
HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE INQUIRY

being heard before:

SIR ANTHONY HART (Chairman)

MR DAVID LANE

MS GERALDINE DOHERTY

held at
Banbridge Court House
Banbridge

on Wednesday, 29th April 2015

commencing at 10.00 am

(Day 113)

MS CHRISTINE SMITH, QC and MR JOSEPH AIKEN appeared as
Counsel to the Inquiry.

1 Wednesday, 29th April 2015

2 (10.00 am)

3 (Proceedings delayed)

4 (10.45 am)

5 WITNESS NL4 (called)

6 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. Just before
7 we start this morning's hearings can I, as always,
8 remind everyone that mobile phones must be turned off or
9 placed on "Silent"/"Vibrate" and that no photography or
10 recording is permitted either in the chamber or anywhere
11 on the Inquiry premises.

12 Good morning, Ms Smith.

13 MS SMITH: Good morning, Chairman, Panel Members, ladies and
14 gentlemen. Our first witness today is NL4. NL4 wishes
15 to take the religious oath and she also wishes to
16 maintain her anonymity. NL4 has certain mobility
17 difficulties, Chairman. So it might be easier for her
18 if she were to remain seated during the oath.

19 WITNESS NL4 (sworn)

20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, NL4.

21 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

22 MS SMITH: Now, NL4, you have given three statements to the
23 Inquiry. They are found at SNB-80006 to 80029, which
24 includes exhibits. That statement is dated 11/1/2015.
25 The second statement on 20th January 2015 is found at

1 SNB-80059 to 80062, and a third statement, including
2 exhibits, of 6th February is at 80079 to 80090.

3 NL4 also brought some photographs to the Inquiry.
4 I am going to look at those very shortly. They are at
5 80009 and 80090.

6 There is also police material relevant to NL4.
7 There is a number of parts of the bundle. At 60468 to
8 60587, which is NL4's interview with the police on 8th
9 May 1996. Her interview, I should say, part of that can
10 be found at 50... -- I beg your pardon -- 60507 onwards.

11 More police material is at SNB-60905 to 60908. 60927
12 to 60990, and NL4's interview of 19th October 2012 can
13 be found at 60958 onwards.

14 There is also police material at 61024 to 61049 --
15 45, 61060 to 61061, 60801 to 60830, 60833 to 60839,
16 60853 to 60862 and 61025 to 61026. So a lot of pages in
17 our papers, NL4, and those are the page reference
18 numbers. I will make reference to some page --

19 **A. Right.**

20 Q. -- reference numbers as we go through your evidence now.

21 NL4, you are now aged 77. Is that correct?

22 **A. That's correct, yes.**

23 Q.

24

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q.

2 If we can just look at
3 that, please. I just should point out, NL4, that
4 although your full name is given here, before this
5 statement is put on to our website it will be properly
6 redacted so your identity is protected.

7 **A. Right. Thank you.**

8 Q. I am just going to look at the photograph -- the
9 photographs that you sent to us, NL4, because at
10 paragraph 3 here, if we can just scroll down slightly --
11 no, I think it is maybe

12

13 you explain
14 that the photographs you gave to the Inquiry show

15

16

17

18

19 isn't that correct --

20 **A. That's right, yes.**

21 Q. --

22 **A. No, never.**

23 Q. We will look at those photographs at 80089, please.

24 This is you and your sister.

25 **A. My sister and my mother and a cousin.**

1 Q. Okay, and the next photograph just on the next page, is
2 this your parents and you and your sister?

3 **A. That's correct, yes.**

4 Q. Is that taken in the grounds of Nazareth Lodge?

5 **A. No, that would have been taken in the grounds of
6 St. Joseph's Convent in I think.**

7 Q. But certainly just looking at these photographs, NL4,
8
9
10

11 **A.**

12

13

14

15 Q.

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q.

18

19 **A.**

20

21 Q.

22

23

24

25 **A.**

1 show that certainly in '63/'64 you were receiving
2 treatment in Wales --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- and also in July '74 I think, but in September '75
5 you were definitely in Nazareth Lodge for short periods
6 --

7 **A. That's right.**

8 Q. -- before you stopped working there altogether.

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. So over the period from '56 to '75 can you even tell us
11 what you think the longest period you might have spent
12 in -- working in Nazareth Lodge?

13 **A. I think the longest period was when SR172 was there.**
14 **She was the Superior. I might have spent a little bit**
15 **longer then than I had spent at any other time.**

16 Q. We know that she was there between 1965 and 1970.
17 That's SR172.

18 **A. Yes, SR172, yes.**

19 Q. You actually were telling me when we were speaking that
20 when she left to go to England, she asked you to come
21 and help her work there?

22 **A. That's correct, yes.**

23 Q. Well, in paragraphs 8 to 13 of your statement at 80007
24 you describe here about what you remember about your
25 time in Nazareth Lodge when you were there. You said

1 that most of your work was with boys of primary school
2 age aged between the ages of 4 and 11. Can I just
3 check? I know you have difficulty. Can you see any of
4 this?

5 **A. Not very well.**

6 Q. Okay. Then I will continue to read and please interrupt
7 me if I've got anything wrong.

8 **A. Right.**

9 Q. At some stage during the '60s when you returned to
10 Nazareth Lodge, the decision had been taken to keep
11 brothers and sisters together. So you would have had
12 some limited contact with girls, but the majority of the
13 children you supervised and looked after were boys.

14 I was wondering if you could describe what Nazareth
15 Lodge was like at that time, NL4, the general layout of
16 it, if you could.

17 **A. Well, there were four groups, and there were two groups**
18 **on each floor, and there had to be two dormitories if**
19 **the girls were -- even though they were combined, the**
20 **boys were in one part of it and the girls were in -- the**
21 **sleeping quarters were in another part, but I thought it**
22 **was quite a pleasant place, very daunting for young**
23 **ones, but, you know, it was -- I don't have --**

24 Q. You described when you first went to Nazareth Lodge, you
25 thought it was a dismal type of building.

1 **A. Very different. When I walked up to the front door in**
2 **1956, it was raining and there were four swings in the**
3 **front and you could hear the chains rattling, and my**
4 **mother says to me, "It doesn't look very ...", you know,**
5 **and it was a very dismal place. It would -- it was**
6 **scary, yes.**

7 Q. Certainly for a child.

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. We have heard yesterday that a lot of the children who
10 were in the Lodge, though, had come from St. Joseph's
11 Babies' Home --

12 **A. That's right.**

13 Q. -- and not so many from the community certainly in the
14 earlier days. They went from the babies' home into the
15 nursery, which looked after the 2 to 5-year-olds --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- and then into the Lodge property -- proper until they
18 were 11 and then were transferred to Rubane.

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. In all the time you were working there the boys did
21 transfer to Kircubbin, didn't they?

22 **A. Yes, they did.**

23 Q. Now you also go on to talk in paragraph 8 -- sorry.

24 I think we have mentioned that. At paragraph 9 here you
25 said you were employed by Sisters of Nazareth. They

1 provided your board and keep and you received a very
2 small wage. I was asking you about what exactly you did
3 earn. You said at first in 1956 you were given 10
4 shillings.

5 **A. That's correct, yes.**

6 Q. That's per week?

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. Then as an 18-year-old you remember getting 2 pounds per
9 week.

10 **A. 2 pounds a week.**

11 Q. Sorry. The 10 shillings was an 18-year-old. That went
12 up eventually to 2 pounds per week.

13 **A. Yes, eventually.**

14 Q. You said there was a period of time when you worked in
15 the baby home.

16 **A. At night-time.**

17 Q. So that involved night shifts?

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. At that stage you were getting 2.50 pounds per week?

20 **A. That's correct, yes.**

21 Q. You also when you were -- you say that you normally
22 stayed overnight in staff accommodation.

23 "Initially the staff members shared an attic room
24 and some time later proper staff quarters were
25 provided."

1 You say:

2 "This was separate from the dormitories where the
3 children slept".

4 but when you spoke to the police and when you were
5 speaking to me, you told them -- and I'll just give the
6 page reference number. We don't need to call it up. It
7 is SNB-60933. You say the staff were originally in a
8 dormitory in the attic, but there were also children who
9 were in that dormitory as well.

10 **A. There was a big curtain crossed over and the children**
11 **were in one division and the -- we were in the other**
12 **part, you know. We were completely separate from the**
13 **children.**

14 Q. That -- you have said that that was a particular group.
15 That was St. Joseph's group was up there.

16 **A. St. Joseph's was in that part of the attic, yes.**

17 Q. We have heard at one stage there were five groups in the
18 home, NL4. Is that why the attic was being used or can
19 you remember?

20 **A. No, I don't ever remember five groups being there.**
21 **There was always four. The reason that the attic was**
22 **there was because there was not enough sleeping**
23 **accommodation for the children and they used that part**
24 **of the attic.**

25 Q. That was like an overflow part for children?

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. I did ask you how many children -- you were working with
3 one of the Sisters in a group --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- looking after a group of children. If I've got this
6 right, there was only yourself and one of the Sisters.
7 You didn't have any other staff to help you at that
8 point?

9 **A. No, no staff helped.**

10 Q. Even in the '70s just before you left had the staff
11 complement increased at that time or not?

12 **A. No, not for the groups. It was always one staff member
13 and a Sister.**

14 Q. The four groups that you recall were St. Joseph's, Our
15 Lady's, Sacred Heart and Marion group.

16 **A. That's correct.**

17 Q. At various times, because you came and went, you would
18 have been in different groups.

19 **A. The only group I didn't work in was St. Joseph's.**

20 Q. So all of the other three you would have been helping
21 out in at some point in time?

22 **A. Yes, that's right.**

23 Q. You were also explaining to me there would have been 25
24 to 30 children in the group.

25 **A. Could easily have been up to that, yes.**

1 Q. Paragraph 10, NL4, you go on to say:

2 "I received no instructions or training during my
3 work in Nazareth Lodge. I was given no information
4 about any particular child. I worked under
5 the direction of a nun who was this charge of each of
6 the four groups of boys. I did not attend any meetings
7 and no personal details about individual children were
8 discussed with me. I did not meet social workers or get
9 information from them when they called to visit children
10 at the home from time to time."

11 Now back in 1956 there wouldn't have been social
12 workers involved at that stage.

13 **A. None at all, no.**

14 Q. This would have been something that was later.

15 **A. I think it was when the girls started to come where they
16 integrated the girls with the boys that the social
17 workers started to come.**

18 Q. You also received no guidance or instructions in
19 relation to the discipline of children.

20 "When a child was unruly or misbehaved, I would have
21 sometimes slapped them with my open hand. Normally
22 I would have slapped them on their hands or their legs.
23 On occasion I may have slapped them on their bottom.
24 This was a spontaneous thing. I did not use excessive
25 force or cause any bruises or marks on a child's body.

1 I also used a ruler from time to time to slap a child,
2 but this would normally have been one or two slaps, and
3 again I never used excessive force. I didn't carry the
4 ruler round with me, but would have picked it up if it
5 was lying around. However, more frequently I would have
6 used my open hand to slap a child for misbehaviour."

7 Now I'm going to come back to discuss that, NL4 --

8 **A. Right.**

9 Q. -- but it's quite clear and you are aware that there are
10 a number of people who have made complaints to the
11 Inquiry and to the police about your treatment of them.

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. You deny ever doing anything more than what you have set
14 out in that paragraph. Isn't that right?

15 **A. I do.**

16 Q. When you spoke to the police, you also told them that
17 you were never briefed about how to discipline children.

18 **A. Never.**

19 Q. The Congregation have told us that they had a policy of
20 no physical punishment, but you told the police in 2012
21 at SNB-60947 -- and again if we could maybe just look at
22 that, please. If we can just -- you were asked about --
23 right at the top there you -- if we can just maybe
24 scroll back to the preceding page just. You were
25 talking about smacking children here, NL4.

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. You see the questions are the policeman asking you the
3 questions and the answers are yours. If we can just
4 scroll on up a little bit more.

5 "Q. Okay. Were you involved in the chastising of
6 the children?

7 **A. Well, yes, I'd say I was.**

8 Q. And how would you have chastised the children?

9 **A. Well, I would have given them a smack or I would
10 have given them a smack.**

11 Q. And when you say 'smack', which part in the body
12 would you have smacked?

13 **A. Probably their hands or their legs.**

14 Q. And when you smacked with your hand?

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. And how long would the smacking last for?

17 **A. That's just a [something]. Know what I mean?
18 It wouldn't -- it wouldn't be a prolonged thing, you
19 know."**

20 **So the policeman says:**

21 **"So it was kind of acceptable --**

22 **A. It was.**

23 Q. -- to do that?",

24 and he goes on. You say:

25 "Yes, it was",

1 and the policeman says to you:

2 "And the Sisters would have been aware?",

3 and your answer was:

4 "Yes, very much so."

5 So is it your evidence that the nuns saw you

6 chastise the children in this way?

7 **A. Well, sometimes they would have seen me chastise them,**
8 **yes.**

9 Q. And you also go on to say the reasons why you would have
10 smacked a child. I will come back to that again in
11 a moment, but basically you say you would have smacked
12 a child if they didn't really --

13 "If they really didn't listen and do what they were
14 told and, you know, they would climb on -- the
15 windowsills were about that wide."

16 You must have been explaining to the policeman how
17 wide the windowsills were.

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. "And they'd be on. The boys would be a wee bit wild at
20 climbing. Get them down or get them -- if they -- they
21 would maybe not go to bed and they'd be jumping around,
22 things like that, and you would give them a smack, you
23 know."

24 Then you were asked:

25 "Was that ever written down anywhere that you would

1 have recorded that you'd smacked a child?"

2 and you said:

3 "No.

4 How young would the youngest child have been that
5 you would have smacked? Would you do it according to
6 age?"

7 You say:

8 "No, not at all."

9 You said:

10 "It depended on -- it would have been a spontaneous
11 thing. You didn't sit and go, 'I'll smack you now'. It
12 was just a spontaneous thing. So I couldn't really --
13 it just would have been a spontaneous reaction."

14 You were asked if you were ever over-zealous and you
15 didn't think so. You were asked then about whether
16 there were any written instructions for chastisement.
17 Not while you were there. You were asked if you ever
18 asked the Sister in charge, "How do I chastise a child?"
19 and you didn't. Asked if she ever told you how to and
20 you said "No". Then you were asked:

21 "Would you have seen the nuns chastise the
22 children?",

23 and your answer was:

24 "Well, like myself, they would have given them, you
25 know. It would also have been a spontaneous thing, you

1 know."

2 So not only did the nuns see you chastise the
3 children, but you were telling the police, when you were
4 speaking to them, that you also saw the nuns do the same
5 thing to the children.

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. They would have smacked the children in the way that
8 you've described.

9 **A. That's right.**

10 Q. You also told police, NL4, just at 60950 -- I think it's
11 in this same passage -- that you probably shouted at the
12 children as well.

13 **A. I did sometimes, yes.**

14 Q. You said that you would have used the ruler, but you
15 never used a wooden spoon or anything like that.

16 **A. No.**

17 Q. Now I was asking you when we were talking earlier what
18 nuns you remember working with and what your
19 recollections were and what contact the children had
20 with the Sisters.

21 You told the police at 60939 those that you
22 remembered working with were SR34, SR71, SR47. You
23 mentioned SR152 and you mentioned what the police record
24 as SR 228 , but you say it was actually a SR 228
25 SR 228

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. When we were talking, you were saying you didn't
3 actually yourself work with SR34 in her group, but she
4 was in overall charge of the groups.

5 **A. Right.**

6 Q. Is that right? You were quite close to her?

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. I was asking, you know -- I was explaining to you that
9 some of the children have said she would have grabbed
10 them by the cheeks or the sideburns and pulled them
11 nearly off their toes. I was wondering if you had ever
12 seen her do that to any child?

13 **A. I have never seen her do that, never.**

14 Q. You also made the point to me that the groups kept very
15 much to themselves.

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. You also mentioned one other nun, who was a SR184
18 I believe.

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. You remembered her and working with her, but she left
21 the Congregation.

22 **A. She left altogether, yes.**

23 Q. That was during your time in the home. You remember her
24 leaving?

25 **A. I can remember her leaving.**

1 Q. I can hear your voice is getting a little bit feeble.
2 I know you were saying you have a problem. So maybe
3 a sip of water will help, NL4. I think I'll take one
4 myself.

5 **A. Thank you.**

6 Q. NL4, you were saying that -- I was asking what contact
7 the children had with the Sister. You were saying the
8 Sister was there every day except Saturday, when they
9 went collecting.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. And on Saturdays you were left on your own with the
12 group of children, first of all.

13 **A. With my own group, yes.**

14 Q. And then on Saturday afternoon you were responsible
15 solely for taking them to the Curzon cinema.

16 **A. Yes, that's correct.**

17 Q. I was asking a little bit about that and, you know, why
18 it was you who was sort of left to do that, but you were
19 explaining to me that there were a lot of the younger
20 members of staff used to go home at weekends.

21 **A. That's right. They did. They lived down in Newry,
22 Bessbrook and places like that, and they went home for
23 the weekend.**

24 Q. So the only people who would have been left in the home
25 on a Saturday to look after the children would have been

1 yourself --

2 **A. NL5.**

3 Q. -- and NL5?

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. So the two of you would have had -- if there were even
6 25 children in each group, you would have had to look
7 after 100 or 100 plus children?

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. I was wondering just about the staff as well and what
10 other staff that you remembered there. You remembered
11 there were three different at one stage. There
12 was an and you remember a lady called who
13 worked in the chapel.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. She then later came and did the corridors. Is that
16 right?

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. I was -- you told police when you were speaking to them
19 that -- there were never any staff meetings. Is that
20 right?

21 **A. I was never at a staff meeting. There was never --**
22 **I never knew that they existed, if there was any, you**
23 **know.**

24 Q. You took all your directions from the nun in charge of
25 the group?

1 **A. I did, yes.**

2 Q. There was never any discussion, as you indicated in your
3 statement to the Inquiry, about the children and what
4 their backgrounds was or anything like that with you?

5 **A. We never heard what their backgrounds were, you know.**

6 **They were just there.**

7 Q. You also mentioned recreation time. I think again when
8 you were speaking to the police, you said that you had
9 a tea break, you had a lunch break, and we were talking
10 about this. You had to supervise the school lunches
11 and -- so you would have had your lunch after the
12 children had gone back to school.

13 **A. That's right.**

14 Q. You were told that you could have time off in the
15 afternoon either after school or before school finished.
16 When was that break?

17 **A. It was when they went back to school in the afternoon
18 and we had had our lunch and we got time off, but it
19 could have gone into two and a half hours or so, but we
20 were also given on our time off a pile of socks to darn
21 and -- I suppose to keep us busy as well, you know.**

22 Q. So your time wasn't effectively your own?

23 **A. No.**

24 Q. I was asking about what the situation was when the
25 children came back from school and who supervised

1 homework. You say you don't remember them ever getting
2 any homework.

3 **A. I don't remember them ever getting homework, because if**
4 **they had gotten homework, you would have been helping**
5 **them with their reading. We never ...**

6 Q. You never did that?

7 **A. I don't remember ever doing that.**

8 Q. Do you ever remember seeing the nuns doing that at all?

9 **A. No.**

10 Q. You do say you got on well with your fellow workers in
11 the home.

12 **A. I did.**

13 Q. At paragraph 10 at 600... -- sorry -- 80060 -- I am
14 having troubles with my numbers this morning -- you told
15 police that -- sorry. Just there. No. 80060.
16 Paragraph 10. Yes.

17

18

19

20

21 You provided some of those references. I made mention
22 of SR34's references --

23 **A. Right.**

24 Q. -- that you've provided to the Inquiry, NL4.

25 In December 2012 you said that -- you told police

1 when you were interviewed by them at 60939 who you
2 worked with, and you said that -- in answer to -- when
3 the policeman actually put it to you and you agreed with
4 him that you intermingled and worked together at
5 different times. That's the lay staff, and that
6 included NL5, but later in the same interview you told
7 police the only time staff would have been with the
8 children together was in the field.

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. That was when you were supervising playtime. Is that
11 right?

12 **A. That's correct.**

13 Q. You said that the groups were nearly always separated in
14 the building.

15 **A. They all had their own group and they went to their own
16 group for everything.**

17 Q. You were explaining to me that -- NL5 has said to the
18 Inquiry that the only time she would have been with you
19 would have been in the dining room and you said that you
20 probably think she didn't come outside much. Is that
21 right?

22 **A. No, she was seldom outside.**

23 Q. Seldom outside, but you did see her in the dining room?

24 **A. I did, yes.**

25 Q. We were having this discussion which -- about the layout

1 of the dining room, and please correct me, because I am
2 not still very clear on the layout, but essentially
3 there was a path down the middle of the room --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- that you were able to walk up and down --

6 **A. Correct.**

7 Q. -- to get the food and bring it to the children.

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. Then there were four compartments within the room --

10 **A. That's right.**

11 Q. -- separated by partitions, which you described to me
12 were about 5 foot maybe, as high as 5 foot.

13 **A. I think they were about 5 feet, yes.**

14 Q. But, however tall they were, you were still able to see
15 over them?

16 **A. Still able to see each group.**

17 Q. So if you were standing beside your group, you could see
18 what another group was doing in a different part of the
19 hall?

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. The groups were colour coded in terms of crockery.
22 Isn't that right?

23 **A. That's correct, yes.**

24 Q. So even in the dining room they would have been
25 separate?

1 **A. Yes, they were.**

2 Q. And staff went with their own group in the dining room,
3 but you said there was always one nun there as well --

4 **A. That's right.**

5 Q. -- to supervise. You actually remembered the colours
6 that you could for the different groups. You thought
7 red was for Sacred Heart, blue for Our Lady's, green for
8 St. Joseph's, and yellow for Marion?

9 **A. I think (inaudible) yellow for her.**

10 Q. Paragraph 11 of the statement you mention the fact --
11 I think maybe it was the original statement. You were
12 talking about the routine in the home. One of the
13 things that you said -- yes, it is page 80008,
14 paragraph 11. You mention the routine and one of the
15 things you said is that there was mass every day in the
16 home.

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. I was asking you about that, because the Congregation
19 have said that the children weren't expected to go to
20 mass every day. I was wondering what your memory was.

21 **A. My memory is that we did go to mass every day. Any**
22 **child that was there went to mass. I know that I went**
23 **to mass every day. So I wouldn't have been there**
24 **without the group.**

25 Q. You were saying that you couldn't have left the group on

1 their own in the dormitories.

2 **A. I couldn't leave them on their own, because the Sister**
3 **would be in mass as well.**

4 Q. You also when talking to the police -- and again we
5 don't need to pull this up, but it is at page 60931 --
6 you talk about apart from your responsibilities with
7 your own group, you would have helped out in the home
8 when they were short staffed, and that included working
9 in the laundry and the kitchen.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. You also mentioned to me that you also worked in
12 parlours.

13 **A. Parlours, yes.**

14 Q. So you were kept occupied and busy.

15 **A. Busy, yes.**

16 Q. Paragraph 12, you talk here about having to supervise
17 the children and they normally went to bed between 6.00
18 pm and 7.00 pm and I was asking was there a different
19 time for the younger children and the older children?

20 **A. No. I don't recall it being different times. They all**
21 **went upstairs and went into the -- for to go to bed**
22 **together, and by the time would you get the younger ones**
23 **maybe settled, the bigger ones would just be getting**
24 **ready. So ...**

25 Q. So they all went to bed together and you were saying

1 that there was maybe a later bedtime when you were in
2 Ballyhornan on holiday.

3 **A. That's right, yes.**

4 Q. But certainly some of the children were known to
5 regularly wet their beds, and you would have taken it in
6 turns along with the nun in charge of the group to waken
7 those children at around 9.00 pm and bring them to the
8 toilet close to the dormitory.

9 "If the bedclothes were wet, they would be changed
10 and the soiled bedclothes left in a pile until the
11 morning time. I would only have wakened up those
12 children who were known to wet the bed frequently.
13 After this I had no further contact with the children
14 during the night. A nun would have slept in a small
15 cubicle or annex the dormitory. Each of the four groups
16 had their own dormitory and the nun in charge slept
17 close by. If there were any further problems during the
18 night, the nun would have dealt with it."

19 Your sleeping quarters, as you've explained, were
20 initially in the attic.

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. So they were a distance away from the dormitory. When
23 you spoke to the police, you gave them a little bit more
24 detail about the bedwetting. We will just look at that,
25 please, if we may, at 60936. If we can just scroll on

1 down, you were talking, first of all, about bath time
2 and I will come back to that in a moment.

3 "Q. Okay. What was the procedure for the children
4 who wet the bed?"

5 You said:

6 "They would -- well, they would get up. That is --
7 is that for the morning or --"

8 The policeman said:

9 "Any time.

10 A. At night-time there would be -- say 9 o'clock --
11 around 9 o'clock -- the children went to bed around
12 6.00, 7.00 at the latest and then by 9 o'clock either
13 one of the nuns or one of the staff, we took turns in
14 going round at 9 o'clock to what we call -- what is the
15 word -- wet -- for the ones who had wet the bed to take
16 them to the toilet, to toilet the ones that had -- would
17 have a habit of wetting their bed."

18 So you go on to explain:

19 "If the bed was wet, then the sheet, drawer sheet
20 would be taken off, a clean drawer sheet would be put on
21 and the drawer sheets would be left in a pile until the
22 next day, and then in the morning when anyone who wet --
23 when anyone wet the bed, the same procedure really with
24 the sheets and then they would be tied into a big
25 bundle and sent down to the laundry."

1 **Now I was asking you to explain to me about the**
2 **drawer sheets.**

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. You were saying that there was like a rubber sheet on
5 the bed.

6 **A. There was -- when you made the bed up, you had a proper**
7 **sheet first and then there was a rubber sheet put. It**
8 **was about maybe 2 or 3 feet long and wide, and then**
9 **there was a drawer sheet was a white cotton, maybe**
10 **a sheet cut in two, and it was put over and it was**
11 **easier to take off if a child had wet the bed.**

12 Q. So you basically would have taken the top layer, the
13 cotton half size sheet, as it were --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- off, and then just replaced that?

16 **A. Normally then it would be replaced before the child**
17 **would get into bed.**

18 Q. You were asked -- basically you just knew which children
19 were bedwetters and that was the procedure that was
20 done. It wasn't a rule or anything, but it was
21 something that you just did and that you were told to do
22 that, that you would have been sent -- you know, the
23 children had to be wakened up at 9 o'clock to try to
24 stop them wetting the bed.

25 **A. It seemed to be the normal thing. It was something**

1 **I would have done.**

2 Q. That was what happened in your group. Do you know what
3 happened in other groups?

4 **A. I would say that happened in every group.**

5 Q. Paragraph 13, going back to your statement, and that's
6 at page 80008, you say that:

7 "On Saturdays the children were sometimes taken to
8 Curzon cinema on the Ormeau Road, which was several
9 hundred yards away."

10 You explained how you would have to supervise 80 to
11 100 children by yourself and bring them to the cinema on
12 the Ormeau Road.

13 "You were always worried that something would happen
14 to a child when you were taking such a large number out
15 of the home, but thankfully nothing untoward ever
16 occurred and I was always relieved when they came back
17 safely."

18 NL4, did you ever question the fact you had to do
19 this on your own? Did you ever say to the nuns, "Look,
20 I'm worried about taking such a big ..."?

21 **A. I never queried it. I was happy to do it and it was**
22 **just -- you thought you were doing the best thing for**
23 **the children. The manager had organised that they come**
24 **at a certain time, and when you got there, he would give**
25 **them sweets and a cold drink and watch the movie and**

1 **then we'd just get them in order again to take them**
2 **home.**

3 Q. I am just -- you know, I am just wondering. It clearly
4 caused you worry that you had to look after such a large
5 group of children on your own.

6 A. **It stressed me a little bit, but in those days you just**
7 **went along with it, you know.**

8 Q. I know, but I am just wondering you never thought of
9 saying to whichever Sister --

10 A. **No.**

11 Q. -- "Look, could I get somebody else to come with me or
12 help me here"?

13 A. **No, I never. It never crossed my mind to ask.**

14 Q. Was that the kind of relationship you had with the nuns,
15 that you just did what you were told by them?

16 A. **Yes.**

17 Q. You wouldn't have questioned them?

18 A. **I wouldn't have questioned it.**

19 Q.

20 .

21

22

23

24 A. **Well, you had to --**

25

Sisters ask

1 **you to do something. You sort of did it.**

2 Q. And you would never --

3 **A. You didn't really question it.**

4 Q. You also go on to talk about -- well, you talk to the
5 police here about:

6 "During the summer the children were taken away for
7 a holiday for a number of weeks to Ballyhornan, and if
8 I was working there at that time, I would have gone as
9 well. There would have been nuns and other staff
10 members there to supervise the children and I always
11 recall the children were happy to get away during this
12 time."

13 Again we are not going to call it up, but when you
14 were speaking to the police, you told them that that was
15 as long as six weeks that you went to Ballyhornan.

16 **A. It was, yes.**

17 Q. You were able to bring your own nieces and nephews to
18 join in.

19 **A. That's correct. Yes, I was.**

20 Q. You also told the police that you were able to take
21 children out of the home to your own home.

22 **A. That's right, yes.**

23 Q. You talked about, when we were talking about this, and
24 I think you mentioned to the police that there was
25 a driver, a NL 151 , if that's right --

1 **A. That's correct, yes.**

2 Q. -- who took the whole group, your whole group, to your
3 sister's home --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- where they had a bit of a party in the kitchen.

6 **A. That's right, yes.**

7 Q. Your sister lived across -- she had a garden. She lived
8 across the road from a or or
9 something.

10 **A. yes.**

11 Q. They sent over -- they sent over things for the
12 children.

13 **A. That's right. They did.**

14 Q. You also, though, confirmed to me there were occasions
15 when you would take some children home, just one or two
16 children.

17 **A. I did. I took -- would take one or two home just for
18 the day, you know, if I was going home for the day, and
19 I would take them with me on the bus and then bring them
20 back that evening with me.**

21 Q. I was asking you if you thought that that -- might that
22 have caused resentment in the group, that you were
23 taking some children and not others?

24 **A. It never crossed my mind that I was causing resentment.**

25 Q. Looking back on it now, though, do you think it might

1 have?

2 **A. I don't know, because most of the children would have**
3 **gone out for weekends and so on, and I think the ones**
4 **I would have taken out were children who didn't get out**
5 **and I was maybe trying to make it up to them.**

6 Q. One other thing I was asking you. There was only you
7 and NL5 there on a Saturday whenever the nuns were out
8 collecting. She never came with you to the Curzon.

9 **A. No.**

10 Q. She didn't bring her group down.

11 **A. I had her group.**

12 Q. Well, her group had gone. You had her group.

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. I was wondering why that might have been, and we were
15 discussing the fact that she had particular
16 responsibility for a child

18 Q. -- who was very

19

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. You remembered that he was particularly difficult to
22 handle. So I was wondering if it was the case that he
23 wouldn't have been able to go to the cinema with the
24 other boys.

25 **A. I don't think you would have been able to control him,**

1 . You wouldn't have known what
2 he wanted, you know, and he got very excitable at times.

3 Q. You do remember that there was one point where he threw
4 such a tantrum that he actually very seriously injured
5 NL5.

6 A. He did, yes.

7 Q. After that he was moved from Nazareth Lodge to
8 Purdysburn.

9 A. Yes. He was in Purdysburn for maybe a week or so.
10 I don't know how long, and then from there on to St.
11 John's I think you called it in Warrenpoint.

12 Q. Well, you don't really remember when that happened,
13 though.

14 A. No, I can't recall the dates, you know.

15 Q. I'm sure NL5 might remember and be able to tell us
16 herself.

17 A. She will probably remember it.

18 Q. Well, some other general matters about life in the home,
19 NL4, if we can deal with you. Do you ever remember
20 visits by girls from Nazareth House?

21 A. Yes. Some of the boys had sisters in Nazareth House and
22 some of the girls would have come down on a Sunday to
23 visit their brothers.

24 Q. I was wondering were they brought down by the nuns or by
25 their families?

1 **A. No, I think they just walked down. There wasn't much of**
2 **a distance between Nazareth Lodge and Nazareth House,**
3 **and the girls would have come down the Ravenhill Road**
4 **from the back of Nazareth House.**

5 Q. They were allowed to do that unaccompanied at that stage
6 that you remember?

7 **A. As far as I remember.**

8 Q. You didn't have anything to do with arranging such
9 visits or anything?

10 **A. No, not at all, no.**

11 Q. I was asking you about -- you have given us a picture of
12 how very busy your life was in Nazareth Lodge. I was
13 wondering if you ever had any time off. You know, apart
14 from this supposed recreation time when you were darning
15 socks, did you ever get days off?

16 **A. Yes, I got one day a week off and I would go home.**

17 **I would go home in the morning after we had had the beds**
18 **and that done and everything done, and then I would --**

19 NL 151 **sometimes would drive me home, because SR34**
20 **would give me a package of food to take home with me,**
21 **and then I would get the bus back in the evening, but**
22 **I was there a good part of the time, you know.**

23 Q. That was -- you were saying that you occasionally went
24 home on a Sunday, but the bus situation was difficult if
25 you didn't get a lift from NL 151 .

1 **A. If I didn't get a lift from somebody, it wasn't easy to**
2 **get home.**

3 Q. You sometimes had Thursdays off.

4 **A. I remember having Thursdays off, yes.**

5 Q. I also asked -- did you -- we touched on the fact that
6 there were social workers involved in the children's
7 lives at the later period that you would have been
8 working in Nazareth Lodge. You never -- you never had
9 any contact with them. Is that right?

10 **A. I never had any contact with the social workers.**

11 Q. If I've got this right, the nuns would have spoken to
12 them.

13 **A. They would have spoken to the nuns and they would have**
14 **conversed, yes.**

15 Q. Did they ever -- did the nuns then ever say to you after
16 they had had a meeting with the social worker, "Look,
17 you know, you should know this about ".

18 **A. Never.**

19 Q. " 's parents are having difficulties", or anything
20 like that?

21 **A. Never. Never knew anything about any of the children.**

22 Q. Do you remember where the social worker met with the
23 nuns or with the children?

24 **A. I don't know where they would have met with the nuns,**
25 **but probably the parlour, but the children -- I think**

1 **they came up to their group and would have had them in**
2 **the -- what do you call it -- sitting room. That would**
3 **have been it.**

4 Q. Would they have been in the sitting room with the child
5 or would they have taken them out?

6 A. **No, they would have taken the child into the sitting**
7 **room and then they would have had to go downstairs to go**
8 **out. So they would have met maybe somebody downstairs**
9 **and spoke about the visit.**

10 Q. I was asking you what involvement the Mother Superior in
11 the house had with the children and you made the point
12 to me that during the time you were there there were
13 different Mother Superiors --

14 A. **Yes.**

15 Q. -- but you only really remember one who engaged with the
16 children. Is that right?

17 A. **That's correct, yes.**

18 Q. That was SR172.

19 A. **It was SR172 and she also -- the floors used to be small**
20 **red tiles and the children would help to polish them,**
21 **but it was SR172 who organised to have tiled carpet**
22 **down, you know. So she took away all that polishing**
23 **thing.**

24 Q. She started to refurbish the place?

25 A. **Yes.**

1 Q. You were saying that her outlook was different. She had
2 come from America. Is that right?

3 **A. She was in America for a while, yes, and her outlook was**
4 **different, you know. She had a different outlook, more**
5 **open outlook.**

6 Q. She actually slept in the cubicle in the children's
7 dorm.

8 **A. She did sleep in a cubicle in SR71's group.**

9 Q. You did mention that the others essentially did not
10 engage with the children, the other Mother Superiors
11 that you knew?

12 **A. Not that I know of. They wouldn't have been as friendly**
13 **as SR172.**

14 Q. Talking -- I think we are maybe on that page, 80080.
15 Just talking about visits to children by family, you
16 mentioned how those who didn't have families of their
17 own or people visiting them you would have taken them
18 home yourself --

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. -- to try to make up for them. I was -- you are talking
21 here at paragraph 8 about a particular child. You can't
22 remember what visits -- visitors came to see her during
23 her time in Nazareth Lodge, but your recollection is
24 that:

25 "Usually visitors came to take the child out for the

1 afternoon or at weekends, but it is also possible that
2 visitors would see the child in the parlour of the home.
3 I would not be present and I didn't supervise visits",
4 as this person alleged that you did. So you didn't
5 have any involvement with the parents or visitors of
6 children?

7 **A. I had no involvement at all.**

8 Q. Save, if I am right, would you have handed the child
9 over to the parents or brought them back in if the
10 parents were returning them?

11 **A. Sometimes we would be out in the field and a parent**
12 **would come up and go to the child and you would say --**
13 **you know, you'd greet them and say "Hello", but that's**
14 **as much -- you didn't have big conversations or anything**
15 **with them.**

16 Q. But you would have seen parents arriving on occasions?

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. I think we have probably dealt with another matter
19 I wanted to talk about, which was meal times, but one
20 thing -- what happened at meal times if a child didn't
21 eat its food?

22 **A. I don't remember a child not eating its food, because**
23 **they were always so hungry and looking for more.**

24 Q. Were meal times rigid? Were there any times if a child
25 was hungry, could they come and get a snack at any time

1 or what was the position?

2 **A. Well, they had their breakfast and then they would have**
3 **a morning drink that would consist of maybe cocoa or**
4 **bread and jam. Then they would have their lunch. They**
5 **came up from school for their lunch. There was some**
6 **outdoor children went to the school. That's when the**
7 **school was built at the corner of the other garden.**
8 **They would have a good meal and then they would have**
9 **a hot drink or whatever in the afternoon when they came**
10 **in, and then they were told to go upstairs and get**
11 **changed into their play clothes. When they got into**
12 **their play clothes, then they came out and they spent**
13 **time outside. Then after that they would have their**
14 **supper and then ready for bed. That was the height of**
15 **the day.**

16 **Q. So if a child was maybe hungry in between any of those**
17 **times, there was nowhere that he could go to get**
18 **something extra to eat or anything like that?**

19 **A. No. I mean, they didn't really ask. I think had they**
20 **asked, they would have got something, you know.**

21 **Q. You said whenever school dinners were introduced that**
22 **they were brought in from outside. Is that right?**

23 **A. Well, I thought they were brought from outside. There**
24 **were two ladies separate from the rest of the staff and**
25 **I thought they came from the Education Department and**

1 **they served the dinners. So that gave me the impression**
2 **that --**

3 Q. They came from outside?

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. I was asking whether the staff and nuns ate the same
6 food as children, because at 80080 at paragraph 6 there
7 you said that the food was prepared in the same kitchen
8 and whenever you were in Ballyhornan, the nuns would
9 have eaten the same as the children when on holiday. So
10 I was wondering if that meant that the staff and nuns
11 ate different food to the children.

12 **A. No, we got the same kind of food as the children got.**

13 Q. But you didn't eat at the same time. Is that right?

14 **A. We didn't eat at the same time.**

15 Q. Just generally again on that same page at paragraph 7
16 I was asking about medical treatment, and you said that
17 children were taken out to the doctor. Again that was
18 something that the staff did. They were told by the
19 nuns, "Take So-and-So to his doctor's appointment". Is
20 that right?

21 **A. We have would have been asked to take -- if a child**
22 **won't well, to take him to the doctor, or else if**
23 **a child was really, really sick, then the doctor would**
24 **be brought out to him.**

25 Q. The doctor came to Nazareth Lodge?

1 **A. Yes, to the house.**

2 Q. Do you ever remember any of the children being ill?

3 **A. Not really. No, I don't. They might have had upset**
4 **stomachs or something, but I never remember any of them**
5 **being under a doctor or anything.**

6 Q. Certainly up until 1975 you don't remember
7 social workers taking children for their medical
8 appointments or anything like that?

9 **A. No, I don't, no.**

10 Q. At SNB-80011, paragraph 31, if we just -- this is --
11 again you referring to -- and you'll be aware that some
12 boys said that you threatened them by threatening to put
13 them into an industrial machine, washing machine, and
14 turn it on. You are describing the laundry here. You
15 say:

16 "The laundry room was outside the main house. There
17 was a lady who was in charge of the laundry room.

18 I recall her name was NL 178 . The door to the
19 laundry room would be locked when she wasn't there.

20 I didn't have a key. I would have gone to the laundry
21 room a few times every week, mainly to wash woollens,

22 which were done by hand. NL 178 would be there. On

23 other occasions I would have left in some clothes to be
24 washed, or occasionally I would have picked up some

25 clothes after they had been washed and ironed. I do not

1 recall any occasion on which I would have gone to the
2 laundry room specifically with NL5. It is possible that
3 she would have been there when I came into the laundry
4 on occasion, but we worked with separate groups of
5 children and I would only come across her occasionally,
6 most commonly during the supervision of children at meal
7 times."

8 You go on to talk about the person named there, but
9 you did say that you had to help out in the laundry
10 sometimes when they were short staffed, NL5 (sic). So
11 --

12 **A. Sometimes when the laundry was carried in, ^{NL 178} wasn't**
13 **able to cope with it, you now. She would be ironing,**
14 **putting the sheets through a big roller. Well, I'd go**
15 **over and help, take the things out and help her fold**
16 **them and that, you know.**

17 Q. What about children in the laundry? What access did
18 they have to the laundry?

19 **A. Children weren't allowed in the laundry. They weren't**
20 **-- it was just they were forbidden to go into the**
21 **laundry.**

22 Q. You were telling me that Monday was wash-day for things
23 like the woollens.

24 **A. That's correct, yes.**

25 Q. And that's the day you would have gone down and you

1 might have come across NL5 when she was doing the same
2 for her group.

3 **A. That's right.**

4 Q. I was asking about chores, and you talked -- the police
5 asked you about this when they interviewed you at 60951
6 to 60952. Now I am not going to call up the pages, but
7 you did tell the police that the children had to polish
8 the corridor before going to school in the morning.

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. You described to the police that they weren't big chores
11 that they were asked to do, although I think you gave
12 the description of them putting a cloth on their feet --

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. -- to do the polishing. When we were talking, you were
15 saying to me that that was to keep them occupied before
16 --

17 **A. School.**

18 Q. -- before school. Each group had its own section on the
19 floor that had to be polished.

20 **A. That's right.**

21 Q. While you didn't see it as a big chore or a big section,
22 you would accept that for a child that might have seemed
23 like a very big section --

24 **A. A big mountain, yes.**

25 Q. -- a big mountain, as you described it for children.

1 I was wondering, I mean, were there other big chores
2 that the children had to do at the weekends when they
3 were off school?

4 **A. No. The chores on the weekends was as much as what they**
5 **would do during the week, you know. It was never --**
6 **really not -- we had it all done. The staff would do**
7 **most of the heavy work.**

8 Q. One person who has spoken to us talked about having to
9 wax the floors in the chapel at the weekends.

10 **A. I don't ever recall a child ever having to do that,**
11 **never, you know.**

12 Q. Now just again when you were talking to the police, you
13 said that you and the Sister in charge we were talking
14 about had 25 to 30 people and that it was sometimes very
15 difficult to control the children --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- especially in the dining room. Do you think that was
18 because, although they were partitioned off, the boys
19 were all together? Were they sort of --

20 **A. They were probably excitable, you know, but at that time**
21 **we didn't look at it that way. They were just a wee bit**
22 **wild and it was awfully hard to control them.**

23 Q. That was the time of day that it was hardest to control
24 them, in the dining room?

25 **A. In the dining room, yes.**

1 Q. Paragraph 52 -- I think it is the same statement -- you
2 talk about bath time. That's page 80017 -- 16. Sorry.
3 We have nearly got to it, because I can see we are
4 scrolling down here. Yes, paragraph 52. You said --
5 this is again when you were being asked by police about
6 allegations that were being made about bath time and you
7 go on to say that:

8 "Usually there would be a number of people present
9 when the children were being bathed. There were two
10 sides to each bathroom and there would have been other
11 staff members present bathing other children at the same
12 time."

13 I was asking you a little bit about this, and in
14 your police interview you gave them the comment that you
15 weren't sure, but you thought there were showers after
16 the refurbishment, but initially the baths took place
17 downstairs in what was called a changing room. Is that
18 right?

19 **A. That's correct, yes, and when they renovated, then the**
20 **bathrooms were different. I did think there were**
21 **showers there --**

22 Q. But they may have been baths?

23 **A. -- but to tell you the truth I'm not sure now, but we**
24 **did have a bath, and when the baths were doing on, the**
25 **two groups could have been there. So there was always**

1 **somebody in the bathroom.**

2 Q. And you do -- you spoke about this again to police in
3 2012, and you said that there was one bath for all the
4 children and the water -- one set of water.

5 **A. That was when it was the changing room downstairs.**

6 Q. Downstairs, before the refurbishment.

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. And they were bathed once a week.

9 **A. That's right.**

10 Q. I asked you: was Jeyes Fluid ever used in the bath that
11 you remember?

12 **A. Never. I don't even think it was used on any of the
13 floors either, you know, but I know that it definitely
14 was not used in the bath.**

15 Q. The only knowledge you have is that SR34 you thought
16 used it for staining the attic floor?

17 **A. That's correct, yes.**

18 Q. I asked also what the position was with children who got
19 head lice, and you say they were fine-tooth combed and
20 there was a solution put on their head, but it wasn't
21 Jeyes Fluid that was used.

22 **A. Oh, definitely not, no.**

23 Q. In paragraph 53 here you also talk about the children
24 being given malt every day, which was seen as a tonic.

25 I was wondering when was that administered to the

1 children? Was that --

2 **A. Straight after their breakfast every day.**

3 Q. So after breakfast did they come up and there was a
4 great big jar and a spoon?

5 **A. They came in, got into a queue and they got a spoonful
6 of malt every day.**

7 Q. Did any of the children ever refuse to take the malt?

8 **A. They never refused to take it. I never knew that any of
9 them didn't like it. They got it every day.**

10 Q. At one stage when you were being interviewed by the
11 police there was mention of treacle. You don't remember
12 treacle ever being in the home at that stage. Is it
13 possible the treacle and malt might have got mixed up?

14 **A. Probably it did get mixed up.**

15 Q. Now, NL4, I read at the start the paragraph where you
16 denied the allegations that were being -- that had been
17 put to the Inquiry and to the police, and you denied
18 ever using a cane or stick, but you accepted that you
19 slapped children and that you used a ruler. You told
20 the police when you were interviewed in 1996 that you
21 said that was probably on the leg or on the bottom.
22 That's at -- I am not going to call it up -- but it is
23 page 60514. I was asking if you could describe this
24 ruler, NL4. What exactly is it that we are talking
25 about?

1 **A. It was just an ordinary wooden ruler. I don't know if**
2 **it was the same size as the -- it could have been about**
3 **the size of that top there, you know, but ...**
4 **(gesturing).**

5 Q. You say that it was just lying around?

6 **A. It would have been just lying there on the top. So you**
7 **just picked it up on a spontaneous thing, you know. You**
8 **didn't carry it around with you.**

9 Q. Do you know why it was kept in the children's area as
10 opposed to in the school, because a ruler would normally
11 be in the school?

12 **A. I really don't. I really don't know honestly unless --**
13 **SR71 was like an artist and she may have been -- but**
14 **I don't know.**

15 Q. But it was certainly there on more than one occasion?

16 **A. It was there, yes. It was there.**

17 Q. And you would have used it more than once?

18 **A. On several occasion it would have been there.**

19 Q. Now did you -- when you were speaking to the police
20 in -- at SNB 60955 -- again I don't need to pull this up
21 -- but you told them you had to have a certain amount of
22 strictness with the children --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- and it was just continuous trying to keep them in
25 control.

1 **A. It was actually.**

2 Q. Can I just explore that a little bit with you, NL4? We
3 didn't really talk about this, because -- is that how
4 you saw your role was to keep these children in check,
5 to keep them in control?

6 **A. Just -- we were just to keep -- make sure that they**
7 **didn't get into any harm or mischief, and, for instance,**
8 **the Marion group was above the sick bay of the nuns, and**
9 **with the children's feet pounding on the ground and**
10 **that, the nun in charge of the sick bay would, "Keep**
11 **those children under control". So, you know, you**
12 **were --**

13 Q. You had to keep them quiet?

14 **A. Well, as quiet as possible, yes.**

15 Q. You told the police -- again I am not going to go to
16 this -- when you were first interviewed at 60584 -- the
17 police were reading you an extract from the Voluntary
18 Homes Regulations, the piece of law governing voluntary
19 homes, which said that punishment was only to be
20 administered by the person in charge of the home. Your
21 point to them was well, you just did it spontaneously.
22 For example, you gave the example to the police that if
23 a child was going wild in the dining room and not
24 sitting down and listening while they were waiting for
25 their meals, or they would maybe run across the table or

1 pick up a chair to throw at somebody else, and that was
2 the kind of boisterous behaviour that they were engaging
3 in.

4 **A. Yes. It was awful sometimes.**

5 Q. You said that there were four or five in the dining room
6 trying to cater for your groups.

7 **A. That's right.**

8 Q. Those were essentially lay staff and one nun.

9 **A. That's correct.**

10 Q. You talked about this partitioning. You could see what
11 was happening in another section. So I was asking you
12 if -- say, for example, you were up getting your food
13 for your children and your children were misbehaving.
14 Who would have chastised them at that point?

15 **A. I think the nun probably would have told them to sit**
16 **down and behave, but it didn't go any further than that,**
17 **you know. Once they got their plate in front of them**
18 **they settled down.**

19 Q. So it was just -- the difficult time was before they got
20 the food?

21 **A. For waiting, yes. You couldn't let them go up and carry**
22 **it down themselves, because otherwise they would be**
23 **pushing into each other and maybe get burnt, you know.**

24 Q. Just talking about toys, because you know a lot of
25 people have said toys were taken off them, if we can

1 just look at your statement at SNB-80080, paragraph 6,
2 again this is in relation to somebody who was
3 complaining about you, but you do recall from time to
4 time children would have been given toys as gifts when
5 they went to Christmas parties outside the home and it
6 is also true that toys would have been taken from the
7 children and not left in the dormitories.

8 "However, the toys would have been left in another
9 room and the children could have played with them at
10 certain times."

11 You say that you actually remember going home at
12 Christmas.

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. I was asking you a little bit about the toys apart from
15 the Christmas party toys. You made the point to me that
16 children weren't allowed to have personal belongings in
17 the home, that there was nowhere for them to keep
18 personal belongings. So things such as toys were for
19 all of the children. Is that right?

20 **A. For the children in the group, that particular group.**

21 Q. And I was -- I was wondering if, for example, if a child
22 had been out with its parents and was given or out with
23 a family they were visiting and came back with, say,
24 a teddy bear, what would happen to it?

25 **A. It could have been put on its bed for a while, not for**

1 **the whole duration of time, but for -- till they got**
2 **used to it being there and then it would be put into the**
3 **box with the rest of the toys.**

4 Q. I was wondering if a child would have been allowed to
5 take that teddy bear to bed with them?

6 A. **I don't recall them bringing toys into bed with them.**

7 Q. Okay. Now, NL4, those are some of the general matters.
8 You have seen that I have only just gone to a few
9 paragraphs --

10 A. **Yes.**

11 Q. -- in your inquiry statement, but you can rest assured
12 that all of the statements that you have given to the
13 Inquiry have been read in full. I don't propose to go
14 into them in any more detail.

15 There have been a number of individuals who have
16 complained about you and, with one exception, those
17 allegations were of you physically abusing children by
18 striking them, including using implements other than
19 a ruler; allegations of force feeding them, including
20 making them eat their own vomit; threatening them,
21 including threatening to put them into the washing
22 machine and threatening to put it on; name calling;
23 assaulting those who wet the bed; and locking children
24 in rooms; and being unpleasant about their families.

25 Now you have denied all of those allegations and you

1 have dealt with them each individually in the statement
2 that you have provided -- the statements that you have
3 provided to the Inquiry, and when those allegations were
4 put to you by police, you dealt with each and every one
5 of them at that time.

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. Just to be clear, you completely deny those allegations.
8 Isn't that right?

9 **A. I deny them.**

10 Q. But fourteen people have spoken to the Inquiry, seven of
11 whom also spoke to the police, and there were another
12 seven individuals complained to police. So that was
13 a total of 21 people. As I said, you have addressed all
14 of these allegations, but those seven -- sorry -- the
15 fourteen who spoke to the Inquiry, when they gave
16 evidence, I am going to go through what they said in
17 their evidence so that you can comment --

18 **A. Right.**

19 Q. -- or say anything you want to say about what they told
20 us. All right?

21 Now I am going to have to use the names so that you
22 know who I am talking about, but I just want to remind
23 people none of these names are to be used outside this
24 room.

25 The first of the children I am going to talk about

1 was HIA16. That's HIA16. His statement can be found at
2 SNB-396 to 399. Now was unable to actually come
3 personally to speak to the Inquiry. So I simply
4 outlined what he said in his statement and what you said
5 in response to that. That is on the Inquiry record.

6 The next person I want to talk about was HIA56. He
7 is HIA56. His statement can be found at SNB-464 to 477.
8 I am not going to call up any of these statements, but
9 I am going to go to the transcript of what they told us
10 when they came to speak to us. HIA56's transcript is at
11 SNB-90212, first of all. Sorry. Can we have
12 page 90212? Thank you. I think I have got the right
13 page here. I will just double-check. This is -- they
14 were -- HIA56 made a complaint to the Inquiry that you
15 said things about his mother, and he said that -- about
16 -- in his statement he said that they cheered when they
17 saw you leave the home on one occasion. He said:

18 "You knew to stay out of her way in order to avoid
19 being beaten."

20 Can we just go through this? Can we scroll on down,
21 please? He said that other people in the home were
22 terrified of you and he named a person who I think is
23 NL 175 . Do you remember an NL 175 in the
24 home?

25 **A. I do.**

1 Q. He said she was also terrified -- she was the one person
2 who stood up to you in the home. That doesn't -- you
3 don't ever remember having any --

4 **A. I didn't have any disagreements with any lay person in**
5 **the home.**

6 Q. I go on to say that:

7 "You say that NL4 actually hated your mother.

8 **A. Yes. Jealous."**

9 **I said:**

10 "She was jealous of her. You have described how
11 your mother used to come to the home",

12 and HIA56 said:

13 "Because she was quite elegant and arrived ..."

14 and he said :

15 "She was jealous."

16 Then I put what you said in your Inquiry statement
17 about all of this and he said his mother wasn't a shop
18 assistant. You were telling me you thought she might
19 have been, because she came up on a Wednesday, which was
20 half-day closing.

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. She called -- his mum called to see him twice a week.
23 Scroll on down. Scroll on down, please. I am just
24 reading. He said that NL5 didn't actually have a group
25 when he was there.

1 **A. NL5 was with St. Joseph's group.**

2 Q. Is it poss... -- was St. Joseph's a smaller group than
3 the others? No?

4 **A. No. It was just as big.**

5 Q. Same size?

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. He says he thought you helped out in Marion's group.
8 I put it to him that you had said you didn't have any
9 reason to go into any of the other dormitories only your
10 own group. He said:

11 "That's probably -- she probably had no authority to
12 do that, but she did."

13 He said:

14 "Some of the nuns were scared of her. The nuns were
15 scared of her", he said, "but not SR134."

16 SR134 wasn't scared of you. If we can scroll on
17 down, you said that you only checked those children who
18 might have any -- might need to get up to go to the
19 toilet. He says no, you checked every child, whether
20 you wet the bed or not.

21 "If you weren't asleep or if anything -- or if your
22 head wasn't covered, you sort of got slapped. This was
23 at the height of summer. We had no curtains on the
24 windows and the sun was shining through and we couldn't
25 sleep."

1 So did you ever slap children for not being able to
2 get to sleep?

3 **A. No, I didn't.**

4 Q. Can we scroll on down? He said -- he -- I described to
5 him how you said you punished children by slapping them
6 on the legs or occasionally on the bottom. He said:

7 "No, it was a bit rougher than that."

8 I put it to him that you said you weren't overly
9 physical with any child. He said that you were. He
10 said you didn't like this particular child. I think
11 it's DL175 -- NL174. Do you remember a child NL174?

12 **A. I don't.**

13 Q. He said he was able to answer you back. Those were the
14 ones that ended up in Muckamore, I think NL174 and
15 DL175. Do you remember him?

16 **A. I remember DL175, yes.**

17 Q. He said:

18 "There was a whole host of them and they never even
19 got to go to Kircubbin. So there were two of these boys
20 ended up in Muckamore."

21 Do you remember that happening?

22 **A. No, I don't.**

23 Q. Okay, and he said that you rubbed this child's face when
24 he messed the bed in the mess.

25 **A. No.**

1 Q. I know you deny that. But if we can just go on down,
2 please. This was an incident I think involving --
3 unfortunately the version that we have here is fully
4 redacted, but I think this was -- let me just check.
5 Can I just have that page reference now, please? 90217.
6 Yes. This is -- yes. This is -- I am going to have to
7 read this, because obviously the page that we have put
8 in has been edited out, NL4,

13 **A. It is possible, yes.**

14 Q. -- because what HIA56 said is that -- I was putting to
15 him your statement that

19

20 HIA56's point was:

21

1 So basically what he was saying is that in the way
2 you

12 Q. No. Sorry. If we can just go back -- I think this may
13 prove a little bit difficult -- but page 90218. I think
14 we have dealt with that, have we? 90218. Yes.

 Sorry. I think we have dealt what with that
17 where he said you were jealous of his mother. Were you
18 jealous of his mother?

19 **A. No. How would I be jealous of his mother? She was
20 quite an attractive -- she was beautifully ...**

21 Q. I think that was his point, that she was a very elegant,
22 well-dressed woman --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q.

25 He is saying that's why you were jealous, that

1 you didn't match up to her looks, if I can put it ...

2 **A. I wasn't one who overly dressed or anything, you know.**

3 Q. But I think -- I am maybe not making it clear, NL4, but
4 he was saying because you didn't match up to his mother
5 in looks, you were jealous of her.

6 **A. He thought I -- I was never jealous of anyone.**

7 Q. And he said that after his mother would leave:

8 "... she would take it out on me, punch me and say,
9 'Who does she think she is coming up like that?' because
10 she was ."

11 **A. No, that's not true.**

12 Q. He remembered going up on a bus to visit your mother he
13 thought for tea. Did you take him to your mother's?

14 **A. I could have taken him, yes.**

15 Q. He said whoever was there and he said "her sister". He
16 said that was quite regular that you did do that. He
17 then went on to talk about the nuns.

18 If I can go then to the next person to speak to the
19 Inquiry and that's another [name redacted]. This is
20 HIA19. His statement can be found -- he is HIA56 (sic).
21 His statement is at SNB-464 to 477. Sorry. He is
22 reference 19. I beg your pardon. I have given the
23 wrong page reference. I have given HIA56's again.
24 Sorry. HIA19 is HIA19, SNB-405 to 415, and the
25 transcript of his evidence, if we can look at it, and

1 hopefully it won't be as heavily redacted, 1 is 91206 to
2 91207. Yes. I think this is -- scroll on down, please.
3 This is -- yes. He is saying that he wasn't in your
4 group, that you described his parents as
5 I am not sure he is making that allegation about you or
6 NL5 here, but in any event he said:

7 "There were two lay members of staff. NL5 and NL4
8 were employed to look after the children. They used to
9 take us into the laundry and they would lift us and put
10 us into the laundry and would turn -- put us into the
11 machine and close the lids for a few minutes and say
12 they were going to turn it on. They obviously never
13 did, but it left you in fear and squealing, yelling and
14 crying. It gave us nightmares."

15 If we just scroll on down, please, it is put to him
16 that:

17 "It is not clear from this, but it seems you -- you
18 seem to be suggesting that these two women did this
19 together, that they both took you into the laundry at
20 the same time."

21 That's what you addressed in your statement to the
22 Inquiry, that you and NL5 were not in the laundry at the
23 same time. Isn't that right?

24 **A. That's right.**

25 Q. But he says that is a misunderstanding.

1 "It was separate times. They wasn't together in the
2 laundry. It was separate occasions."

3 So he is saying what was in the Inquiry statement
4 was wrong. He is telling -- saying that you did it on
5 occasions and NL5 did it on occasions, but it wasn't
6 that the two of you were doing it together. You were
7 doing it separately. I said:

8 "Each of them did it to you?"

9 He said:

10 "Uh-huh. It was done to me, yes."

11 So is there anything you want to say?

12 **A. There was never a time I took a child to the laundry to**
13 **threaten them about machines, never.**

14 Q. If we can scroll on down, please, he didn't remember the
15 name of NL 178 and he said:

16 "It was definitely a big machine, a big copper
17 machine. It wasn't switched on. It was just closed and
18 then lifted up again. So obviously you weren't
19 suffocated. If you were put in it, you wouldn't be dead
20 at all. Of course, that's why I am here."

21 So he is not saying this was anything more than
22 a threat. There was never anything more than that done.
23 If we can scroll on down, I think the next page actually
24 would be page 12 to 14. 91212. Once again:

25 "She did do it. She did smack me with a ruler."

1 He says that you did smack him. This again I should
2 say is HIA19 speaking. I put it to him -- he said you
3 were interviewed by police. If we can scroll on down
4 to -- he said:

5 "I am not" --

6 Again he says:

7 "I'm not suggesting that at all. It was just one
8 person brought us in -- brought me in anyway and done
9 that to me. I remember that incident."

10 Again this is about placing him inside the machine,
11 closing the door for a few seconds. Your statement is
12 being put to him again. If we can scroll on down. He
13 said -- I said:

14 "You would accept that NL4 wasn't in charge of your
15 group?"

16 He said:

17 "Not in charge of ours, but again NL4 came into our
18 group from time to time, you know. I have seen her
19 there."

20 You say you never went into any other group?

21 **A. Only when I was working there. I sometimes worked in**
22 **Our Lady's group when I came back and they would give**
23 **me -- say, "Would you work there?, "Would you work**
24 **here?" but I never ever went into the group --**

25 **Q. That you weren't working in?**

1 **A. -- that I wasn't working in.**

2 Q. He said -- he said:

3 "I can't remember what group NL4 was in, to be
4 honest with you. I don't remember the group.

5 I'm trying to -- it's a long time ago. No, I can't
6 remember the lady's name."

7 I was asking who was in charge of this group. If we
8 can scroll on down, I think that was probably the end of
9 what he had to say about you in his evidence to us. So
10 he was correcting the mistake that was in his statement
11 --

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- that you and NL5 both took him to the laundry at the
14 one time, but you certainly didn't take him to the
15 laundry at any time?

16 **A. No, at any time.**

17 Q. The next person is HIA21. He is HIA21. He -- his
18 statement is at SNB-631 to 647, but the transcript, if
19 we look at this, please, is at 90969 and onwards. HIA21
20 was explaining, if we can scroll on down, that -- just
21 there -- going through the allegations that he was
22 making about you and he was saying that:

23 "The physical abuse consisted of her pinching and
24 kicking me in addition to being physically force fed.
25 She degraded and humiliated me in front of other

1 children."

2 He talks about the communal dining room:

3 "In most cases stew was the main diet, which I had
4 a huge dislike for."

5 Was there a variety in the diet, NL4? I didn't ask
6 you about that when I asking about meal times?

7 **A. There was a variety. They might have had stew once
8 a week.**

9 Q. What else would they have been fed?

10 **A. They would have got chicken and various -- they never
11 got stew every day, and chicken. What else? They would
12 have got -- I don't think they would have got stake now,
13 but they would have got maybe sausage or something.
14 There was a variety of things that they got.**

15 Q. He talks about -- I'm just going scroll on down, because
16 I'm just reading from his statement here. Scroll on
17 down, please. I think this has also been redacted. He
18 says -- he goes on -- he said:

19 "I can explain ..."

20 He was talking to me. He says:

21 "Nazareth House was being renovated or Bethlehem.
22 We actually lived in what was called a concert hall."

23 Is there a period of time whenever the boys lived in
24 the concert hall when there was building work going on?

25 **A. It is possible, but I wasn't there when that --**

1 Q. "That would have been", he says, "the early '60s.

2 I can't be precise but certainly I would say from '62
3 anyway",

4 and you were working in that environment in that
5 hall, he said, in the concert hall?

6 **A. No, I wouldn't have been. I wasn't -- I don't remember
7 the concert hall.**

8 Q. "... and I was one of those children who was in that
9 hall.

10 So, I mean, for her to suggest that she only worked
11 from '66 to '68, I mean, that may be the case, but the
12 fact she left on numerous occasions during the course of
13 my time that I grouped something like five years as what
14 I endured from her, it doesn't cause me to say from '64
15 to '68 that she abused me constantly. It is during
16 a period of five years while she was there that
17 I suffered under her."

18 So I was putting him you said you were away from
19 Nazareth Lodge for periods of time.

20 **A. I was.**

21 Q. He said that might be the case, but in the five years
22 you were there, he is saying he suffered under you. If
23 we can just scroll on down, please. There again was
24 discussion about -- he remembers it was a five-year
25 period in his life that he recalls having had trouble

1 with you, and he was, first of all, in Sacred Heart's
2 group. I think that's SR 154 I think was the
3 nun in charge of -- of Sacred Hearts.

4 "When she arrived -- I think it was '66 -- or maybe
5 it was SR172 -- as Mother, she transferred me into the
6 Marions group, which was -- which NL4 was in charge of.
7 So NL4 would have known me before I went to the Marions.
8 So, therefore, I was in Sacred Hearts at least four
9 years where I remember NL4, and then I stayed in the
10 Marions for two years thereafter before I left in '68."

11 Now this is HIA21 saying this. So he is saying he
12 was in Sacred Heart group and then a nun arrived, and
13 I think SR172 we know arrived in 1965. So he is saying
14 he was then transferred into Marions group at that time.
15 Do you remember boys being transferred between groups,
16 NL4?

17 **A. No, I don't. Honestly I don't remember them being**
18 **transferred, but it's possible that if one group had too**
19 **many, maybe one of them would have been, you know.**

20 Q. Okay. If we can scroll on down, please. Again I'm
21 reading from his statement. He's talking about pillow
22 fights and about you punching him in the stomach and
23 stamping on his bare feet, which caused the big toe to
24 bleed. If we can scroll on down. He said that his
25 sheet was stained with blood, which resulted in being

1 beaten again by you and being put into a cold shower.
2 If we can scroll down. Scroll on down, please. He
3 talks about the colour coding, about Our Lady's being
4 red, Sacred Hearts blue, Marions green and St. Joseph's
5 yellow. Your colours are a bit different, but I don't
6 think --

7 **A. It was Our Lady's would be blue, because it is Our**
8 **Lady's group. Sacred Heart would be red because of the**
9 **Sacred Heart and --**

10 Q. He may have got the colours round in the wrong order but
11 certainly they were the right colours anyway.

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. Sorry. Just going on down, please, if we may, he is
14 again talking to you. He said the biggest factor for
15 him was when he was transferred from Sacred Heart to
16 Marions. That was the start of his nightmare:

17 "... because I knew what NL4 was like before. To be
18 actually under her wing was actually going to be
19 devastating and it proved to be the point."

20 If we can scroll on down, again he is talking about
21 various things. I put to him:

22 "Any opportunity you did get a chance to talk to the
23 nuns [you were] always present",

24 and he said:

25 "It was purely a fear factor."

1 He said:

2 "Very much so. This person as far as I'm concerned,
3 I mean, was totally unsuitable to look after children
4 and the fact that we as children were in fear of her,
5 I mean, you could see it in our eyes. I had great
6 difficulty in liaising with her in any shape or form or
7 even warming to her, because there was a vicious streak
8 in her. I actually think she was a psychopath, that
9 she'd a split personality. The fact she had left the
10 home on numerous occasions would tell you there is
11 something different there. I felt it was an opportunity
12 for the nuns at any time when she did leave whether to
13 have her back or not. The fact she was allowed back was
14 detrimental to the children who were left behind."

15 So basically he was saying, NL4, that he felt there
16 was -- you know, the fact you were leaving the home was
17 saying something about -- he was implying there was some
18 reason for your leaving other than your own personal
19 choice.

20 **A.**

21 **there's**
22 **no way that I would have done those things to any child,**
23 **you know.**

24 Q. If we can scroll on down, please. Again I am reading
25 from his statement to him and I am just -- scroll on

1 down just. I am just going to give what extra answers
2 he has given other than above what was in his statement,
3 NL4. He talks about the last day. Just if we can
4 scroll back up slightly, please:

5 "Q. You describe the Lodge as a mainly happy
6 environment with the exception of this one member of
7 staff."

8 He talks about the last day he was in Nazareth
9 Lodge. At this point when he is talking to us, NL4, he
10 gets very emotional. I ask him if he needs a break. He
11 says:

12 "It's okay. I know what happened to me as a child
13 in Nazareth Lodge and NL4 knows what happened to me. To
14 leave Nazareth Lodge to me as the biggest
15 disappointment, because it was my home, and I was only
16 too glad to tell NL4 how I felt as a child that I was
17 leaving her behind, and for that reason alone I wanted
18 to make sure she knew where I was coming from.
19 I actually ran into the bus after she hit me.

20 I mean, for the Order to recognise that they are
21 responsible for hiring staff such as NL4 and accept that
22 anybody hurt by staff would be totally inappropriate and
23 unacceptable is commendable, but nevertheless NL4
24 through the Order abused me for those years and I am
25 very disappointed that NL4 has taken the decision to

1 rebut these allegations that I'm making, knowing it has
2 actually -- knowing it actually has impacted me even
3 further to this day now. It did happen to me. I
4 actually feel sorry for her and I pray for her."

5 So he is insistent that you treated him in the way
6 that he's described to the Inquiry, NL4.

7 **A. I couldn't have treated him in that way.**

8 Q. If we just scroll down, please. He also talks about
9 having met you on an occasion and he said:

10 "I never thought I would meet this woman ever again
11 but hoping one day I would. She was actually walking in
12 the same street I lived and I made a point of going to
13 see her, because I felt I had to get it all off my
14 chest. I felt I had done it in a very controlled
15 manner, although I was an angry young man. I was 17, 18
16 or 19. Nonetheless I made my point to her that she did
17 leave a mark on me, but she didn't recall me. She
18 didn't even remember my name. That says more about her
19 than me."

20 **A. I don't remember him talking to me in the street.**

21 Q. He also -- he is not somebody who spoke to the police
22 and he explains why he didn't do that. If we can scroll
23 on down, he said:

24 "I still respected those people who genuinely looked
25 after me both in Nazareth and Rubane. NL4 knows what

1 she's done and the fact she has to live with that."

2 Then I put to him what you said in your inquiry
3 statement. If we can scroll on down, please, to --
4 I think the next page is probably -- just here. He made
5 an allegation about you, NL4, that you had thrown
6 a child down the stairs and told a nun that the child
7 had fallen. You didn't address that in your Inquiry
8 statement. So I'm offering you the opportunity to say
9 did you ever do that?

10 **A. I never threw a child down the stairs, never, you know.**
11 **I mean, sure you could never have got away with**
12 **anything. I just don't know where he is getting that**
13 **from.**

14 Q. You say:

15 "The fact is what she did to me in the dining room,
16 and what she did to me in Ballyhornan, and what she did
17 to that child and what she did to me on the day I left,
18 of course she is going to deny it. The fact that she
19 has not recognised what she did in Ballyhornan itself is
20 testimony to her that -- the fact that she has ignored
21 it because she done it, the fact that I couldn't report
22 or go to the nuns is -- that was fear because of her.

23 I mean, she was . I was with
24 her 24/7. I didn't have the courage or conviction to go
25 and face the nun, and whether the nuns would believe me

1 or not was neither here nor there. The fact that I was
2 in fear of her as a young child, vulnerable child, what
3 else would you expect other than a child would suppress
4 himself into himself and that's exactly what I did.

5 So I am taken aback a bit by the fact that she is
6 not acknowledging what she has done on me. While she
7 acknowledged she may have known of me, it is just being
8 cosmetic. I mean, it is an insult to me and my
9 intelligence."

10 So HIA21 was quite cross, NL4, that he felt you were
11 not owning up to what he said you had done to him.

12 **A. There was not a thing I did to him. I never. I deny**
13 **all those things.**

14 Q. Then at page 90994, if we can just look at that. This
15 again is still HIA21. This is -- as I explained to you,
16 NL4, when I finish asking you questions, the Panel will
17 have some questions for you. That's what happens with
18 each witness. So Ms Doherty was asking HIA21:

19 "Can I ask when you were in Marions and NL4 was
20 obviously in charge, were there other staff around that
21 were there regularly as well?"

22 He says:

23 "There would have been staff on the next -- same
24 level in Sacred Hearts."

25 He talks about the nuns and staff member who --

1 "... which was originally my group, which I missed
2 immensely to be moved. I don't know why. Only the nuns
3 can answer that, but I think maybe I might have been
4 boisterous. So maybe it was my own downfall, my own
5 fault.

6 In regard to NL4, as far as I am concerned, this
7 woman knew exactly what she was doing, but when the nun
8 in my time", which was SR 154 , "was in that
9 queue in charge of that group, she would go" -- if we
10 can scroll on down -- "she would go to prayer time or
11 meal time. That NL4 -- it was like changing a clock.
12 She'd more faces than the Albert Clock. She was
13 ruthless. That's why I felt that I was vulnerable,
14 exposed.

15 Now the nuns didn't expose her to me deliberately.
16 They were not -- I don't think they were conscious of
17 what she was doing --
18 when the nuns left that she would come in and dominate
19 our life or dominate certainly my life to the extent
20 that she did."

21 Miss Doherty said:

22 "You talked about fear in your eyes and the fear in
23 other children's eyes in relation",

24 and would ask if the nun would have recognised
25 that. He said he didn't think the nuns would have

1 picked up:

2 "Maybe they had other chores or whatever, but the
3 fact we were afraid to talk to the nuns."

4 "Then you go to the likes ..."

5 He talks about the nun being like a mother figure to
6 him:

7 "Then you go to the likes of NL4, who are the
8 coldest and no love in her at all, but only just
9 controlled in the physical sense. That in itself" -- if
10 we can scroll on down -- "was a factor in how we had
11 fear in our eyes."

12 So he is saying, NL4, that the nuns didn't know what
13 you were doing, that the children were too fearful to
14 say to the nuns what you were doing to them, and you did
15 these things to children whenever the nuns weren't
16 about.

17 **A. That's not true. There's no way I could have done all
18 those things.**

19 Q. Well, NL4, the next person is HIA104. He is HIA104.
20 His statement is at SNB-492 to 499. The transcript is
21 at SNB-91253. If we can just scroll on down, he is
22 talking here about NL5. If we can just scroll on down.
23 He remembers -- yes.

24 "There was one occasion" --

25 He was asked:

1 "There was one occasion when you had a problem with
2 NL4. You were in the dormitory and she was hitting you.
3 Can you remember why she was hitting you?"

4 He said:

5 "No. Well, if it's in the dormitory, it must have
6 been something to do with the beds or something",
7 but he didn't remember why you were hitting him,
8 but what he remembers was that NL5 came in and spoke to
9 you. This is in relation to he thought that NL5 came in
10 to tell you that -- in his Inquiry statement he said
11 mother but he clarifies that it was your father had
12 died, and that NL5 came in and you left in tears. If we
13 can just scroll on down, what you said about that was
14 put to him in interview. If we can scroll on down,
15 please, he said:

16 "This seems to be -- the two of them together, two
17 stories ..."

18 There were two allegations he was making and somehow
19 the two allegations got put into one allegation, and he
20 was trying to clarify that. So if we can just scroll on
21 down, he was saying he wasn't being hit by you in the
22 dormitory at the time that NL5 came in to tell you --
23 give you news about your father or ask you to come out.
24 He is saying that was a different occasion. He
25 remembers that happening in the home, but he also

1 remembers you hitting him in the dormitory. Is there
2 anything you want to say about that at all?

3 **A. My father died in 1973 and my mother died in '74 and**
4 **I was in Manchester when my father died and I was in**
5 **Nazareth Lodge when my mother died, and SR34 -- we were**
6 **going into breakfast and SR34 came to tell me that my**
7 **brother was in the parlour, but it wasn't good news, and**
8 **I went home directly with my brother.**

9 Q. There was no -- do you ever remember any occasion where
10 NL5 came and gave you bad news --

11 **A. Never, no.**

12 Q. -- that might have caused you to cry that might have
13 been interpreted as this?

14 **A. No.**

15 Q. Would the boys have known about your parents' death?

16 **A. I don't know. I mean, they wouldn't have heard it from**
17 **me.**

18 Q. The next person is HIA110. His -- he is HIA110. His
19 statement is at 500 to 508 and the transcript is at
20 91284. Again he is somebody who talked about the
21 washing machine. He said that:

22 "She just turned it on to frighten you."

23 She said -- he said you didn't ever put him into the
24 washing machine. You just lifted up the lid to show
25 where he would go and then turned on the washing

1 machine. He said that came about when all the boys from
2 the dorm had come down to the laundry with their sheets.
3 Did the boys bring their sheets down to the laundry?

4 **A. When the sheets were changed at night after the wet beds**
5 **and all that, they would be put into the one sheet and**
6 **then tied up and then they would be taken down in the**
7 **morning, but it could have been one of the olders boys**
8 **that would take the sheets down and leave them outside**
9 **the door. They were never in the laundry and ^{NL 178} had**
10 **the key to the laundry. So there was nobody got into**
11 **the laundry without ^{NL 178} being there.**

12 Q. I am just wondering -- obviously the drawer sheets you
13 were describing to us would have been put in that pile
14 --

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. -- and that was at 9 o'clock at night. Presumably some
17 boys then did nonetheless wet the bed between 9 o'clock
18 at night and getting up the next morning.

19 **A. But the beds were changed then, you know, and you were**
20 **making the beds up in the morning after they came up**
21 **from breakfast.**

22 Q. Yes.

23 **A. If the bed was wet, it would be changed.**

24 Q. I appreciate that. I am just wondering about the sheets
25 then.

1 **A. They would all --**

2 Q. If you were making the beds, would they have been sent
3 down to the laundry with the sheets or anything, just
4 the older boys?

5 **A. No, I think we would have brought them down, because the**
6 **boys would have been going to school after we made the**
7 **beds up. So we would have brought them down ourselves.**

8 Q. He said -- sorry. I am just -- this was Mr Aiken who
9 was taking him through his evidence.

10 "Q. This came about whenever all the boys in the
11 dorm had to come down to the laundry with their sheets."

12 HIA110 says:

13 "That's right."

14 He then says:

15 "The ones who wet the bed were separated from the
16 ones who didn't wet their bed."

17 Was there a special section in the dormitory for
18 those children who wet the bed?

19 **A. No.**

20 Q. He said:

21 "Q. You say this frightened you?"

22 This was after he says about the business about the
23 washing machine. He said:

24 "The next day I didn't wet the bed. I was
25 frightened."

1 If we can scroll on down, please, he said that you:
2 "... always looked angry, just from looking AT her
3 face, you know, and her face, you know, looking very
4 angry."

5 He was asked if there were ever good times with you
6 that he could remember and he said:

7 "No, no, no, no. It was always bad times.

8 Q. But she wasn't in your group?

9 **A. No, she wasn't.**

10 Q. But you encountered her over the bed sheets and
11 the laundry?

12 **A. Yes, yes.**

13 Q. And at meal times. Is that right?

14 **A. Yes, I didn't eat the meals."**

15 Then he goes on to talk about polishing the floor.
16 It's put to him that it was a one-off occasion that he
17 remembered you threatening him in that way -- if we can
18 just scroll on down -- and he said yes, and it wasn't
19 something that was happening all the time. He confirmed
20 that you never put him in the washing machine, just
21 threatened him to get him to stop wetting the bed. He
22 confirmed he didn't see anybody being put into the
23 washing machine. I think that was really all that he
24 said about you in his evidence. I will just check.
25 Sorry. Just if we can scroll on down, please, through

1 this just up to page -- he talks about waxing the floor
2 with an orange wax. Was it an orange wax that they used
3 for the floor?

4 A. Could have been, you know. It was wax came in a flat
5 sort of tin, but children never had to wax the floor,
6 because we would have waxed it, and then we would
7 have -- there was a rollick. I don't know if you would
8 know what a rollick is. It was a square heavy metal
9 thing and we would have rubbed it in.

10 Q. The boys called it a bumper. Is that what it was
11 called?

12 A. Could have been. They may have called it that, but we
13 called it a rollick. Then the wax was sort of put in,
14 and that's why in the mornings they were going back and
15 forth.

16 Q. To polish the wax off?

17 A. No, the wax would have been off, because there was
18 an electric polisher and it would have been done with
19 that. We may have done it or the lady who did the
20 church may have done it, because she was one of the ones
21 who used this electrical polisher, but then the next day
22 just to give them something to do, they would polish the
23 floor -- the squares -- like a wee square of blanket put
24 under their feet.

25 Q. Okay. Can we just scroll on down, please, here? He

1 said that:

2 "Nearly every day we did it."

3 This is the polishing.

4 **A. That's correct, yes.**

5 Q. That would be right. He said:

6 "It was a big long hall."

7 **A. To them it could have been. It was half of the**
8 **corridor. The corridor was long and it was half the**
9 **corridor, because it was combined of two groups.**

10 Q. He said you would have -- if it wasn't shone properly,
11 he would have got a slap.

12 **A. No, he wouldn't have, because the polisher would have**
13 **gone over that later on in the morning.**

14 Q. He said you would hit across the back of the legs. He
15 did say that. If we just scroll down, your police
16 statement was being put to him and what you said about
17 using a ruler and he said:

18 "Q. She would have used really on the legs or the
19 hands?

20 **A. The hand.**

21 Q. But you describe being hit in the face by her.

22 **A. Yes."**

23 **He said he didn't know why he was saying that.**

24 "Q. But you said the same thing. She didn't show
25 you any love."

1 **He said:**

2 **"No, she didn't.**

3 Q. Or affection.

4 **A. No.**

5 Q. She was not someone you liked being around?

6 **A. No, no, no."**

7 **He talked about pulling clumps out of his head.**

8 **Scroll on down, please. He said that --**

9 **"Now I asked you what you meant by that. Since**
10 **living in Nazareth Lodge the boys talked to each other**
11 **about their time there with NL4 and weren't very**
12 **positive about what they were describing."**

13 **So he is saying he talked to other boys and his**
14 **answer was:**

15 **"No, they weren't. They didn't like her. Think she**
16 **was the worst of the lot."**

17 **He remembers going -- he was working in Milltown**
18 **Cemetery. Do you remember meeting him there?**

19 **A. I do, yes.**

20 Q. He said:

21 **"Yes, I was."**

22 He said he got his own back on you, because you were
23 looking for a particular grave at the bottom meadows and
24 the grave was --

25 "Q. She said to the Inquiry, as I said to you

1 earlier, that she was surprised at you making
2 allegations against her, because she always thought you
3 were being friendly towards her."

4 He said he wasn't. He basically said he sent you on
5 a wild goose chase in Milltown Cemetery, NL4.

6 **A. Any grave that I would be going to in Milltown Cemetery**
7 **I would have known where I was going. It was only after**
8 **my sister passed away six years ago it was more frequent**
9 **that I was in the graveyard and that's when I would have**
10 **seen him.**

11 Q. Might you have been looking for somebody else's grave?

12 **A. No, because I knew -- I knew where my mother's grave**
13 **was. I would only have been going maybe there to my**
14 **grandmother's. I would never have asked HIA110, because**
15 **he was just a worker. You know, I would have gone -- if**
16 **I needed to know about a grave, I would have gone into**
17 **the office.**

18 Q. Well, the next person, NL4, is HIA183, HIA183. He is
19 HIA183. His statement is at SNB-521 to 528. There is
20 a transcript of his evidence relevant to you at
21 SNB-91347.

22 "You talk about another individual" -- again
23 Mr Aiken is questioning him -- "who was a lay civilian
24 worker who came into the home."

25 That's NL4. He said:

1 "She wasn't involved in your group?

2 **A. No.**

3 Q. And that's not someone that you met a lot in the
4 home. Is that fair?

5 **A. That's correct, yes.**

6 Q. On this particular occasion there was a lining
7 up going on to go into the refectory.

8 **A. That's right."**

9 **What he remembers is:**

10 **"I think it was after school we were going in for**
11 **our tea break, sandwiches ..."**

12 **So there was something given to them when they came**
13 **back home from school --**

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- as you were describing.

16 "... and at that particular time I remember there
17 was -- there was a kitchen being built at that
18 particular time and the kitchen had been completed and
19 I remember looking at this. It was a half moon door and
20 I remember looking through. I was mesmerised by the
21 building, you know. I was about 9 or 10 at that
22 particular time. They spent quite a few years building
23 it."

24 Was there a new kitchen built on?

25 **A. There was -- the kitchen never seemed new to me, but**

1 **they maybe would have renovated. I wasn't there when**
2 **they renovated the kitchen.**

3 Q. "I remember sitting looking at it with awe, you know.
4 "This is great", you know. This next minute this person
5 behind me asked me to move on and I looked round again
6 and the next minute she just gave me one big smack and
7 I was off balance.

8 It was right on the face, on the cheek and it stung.
9 It really, really stung and it just knocked me off
10 balance. At that particular time the baby home was
11 being built."

12 Were you there when that was being built ..."

13 **A. No.**

14 Q. "... and I used to hear the mean using foul ..." --

15 **A. Sorry. He may be -- the baby home was nearly always**
16 **there when I was there, but the nursery was rebuilt.**
17 **That's when we got our own section of bedrooms, but**
18 **I wasn't there when it was being built.**

19 Q. "... while the baby home was being built, and I used to
20 hear the mean using the foul language. So I told her
21 the f*** word. I told her -- she asked me what I said
22 and I says, 'I told you to fuck off' and she asked me
23 quite a few times and I denied it. She says to me, 'If
24 you tell me what you said, I'll give you sweets'. So
25 naturally I went -- my eyes were bigger than my mouth,

1 you know. So I told her what I told her -- what I said.

2 I was to go out to Hollywood that weekend and she
3 reported ..."

4 This was -- he was going out to a family.

5 "A. Yes, yes. That was something -- I had to go --
6 I had to go -- the next day I was going to Hollywood.
7 I was down -- that was knocked on the head because of
8 what I said to NL4."

9 Basically what he is saying is that he swore at you,
10 you told the nun and the nun then stopped him going out
11 that weekend. That's why he remembers this particular
12 incident, because otherwise you had nothing to do with
13 him.

14 **A. I don't ever remember any child swearing at me.**

15 Q. He said it took a lot out of him, because he was told he
16 wasn't going to Hollywood the next day and he had been
17 really looking forward to it, because he had been told
18 he was going three months in advance, but he was told
19 that day:

20 "It was in church whenever I was saying the rosary"
21 -- if we scroll on down -- "that I wasn't going down and
22 that was -- somebody else was going instead of me. So
23 that took a lot out of me."

24 What you said to him was put to him. If we can
25 scroll on down, please, what you said in your Inquiry

1 statement was put to him. He said:

2 "It certainly was NL4. I have a good memory.

3 I remember it. She had hair at that
4 particular time, but I would have seen her the odd time
5 manhandling children, you know, but she wasn't suitable
6 for the job. That's my honest opinion."

7 But he was clear it was definitely you.

8 "Believe me, it was NL4."

9 So he is saying there is no mistake as far as he is
10 concerned that the person who smacked him while he was
11 standing in the queue to go into the refectory and the
12 person who reported him to the nun and prevented him
13 from going out that weekend was you, NL4, but you --

14 **A. I never, ever reported a child to the nun, and even if**
15 **I did, I don't think the nun would have kept a child**
16 **back.**

17 Q. The next person, there's quite a lot that he says.

18 That's HIA225, HIA225. The first piece of transcript is
19 at 91058, but his statement can be found -- we don't
20 need to look at that -- at 529 to 540. If we look at
21 91058, please. Now this page -- he remembers -- the
22 first memory he has of you was of being nice and giving
23 him sweets. He thought -- he got transferred out of the
24 group he was in into the group that you were in. The
25 reason he said is he felt he was being ill treated in

1 one group and he felt the Marion group might have been
2 a safer group for himself and his brother, because you
3 had appeared nice and "appeared" he says may be the
4 object word.

5 So, in other words, he was looking out for his
6 younger brother who was in the home with him. He said
7 they were being ill treated in the group they were in,
8 and you had been a person who had given him some sweets.
9 So he thought, "I'd rather be in her group" and managed
10 to get transferred, himself and his brother, into it.

11 The next entry is -- again you don't remember
12 children transferring that readily from group to group?

13 **A. I have no recollection of any child being transferred**
14 **from one group to the other.**

15 Q. If we just go to 91063, please, here he's talking
16 about -- if we can scroll on down. Sorry. If we just
17 go up a little bit, if we may:

18 "The person you thought -- this is the person who
19 you thought would treat you well ..."

20 I'm just turning to the complaints he made about
21 you:

22 "... because she gave you sweets and thought she was
23 lovely."

24 He said:

25 "Yes."

1 If we can scroll on down, he talks about a boy who
2 had a problem with wetting the bed. Again I'll give the
3 child's name. That's DL175. You do remember him.
4 Isn't that right?

5 **A. I can remember DL175, yes.**

6 Q. He says -- what he said was he thought he might have had
7 a learning disability, looking back. Do you think that
8 about DL175 now, as you sit here, NL4?

9 **A. He probably did, but he wasn't sent to any special**
10 **school or anything.**

11 Q. Was he not one of the boys who went to Muckamore?

12 **A. I don't know. I don't know if any child had gone to**
13 **Muckamore.**

14 Q. Okay. Well, you remember when I was reading through
15 HIA56's evidence he said there was DL175 and this boy
16 NL174 who both went to Muckamore and didn't go to
17 Kircubbin. Did you --

18 **A. I don't even recall NL174, but DL175 I was -- yes,**
19 **I took DL175 home to my parents' house on a few**
20 **occasions.**

21 Q. Well, HIA225 is saying here about your way of dealing
22 with bedwetting was to shove a flannel into DL175's
23 mouth and beat him in front of everybody in the
24 dormitory. He goes on then to make a complaint, but he
25 stops me as I am questioning him. He said:

1 "My recollection is this was one incident. It
2 wasn't something that happened frequently. The boy had
3 a bloody nose and a split lip and we were told to say
4 that he was fighting or he fell down the stairs or the
5 same would happen to us."

6 So that is what he is saying. You did this on one
7 occasion to DL175 and that is what you told the boys to
8 say about it.

9 **A. It's not true and, HIA225, I don't even remember HIA225.**

10 Q. Do you remember his brother, NL3?

11 **A. I don't know the name [name redacted], you know, the --**
12 **I honestly don't.**

13 Q. Well, he goes on and -- to -- if we can just scroll on
14 down, please. I'm again reading out what he's saying
15 about what happened and there was some confusion. He
16 talks about his father he was in Sacred Heart group
17 before he moved into Marions group, and when he was in
18 Sacred Heart group when his father came to visit, there
19 wasn't any difficulty over that, but when -- his father
20 would have presented at the front door and then he went
21 in.

22 "The arrangement was I would go up and see my
23 sisters."

24 So the father would have taken him up to Nazareth
25 House to see the sisters:

1 "This happened I think in the Marion group and
2 I hadn't gone into the refectory and hadn't asked or
3 told NL4 I was doing this. That is when it began."

4 So he is saying that after this incident with his
5 father when his father arrived to take him out and he
6 didn't tell you or ask your permission to go, that you
7 were annoyed about that, and if we can scroll on down,
8 he thought the father had confronted you about this and
9 knocked you over and for a while after that you left him
10 alone. He goes on to say:

11 "That was the first time I can remember NL4
12 physically harming me, and I do recall her punching me
13 and pulling me around, hitting me on the back of the
14 head, on my back and told me to go upstairs, and I ran
15 past my father very distressed and he asked me what was
16 wrong and followed me upstairs, and I wouldn't say and
17 I told him. He wasn't going to go anywhere until I told
18 him. It was clearly obviously that I was very
19 distressed. After that -- what happened after that
20 somebody told me. I don't know if it did, but they
21 suggested they went down and confronted NL4 and struck
22 her or knocked her over or whatever. I don't know if
23 that be true, because I didn't see that, but I do know
24 that for a period of time she never physically hurt me
25 again."

1 So somebody told him that his father had confronted
2 you about physically assaulting his son. You don't
3 remember any confrontation?

4 **A. No, I don't remember that. I was never, ever knocked**
5 **over by any parent and if -- the child wouldn't have had**
6 **to tell me he was going if he had been. The nuns would**
7 **have probably told him to go. So he wouldn't have had**
8 **to tell me that he was going.**

9 Q. That's certainly what he took out of it --

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. -- that you were angry he had not asked permission and
12 that's why you struck him in the way he described.

13 **A. I never struck any child honestly for that.**

14 Q. If we can just scroll on down, please, to the next page.
15 Then his father left and moved to England, and he
16 interrupted me again. He said something about his
17 father, but if we can just scroll on down, I put to him:

18 "You say that after he left to go to England you say
19 that NL4 reverted back to form?

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. 'If she considered you'd stepped out of line,
22 not making your bed to her satisfaction or thought you
23 were being cheeky, she would hit you.'

24 **A. Yes."**

25 **Scroll on down, please. He talks about an incident**

1 in Ballyhornan during the summer about lemonade bottles
2 and about you going mad and shouting at everybody,
3 because what they were doing was basically a scam. The
4 boys were going round the back of the shop, picking up
5 lemonade bottles, the empties. In those days you got
6 money for empties --

7 **A. Returning.**

8 Q. -- for returning them, and bringing them into the shop
9 getting the money and doing that, and that you found out
10 about this and you punished the boys for it. Do you
11 ever remember this incident?

12 **A. No, I don't and the shopkeeper was very friendly person,**
13 **but she would have -- if she had had any complaints, she**
14 **would have gone to one of the Sisters, and I am sure if**
15 **she had a complaint, she would have gone to SR34.**

16 Q. Just scroll on down. He is relating what he said about
17 this incident, and again, NL4, I know that you have seen
18 his statement and what he said in his statement --

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. -- and you have responded to it. He says -- gives us
21 a little bit more about -- reading from the statement,
22 he didn't understand how the nuns didn't hear the
23 commotion he said.

24 "That was -- I suppose my memory of it today as we
25 speak is that NL4 was chastising those others and making

1 comments, 'Nobody in my group has done this. Nobody in
2 my group would do that'. I wasn't a difficult child in
3 care, but I wasn't an angel. I mean, this was a scam.
4 We kind of thought a bit of money, bit of pocket money,
5 whatever, didn't think of the consequences. I didn't
6 think they were these. So my anxiety was I was probably
7 going to get it all the more when she found out I was
8 involved, one of her prized group."

9 At that stage he breaks down into tears and
10 apologises for that. He is told to take his time. He
11 says:

12 "I suppose the concern that I have is that any
13 person could behave this way so openly. So why (a) --
14 so why people (a) didn't know and (b) didn't do anything
15 about it -- when I say 'people', I mean the Sisters or
16 other staff. It wasn't -- I mean, we were hit around
17 the head. I mean, it is not like that it was hidden.
18 So I don't get that at all. So I appreciate that might
19 be said in response to that, but I remember it vividly
20 and that's -- okay."

21 So he is saying -- again he is reiterating that it
22 did happen and one of the difficulties he has is
23 understanding why it was allowed to happen.

24 If we can go on then to 91047.

25 NL4, I know we have been going for quite a while.

1 Are you fine --

2 **A. I am all right. Thank you.**

3 Q. -- are you sure -- to continue? We still have some more
4 to go through, but if I can try to speed it up a little
5 bit.

6 **A. Okay.**

7 Q. But if you need a break, please do tell me.

8 **A. If I need a break, I will just say to you.**

9 Q. Please do?

10 CHAIRMAN: There are five more to go through.

11 MS SMITH: Yes, there are.

12 CHAIRMAN: I think we will take a break. We will rise for
13 about ten minutes.

14 **A. Thank you.**

15 **(12.45 pm)**

16 **(Short break)**

17 **(1.05 pm)**

18 MS SMITH: NL4, are you happy to --

19 CHAIRMAN: Before we resume, NL4, it is clear there are
20 quite a lot more things you are going to be asked about.

21 **A. That's all right.**

22 Q. I think what we will do is we will finish what you are
23 being asked about at the moment and then we'll give you
24 a break of about three-quarters of an hour for lunch,
25 because otherwise you could be here for quite a long

1 time.

2 **A. Right.**

3 Q. I don't think that's fair to you or -- particularly not
4 to you.

5 **A. Okay.**

6 MS SMITH: I think in ease of NL4 and indeed of everyone
7 else, Chairman, this -- the witness I am dealing with,
8 his transcript is the lengthiest. After that it should
9 speed up slightly.

10 CHAIRMAN: Well, I appreciate that, but in fairness to NL4,
11 whose health is not terribly good, I appreciate she
12 wants to continue, but I'm not sure that it's in her
13 best interests.

14 MS SMITH: Very well. Thank you.

15 NL4, before we took the break I was asking you --
16 I was telling you what HIA225 had told the Inquiry --

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. -- when he came to speak to us. I am going to look at
19 another section of his evidence, which is at 91074.

20 This is where I am reading out to him what you said in
21 your Inquiry statement --

22 **A. Right.**

23 Q. -- about the allegations that he has made. If we could
24 just scroll on down through this, please. Again I am
25 just -- scrolling on down -- it might not take quite as

1 long. This is -- you are talking about Ballyhornan and
2 what he said about that. If we can scroll on down until
3 we find a response. This is -- now we can just stop
4 there. This is about another matter about failing the
5 11 Plus. If we can scroll on down, please. I am
6 putting to him -- he says -- one of -- sorry. You are
7 talking about --

which was a good memory that he had as well in
9 the home, but he says that -- I read your entire
10 response to him and I said is there anything he wanted
11 to say about that, just as I have been doing with you,
12 and he said:

13 "I mean, NL4 can say whatever she wishes. I suppose
14 that most of the institutions I was in I was deemed to
15 be relatively intelligent and I felt that the
16 preparation I was given for the 11 Plus was woeful, but
17 I didn't really appreciate at that stage just how
18 important it was. I have lived all my life with a chip
19 on my shoulder. If I had had a normal education at
20 a normal school -- my sisters went to a school outside
21 of the home. We had our own school. So whilst I was
22 feeling I was going well, to be called 'stupid' in front
23 of everybody ..."

24 You remember he said you called him "stupid" after
25 he failed the 11 Plus:

1 "... I have felt that all of my life and have always
2 felt insecure when I discuss such matters or talk or
3 when I am contrasting matters. I just find I can never
4 forget that. I am know I am not stupid. I know I am
5 relatively successful, but there's still there -- but
6 that's still there and 'stupid', 'failure', whatever,
7 does bring back some anxiety attacks."

8 You can scroll on down. He talks about coming back
9 from Rubane to visit his brother who was in your care at
10 that time. He talks about being told to have NL3 back
11 at a certain time. If we can just scroll on down:

12 "Well, before I say that, I mean, I think previously
13 and the records suggest I was very anxious that NL3 was
14 safe and that was my reason for my anxiety was that
15 I couldn't look out for him. I'm not suggesting that
16 I could protect him from this woman in a physical sense
17 but I did learn how to avoid things.

18 On one occasion, as you suggest, I came up from
19 Rubane to visit NL3 and my sisters and arrangements had
20 been made for me to take NL3 up to Nazareth House, and
21 NL4 had said to NL3 that he had better be back in time
22 or else, and I asked, 'What do you mean by "or else"?'
23 and she said, 'You know', and I suggested to her -- and
24 I wasn't a small child -- 'Look, you will not harm him.
25 If you put a hand on him or harm him, I'm going directly

1 to the police', and then I took him to Nazareth House.
2 I wasn't aware of anything happening to him as a result
3 of that and we weren't back on time."

4 So he was saying that he came to take his brother to
5 visit his sisters, and this is actually after he had
6 left Kircubbin I think, and he -- you said to NL3, "You
7 had better be back in time or else" and there was this
8 conversation. Do you remember anything like that?

9 **A. I couldn't remember a thing about that.**

10 Q. Then on -- if we can scroll on down, please, to the next
11 page. This is about -- talking about --

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

when he got

21

back to Nazareth Lodge, you took the Scalextric set off

22

him and gave it to the other child and gave you (sic)

23

his plastic truck, which he was too old for, and he gave

24

it to his brother NL3.

25

Do you remember ever taking toys off them in that

1 way?

2 **A. I don't remember taking toys.**

-- but I don't remember them

4 **getting toys**

5 Q. That's the point that he's making here, NL4.

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. He is saying there were actually

Yes. He talks about he actually was out at Christmas
17 with a family, the foster family he was staying with

18

19

20 **A. there was SR47 and**

21 **NL5 and myself.**

22 Q. And I think it was four boys, was it?

23 **A. I'm sure it was four boys, but I can only remember three**
24 **of them.**

25 Q. Okay. HIA225 might have been the fourth then?

1 **A. He could have been.**

2 Q. If we can scroll on down, please, and, you know, I'm
3 putting your statement to him, and he said he can't
4 remember the names of the boys or who accompanied him to

5

6 "I'm just surprised that if NL4 remembers, that she
7 doesn't remember she was looking after me in her group,
8 but that's a moot point", he says.

9 So he is saying okay, you can remember going to this

10 and he says if you can remember that, why can't
11 you remember him?

12 He said that they
13 weren't actually given toys. They were given a book
14 token, a pound book token, but it is fair to say those
15 memories were good memories and he is grateful for those
16 opportunities. If we can scroll on down. Just if we go
17 to page -- 1083 might be the next one. Sorry. 91083.
18 Yes. Sorry. Sorry.

19 The last entry from HIA225 is 91087 that's relevant
20 to you, NL4. This is where he was talking about
21 Ballyhornan. He said you all ate together in
22 Ballyhornan. There was no refectory. There was
23 a dining area. You all ate together and socialised and
24 went to the beach together.

25 That is what you remember of Ballyhornan. Isn't

1 that right?

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. She was saying -- you were saying in your statement
4 that -- I was putting to him you:

5 "... wouldn't have chastised other boys because they
6 weren't in her group."

7 He said:

8 "No. I'm sure there are others who would comment
9 with greater authority than I. I would just say
10 I wouldn't accept that at all."

11 He is basically saying that, if we can just
12 scroll -- I think that was the last page. He is
13 basically saying that he doesn't accept the fact that
14 you wouldn't have chastised children from another group
15 in Ballyhornan.

16 **A. There wouldn't have been any reason for me to chastise
17 other children, because their own group parents would be
18 there and the Sister.**

19 Q. Well, now I am conscious that the Chairman said we were
20 going to take a break for 45 minutes now, NL4.

21 **A. Right.**

22 Q. So that's all about HIA225. There are a few more people
23 that I need to talk to you about, but hopefully they
24 will not take just so long, when we come back.

25 **A. Okay.**

1 CHAIRMAN: Well, NL4, we will take a break for at least
2 45 minutes now --

3 **A. Right.**

4 Q. -- so you can have some refreshments. We will start
5 again as soon as you feel able after 2 o'clock.

6 **A. Thank you very much.**

7 **(1.15 pm)**

8 **(Short break)**

9 **(2.10 pm)**

10 MS SMITH: Good afternoon, Chairman, Panel Members. NL4,
11 are you happy to continue?

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. NL4, the next person that I wanted to talk -- who came
14 to speak to the Inquiry and who gave evidence was
15 HIA152. He is HIA152. The transcript about what he
16 said in addition to what he had said in his Inquiry
17 statement is at 91365. If we can pull that up, please.
18 His own statement is being read to him and he says:

19 "I remember NL4", that's yourself, "and another
20 lay worker would come round our dormitories at night and
21 if you weren't sleeping, they would take you out to a
22 big washroom where they would make you sit until you
23 were tired and then you would go back to bed. I'd
24 pretend to be asleep when they walked around the dorm so
25 I wouldn't be sent out to the washroom'."

1 It was put to him that you were -- he was possibly
2 talking about the children who needed to go to the
3 toilet or had to be taken out to go to the toilet and he
4 said:

5 "No, definitely not."

6 If you can just scroll on, he said that you and this
7 other lay staff person:

8 "... used to go round the beds and check to see if
9 your eyes were open or closed, and they'd even sit on
10 the bed and watch to see were you going to wake up. So
11 you pretended to be sleeping. So they'd go to the next
12 bed. That's what I remember of it, and for some reason
13 it stuck in my head all these years, you know. Times
14 when I couldn't pretend to be sleeping I was brought out
15 and set for what seemed like hours."

16 Your Inquiry statement was put to her (sic), and he
17 was asked whether he wet the bed and he said no, he
18 never did. We can scroll on down, please. He said:

19 "So it seemed to be an effort to get you ready to
20 sleep?

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. But it was never explained to you?

23 **A. No. I could never understand why they were**
24 **doing it at the time. It certainly wasn't the case of**
25 **wetting the bed. If you weren't sleeping, you were**

1 brought out, sure."

2 He goes on to talk about speaking to the police and
3 about being -- if we can just scroll on down, what he
4 said to the police was -- he said:

5 "The last time -- it was as if your turn to go to
6 the bedwetting, take the bed wet, but that would be the
7 last time you'd be in the dormitory until the next
8 morning."

9 He said it was two civilian workers who looked after
10 the bedwetters, which would you agree with. You
11 certainly looked after the ones in your group.

12 A. I did.

13 Q. He said it was definitely two people, not just one.

14 A. We just looked after our own groups.

15 Q. He said the nun never patrolled the beds in any way that
16 he remembered. Do you know whether they did or not?

17 A. They did. They would have come. The night I wouldn't
18 have gone, they would have done it that night.

19 Q. "She was never there when the lay people sort of done
20 it."

21 Would that be right? Would the nuns have been at
22 prayer when you were getting the boys out to go to the
23 toilet?

24 A. No, the nuns would have been finished their prayer.

25 They finished their prayer at 9.00 and the bell -- the

1 **last bell for the nuns would go at 9.00, you know.**

2 Q. Was that your signal to go and get the boys who wet the
3 bed up?

4 A. **It probably -- no, it wasn't. We just went. We knew we**
5 **were going to do it, but we would have only gone the**
6 **night that we knew that Sister wasn't going to do it,**
7 **you know, and then she would just get herself off to**
8 **bed, you know.**

9 Q. You know, he is then going through what you told the
10 police at the time. Sorry. Mr Aiken, who is taking
11 this witness through his evidence, is reading out from
12 your police interview to him at the time. You said to
13 the police that:

14 "'They were never asked to sit on the floor. They
15 were never taken in a group at night to go to the
16 toilet'."

17 That's the whole group.

18 A. **They were never, ever asked to sit on the floor.**

19 Q. He said:

20 "It is one of the things I always remember over the
21 years sort of, you know. It definitely did happen to
22 me."

23 Again more of your police interview is being read
24 out to him. When you lifted children up, they nearly
25 would have always gone to the toilet right away?

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. It was put that you didn't remember him. That was
3 essentially what he was saying about that.

4 So he is saying he was a boy who was taken -- if he
5 wasn't asleep -- perhaps in an attempt to get him to
6 tire himself out and get tired enough to go to sleep, he
7 was taken out of his bed and made to sit on the bathroom
8 floor.

9 **A. That wasn't true. You know, we were glad to get them to
10 go to the toilet so as we could get off to our beds.**

11 Q. The next person, NL4, was a HIA422. That's HIA422. Now
12 the transcript of his evidence is at 91357. Now
13 whenever he gave his evidence -- you might remember this
14 and I know your legal representatives will -- we didn't
15 have your response to what he said in his Inquiry
16 statement, but just so that you know, it was put to him
17 and he then subsequently addressed what he said at -- if
18 we can just look at 80059. This a statement that came
19 into the Inquiry after he had given his evidence, NL4.
20 You said you had no recollection of him. Cannot say
21 whether he was in the group of boys that you supervised.

22 "In his statement he makes a general observation
23 that I was wicked and a bully. He gives an example of
24 if I caught him out of bed. I have already explained
25 that once the boys went to bed, I had no contact with

1 Q. Another person who spoke to the Inquiry was HIA48.

2 That's HIA48.

3 I should have said that HIA 422 witness statement
4 was at SNB-211 to 217.

5 HIA48's witness statement is at 860 to 864. The
6 transcript of where she is asked about you is at
7 SNB-91312. Yes. This is -- I had asked her when I was
8 speaking to her, just as I had spoken to you earlier --

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. -- about what -- she described you as being wicked, and
11 I asked her what she meant by that. What she described
12 to me was that:

13 "She grabbed you and pulled you by the hair, by the
14 ears and that was how she would have been wicked."

15 Then there was an issue over the microphone, but if
16 we can just scroll on down, I put then your statement to
17 her. If you can scroll on down, please, through this.
18 I was putting it to her -- she said that:

19 "'She forced us to wash in a cold bath.'"

20 That was again from her statement that I was reading
21 out to her. Then I put it to her what you had said in
22 your statement to the Inquiry, and I asked if she ever
23 remembered you leaving Nazareth Lodge and coming back
24 and she said "No". She just had a memory of you being
25 there all the time. Now it is possible in the time she

1 was in the home you might have been there for the entire
2 time she was there or can you remember?

3 **A. I don't think -- I was only there part of the time.**

4 Q. I said that although you admitted to slapping children
5 with your hand and occasionally with a ruler if they
6 misbehaved, she then -- her response to that was:

7 "She just lifted everything, so she did, and beat
8 us."

9 She was in the Sacred Heart group that you were in
10 charge of.

11 Then if we go to 91335, and again this is about the
12 fact that she had spoken to police, and -- I am talking
13 to her about the fact she spoke to police. This was --
14 the police had asked her about what another girl,
15 NL 8 had said. They had come to her and asked her
16 to make a statement. So if we can just scroll on down
17 through that, please. I was going over what she had
18 said in her police statement, and at that time she said
19 she had no recollection of you beating them for running
20 away, her and the girl NL 8. Go on down, please.

21 In her second statement -- I was putting to her what
22 you said about the fact she never said this to the
23 police the first time. Then the second time -- just if
24 we can scroll on down, please. She basically said
25 that -- in the second statement she said that she was

1 abused in other ways by you for always wetting the bed.
2 You rubbed her face into the mattress, constantly beat
3 her around the head and body:

4 "... and even when I bled, she wouldn't stop."

5 You make the point in your Inquiry statement that
6 she had not said that to the police the first time that
7 she was asked about anything to do with you. If we can
8 just scroll on down. Sorry. Bear with me. If we can
9 just scroll on down, please. Yes. She said that at the
10 time she made her first police statement that she was in
11 a very bad place in her life and didn't feel able to
12 talk about it at that stage. So when came to speak to
13 the police in 2010, she just felt it was the time to
14 talk.

15 Whenever I was saying to her that -- as you can
16 probably see -- I apologise. You can't see it, NL4. It
17 was quite difficult for this person to speak to us. So
18 I did a lot of reading --

19 **A. Right.**

20 Q. -- to her and spoke to her, reminded her of what she
21 told me when I had been speaking to her earlier. You
22 said -- you in your statement -- sorry. Just go back
23 up, please. I was putting it to her that you denied
24 beating a child until they bled or bruising a child, and
25 putting it to her:

1 "She said that she hit you with a ruler for running
2 away two or three times and that she actually told the
3 Mother Superior that you had done that."

4 That was when you were speaking to the police. NL4,
5 do you remember hitting these two girls for running
6 away?

7 **A. I do, yes, and I remember SR172 coming up to the
8 dormitory and scolding them as well, you know, but that
9 was the end of it.**

10 Q. But you told the Mother that you had actually beaten
11 them for running away?

12 **A. I did. I told her that I had slapped them, yes.**

13 Q. I said to HIA48:

14 "You don't accept she just hit you with the ruler?"

15 and the words she used to me was:

16 "She murdered her and me."

17 That's you murdered her and Josie.

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. Are you all right, NL4?

20 **A. I'm fine. Thanks.**

21 Q. Just scrolling on down just to check. I think I've got
22 the next page number. If we can scroll on down. Again
23 I am putting to you -- to her all the things that you
24 said in your Inquiry statement.

25 **A. Right.**

1 Q. I asked her did she remember playing with toys she got
2 from Christmas parties. She said:

3 "No, because we were always outside playing."

4 If we can scroll on down, again I am putting what
5 you said to -- in your Inquiry statement to her. Then
6 you made the point that she was -- there was
7 an allegation that she had been sexually abused by a man
8 outside Nazareth Lodge, and you said that if it did
9 happen and the police were informed, then you didn't
10 believe the nuns would have told you about it.

11 **A. I never heard anything about it.**

12 Q. The nuns didn't keep you informed if anything untoward
13 happened at all?

14 **A. No, they didn't, no.**

15 Q. You said whenever you were interviewed by police, you
16 are surprised that the police would not have mentioned
17 that to you, and you wondered why she didn't mention it
18 on either the two occasions she made statements to the
19 police. Now her point to that was well, there was no
20 need -- if we can just scroll on down -- to tell the
21 police, because what had happened -- what had happened
22 to her with this man was because the police were
23 involved and they knew anyway was her attitude.

24 "I didn't need to tell them because they had
25 investigated."

1 **A. I never knew anything about it.**

2 Q. I appreciate that, NL4.

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. What I am just -- I am just letting you know --

5 **A. I understand.**

6 Q. -- is what she is saying about the fact she didn't tell
7 the police herself.

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. The next person is DL 269 . He gave a statement
10 to the Inquiry, which is at 80070 to 80073. There is
11 a brief entry in the transcript which we will look at,
12 which is 91270. He is being told -- he said that he
13 remembered you as being cruel and violent to the
14 children. He didn't believe that the nuns knew that the
15 domestic workers were being violent to any of the
16 children. Your statement was put to him. If we can
17 scroll on down, he was asked did you ever hit him and he
18 said:

19 "A couple of times."

20 Sorry.

21 "A few times",

22 I should say. Then your statement was put to him.

23 On the next page he says:

24 "It was basically getting whacked, you know.

25 I couldn't necessarily, you know, remember. All the

1 boys of my age, you know, or my time there always knew
2 these two girls or two women were always, you know,
3 heavy-handed with kids."

4 That's -- he's describing yourself and NL5 in that,
5 NL4. That's how he describes the boys' description of
6 you.

7 The next one is HIA36, HIA36, and his statement can
8 be found at SNB-425 to 434. If we look at the
9 transcript, it is 90164. If we just scroll down through
10 that. He wasn't -- he sort of felt that it was fair
11 enough that if he stepped out of the line that he got
12 a slap and said his mother had actually said that should
13 happen to him. I think he was talking about a nun then,
14 and this is -- sorry. If we just scroll on down.

15 "You do recall experiences with NL4",

16 and he said:

17 "When I first met NL4 when I was about -- let's say
18 about 8 or 9, roughly in or around that, and I had just
19 been returned from holiday -- I had people that took me
20 out on holidays and I had just returned, and all the
21 boys were going in for dinner, and I just arrived and,
22 of course, everybody was making a fuss about me, and
23 then they were all shouting and kind of like screaming,
24 'There's . back', you know, that type of a
25 way."

1 Sorry. HIA36. I beg your pardon.

2 "All I could hear was her shouting, 'Who is making
3 all that noise?', but I couldn't see her, because she
4 was round the corner, and then eventually she just
5 pulled me in by the hair into the dining room and she
6 just beat the life out of me, but the visitors that
7 I had, the people that had taken me out, were still in
8 the reception area, and I was in that bad a state that
9 I couldn't even go and say 'Cheerio' to them, because
10 I was very -- I had been -- she had beat me. She had
11 been over-excessive like, you know.

12 Q. And did you go to the dormitory then?

13 **A. They put me -- just put me into the dormitory
14 and I never seen them.**

15 Q. You didn't mention this to the Inquiry staff."

16 He said:

17 "I didn't, no. I never mentioned it, because when
18 I was writing out my statement, you know, if I had to
19 write everything, like, you know, it would be thicker
20 than that book there, you know, and I'm just sort of
21 like -- separate incidents of different things, you
22 know, and that was just because you mentioned this
23 morning, you know."

24 He was asked was that the only experience of you:

25 "... or your worst experience of her?"

1 He said:

2 "No."

3 He said that he had seen her beating. That's you.

4 "She was a really, really, really, really wicked
5 person and she should never have been allowed to look
6 after children, because she had zero tolerance of
7 children, absolutely zero tolerance."

8 He was asked whether the nuns knew what was
9 happening and he said he wasn't aware of the nuns
10 knowing.

11 Then we need -- just scroll on down the next page,
12 please. He said the nuns weren't hands on. He is
13 talking about -- sorry. Just -- the next -- yes.
14 Scroll on down, please. He said:

15 "Q. But you draw a distinction between NL5 and when
16 she hit and NL4 and when she hit. They weren't on the
17 same level as far as you were concerned?

18 **A. No, definitely not. NL4 was kind of -- I think**
19 **I used to -- I think used as, you know, like -- you**
20 **know, like the elite."**

21 Now we need to skip from this page, please, to
22 90168:

23 "If children were going to -- stepping out of line,
24 she was called to ..."

25 Can we just go down to the next page, please? We

1 will come back to this page, but just scroll down
2 through to the next page:

3 "... she was called to deal with them, because all
4 the kids were absolutely scared of her, like. She
5 was -- she was like a pretty, you know, frightening
6 person, you know."

7 Then whenever Ms Doherty was asking him questions,
8 if we can scroll back up to the preceding page,
9 Ms Doherty asked:

10 "Can I just check is that the only time that NL4 hit
11 you, that one occasion?"

12 and he said:

13 "No. She hit me quite a few times, but that was the
14 worst I ever experienced from her, you know. I mean,
15 I never met the woman. It was only because the kids
16 were making such a fuss about me that she tried to make
17 an example of me, you know. I only wish at that time
18 that the people that had taken me out had seen me and
19 things might have been different, but they were able to
20 cover that up by just saying, 'Look, he's away up to the
21 dormitory and just leave him. Let him settle in' or
22 something, you know, because I was crying. You know,
23 when I -- when I had to go back, I was pretty upset
24 anyway about having to go back, but -- especially when
25 somebody was spoiling you for two or three weeks, you

1 know. You had to go back and try and fit in with their
2 regime again, you know."

3 So that's what he was saying about an incident where
4 he was brought back from the family he was out with and
5 this was a particularly bad beating, as he describes it,
6 by you.

7 **A. I deny all that.**

8 Q. Finally about the people who have spoken to us was
9 a HIA147. That's HIA147. He gave statements at
10 SND80030 and there's material that he provided that he'd
11 written himself at 32083 to 32094, but the transcript of
12 what he said is at 91355. He had been saying that you
13 and NL4 (sic):

14 "... used a PVC type of bat and smacked you very
15 hard on the thighs for absolutely nothing. They also
16 had a stick, which they hid from the nuns."

17 He had been speaking to Mr Aiken and he said:

18 "Q. You mentioned to me that one of them in
19 particular used to take you by the --

20 **A. The locks.**

21 Q. -- the cheeks or the locks of the hair."

22 That he said was NL5.

23 "Q. Can you remember which of them did more hitting
24 than the other?

25 **A. Well, that would have been even, you know,**

1 because you would have got nipped on the arms or your
2 locks and you got a beating from NL4. It was just six
3 of one, half a dozen of the other."

4 Now, NL4, those are all the people who came to speak
5 to the Inquiry. As we've gone through them, you've made
6 certain comments and I've asked some questions and got
7 some more details about them, but it's clear you have
8 completely denied all the allegations these people have
9 made against you.

10 **A. I have, yes.**

11 Q. I am just going to name the people. There were seven
12 more individuals who complained to the police about you.
13 There was a NL8; DL131;
14 DL425; NL95; NL 94
15 NL 94

16 Now in all of your Inquiry statements you didn't
17 address NL 94 , but I think what he was saying
18 was he had seen you beat his brother.

19 **A. I don't even remember the name, you know.**

20 Q. There was DL432.

21 Now there is one other person -- and I am sorry
22 I can't give the designation, but I can get that --
23 a HIA 455 . We were talking about him earlier,
24 because he only recently spoke to the police and gave
25 a statement to the police in January of last year. I am

1 not going call it up, but it's at 61178 to 61186.

2 Essentially he was making certain allegations largely
3 about NL5, but basically he said you were brought in by
4 her to him. You have no recollection of him at all. Is
5 that right?

6 **A. I don't even remember his name.**

7 Q. You said to me when we were talking earlier that you
8 wouldn't have been with NL5 or SR34 if they were with
9 their group.

10 **A. No, I wouldn't.**

11 Q. Now, as I have said, and I have made mention of the
12 fact, NL4, when all of these people spoke to the police,
13 you were interviewed on two separate occasions by police
14 and you denied the allegations and you gave the police
15 certain information which we have heard about. You were
16 never prosecuted. Isn't that right?

17 **A. That's correct.**

18 Q. You will be glad to know, NL4, that that's all I want to
19 ask you about. I know it took some time to go through
20 all of that, but it is only right you should have the
21 opportunity to know what they said when they come to
22 speak to us --

23 **A. Right.**

24 Q. -- so that you can say anything else that you want to
25 say, but is there anything else that you want to say or

1 are you happy with the way we have covered your
2 evidence?

3 **A. I am pleased at the way you covered the evidence.**

4 I just want to say that I do deny the things that they
5 have accused me of. I just can't believe it. Sometimes
6 I think they're talking about somebody else, you know.
7 So -- and I don't know what else to say, to tell you the
8 truth. I'm just glad it's over.

9 Q. Well, NL4, thank you very much for that. It is not
10 quite over, I am afraid, because the Panel may have some
11 questions for you.

12 **A. That's all right. It is just that ...**

13 Q. It has been a long day.

14 **A. It's better to get it all out in the open.**

15 Q. Thank you very much.

16 Questions from THE PANEL

17 MS DOHERTY: Thanks very much, NL4. Can you hear me okay?

18 **A. Yes, I can.**

19 Q. You mentioned that you told the Mother that you hit the
20 two girls that ran away.

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. Did you ever talk to the nuns at other times about when
23 you hit children?

24 **A. No, because there was never any need for it. The reason**
25 **that I told SR172 about hitting the girls was because**

1 **she actually came up to the dormitory, because the**
2 **police went to tell her about the girls, you know. So**
3 **other than that I wouldn't have said anything.**

4 Q. So did she come up when you were chastising them? Did
5 she --

6 A. **No, I had already given them a slap and she came up.**

7 Q. So you told then. You said in your evidence in relation
8 to HIA183 that you never hit a child in a face for
9 a particular reason, you know -- for no reason. He said
10 you slapped him in the face for no reason, and you said
11 you wouldn't have done it for no reason. Does that mean
12 sometimes maybe spontaneously you did slap a child in
13 the face?

14 A. **I'm not sure, but maybe I could have. I wouldn't have**
15 **done it -- I wouldn't have just done it and given**
16 **a child a smack in the face. I don't think I would have**
17 **smacked him in the face.**

18 Q. You say you don't think you would have smacked them in
19 the face at all?

20 A. **No. It was always the hands or the legs.**

21 Q. Just a final thing. Did you and the nun in charge, you
22 know, did you ever discuss together how to manage the
23 behaviour of the children?

24 A. **No, it was never discussed.**

25 Q. Okay. Okay. Thank you.

1 CHAIRMAN: Well, NL4, you will be relieved I am sure to hear
2 that we don't have any more questions for you. I would
3 just emphasise again for everyone's benefit that we have
4 read your extremely detailed statement in which you deal
5 in much greater detail with the allegations. So we have
6 that as well as your oral evidence here today, but thank
7 you very much for coming to speak to us. I know it has
8 taken you quite a long time in the witness box, but
9 thank you for coming today.

10 **A. Thank you. Thank you very much for giving me the**
11 **opportunity, sir, to speak.**

12 MS SMITH: Thank you, NL4. If you want to go back with
13 I will see you shortly in a moment or two.

14 **A. Thank you very much.**

15 **(Witness withdrew)**

16 MS SMITH: Chairman, there is one other matter that I just
17 wanted to put on the Inquiry record. When I was taking
18 witnesses through evidence earlier in the week, I made
19 reference to statements that the Inquiry have received
20 in this module from DL 518 . There are two
21 statements. The first was on 25th March of 2015. That
22 can be found in the bundle at SNB-6913 through to 7006,
23 and a second witness statement dealing with the NL 157
24 NL 157 investigation. That statement is dated 3rd
25 April 2015, and it's in the bundle at SNB-7323 to 7345.

1 DL 518 is not giving evidence in this module, but
2 may come to speak to the Inquiry on a later occasion.

3 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you.

4 MS SMITH: Mr Aiken has the next two witnesses, Chairman.

5 So I hope he will be ready very shortly if we just take
6 a very short break.

7 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We'll just rise for a minute or two.

8 (2.38 pm)

9 (Short break)

10 (2.55 pm)

11 WITNESS HIA154 (called)

12 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, the next witness
13 today is HIA154, who is "HIA154". HIA 154's aware,
14 Chairman, you are going to ask him to take the oath.

15 WITNESS HIA154 (sworn)

16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, HIA 154 Please sit down.

17 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

18 MR AIKEN: We can bring up on the screen, please, 882.

19 HIA 154, I am aware you are anxious about giving
20 evidence. So relax as best you can and I will summarise
21 much of the material in the way that we discussed. If
22 at any stage you are having difficulty, just let me know
23 and we'll deal with that.

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. Coming up on the screen, HIA 154 is the first page of

1 your witness statement now with the black boxes in the
2 way we described about the anonymity policy of the
3 Inquiry. Can you just check that it matches the first
4 page of the hard copy you have just till we make sure
5 it's the same statement except for the black marks?

6 **A. Yes, yes. It is the same statement.**

7 Q. Then if we move through to the last page at 887, please,
8 can you just check that this matches the last page of
9 yours, HIA 154?

10 **A. Yes, it does.**

11 Q. Can you confirm you've signed your statement?

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. And want to adopt the contents as your evidence before
14 the Inquiry?

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. We were discussing earlier the black marks are part of
17 the anonymity policy of the Inquiry and you want to keep
18 your anonymity?

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. Just bear with me for a moment. I said to you I'd make
21 the Panel aware of where various documents can be found
22 relating to you in the electronic bundle.

23 So HIA 154 spoke to the police on 26th June 1995 when
24 he was 26. That was part of the police investigation
25 into Father Brendan Smyth and allegations that have been

1 made in respect of him.

2 Then HIA 154 spoke again to the police --

3 CHAIRMAN: Is there a reference for that?

4 MR AIKEN: My apologies. The reference for that, Chairman,
5 is at 60991 through to 60992.

6 At that stage, HIA 154 -- I will just deal with this
7 now -- you didn't make any mention of abuse --

8 **A. No.**

9 Q. -- in respect of Father Brendan Smyth --

10 **A. No, no.**

11 Q. -- but you did refer to being touched by

12 a We are not going to use his name.

13 At the time you weren't --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- you didn't recall his name --

16 **A. No.**

17 Q. -- but then after you spoke to your oldest sister --

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. -- who did remember the man you were talking about, and

20 whenever you come to speak to the police in August of

21 2012, that's 15th August of 2012 -- and that statement

22 can be found at 60993 through to 60995 -- at that stage

23 you named the that you were talking about. We

24 are not going to use his name in the chamber today. The

25 Panel are aware of who it is, as are you and I. You

1 described what he did. Then you also went on to talk
2 about serious sexual abuse in respect of Father Brendan
3 Smyth.

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. You also said in your August 2012 statement that the
6 Mother Superior had hit with you a strap and you said
7 fifty times, but when I was discussing with you earlier,
8 you were using numbers both in terms of your contact
9 with Brendan Smyth and in terms of --

10 **A. Yes, yes.**

11 Q. -- being hit as meaning it happened a lot --

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- without you knowing how many times it happened.

14 **A. Exactly.**

15 Q. You explain that you suffered physical abuse from some
16 of the other Sisters. Now whenever you spoke to the
17 police in 1995, you had said you hadn't had any physical
18 abuse --

19 **A. No.**

20 Q. -- from any of the Sisters, but in 2012 you explained
21 that you had. You didn't remember their names.

22 In addition to those two police statements, as we
23 were discussing earlier, the Panel have access to
24 Dr Mangan, the consultant psychiatrist's, report from
25 15th April 2013 and that runs from 72135 through to

1 72141. You explain to him as well the extent of the
2 sexual abuse that you're describing in the statement.

3 The that you refer to is HIA135, and the
4 Panel have material relating to him of the type that you
5 and I were discussing earlier, which means he is not in
6 a position to be before the Inquiry, and the references
7 to that, Members of the Panel, if I can give you them,
8 are at 60998 and then 60996 and 7. Then in this matter,
9 because it was the matter of a police investigation,
10 there is a DPP direction in May 2013, which is at 60999.

11 In addition, HIA 154 we were discussing earlier the
12 practice of the Inquiry to ask the institution where you
13 resided what can they say about your time in the home.

14 The Sisters of Nazareth have provided a replying
15 statement, which is at 2242 in the bundle. I was
16 discussing with you that that -- they don't have a huge
17 amount of records on you other than the register
18 entries, but in paragraph 4 of the statement it contains
19 an apology to you for any occasion whenever any
20 treatment you had fell beneath the reasonable standard.
21 Obviously, as you are aware, the nuns of today who are
22 trying to assist the Inquiry, they weren't the nuns who
23 were there --

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. -- at the time. So that's why they put it in the way

1 that they have.

2 Then, Members of the Panel, the Health & Social Care
3 Board have provided a replying statement, which runs
4 from 7505 through to 7507. That has exhibits from 7508
5 to 7516. You are aware, **HIA 154** from our discussions
6 earlier that the social work file relating to you the
7 Health & Social Care Board have been able to produce to
8 the Inquiry and it runs from 111065 to 111243. You and
9 I had some discussion about the various documents --

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. -- and I am going to just illustrate a few of those as
12 I go.

13 You were born on --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- and are now aged 45.

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. You explain to the Inquiry in paragraph 1 of your
18 statement, and it is also through the social work
19 material, that the home from which you came was a very
20 difficult home with unfortunately significant domestic
21 violence and alcohol abuse.

22 **A. Yes.**

23 Q. Eventually that resulted in you and all of your brothers
24 and sisters being taken into care.

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. That appears to have happened on 9th April 1973, at
2 which point you were only 3, just about to turn 4.

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. If we just can bring up, please, 7509, which is the
5 Admission to Care document that you and I were talking
6 about this morning. HIA 154 if we can rotate that,
7 please, then we can see the admission to Nazareth Lodge.
8 It is said to be temporary, because we will later see,
9 as you and I were discussing, the record by the time two
10 years later you were moving to Marmion, it is described
11 as a "planned move".

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. So the idea when you were going into Nazareth Lodge of
14 keeping all of you together, because that was a place it
15 seems where there were sufficient places to do that, it
16 was not intended to be the long-term solution for where
17 you were going to reside.

18 The Health & Social Care Board have recognised in
19 their statement to the Inquiry that you appear to have
20 been from this point on the subject of a Welfare
21 Authority. The Welfare Authority were responsible for
22 your care and they acknowledge that in paragraph 5 of
23 their statement at 7506, but I was showing you a Belfast
24 Welfare minute that we were looking at earlier of
25 14th May 1973. If we can bring that up, please, at

1 31395, and it is the section -- fourth paragraph. This
2 sets out the background, that it appears you had lived
3 in and then you'd lived for a period in
4 Belfast, but at the time you are taken into care your
5 mum has left because of what was happening to her and
6 you were at your granny's house with your dad --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- which is in

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. It seems that, untangling this record, the Down Welfare
11 Authority took you into care and placed you in Nazareth
12 Lodge, but Tyrone County Welfare were writing to Belfast
13 saying, "Will you take responsibility?", because the
14 last address that there had been for your mum and dad
15 was in Belfast. This record -- the Health & Social Care
16 Board have said in the statement it was Down Welfare who
17 were responsible for the maintenance, but in discussion
18 with Ms Smith, she and I agree that this record is
19 indicating ultimately that Belfast were taking
20 responsibility for HIA154 and his siblings, because this
21 is a Belfast Welfare Authority minute. The last
22 line indicates that they were accepting financial
23 responsibility.

24 What the Health & Social Care Board have then said
25 is that in the file that they can find relating to you

1 -- and, as you know, they haven't been able to find it
2 necessarily for your siblings --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- but in relation to you there is no record of social
5 workers from Belfast visiting you in Nazareth Lodge.
6 That's not to say they didn't, but on the material they
7 have they can't say that they did, but you yourself
8 don't have any recollection of them doing that?

9 **A. No, no.**

10 Q. You were in the home between, as I said, just before
11 your fourth birthday and you left then on 15th
12 November 1975, when you just turned 6. You were moved
13 to Marmion with your siblings.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. That is recorded as a planned move. If we can look,
16 please, at 7511, this is a document you and I were
17 discussing earlier, HIA 154, that shows -- it's from 1986
18 in terms of it is recording the social work visits
19 taking place then, but we can see from this
20 section under "Previous Placements" that the move from
21 Nazareth Lodge to Marmion is being described as
22 a "planned move" as opposed to as a "result of
23 breakdown" or "discharge". That's in keeping with what
24 you recollect, that ultimately -- you think there was
25 some discussion with your sister as well --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- but a decision that you were all going to move to
3 Marmion --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- and that's what happened.

6 I was explaining to you earlier how generally your
7 youngest sister was I think really a baby at the
8 time.

9 **A. Yes, yes.**

10 Q. That point you were making was, "Well, she wasn't kept
11 with us". I was explaining how Nazareth Lodge was more
12 for children from about 4 onwards and there was
13 St. Joseph's on the same site --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- which looked after the smaller children. I was
16 saying to you, without telling you the detail of it, in
17 fact, we have an example of a baby going into Nazareth
18 Lodge and that not necessarily working out terribly
19 well. So the arrangement, as I was discussing with you,
20 may not have been as bad as it first appeared in terms
21 of being separate, because there was a specific
22 place designed to look after her.

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. What -- the social work records do record on 31st
25 December 1976 -- by this stage you had moved to Marmion.

1 If we look at 111210, please, it records that -- if we
2 can just scroll down, please, so we can see, because it
3 is something you talk about in your statement, HIA 154
4 about the nightmares that you had. It is quite clear
5 that the nightmares that you were having in Marmion by
6 this point were causing the staff particular concern.

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. You had seen a doctor, who had given you some medication
9 to help you relax and sleep, and certainly a suggestion
10 that if things continued to be as bad as they were at
11 this point, then you would be referred on to
12 a psychiatrist to try and help with the nightmares.

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. I think you were agreeing with me that the records then
15 in the file show that thankfully things improved as the
16 time went on and ultimately you weren't referred on.
17 The nightmares began to lessen --

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. -- in severity and number. Certainly it appears from
20 this record that the staff were of the view that what
21 you were recollecting was experiences that you had seen
22 in your home involving your mum and dad and the
23 particular distress that that caused. That's -- that
24 was their analysis at the time.

25 Just to complete the picture then, what became the

1 Eastern Health Board then obtained a Parental Rights
2 Order over you in 1977. If we look, please, at 111213
3 -- sorry -- 111115. If we go back, 111115. Yes. This
4 is the Parental Rights Order of May 1977, because you
5 talk in your statement about being -- you use the phrase
6 a "ward of court" and thought it was 1975 --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- at the time you were in Nazareth, but it looks like
9 this is -- it happens in 1977. If we just scroll down
10 to the bottom so the Panel can see the date on the
11 document, please, 23rd May 1977, by which time, as the
12 document itself shows, you are already living in
13 Marmion.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. The record that was on the screen was a document from
16 October '77 that recorded some of your nightmares as
17 saying -- you waking up and saying, "All right. Don't
18 hit me". So that's material that's there later in
19 the -- in the documents.

20 So that's the potted or shortened history of what,
21 as you know, is a thick file of material, but the actual
22 part that relates to Nazareth is limited in that there
23 is the discharge entry that exists, but not really much
24 beyond that unfortunately.

25 If we look, please, at 4422, which is the record

1 that the Sisters of Nazareth had, if we move, please, to
2 the next page -- 4427, please -- this is the discharge
3 then of you leaving, HIA225 -- just scroll down, please
4 -- It's the bottom one -- as you were leaving Nazareth
5 Lodge in November '75 and that's into the hands, as it
6 were, of a social worker.

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. When I named NL 264 , you remembered --

9 **A. Yes, yes.**

10 Q. -- her as someone who worked with you and I think you
11 had positive memories --

12 **A. Yes, yes.**

13 Q. -- of her.

14 You describe, HIA 154, and we have touched on them,
15 in paragraph 3 of your statement the abuse that you say
16 Father Brendan Smyth engaged in. You've set that out in
17 the statement. I'm not going to go into the detail of
18 that with you unless there is anything else you want to
19 say about it. I don't think there is anything else you
20 want to say.

21 **A. No, no.**

22 Q. That's recorded then in the police statement of 2012,
23 albeit not in 1995. I think you said to me earlier you
24 didn't feel ready to talk about that?

25 **A. No, no, not at the time, no.**

1 Q. Then in paragraph 5 of your Inquiry statement -- I am
2 not going to bring it up -- you talk about what another
3 individual who worked in Nazareth did to you. You
4 remember him taking you round to the toilets. They were
5 at the side or back of the premises.

6 **A. Back, back of the premise.**

7 Q. That was HIA135.

8 **A. Back of the kitchens I think it was. Back of the**
9 **kitchen.**

10 Q. Back of the kitchen?

11 **A. Yes. The toilets were out there.**

12 Q. You have explained again to the Inquiry what -- you
13 talked to the police about that in 1995 --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- and you have talked to the police in 2012 and since
16 then. Is there anything else you want to say about
17 those matters or are they covered in the document that
18 the Panel has access to?

19 **A. No, I think they're covered all right, you know. It is**
20 **all down there, so ...**

21 Q. You talk in paragraph 6 of your statement about the
22 Mother Superior. The only thing I will say to you, as
23 I said to you earlier today, the Inquiry has not
24 received any other complaint about that particular

25

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. You yourself didn't remember the name --

3 **A. No.**

4 Q. -- but your sister put a name to the person you were
5 describing.

6 **A. Yes, yes. That jogged my memory. So ...**

7 Q. That's why you have that particular name.

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. The Panel are aware of who that is.

10 The Mother Superior that you refer to, paragraph 6,
11 as being the person who would have done the hitting --

12 **A. Well, I don't know if it was actually the Mother
13 Superior, but it could have been one of her, you know
14 ...**

15 Q. Yes. You said to me you are not sure if it was
16 ultimately the Mother Superior. It might have been one
17 of the other nuns. The Mother Superior at the time
18 would have been a lady called **SR 154** .

19 **A. That clicks.**

20 Q. I think that's a name that you remember, but again the
21 Inquiry has not heard any other complaint about her.
22 What I understand you to be saying is it might have been
23 a different nun who did the hitting, not necessarily the
24 Mother Superior.

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. But what you did say in your Inquiry statement is that
2 the nun that you remember was SR 157

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. She was in charge of your group that you resided in --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- and that she was very kind to you --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- and have a positive memory about her.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. I have covered -- the last two questions that we would
11 ask people when they give evidence, HIA225, I was
12 explaining to you at the end of the Panel's work they
13 have to consider what recommendations they might make to
14 the Northern Ireland Government about three areas. The
15 first is some form of apology; then, secondly, some form
16 much memorial; or, thirdly, some other means of redress.
17 We ask each witness whether there's anything they want
18 to say to help the Panel's thinking about those issues.
19 Is there anything you want to say to the Panel about
20 those things?

21 A. No, no.

22 Q. The last question we ask each witness, HIA 154 is
23 whether there is anything else about their time in the
24 home we are investigating -- at the moment it is
25 Nazareth Lodge -- whether there is anything else about

1 their time in Nazareth Lodge that maybe I have not
2 covered correctly, or covered in the detail you want to
3 cover, or perhaps just something else that isn't there
4 that you want to make the Panel aware of. Now is your
5 opportunity to do that. Is there anything that
6 I haven't covered or --

7 **A. No.**

8 Q. -- is there anything else you want to say in any more
9 detail --

10 **A. No.**

11 Q. -- than we have?

12 **A. No. I'm okay.**

13 Q. Okay. I'm not going to ask you any more questions. If
14 you bear with me for a short time, the Panel Members may
15 want to ask you something.

16 Questions from THE PANEL

17 MR LANE: Just to clarify one point: the toilets that you
18 were mentioning, they were outside, were they?

19 **A. They were definitely out the back of the kitchen, so
20 they were.**

21 Q. So would they have been used by children when they were
22 playing outside?

23 **A. I would say so, yes. I would say so.**

24 Q. That was the point of them.

25 **A. Yes, yes.**

1 Q. They weren't used during the daytime when playing inside
2 or in the dormitories?

3 **A. No, no.**

4 Q. Thank you.

5 CHAIRMAN: Well, **HIA 154** that's all we want to ask you.

6 Thank you very much indeed for coming to speak to us
7 today about your experiences. We have your written
8 statement, of course, which we've read as well as what
9 you've told us, but thank you for coming today.

10 **A. Okay. Thanks for having us.**

11 **(Witness withdrew)**

12 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, I am dealing with
13 the next witness, but perhaps if we took a short break
14 so that I can just have a word with **HIA 154**

15 CHAIRMAN: Yes, of course.

16 (3.20 pm)

17 (Short break)

18 (3.45 pm)

19 **ALAN CHARD (called)**

20 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, the next witness
21 today is Alan Chard and he is aware, Chairman, you are
22 going to ask him to affirm.

23 **ALAN CHARD (affirmed)**

24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, Alan. Please sit down.

25

1 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

2 MR AIKEN: Now, Alan, I'm going to bring up on the screen
3 the first page of your witness statement. I trust it is
4 7047. Can you just check that is the first page --

5 **A. Yes, yes, it is.**

6 Q. -- on the hard copy you have?

7 **A. Yes, it is.**

8 Q. If we go through to the last page at 7050, can you
9 confirm that's the last page and that you've signed your
10 witness statement?

11 **A. Yes, that's right.**

12 Q. And want to adopt the contents as your evidence to the
13 Inquiry?

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. The Inquiry has had, the Panel has had your statement
16 and had the opportunity to read the content of it. Your
17 qualifications are set out in it, and having spent
18 a lifetime in social work, you retired in 2006.

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. As you know, what we are looking at is one particular
21 instance and perhaps I think the only instance in your
22 career where you were asked to step out of your role
23 within the Trust where you were based and be part of
24 an independent panel or be the independent member of
25 a panel within the Nazareth Lodge structure or the

1 Management Committee that was looking at particular
2 allegations that had been made against a member of
3 staff.

4 **A. That's correct.**

5 Q. As we were discussing earlier, the Panel have been
6 receiving elements about this story from a variety of
7 sources, because various trains, as I describe them,
8 were travelling all at the one time. So you had these
9 allegations being made to Judith Chaddock, the Social
10 Service Inspectorate Inspector, and she had conveyed
11 them to the home, and at the same time she had made the
12 various Trusts of the three children who were affected
13 aware of the allegations, and then they began to do
14 an investigation from their perspective on behalf of the
15 children.

16 As I was discussing with you, the Panel have heard
17 from David Gilliland, who explained that he met with Pat
18 Kinder, and the three things that he wanted as far as
19 his advocacy on behalf of the various Trusts was to
20 ensure that there was an investigation, that it had
21 an independent element to it and that during it the
22 member of staff concerned, SR18, wasn't working with
23 children. Those three requirements he explained to the
24 Panel were all achieved. The one that involved
25 an investigation with an outside element coming in

1 turned out to be you.

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. You were explaining to me -- perhaps if I let you just
4 explain in your own words to the Panel how it came to be
5 you. By that if you just explain who Pat Kinder was,
6 who your Chief Executive was, and where you then ended
7 up being nominated that's ended you up many years later
8 sitting talking to me today.

9 **A. I may have said in my statement that I wasn't aware of**
10 **the process by which I was chosen. I now am. It**
11 **appears that there was a telephone call from Pat Kinder,**
12 **who was the Honorary Secretary of the Management**
13 **Committee of Nazareth Lodge, who was also a former Chair**
14 **of the Eastern Health & Social Services Board, to my**
15 **Chief Executive, Dr Colin Patten, who was the Chief**
16 **Executive of the Trust, asking for somebody from the**
17 **Trust to be nominated to be the independent member of**
18 **the subcommittee enquiring into these allegations. So**
19 **it would have -- that sort of personal contact would**
20 **have probably considerably shortcircuited the process,**
21 **but, as I say, I haven't been really aware until**
22 **recently that that was the process by which I was**
23 **chosen.**

24 Q. The position, as you explained it to me, was you had no
25 prior involvement with Nazareth Lodge of any kind. You

1 had had some involvement with the Adolescent Unit that
2 had some mental health element to it of St. Joseph's
3 that was now on the site, the same site as Nazareth
4 Lodge, different building, but same site, but you had no
5 involvement with Nazareth Lodge.

6 **A. Not only did I have no involvement, but our Trust was**
7 **not in the habit, just for geographical reasons, of**
8 **placing children or young people in Nazareth Lodge. So**
9 **in that sense I really was independent in relation to**
10 **it.**

11 **Q.** Just to put this in context, Pat Kinder phoning your
12 Chief Executive, did that put pressure on you in terms
13 of, "Right. Better get this right", not that you
14 wouldn't have been trying to get it right, if you
15 understand me, but is that a common thing, that the
16 former Head of the Eastern Health & Social Services
17 Board is talking to your Chief Executive, which results
18 in a job for you to do?

19 **A. No, it didn't, because at the time I was unaware of that**
20 **particular process. All I knew was that our Chief**
21 **Executive had asked or probably told me to be a member**
22 **of that particular inquiry panel. I wasn't aware at**
23 **that time and, in fact, until very recently that that**
24 **was how it came about. So there was no additional**
25 **pressure.**

1 Q. The Inquiry Panel are aware of the various letters.
2 I am not going to bring them up again now. Just to set
3 the scene, the -- at the end of the November the South &
4 East Belfast Trust on behalf of **NL 173** and his
5 sister had written to Nazareth Lodge about the elements
6 that related to those children.

7 On 11th December of 1995 -- just for the Panel,
8 I will give you -- the reference is at 19313. On 11th
9 December 1995 Judith Chaddock wrote to the head of the
10 home, SR194, explaining what a member of staff had had
11 to say. She seems to have distinguished out the things
12 that were purely NL170 complaining about practices from
13 the events that related to the children that NL170 could
14 talk about, and those were dealt with by letters from
15 the Trust. That letter is at 49392.

16 Then David Gilliland had written on behalf of the
17 North & West Belfast Trust writing on behalf of NL168.
18 He wrote twice, once just at the end of November -- his
19 colleague, Judy Ferguson, who I think you ultimately met
20 -- and then again on 19th December he wrote setting out
21 fifteen issues that he expected to be addressed. That
22 was 19315 through to 19317.

23 What's missing from that -- that's three trains that
24 are en route: North & West Belfast, South & East Belfast
25 and Judith Chaddock on behalf of the SSI -- what's

1 missing is the Craigavon & Banbridge train relating to
2 NL164. We'll see right at the end of the process how
3 that was remedied, but at the time you became involved
4 you were aware of the **NL 173** issues, you were
5 aware of the NL168 issues and you were aware of the
6 Judith Chaddock issues that came from NL170.

7 **A. Yes. So it was two Trusts and the Social Services**
8 **Inspectorate at that time that we were aware of, yes.**

9 Q. It just so happened in any event that the letter from
10 North & West Belfast that related to NL168 and the
11 fifteen issues that affected her, some of the NL164 ones
12 were covered in any event in the NL168 fifteen, if I can
13 put it that way.

14 **A. Yes, yes, they were.**

15 Q. What we can see then is Mr Gilliland writing at the
16 start of January setting up a meeting between you and
17 Judy Ferguson and the subcommittee, and there's a letter
18 of 17th January from Pat Kinder to Barbara McDermott,
19 who is in Craigavon & Banbridge -- the NL164 element --
20 confirming that by the date of that letter the
21 subcommittee had been set up. That was 17th January.
22 Just for the Panel that's at 19314.

23 If we just look at paragraph 7 of your statement at
24 7048, please, Alan, you explain that to the best of your
25 recollection you as a subcommittee -- and just to be

1 clear who that was, so you are performing this
2 independent element?

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. Also was **SR 43**, who was the Regional Superior?

5 **A. Regional Superior of the Order, yes.**

6 Q. Based in Dublin?

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. But on the Management Committee of Nazareth Lodge?

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. And the third member was -- do you want to just explain
11 who that was?

12 **A. Yes. Mrs Frankie McNally, who was a member of the**
13 **Management Committee and was also a lecturer at the**
14 **University of Ulster. So Sister Hilary -- sorry --**
15 **Mother -- and Mrs McNally were both members of the**
16 **Management Committee and I was the independent element**
17 **in that trio.**

18 Q. The process involved you reading what material had been
19 received and also speaking to NL170 --

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. -- and we will come back to that shortly -- Judith
22 Chaddock, the SSI Inspector --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- and SR18.

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. You don't recall the subcommittee itself talking to the
2 children concerned --

3 **A. No.**

4 Q. -- although there is one document that suggests that
5 might have happened, but your recollection is more that
6 their issues were set out in the correspondence that you
7 received and then you spoke to these other individuals
8 personally about those matters.

9 **A. Yes, that's right.**

10 Q. We touched on in our discussion earlier the issue of
11 NL170. You were having to cast your mind back about the
12 circumstances of meeting NL170, because she has now
13 given a statement to the Inquiry. I am just going to
14 show you paragraph 34 of that, please, at 7491. As you
15 know, she had worked in Nazareth Lodge for a period,
16 then left Nazareth Lodge and ultimately began working in
17 Down & Lisburn Trust. So she worked in the same Trust
18 as you, albeit she was based in Newcastle and you were
19 in Lisburn. I think you were saying to me she is not
20 someone known to you.

21 **A. I don't recall her having been a Trust employee, but**
22 **I do recall speaking to her about her allegations.**
23 **I can only assume that that was that she contacted me as**
24 **a member of the investigation subcommittee rather than**
25 **a senior member of staff in the Trust, because**

1 **I wouldn't have had any line responsibility in relation**
2 **to her.**

3 Q. Her recollection as far as paragraph 34 is concerned is
4 she is saying as a result of conversations that she had
5 she presumably found out perhaps through her bosses that
6 you were doing this in the subcommittee.

7 A. **Her Senior Social Worker would probably have been aware**
8 **that I was doing it, yes.**

9 Q. As a result of that she -- her recollection is a meeting
10 takes place where she then explains to you what as far
11 as she's concerned the position was. I was asking
12 you -- you then would have taken what she told you and
13 shared that with your colleagues.

14 A. **Yes, I would have.**

15 Q. You had indicated -- if you just want to explain to the
16 Panel -- it wasn't a question I asked you earlier, but
17 you were explaining the view that you formed of NL170
18 and how she was explaining to you. Like a lot of people
19 looking back over this length of time, you don't have
20 a precise detailed memory of matters, but there are
21 certain things, feelings and things that stick with you
22 from this investigation, and you were going to mention
23 one of them to do with NL170.

24 A. **Yes. I was very -- I have a very clear recollection**
25 **that she was a clear-thinking, truthful, credible person**

1 **in relation to her concerns and seemed to have thought**
2 **her concerns through carefully and sensibly. That's**
3 **a recollection I very clearly have.**

4 Q. So you remember being essentially impressed --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- from your discussion with her --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- and that then fed into your thinking as part of
9 looking at this invest... -- looking at matters.

10 **A. I recall feeling that what she was saying was credible,**
11 **yes.**

12 Q. What happens then, this investigation is taking place.
13 Presumably you had a series of meetings with your two
14 colleagues --

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. -- who were having to come up with a view about this.

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. Then there's a memo from Barbara McDermott, who is in
19 the NL164 train, the Craigavon & Banbridge Trust. If we
20 bring up, please, 49463, this is of 27th February.
21 Ultimately the Management Committee meeting we are going
22 to look at is 4th March. So this is shortly before
23 that. This is saying:

24 "The investigative team have concluded an interim
25 report and spoke only to the two other young people who

1 have made a direct complaint."

2 Now your recollection is you had actually received
3 from their social workers letters setting out their
4 position.

5 **A. Yes, and the records I think do show that somebody at**
6 **least on the subcommittee had spoken to the young people**
7 **as well.**

8 Q. "It would appear that the issue of re NL164 had been
9 overlooked."

10 What they mean or what ultimately that seems to mean
11 is that correspondence setting out NL164's position had
12 not been received from the Banbridge & Craigavon Trust
13 or Craigavon & Banbridge. It was agreed that that would
14 be dealt with by NHB137, his social worker, who the
15 Panel have heard from, speaking to NL164 pretty much
16 immediately and finding out was there anything more he
17 wanted to say so that that could feed into your work,
18 albeit it seems that already a report, which we are
19 going to shortly look at, had been drafted, and:

20 "Then the report would be prepared and forwarded to
21 Alan Chard prior to Monday, 4th March, when the
22 Management Committee would meet."

23 So it looks like Barbara McDermott knows that the
24 date is already set for the Management Committee
25 meeting. The report that you and I are about to look at

1 is already drafted --

2 **A. Uh-huh.**

3 Q. -- but you are going to get this information coming to
4 you and that's ultimately on 1st March.

5 **A. It was described as an interim report in that memo. In
6 fact, it was I think probably our final report had been
7 drafted by that stage.**

8 Q. Yes.

9 **A. So when the letter came from NHB137, that was included
10 with the report as an appendix or an addendum.**

11 Q. Yes. It was simply given to the Management Committee --

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- to consider alongside your report.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. That's borne out by the content of the Management
16 Committee minute. If we see that letter, please, at
17 19323. 19323. There we are. That's the letter from
18 NHB137 of 1st March that ultimately we will see received
19 to in the minutes, because, as you say, you simply
20 passed it on, because the three of you weren't going to
21 start and rewrite the report that you already completed.

22 The second page of that, if you scroll down through,
23 please, on to 19324, shows -- just scroll on down to the
24 bottom so we can see that's NHB137's letter.

25 Then we are now heading towards the Management

1 Committee meeting of 4th March. You explain in
2 paragraph 8 of your statement, please, if we can go back
3 to 7048, about the nature of your findings. Your
4 recollection is you found some of the allegations
5 clearly substantiated; there was a considerable degree
6 of substance in others; and:

7 "We could come to no conclusion on a small number."

8 **A. Could I add that that was my recollection prior to**
9 **having seen a copy of the actual report --**

10 Q. Yes.

11 **A. -- but I think that recollection is fairly accurate in**
12 **the light of having seen the report subsequently.**

13 Q. A memory that you -- the thing that stuck in your mind
14 you said to me earlier was two things. One you have
15 said here is you recall the minibus in Donegal and the
16 person being left to --

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. -- make their own way, as it were. That was something
19 that struck in your mind --

20 **A. Oh, yes.**

21 Q. -- and has stayed in your mind.

22 **A. Yes. I've always had a very clear memory of that**
23 **allegation, yes.**

24 Q. I think you said there was a second one.

25 **A. Yes. That was about SR18 reading aloud to a group of**

1 **staff and residents a newspaper cutting about NL168's**
2 **brother having been arrested. It sounded a fairly sort**
3 **of strange thing to do.**

4 Q. So although you don't remember the detail and the
5 documents refresh your memory of the detail, those are
6 two things that stay as a memory of --

7 A. **Oh, yes.**

8 Q. -- doing this --

9 A. **Yes.**

10 Q. -- particular piece of work?

11 A. **In terms of detail, I mean, I recall before I saw these**
12 **documents where NL164 was put out of the minibus, for**
13 **example, the name of the place. So it was a sort**
14 **of very clear memory, just I think because of the scale**
15 **of it as an event.**

16 Q. I wanted just to ask you about that in terms of the
17 scale of these things. This is '95/'96. Obviously we
18 were discussing earlier the world had moved on and
19 things were now being investigated in much more detail
20 and steps being taken to do something as opposed to --
21 I think you made the point they weren't being covered up
22 in the same way as might have been in the past.

23 Certainly within the Trusts a more vigorous
24 investigatory process was taking place over incidents,
25 and as the scale of the incident -- what produced a much

1 bigger investigation was even a small incident by this
2 point in time, but how did these types of matters that
3 you were looking at as part of this investigation --
4 where would they have sat on the scale for you as
5 someone who you had to do investigations in your own
6 Trust of your own homes that you were responsible for?
7 Where did these sit?

8 **A. Well, certainly the minibus one, for example, would in**
9 **my view have been sort of near the top of the scale then**
10 **and the reading aloud to a group of residents wouldn't**
11 **have been, you know, far short of that. They would**
12 **still have been viewed as extremely serious events, but**
13 **you are right, nothing perhaps as serious as some**
14 **perhaps things that would have been investigated in the**
15 **past, but nevertheless still, you know, putting children**
16 **or young people at either physical or emotional risk.**

17 Q. I was asking you earlier on as best you could if these
18 type -- those two examples that you give, if they had
19 been something that happened in your Trust, what would
20 have happened to the employee who was responsible for
21 them if found?

22 **A. They would have been dismissed for gross misconduct.**

23 Q. Even in '95/'96?

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. So they are -- whatever the threshold that was

1 pertaining in '95/'96 --

2 **A. Well above the threshold, yes.**

3 Q. -- these were still things that would have had serious
4 consequences?

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. One of the matters that comes out of the report -- now
7 if we just bring up, please, 19320, which is the elusive
8 report, and we are going to come on to talk about how
9 that came to be the position in respect of it, but you
10 recognise the document now that you see the report?

11 **A. I do, but I have only seen it today for the first time**
12 **in twenty years.**

13 Q. I was asking you to the extent you remember were you
14 likely to have been the one that drafted it and you
15 weren't sure?

16 **A. I'm not sure, but it's certainly possible.**

17 Q. I was asking you whether this was ultimately the
18 unanimous view of the Panel whenever this report was
19 completed.

20 **A. Yes. To my recollection yes, it was. I don't certainly**
21 **recall any of us disagreeing.**

22 Q. As you know, there's no -- the Inquiry does not engage
23 in cross-examination, but one of the matters that comes
24 out of the document is the way certain matters are
25 phrased, where they are almost -- they could be either

1 "Yes" or "No", the thing happened or it didn't happen,
2 and the language that's used is, "We accept there's some
3 validity in this allegation".

4 You were explaining to me in some detail the
5 circumstances that led to that type of language being
6 used and the message you were receiving about what was
7 expected of you.

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. Can you just explain to the Panel that signalling and
10 message that you picked up and you recall even today?

11 **A. My recollection is very clearly that there was**
12 **a message -- now how it was delivered I'm not clear --**
13 **but that the level of proof that would be required by**
14 **the Management Committee would be extremely high and**
15 **that, therefore, unless we could absolutely provide sort**
16 **of clear proof, that we were precluded from making a --**
17 **thinking something was substantiated, and some of those**
18 **allegations are by their nature something that you could**
19 **never provide sort of cast-iron proof, but my view would**
20 **be that where we have said, "We accept that there is**
21 **some validity in this allegation", it was almost code**
22 **for the fact that, "Yes, this is true on the balance of**
23 **probabilities", but we couldn't act -- shall we say that**
24 **-- because I was getting the very clear message that the**
25 **Management Committee wouldn't accept things at a lower**

1 **standard of proof. Does that sort of clarify? It's**
2 **a sense or a feeling, but again it's real in that, you**
3 **know, I recall it very clearly.**

4 Q. I was asking you how -- because it certainly wasn't the
5 case that Pat Kinder or **NL 35** or anyone else from
6 the Management Committee came to you and said, "Now
7 look, this is how you have to do this" --

8 A. **No, but the other two members of the subcommittee were**
9 **members of the Management Committee.**

10 Q. That's an impression that stuck with you, that you
11 remember being aware that there was a high threshold.

12 A. **We needed to prove things to a very high degree of**
13 **proof, yes.**

14 Q. The document contains -- if we just scroll down through,
15 please -- the report looks at -- if we just scroll on to
16 the next page, please, and go towards the bottom of the
17 document, there are seventeen matters that in effect are
18 dealt with as part of the report. If the memo from
19 Barbara McDermott is accurate, this report was already
20 concluded. So you had had your meetings in order to
21 come to a view about it --

22 A. **Yes.**

23 Q. -- and had written them down by 27th February in all
24 likelihood.

25 A. **Yes.**

1 Q. Then you were you to go to the Management Committee on
2 4th March.

3 **A. Yes. I think the document would probably have been**
4 **circulated to members of the Management Committee prior**
5 **to our meeting. So that would fit in with the fact it**
6 **was already written at that stage.**

7 Q. If we just look, please, at the Management
8 Committee minute of 4th March, which we will find at
9 49402, please. Do you have -- again it's not
10 necessarily the precise detail at this remove -- but do
11 you have a memory of this meeting taking place?

12 **A. Yes, I do have a very clear memory of at least parts of**
13 **it.**

14 Q. Can you give the Panel a sense of -- and I think you
15 deal with this in paragraph 9 of your statement. If we
16 just bring that up, please, at 7049, and then we'll come
17 back in a minute. In paragraph 9 you say to the Panel
18 that:

19 "My recollection of that meeting was that the
20 Management Committee members, especially the Chair", who
21 was **NL 35**, "and the Honorary Secretary", who was
22 --

23 **A. Pat Kinder.**

24 Q. -- Pat Kinder, "questioned us in considerable detail
25 about our conclusions and that they appeared to be

1 reluctant to accept a number of these on the grounds
2 that they appeared to require a higher standard of proof
3 than was possible due to the nature of the allegations.
4 I recall feeling that the questions of members of the
5 Management Committee appeared to be defensive of
6 Nazareth Lodge and of SR18."

7 Now I have been commenting to various social workers
8 that I've met that they use a gentler language than
9 perhaps lawyers do, but is that code for you saying
10 there was a lot of heat that night on you or your three
11 -- the three of you?

12 **A. There was not any heat. It was all very civilised, but**
13 **I did feel uncomfortable in that I did very clearly feel**
14 **that we were being -- again being asked to justify our**
15 **even sort of fairly minor conclusions. Again it's led**
16 **back to this standard of proof thing. I don't know that**
17 **the phrase "Prove it" was actually used, but that was**
18 **the sense that I got, that the Management Committee and**
19 **I think especially the Chair and the Honorary Secretary**
20 **were extremely defensive, and it may be an exaggeration**
21 **to say they were hostile towards the report, but they**
22 **certainly didn't receive it with any sense of joy that**
23 **I recall. They were -- they were -- it was**
24 **uncomfortable. I do remember that very clearly as**
25 **a member of the subcommittee.**

1 Q. We were discussing earlier -- if would go back to
2 the minute of 4th March, if we go back to 49402, and
3 this is a minute that runs across three pages. I want
4 to ask you just about the third page. So if we move
5 through to 49403 and (iv), because what's written down
6 -- if we just scroll a little further down, please, to
7 (iv) -- just a little further down -- you can see what's
8 recorded:

9 "The Committee noted the limited nature of the
10 inquiry and that the allegations were made not by any of
11 the children allegedly involved but by social workers
12 who were in different ways involved with the children.
13 He also decided to accept as the standard by which
14 an allegation should be considered as one of proof on
15 the balance of probabilities".

16 I think when you had the opportunity to read the
17 minute, you thought that was signalling some reluctance
18 towards the approach that you'd taken.

19 **A. I actually thought that was exactly the opposite to what**
20 **happened in that other members -- the members of the**
21 **Management Committee did not wish to use the balance of**
22 **probabilities standard but a higher one. Beyond**
23 **reasonable doubt I think it's probably called.**

24 Q. I think the point you made to me earlier was that it was
25 actually as a result of interviewing SR18 and the

1 concessions that she made during those discussions that
2 allowed you on a number of occasions when you did say,
3 "This is -- we accept this occurred", in effect.

4 **A. Yes. I suspect that all the ones -- I haven't got them**
5 **in front of me, but certainly the vast majority, if not**
6 **all the ones, which we found substantiated were**
7 **substantiated by the fact that SR18 had agreed that they**
8 **were true.**

9 Q. And it was likely to be those other ones where you were
10 saying, "We accept there's some validity to this", where
11 you are not using legal language, but essentially you
12 are saying, "We think it is more likely than not this
13 occurred".

14 **A. I think that would be fair. Our instinct was probably**
15 **that they had occurred, but that, you know, we could not**
16 **produce chapter and verse.**

17 Q. So you had come along to the Management Committee to
18 speak to your findings, you and your two colleagues.
19 Then another memory that you have, which you don't think
20 is necessarily accurately recorded in (iii) of
21 this minute, are the circumstances by which you left the
22 meeting.

23 **A. Well --**

24 Q. This is, as I understand it, factually accurate.

25 **A. Yet. It says:**

1 "... Mr Alan Chard, who had left the meeting prior
2 to the considerations given to the report."

3 That is factually true, but that was not voluntary.
4 I was asked to leave the meeting because I was not
5 a member of the Management Committee who were going on
6 to consider what action they should take on foot of our
7 report. So I (a) was asked to leave the meeting and (b)
8 I was asked to leave my copy of the report behind, and
9 again with a 20-year gap, those are very, very clear
10 memories. So it must have come as -- both must have
11 come as quite such a shock to me that I have still such
12 a clear memory of them to date.

13 Q. Is that because you were explaining to me earlier you
14 had assumed that when you were asked to come along, you
15 were going to assist in the discussion about, "What do
16 we do about this now?"

17 A. I thought it would be a collegiate, cooperative event
18 and the sort of level of questioning and the fact that
19 I was asked to leave and leave my copy was not really
20 what I had expected.

21 Q. The record doesn't show you being asked to -- it is
22 recorded that you were thanked for your participation.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You've left the meeting. The leaving of your copy isn't
25 reflected.

1 **A. No.**

2 Q. But is that the position, that you were left in no
3 uncertain terms that your report was not to be taken by
4 you and given beyond to anybody else?

5 **A. Yes, because I had some inquiries subsequently from**
6 **various social workers about getting a copy of the**
7 **report and I had to tell them that I did not possess**
8 **one.**

9 Q. We will look at that in just a moment, but the -- in
10 fact, we will look at that and then I will come on to
11 the issue that I want to you address. You -- one
12 example of what you are talking about is on 25th March.
13 If we look, please, at 49471, there is a letter to you
14 from Barbara McDermott. Now she's ultimately involved
15 in the chain that relates to NL164 in Craigavon &
16 Banbridge. She has clearly phoned you and is then
17 recording in the conversation that has taken place --
18 she's writing to you:

19 "I write formally to you as an involved member of
20 the inquiry team seeking formal written communication
21 regarding the outcome of the above. Obviously in terms
22 of maintaining accurate records on both NL164's file and
23 the need for the Trust to have an outcome regarding the
24 above, it is essential we have some form of written
25 communication in respect of the above. I appreciate it

1 has been a difficult and indeed lengthy period of
2 assessment, but bearing in mind Craigavon & Banbridge
3 Trust became aware of this in the week before Christmas
4 '95, I feel that the time lapse is now crucial in terms
5 of a formal response.

6 I look forward to hearing from you as soon as
7 possible."

8 So she's phoned you up looking for the result and
9 then has followed that up to you in writing. I presume
10 the conversation that took place would have been you
11 telling her you didn't have the report and weren't in
12 a position to give her it.

13 **A. I suspect so and I suspect she felt that she needed to**
14 **sort of get rather more formal about the matter.**

15 **Q.** Then you wrote back to her on 4th April. If we look at
16 49472, you say:

17 "Thank you for your letter.

18 The inquiry team reported to the Management Board on
19 4th March. As I was the only member of the inquiry team
20 not on the Management Board, I was not present for their
21 discussion of any action on the basis of our report.

22 I am, however, surprised that you have had no
23 information about the decision of the Management Board
24 yet either directly or via David Gilliland."

25 As it turns out, he was separately writing not to

1 you but to --

2 **A. Nazareth.**

3 Q. -- Nazareth, to Pat Kinder, in fact, following a similar
4 path.

5 "I have taken the liberty of forwarding a copy of
6 your letter with a covering letter of my own to Nazareth
7 Lodge in the hope that this will prompt a reply."

8 Now I haven't got -- the Sisters of Nazareth have
9 produced some material that relates to this issue.
10 That's where we got a copy of the report. The letter
11 that might have been received from you wasn't among
12 those papers and there doesn't seem to have been a copy
13 on any of the other papers that we've got to date, but
14 it seems you passed on or were going to pass on
15 Barbara's request and put with it a covering letter
16 which I presume would have said something like, "Perhaps
17 you could help them out here".

18 **A. Yes. "Please contact." Something like that, yes.**

19 Q. But this single example raises an issue that we've
20 touched on with you not taking a copy of the report away
21 and that is the degree to which this mechanism allowed
22 for the communication of the result, because you've got
23 three Trusts who are waiting to know what they are in
24 a position to tell their children and close their file
25 effectively on this period of their work. You are

1 expressing, again perhaps using gentle language, the
2 surprise that they don't yet know what has happened and
3 that you are not really in a position to help them. How
4 would you describe that as a scenario, albeit back in
5 1995/'96?

6 **A. I think I can't put it better than I have in the letter,**
7 **that I'm surprised that they -- I was surprised that**
8 **they hadn't been informed of the outcome, but again**
9 **maybe on reflection maybe not in that I think, you know,**
10 **the Management Committee were sort of fairly controlling**
11 **of the amount of information they gave out I suspect,**
12 **and, you know, theoretically one should have been**
13 **surprised, but maybe in reality maybe not.**

14 **Q. Well, this was obviously a period -- we are moving into**
15 **the Children's Order. There's a move towards more**
16 **openness and transparency. Reflecting back or even as**
17 **you thought at the time as best you can, if it was**
18 **something that stuck with you, was this an effective**
19 **way -- I am not criticising your participation in it --**
20 **was this an effective way to deal with these problems**
21 **that seem to have presented themselves in this home?**

22 **A. You see, when you say "problems", all I was aware of,**
23 **not having connect with Nazareth Lodge, was complaints**
24 **about the actions or inactions of one particular member**
25 **of staff, who with hindsight was clearly unsuited to**

1 that particular role.

2 I would also say that what happened in relation to
3 our investigation was a vast improvement on what might
4 have happened a decade previously, but was fairly
5 inadequate in terms of, you know, what would have
6 happened today or even ten years afterwards. So it was
7 an improvement on the past but, you know, obviously sort
8 of quite flawed as a process, because the institution
9 still kept total control of that particular process.

10 Q. Well, one of the matters the Inquiry has heard about,
11 there was a debate has gone on during this period and in
12 the ten years prior to it between the Department as
13 a regulator, on one hand, and the Boards, Trusts, on the
14 other, as responsible for the individual children, and
15 the vehicle for this seems to have been three Trusts who
16 use the home with one coordinator, which was David
17 Gilliland, but with the home itself investigating. So
18 the Department appear to have passed the information on
19 and the home then investigates and the Trusts struggle
20 it seems to get the information in the way you're
21 describing.

22 The point, if I've collected it correctly, is it was
23 a better position than not investigating these things --

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. -- which might have been the case in times before, but

1 not necessarily a very effective way of achieving the
2 ultimate end, which was to find out: what exactly
3 happened here and what needs to be done about it?

4 **A. In relation to regulation and inspection and**
5 **investigation, I mean, I think there are much more**
6 **sophisticated and independent procedures available**
7 **today. I am not saying they are perfect, but they --**
8 **you know, they would certainly be a great improvement on**
9 **what we went through on that occasion.**

10 Q. Alan, I'm not going to ask you any more questions. It
11 may be that the Panel Members may want to ask you
12 something about your involvement in these matters, but
13 if you just bear with us for a short time. Thank you.

14 Questions from THE PANEL

15 CHAIRMAN: Alan, may I just ask you something further about
16 the way in which the full committee responded to the
17 conclusions of the subcommittee, of which you were the
18 independent member? Would it be fair to say that there
19 are two possible -- perhaps more -- but certainly two
20 possible ways of looking at this? The first is perhaps
21 subtly but significantly different from the second. The
22 first is clearly it was a serious situation that was
23 being described. The consequences were possibly very
24 serious for the institution as well as the individuals
25 and therefore the members of the Management Committee

1 might have wished to satisfy themselves that you had
2 really done your job thoroughly.

3 The alternative reading of the situation, of course,
4 might have been that they really didn't want to hear the
5 message you were giving them, to be blunt about it.

6 **A. I'm fairly clear that it would have been the latter,
7 just because of my recollection of the nature of the
8 questions from especially the Chair and the Honorary
9 Secretary. My recollection is that other members of the
10 Management Committee said very little.**

11 Q. Yes. Thank you very much.

12 MS DOHERTY: Thanks. Can I just -- I think I know the
13 answer to this, but, I mean, in a way what I see here is
14 a summary of conclusions. There's very little evidence
15 or rationale for -- for where you came. You know, even
16 that discussion of which level of evidence, well, there
17 doesn't appear to be any evidence. Was anything else
18 given up? Was this the sum total of what went to the
19 committee?

20 **A. With hindsight I would be at least as critical as you
21 are of the way that that is presented. I'm not sure
22 what influenced that format quite frankly, because it
23 would not have been the same had I been investigating
24 a complaint within our own Trust, but I have no
25 particular explanation of why it turned out like that.**

1 Q. You just saved yourself answering the second question,
2 because that was going to be my follow-up.

3 The other issue is whether there was any attention
4 at any time to a notion of how SR18 was managed and how
5 her work was supervised within the home. Was there any
6 discussion with her -- you know, the officer in charge
7 or how this could have been allowed to happen?

8 **A. Not that I will recall, no.**

9 Q. So it was very much seen as one individual acting in
10 a particular way?

11 **A. Yes, one sort of unsuitable member of staff acting in
12 a particularly unsuitable way, yes.**

13 Q. As opposed to any notion of what was the overall
14 management in the home.

15 **A. Of systemic origin, yes.**

16 Q. Systemic, yes.

17 **A. No. It was very much investigating the individual
18 complaints in relation to individual children and young
19 people.**

20 Q. Was there any sense of any follow-up? I mean, this
21 notion that this young boy was kind of kept within the
22 home and things, was there any view about that, I mean,
23 because there are some very serious issues just about
24 the overall management of the home?

25 **A. Again this may be sort of the benefit of hindsight.**

1 I am -- you know, were that to happen today, I would
2 certainly have been pestering the home to find out what
3 had been done both in relation to the staff member and
4 the children. I think it was a combination of the kind
5 of messages that I got, however subtly, that my work was
6 done and, secondly, I think frankly because the Honorary
7 Secretary happened to have been a former Chief Executive
8 of the Board which employed me, and I suspect I was
9 slightly intimidated, but that's a guess.

10 Q. Yes, I can understand that. The last is just a matter
11 of clarity, because I am just trying to be clear. At
12 the start of the minutes it suggests that the Panel met
13 with the complainants, but that's not your memory, that
14 you met with the --

15 A. My memory -- I have no memory of meeting with the
16 children and young people, but I'm fairly clear there is
17 a record which is very clear we did. It's just I don't
18 remember.

19 Q. Thanks very much. I appreciate your ...

20 MR LANE: Were you actually asked to keep the contents of
21 the report confidential and not discuss them with other
22 people?

23 A. You mean after the Management --

24 Q. After the meeting, yes.

25 A. No, I don't recall a specific request, but not having

1 a copy would have, you know, hampered me a little bit,
2 were I wishing to share them anyway. I suppose the
3 message that I was not allowed to keep a copy was as
4 good as saying, "Keep it confidential".

5 Q. Right, and you mention that the findings were unanimous.
6 Was that really the case? Were the other members of the
7 panel arguing for the conclusions you had reached as
8 firmly as yourself?

9 A. I don't recall any disagreements and I suspect that our
10 conclusions were the -- if you like, the lowest common
11 denominator that we could get unanimity on. That would
12 be my guess, but I don't recall any particular either
13 disagreements or agreements in relation to conclusions,
14 but my guess is that it would have been we concluded
15 what we could all agree on.

16 Q. One other question, something I might have missed. Was
17 your work you were doing prior to being asked to take
18 part in this, was it undertaking inquiries of this sort
19 in your Trust?

20 A. Part of it was, yes.

21 Q. So the reason for your choice would be obvious,
22 therefore. It was a reasonable selection to ask you to
23 do that?

24 A. Yes, in that I was reasonably senior, reasonably
25 experienced and, you know, had reasonable knowledge of

1 **that area of work, yes.**

2 Q. Thank you very much.

3 CHAIRMAN: Just to underline one thing by way of a perhaps
4 rather minor correction. As you have I think corrected
5 us, Mr Kinder had been the Chief Executive and not the
6 Chairman of the Board that had ultimately --

7 **A. Sorry. Did I --**

8 Q. No, no. You said Chief Executive. I think we said
9 Chairman, but --

10 **A. He was Chairman of the Management Committee, but**
11 **obviously --**

12 Q. I think he was the Honorary Secretary of the Management
13 Committee.

14 **A. Sorry. He was Honorary Secretary of the Management**
15 **Committee.**

16 Q. He had been the Chief Executive --

17 **A. The Chief Executive of the Eastern Health & Social**
18 **Services Board, yes.**

19 Q. So he was a very senior person indeed.

20 **A. Probably the most senior operational person within**
21 **Health and Social Services Northern Ireland, yes.**

22 Q. The Eastern Board being the biggest --

23 **A. Yes, exactly.**

24 Q. -- and therefore the Chief Executive of the Eastern
25 Board is chief among equals, if I may put it that way.

1 **A. Exactly.**

2 Q. Well, thank you very much indeed for coming to speak to
3 us this afternoon. I know we have all found that
4 extremely helpful. Thank you very much indeed.

5 **A. Thank you.**

6 **(Witness withdrew)**

7 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, I am pleased to
8 say that concludes today's oral evidence.

9 CHAIRMAN: Well, we managed to finish a little bit earlier
10 than yesterday. I am sure everyone is relieved at that,
11 but we will resume again in the usual way tomorrow
12 morning.

13 (4.20 pm)

14 (Hearing adjourned until 10 o'clock tomorrow morning)

15 --ooOoo--

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I N D E X

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

WITNESS NL4 (called)2
 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY2
 Questions from THE PANEL126

WITNESS HIA154 (called)129
 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY129
 Questions from THE PANEL145

ALAN CHARD (called)146
 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY147
 Questions from THE PANEL175