

THE INQUIRY INTO HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE 1922 TO 1995

MODULE 12

**CLOSING WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS FOR
THE HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE BOARD**

April 2016

Moira Smyth QC

Louise Murphy

Bar Library

Caroline Hannan

Directorate of Legal Services

Business Services Organisation

CONTENTS

1	Introduction	3
2	Background	5
3	The Applicants	7
4	Welfare Placements in the Good Shepherd Convent, St Mary's Homes	11
5	Relevant Evidence from Module 4	21

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The Inquiry is tasked to investigate historical institutional abuse and examine if there were systemic failings by institutions or the State in their duties towards those children in their care between the years of 1992 - 1995.
- 1.2 In Module 12, the Inquiry has heard evidence in respect to Homes run by the Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd (the “Good Shepherd Sisters”)
- a. Sacred Heart Home Derry that closed in 1952.
 - b. St Mary’s Derry that ceased admitting teenagers in 1980/81 and closed in 1994.
 - c. Sacred Heart Home Belfast that closed in 1962.
 - d. St Mary’s Belfast that ceased admitting teenagers in the early 1970s and operated only for adults thereafter.
 - e. The Roseville Hostel that opened in 1967 for teenagers and older girls as a support service for those transitioning out of care into independent living and closed in 1975.
 - f. The Adolescent Centre, Belfast closed in 1982.
 - g. St Mary’s, Newry that ceased admitting teenagers in the mid/late 1970’s and was re- registered as a Home for Persons in Need catering for adults only in or around 1979.
- 1.3 The Health and Social Care Board (HSCB) has confined its written submissions to the following:
- 1. Background;
 - 2. The Applicants;

3. Welfare Placements in the Good Shepherd Convent, St Mary's Homes; and
4. Relevant Evidence from Module 4

1.4 In extracting these issues the HSCB has sought to identify those matters in Module 12 that touch upon their responsibilities and that will further develop themes seen and addressed in earlier Modules.

1.5 If the Inquiry has any further issues outstanding for the HSCB as a result of evidence heard in this Module, the HSCB will respond accordingly.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1. The Homes of Good Shepherd Sisters were a significant part of the wider community of Voluntary Homes in Northern Ireland. The policy of the Good Shepherd was to refuse nobody:

“Our object is to attract penitents; to take, if possible, all who present themselves; to refuse none, however poor they may be”¹

- 2.2. In a Child Welfare Council Questionnaire answered in or around 1964, the Good Shepherd Homes described their role and place in the Voluntary Child Care Services in Northern Ireland in the following terms:

2.2.1 Belfast:

“In the sphere of moral re-education of girls in which we specialize, we are convinced that a religious motivation and a sense of personal vocation is indispensable. Our sisters receive a specialised training, spiritual, intellectual and technical, for the work. In performing it, we benefit from the inherited experience of our Order, which has been engaged in this form of social work for over a century. The international structure of the Order enables us to profit by the experience of our Sisters engaged in the same work in all the European countries and in the Americas; and keeps us in contact with new ideas, methods and techniques, in the fields of our special work.”²

2.2.2 Newry:

“The end of the Good Shepherd Home is to re-build in Christ the personalities of unsettled young girls, to repair the damage of immoral or morally dangerous experience, to restore their dignity and self-respect, to give them moral instructions, to teach them a love of prayer, work, regularity, to prepare them for home-making and to try to remove from their lives and homes the

¹ GSC 443

² GSC 5868

conditions that produce delinquency.”³

2.2.3 Derry:

“Homes animated by religious motives and staffed by Sister with a sense of personal vocation have an irreplaceable role in child care services, particularly in the case of children who have fallen under immoral influences, or who require moral and spiritual re-education, as so many teenage problem children now do. Our Order is exclusively devoted to the work and is specialized in it, having been engaged in it for over half a century. The sisters receive spiritual and intellectual training for the work and can draw on a rich tradition of experience in dealing with it. Also the international structure of the Order enables us to profit from the experience and experiments of our Sisters in other counties in the domain.”⁴

- 2.3. It seems, therefore, that the Good Shepherd Convents offered specialist services for teenage girls who had suffered or were at risk of suffering harm by reason of “immoral” experiences or influence.

³ Ibid.

⁴ GSC 5869

3. THE APPLICANTS

- 3.1. There were ten Applicants in Module 12.
- 3.2. As the Inquiry will know, some of the Applicants gave evidence about their experience in more than one of the Good Shepherd Homes. Five of the Applicants gave evidence about their placement in the Good Shepherd Homes in Belfast; five spoke to the Inquiry about living in Good Shepherd Home in Derry and three spoke about living in the Good Shepherd Home in Newry.
- 3.3. Of the ten Applicants, it seems that four of them were placed in the Good Shepherd convents by welfare authorities, as follows:
- 3.3.1. HIA 377 was placed in ██████████ Children's Home and an entry from a log kept in that home records her transfer on 7th April ██████████ to the Good Shepherd Convent⁵ where she remained until 3rd April ██████████. The records demonstrate the involvement of the ██████████ office of County ██████████ Welfare Committee and, in her witness statement, HIA 377 recalled a Social Worker called ██████████. The same name was recorded by the Good Shepherd Sisters in their records.
- 3.3.2. HIA 124 was placed in the Good Shepherd Home by Belfast Welfare Authority in Belfast between 15 June ██████████ and 14 March ██████████. HIA 175 was aged ██████████ years at the date of placement. On 28 June ██████████, the welfare authority social worker made arrangements for HIA 124 to move to Nazareth Lodge. However, this did not work out as HIA 124 was attached to GSC 21 ██████████ in the Good Shepherd Convent and she moved back there on ██████████.

⁵ GSC1239: Exhibit 1, HSCB Supplemental Response Statement for HIA 377 dated 13th April 2016

3.3.3. **HIA 175** moved from Nazareth House Belfast to St Joseph's Babies Home on [REDACTED] when she was [REDACTED] years old. HIA 175 remained there until she moved to the Good Shepherd Convent Belfast on [REDACTED], still aged [REDACTED] years, and she continued to work in St Joseph's Babies Home until [REDACTED]. After spending some time at home and then St Joseph's in Middletown, HIA 175 moved back to the Good Shepherd Convent (Roseville) in Belfast in [REDACTED], just after her [REDACTED] birthday where she remained until [REDACTED], when she was moved, under a Place of Safety Order, to the Good Shepherd Convent in Newry. On [REDACTED], a Training School Order was made in respect of HIA 175 and she moved to St Joseph's, Middletown.

3.3.4. **HIA 7** had two separate placements in the Good Shepherd Convent in Derry (St Mary's). Her first placement was between [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] and, in the Board's view, this was a private placement organized by the Parish Priest and HIA 7's mother.⁶ HIA 7 was subsequently placed by Social Services in the Good Shepherd Convent Derry on [REDACTED]. This placement lasted only weeks when she moved to [REDACTED] Children's Home.

ANALYSIS

3.4. The four Applicants who were placed in the Good Shepherd Convent by predecessors of the Board were all teenagers: HIA 124 was [REDACTED] years of age when first placed in [REDACTED]; HIA 175 was [REDACTED] years of age when first placed in [REDACTED] and aged [REDACTED] years when she was placed for a second time; HIA 7 was [REDACTED] years old at the time of placement; and HIA 377 was [REDACTED] years old when first placed.

⁶ GSC 3009

- 3.5. Of the four Applicants, it is known that HIA 175 and HIA 377 were both above the upper limit of school leaving age during their placements and it is known that the other two Applicants, HIA 124⁷ in Belfast and HIA 7 in Derry⁸, both attended school.
- 3.6. It is also known that HIA 175 worked in St Joseph's Babies Home for part of her stay in the Good Shepherd Convent, at which time she was over ■ years of age.
- 3.7. This issue of young residents going on to work in the Children's Home featured in a report of the Northern Ireland Child Welfare Council dated 1956 entitled "Children in Care" which states at paragraph 90⁹:

"Retention or Employment of Children

90. We are conscious of the danger that children may, perhaps through inertia on the part of the Managers of the Home, spend their entire life in the institution – passing imperceptibly from the status of a child who helps with the housework to that of a domestic drudge. Nevertheless, we cannot recommend a flat prohibition on the employment in Children's Homes of young people who were reared there (though were a child is employed in the Home as a nursery assistant to domestic servant he should be paid the full wages to which the post is entitled)."

- 3.8. Accordingly, so long as HIA 175 was receiving a wage for her work, it does not appear that any opprobrium should be attached to this.
- 3.9. HIA 124 was placed in the Good Shepherd Convent Adolescent Centre in ■ It appears that the Adolescent Centre had the specific function of caring for teenagers between the ages of 12 and 17 years¹⁰. HIA 124 was

⁷ GSC 137 and GSC 140

⁸ GSC 099

⁹ HIA 1761

¹⁰ GSC 567

only aged [REDACTED] years when she was placed in the Adolescent Centre and, although she was within the age range for placement there, it is perhaps noteworthy that HIA 124's field Social Worker took steps to arrange a change of placement to Nazareth Lodge, within two weeks of her placement. In the Board's view this may suggest that the Welfare Authority took steps to place HIA 124 with younger children and, as such, demonstrates a child focused approach to meeting her needs. The fact that HIA 124 did not settle in Nazareth Lodge and was quickly transferred back to the Adolescent Centre also demonstrates that both the Welfare Authority and the Congregation of the Good Shepherd Sisters responded flexibly to HIA 124's presenting needs.

3.10. In addition, HIA 7 was placed by Social Services in the Good Shepherd Convent in Derry on [REDACTED] when she was [REDACTED] years old. This placement lasted only two weeks when she was moved to [REDACTED] Children's Home. In her evidence to the Inquiry on Day 189, HIA 7 spoke of her fondness of SR 49 but her overall unhappiness at living in the Good Shepherd Convent and she credited SR 49 for making arrangements with Social Services for getting her into [REDACTED].¹¹

3.11. In the Board's view, HIA 7's case demonstrates good collaborative working between the Good Shepherd Sisters and Social Services and it is clear that Social Services did not allow HIA 7 to drift in the Good Shepherd Convent, but rather properly and promptly implemented the plan to place her in [REDACTED], a statutory children's home about which she makes no complaints.

¹¹ Day 189, page 117, lines 20-25 and page 118, lines 1-3

4. WELFARE PLACEMENTS IN THE GOOD SHEPHERD CONVENT ST MARY'S HOMES

Belfast

4.1. Between the closing of the Sacred Heart Home in Belfast and the opening of the Adolescent Centre on the Good Shepherd Convent site in Belfast, the St Mary's Home in Belfast accommodated teenagers, usually above the upper limit of compulsory school age in the same building as adult women. St Mary's also operated a laundry up until its closure in 1977.

4.2. There is no doubt that Welfare Authorities placed teenagers in the St Mary's Home in Belfast during this time frame. This is evidenced by the annual returns referred to by Mr Aiken BL in his opening of Module 12 when Mr. Aitken BL said:

*"Social Services, if you like, Welfare Authorities at the time are placing teenagers in the St. Mary's facility, which had residential accommodation not just for teenagers but for older -- those 18 and beyond or beyond 18 and presumably they would have been aware of the work facility that was part of the services that were offered"*¹².

4.3. The available evidence from the annual returns suggests that the Welfare Authorities placed teenagers in St Mary's Belfast in small numbers between the years 1964 and 1970. Significantly, however, the annual returns do not disclose that that the Welfare Authorities placed girls in St Mary's under the compulsory school age. The statistical return for 1963 shows that the Welfare Authority had placed 13 of the 36 year old girls aged between 15 and 18 years in the Good Shepherd Home in Belfast and that no girl under the age of 15 was placed there by a Welfare Authority¹³. The statistical

¹² Transcript for Day 188, page 103, lines 4 to 10

¹³ GSC 5844

returns for 1964¹⁴, 1965¹⁵, 1966¹⁶, 1968¹⁷ and 1969¹⁸ do not provide any figures for placements of children under the age of 15 years.

Derry

4.4. There was a similar situation in Derry where the Sacred Heart Home (in respect of which there were no Applicants) closed in 1952 and, according to the Congregation, St Mary's Derry admitted teenagers until 1980/81.

4.5. In his opening to Module 12, Mr Aiken BL said,

"...for most years between '63 and '73, when a number of the Inquiry Applicants are speaking about, you have the total numbers who are resident in St. Mary's, Derry and then the total who are under 18. You can see that generally speaking it's less than 10% are under the age of 18, and then occasionally you have within that number -- so in 1963 or indeed then in 1965 you have three girls who are of school age residing, and then you can see in 1972 one girl under 15 going out to school. You can see it is recorded that the congregation is taking stranded young girls who come to their door or are brought by police"¹⁹.

4.6. Analysis of the statistical returns for St Mary's, Derry shows that in 1963, three of the eight 15 to 18 year olds who were resident there were placed by a Welfare Authority. The same return confirms that although there were two girls living there who were between the ages of 5 and 14 years, none of these were placed by a Welfare Authority²⁰. The statistical returns for 1964 show that 2 out of the 10 under 18 year olds living in St Mary's Derry were placed by a Welfare Authority. However, due to the way the data was

¹⁴ GSC 5838

¹⁵ GSC 5825

¹⁶ GSC 5884

¹⁷ GSC 5885

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Day 188, page 136, lines 19 to 25 and page 137, lines 1 to 6.

²⁰ GSC 5844

presented, it is not possible to say how many, if any, of these girls was under the age of 15 years. The statistical returns confirm that in 1965, four of the eight girls living in St Marys Derry were placed there by a Welfare Authority and 3 of these girls were between the ages of 5 and 14 years²¹. In 1966, Welfare Authorities placed four girls in St Mary's Derry but the data does not disclose the age of these girls²².

Newry

4.7. A similar situation pertained in Newry. The statistical returns for 1963 show that three of the four girls aged 15 to 18 years that lived there, were Welfare Authority placements and there were no girls under the age of 15 years resident in the GSC according to the 1963 statistical return²³. In 1964, the statistical return suggests that one of the four under 18's placed in St Mary's Newry was a Welfare Authority placement. However, due to the way the data was presented, it is not possible to say how many, if any, of these girls was under the age of 15 years.²⁴ In 1965, two out of the four girls in residence were placed by a Welfare Authority and both these girls were between the ages of 15 and 18 years²⁵. In 1966, Welfare Authorities placed two girls in St Mary's Newry but the data does not disclose the age of these girls²⁶.

4.8. It is clear, therefore, that Welfare Authorities placed teenage girls in the St Mary's Homes of the Good Shepherd Convents in Belfast, Derry and Newry in small number in the 1960s when these Homes also provided accommodation and work for adult women who were being looked after by the Good Shepherd Sisters.

²¹ GSC 5825

²² GSC 5884

²³ GSC 5844

²⁴ GSC 5838

²⁵ GSC 5825

²⁶ GSC 5884

4.9. By today's standards, this practice may seem anomalous. However, the Congregation of the Good Shepherd Sisters have described how they adapted their living and sleeping arrangements to accommodate the teenagers and one sister has recalled one sister being assigned to the younger residents in Belfast.²⁷

4.10. The efforts made by the Good Shepherd Sisters was recalled by some of the Applicants in Module 12. For example:

4.10.1. HIA 211 arrived in the Good Shepherd Convent on [REDACTED] when she was [REDACTED] years of age and she remembers that:

"There were quite a few girls in the Good Shepherd, it was mostly older people there when I went..."²⁸

On Day 189, reading from HIA 211's statement, Ms. Smith QC suggested to HIA [REDACTED] 211:

"You were one of the youngest and you went there with a couple of other young girls. There were two rooms for the girls around your age, a blue room and a pink room. You were in the pink room and you name the girls who you were in that dormitory with: "The older girls and women stayed in a dormitory. I moved there when I was older. I don't know what age I was."²⁹

It is known that HIA 211 stayed in the Good Shepherd Convent until she was [REDACTED] years old.

²⁷ GSC 394, paragraph 6.7.2.

²⁸ Transcript for Day 189, page 11, lines 7 to 8

²⁹ Day 189, page 11, lines 8-16

4.10.2. On Day 189, there was following exchange between Ms Smith QC and HIA 7, who was accommodated for a short time in the St Marys Home in Derry:

“Q. Good Shepherd would say, yes, you were one of their younger residents and they tried to accommodate that by making sure you went to school and looking after you in the kitchen and they tried to provide you with love and stability. You certainly would say that they achieved that for you.

A. Well, they definitely did.”³⁰

4.11. In a statement dated 25 March 2016, Dr Harrison stated at paragraph 1.3:

“The appropriateness of these arrangements for children and young people under the age of 18 years must, however, be considered in the light of available information about the socio-legal framework that prevailed over the three decades of the 1950s- 1970s, the age groups and peer groupings served by the homes and the physical accommodation within them.”³¹

4.12. The Board agreed with this analysis and asks the Inquiry to place weight on the following contextual factors when considering the appropriateness or otherwise of welfare authorities placing a teenage girl in St Mary’s alongside adult women in the 1950s and 1960s:

- a. The Good Shepherd Homes were registered by the Ministry of Home Affairs as Voluntary Children’s Homes. Thus, Welfare Authorities placing teenage girls in these Homes knew that the regional body responsible for registering, regulating and inspecting children’s homes was satisfied that these institutions were suitable voluntary homes for children and young people;

³⁰ Transcript for Day 189, page 120, line 24 to page 121, line 5

³¹ GSC 1216

- b. The Good Shepherd Sisters were a respected part of the voluntary community in Northern Ireland who organised their premises so that the young people slept separately from the older women;
- c. It seems that the Good Shepherd Sisters in Belfast at least allocated one sister to have special responsibility for resident teenage girls;
- d. It is known that the Good Shepherd Sisters in Derry had teachers working on site. The 1964 Child Welfare Council questionnaire reveals that five teachers were working in the Homes' Further Education Centre.³²
- e. It is known that the teenagers of school going age that were placed in St Mary's Home in Belfast attended St Monica's School on the Ravenhill Road³³.
- f. The Good Shepherd Sisters statement of their role and purpose³⁴ and internal recordings in the Ministry of Home Affairs provide some evidence that the Good Shepherd Homes served a 'specialist'³⁵ function, reserved primarily for teenage girls "to repair the damage of immoral or morally dangerous experiences³⁶" which in today's terms equates to young people considered to be at risk of sexual harm or exploitation.
- g. Until 1972, those girls who were aged 15 years and over were no longer required to attend school³⁷. This evidences societal norms at the time, that 15 years old were employable and were no longer required to attend school.

³² GSC 5788 at 5791

³³ GSC 5791

³⁴ GSC 5868

³⁵ GSC 5821

³⁶ GSC 5868

³⁷ It is accepted by all core participants that between 1947 and 1957 the school leaving age was 14 years.

- h. There may have been specific reasons for placing a particular teenager in the Good Shepherd Homes. This was recognised in a report by the Child Welfare Council entitled “Operation of Social Services in relation to Child Welfare” covering the period 1956 – 1959, which states at paragraph 38³⁸:

“In the general approach to the problem, the welfare authorities quite rightly take the view that residential care should not be regarded as the solution for every child in care, and that no deprived child should be placed in long-stay residential accommodation until all other methods of dealing with the case had been considered...on the other hand the child who, because of some behaviour maladjustment, or physical or mental handicap, finds himself in the care of a welfare authority, would in many cases be more suitable for group treatment, .Similarly, the child within reach of school leaving age who fails or refuses to attend schools suitable for group treatment in a residential home. So also is the legitimate child for whom boarding-out in the area in which his family resides would be inappropriate; the bigger child who comes into care as being in moral danger or because he has committed minor offences...”

- 4.13. It is also clear that other Public Authorities placed teenage girls in the Good Shepherd Convents without the Welfare Authority being involved. The Board submits that the following Applicants in Module 12 were admitted directly to a Good Shepherd Convent by the Court on application by the Police:

- 4.13.1. **HIA 107** was placed in the Good Shepherd Convent when she was just █ days’ short of her █ birthday. The Order made by the Juvenile Court for the Petty Sessions District of █ on █ was a Fit Person Order required that HIA 107 be committed to the care of the Good Shepherd Convent, Londonderry. The Order also records the application

³⁸ HIA 1695

having been made by J Whan, Woman/Sergeant of the Royal Ulster Constabulary³⁹.

In the Board's submission, there is no evidence that the Board's predecessors had any involvement with HIA 107 at that time of her admission and whilst a typed record produced by the Good Shepherd Sisters recorded "under [REDACTED], [REDACTED] County Welfare"⁴⁰, the Board believes this information relates to a later time. It is noted that in a statement filed by Sr Ethna McDermott dated 13 March 2016, it is confirmed at paragraph 3.2 thereof that the Sisters likewise believe, in light of their handwritten record containing no record to the Social Worker, that this relates to a later time⁴¹.

It is also noteworthy that in the initial years of HIA 107's placement, there is no record of any Welfare Authority involvement. The earliest record of involvement by a Social Worker currently available is dated 19 February [REDACTED]⁴². This is a Case Report written in the context of a second application by HIA 107's parents to vary or revoke the Fit Person Order, the first application having been made in November [REDACTED]. The Board believes that these court proceedings were likely to have been the catalyst for their predecessor becoming involved with HIA 107.

4.13.2. **HIA 203** was placed in the Good Shepherd Convent at the age of [REDACTED] years by Order of Belfast Juvenile Court on the 7 October [REDACTED] under a Fit Person Order, having been brought before the court by the RUC as "*being a young person in need of care and protection and exposed to moral danger*"⁴³.

³⁹ GSC 3015

⁴⁰ GSC 3016

⁴¹ GSC 1184

⁴² GSC 3017

4.14. In the Board's submission, her young age and the length of time that HIA 107 (from 24.11.1960-25.2.1965) and HIA 203 spent in the Good Shepherd Convent stands in sharp contrast with the general profile and experiences of those girls who were placed by Welfare Authorities, for example HIA 124 and HIA 7, where there is evidence that the Board's predecessors made plans about where each girl would be best placed and took action accordingly.

4.15. HIA 107 was very young when she was placed in the Good Shepherd Convent and the Board notes that, in the exercise of its powers, the Court made the Fit Person Order in favour of the Good Shepherd Convent until HIA 107 was 18 years old. The Board also notes that the report by the Child Welfare Council entitled "Operation of Social Services in relation to Child Welfare" covering the period 1956 - 1959 stated, at paragraph 8

"It seems to the Council that, in some instances residence in a voluntary home where there is a religious background would be more beneficial than boarding-out for those committed to the care of welfare authorities under fit person orders. Accordingly, we recommend that, when committing a child or young person to the care of a welfare authority as a fit person, the courts should be given power, in any case in which they feel it is desirable, to impose a condition of residence in a particular voluntary home..."⁴⁴

4.16. Although, this recommendation was not taken up by the Northern Ireland Child Welfare Council⁴⁵, it does reflect some support for the view that Courts, in some instances, should have had the power to impose a condition of residence in a particular voluntary home when making Fit Person Orders. On one view, this is effectively what happened in HIA 107's case and it

⁴⁴ HIA 1689

⁴⁵ HIA 1730, paragraph (b)

would seem that the Court took such a step having been satisfied that it was in HIA 107's best interests to do so.

5. Relevant Evidence from Module 4

Sister of HIA 117

- 5.1. It is known that the sister of HIA 117, was placed in Good Shepherd, Derry on [REDACTED], when she was [REDACTED] years old and that she remained there until the [REDACTED] when she was boarded out into the care of HIA 117, aged [REDACTED] years.
- 5.2. A 'Progress Report on a Child in Care' dated 5 October [REDACTED]⁴⁶ records that "[HIA 117's sister] remains in the home in Derry and seems to be content especially now that there are other girls her age in the home. She will remain in the Home until school leaving age when alternative plans may be necessary". The report also records that "initially her placement in Derry was a matter of expediency due to the lack of alternative accommodation, but as she has settled well there, there are no plans to move her in the immediate future." The records also show that HIA 117's sister attended school in Derry and that sibling contact between the siblings was promoted by the field Social Worker.
- 5.3. The information available about the circumstances of HIA 117's sister's placement in the Good Shepherd Convent in Derry is in keeping with what is known about welfare placements as a result of the evidence in Module 12, namely:
- Availability of accommodation may have been a factor in determining placement.
 - Placement were made for girls in and around 15 years of age;
 - The girls attended school whilst resident in the Good Shepherd Convent;
 - Family Contact was promoted.

⁴⁶ SNB 44576

HIA 62

- 5.4. The Inquiry is also referred to evidence concerning HIA 62 which emerged in Module 4. HIA 62 was initially privately placed in Nazareth House Belfast and then, following a written request from Down & Connor Catholic Family Welfare Society, HIA 62 was taken into the care of Belfast Welfare Committee on 11 September [REDACTED] and she received regular monthly visits from her fieldwork Social Worker.
- 5.5. A significant issue in the care history of HIA 62 arose on [REDACTED], when HIA 62 was [REDACTED] years old. Records outline that contact was made with HIA 62's Social Worker on that date to advise that SR 18 wanted HIA 62 removed the following day⁴⁷. Upon being notified of this request, the Social Worker took a number of steps which included her securing agreement for HIA 62 to remain in Nazareth House for a further period, until [REDACTED], to properly identify alternative accommodation and she met with HIA 62 to discuss the issues directly with her⁴⁸.
- 5.6. A meeting also took place on [REDACTED] between the Social Worker and SR 18 and records indicate that SR 18 expressed her unhappiness with the Social Worker's plan for HIA 62 to move to Nazareth Lodge in Belfast and suggested instead that this teenage girl should be transferred to the Good Shepherd, Derry. The Social Worker recorded in her notes that she was "totally against that", noting HIA 62's education was based in Belfast, and her sisters resided in Belfast⁴⁹.
- 5.7. In Module 4, the HSCB submitted that the Social Worker's records demonstrated the determination of the Social Worker to base plans upon the

⁴⁷ SNB 44649

⁴⁸ SNB 44649 - 44650

⁴⁹ SNB 44650 - 44651

particular needs and best interests of HIA 62, who was in the care of Social Services⁵⁰. That submission is reiterated here.

⁵⁰ See Chapter 6, paragraph 6.4 of the Closing Submission to Module 4 on behalf of the HSCB