q. If I can -- you have explained to me I think on the last
19 occasion and this occasion, HIA175, that you don't have
20 a good memory.

21 A. No, I don't. No, I --

22 Q. You say that about yourself.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. If I summarise it this way: you were in three main
25 places. Nazareth House you described to the Inquiry was

1 terrible.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Good Shepherd was much better.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. But --

6 A. Middletown was --

7 Q. -- Middletown was best of all.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. I am not going to ask you any more questions, HIA175.

10 If you bear with us for a short while, the Panel Members
11 may want to ask you something. So just bear with us, if
12 you will.

13 A. Okay.

14 Questions from THE PANEL

15 CHAIRMAN: HIA175, can I just ask you one question about
16 something you have been describing to us and that's the
17 occasion when all the girls went into the room when the
18 priest asked them about their sexual approach.

19 Now was it that you were all lined up and then went
20 in one by one?

21 A. One by one, yes.

22 Q. So it wasn't that you were asked --

23 A. No.

24 Q. -- to say what the position was in front of the others?

25 A. No, no, no.

1 Q. Might it have been that he was giving you a lecture
2 about the importance of remaining chaste and not
3 engaging in sex outside marriage or can you remember at
4 all?

5 A. Well, there was no -- it was that question, "Are you --
6 are you still a virgin?" and there was nothing else that
7 came with it, after it or ...

8 Q. So it wasn't that he led up to it in some way or other
9 --

10 A. No.

11 Q. -- by asking other things --

12 A. No.

13 Q. -- or saying how important it was from the church's
14 point of view?

15 A. It was just -- no, it was just that and it just seemed
16 like -- I don't know what the reason for the question
17 was.

18 Q. I see. Thank you very much.

19 MS DOHERTY: I don't have any questions.

20 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA175, thank you very much for coming back
21 to speak to us again. We unfortunately have to ask
22 people to come more than once, because it's very
23 difficult for us to separate the details of what people
24 say, but it's been very helpful to us today what you
25 have been able to say, not just about the Good Shepherd

1 Sisters, but also what you remind us was in your
2 statement about the Sisters of St. Louis at Middletown,
3 and we pay particular attention to that as well. Thank
4 you very much for coming.

5 A. Thank you.

6 Q. If you want to just stay where you are for a moment,
7 because I can see you have a crutch, we will be going
8 out in just one moment.

9 A. Okay.

10 CHAIRMAN: That's the last witness for today, Mr Aiken?

11 MR AIKEN: It is.

12 CHAIRMAN: Very well. Usual time tomorrow.

13 (2.05 pm)

14 (Inquiry adjourned until 10 o'clock tomorrow morning)

15 --ooOoo--

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I N D E X

1

2

3 WITNESS HIA124 (called)2
Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY2

4 WITNESS HIA175 (called)23
Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY23

5 Questions from THE PANEL41

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25