

-----  
HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE INQUIRY  
-----

being heard before:

SIR ANTHONY HART (Chairman)

MR DAVID LANE

MS GERALDINE DOHERTY

held at

Banbridge Court House

Banbridge

on Thursday, 30th April 2015

commencing at 10.00 am

(Day 114)

MS CHRISTINE SMITH, QC and MR JOSEPH AIKEN appeared as  
Counsel to the Inquiry.

1 Thursday, 30th April 2015

2 (10.00 am)

3 MARION REYNOLDS (called)

4 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. Can I, as  
5 usual, start by reminding everyone to ensure that their  
6 mobile phone has either been switched off or placed on  
7 "Silent"/"Vibrate" and also remind you that no  
8 photography or indeed recording is permitted either in  
9 the chamber or anywhere on Inquiry premises.

10 Yes, Mr Aiken.

11 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, good morning.

12 The first witness today is Marion Reynolds. Marion is  
13 aware, Chairman, you are going to ask her to take the  
14 oath.

15 MARION REYNOLDS (sworn)

16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Marion. Please sit down.

17 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

18 MR AIKEN: Marion, on the screen is I hope what you will  
19 tell me is the first page of your witness statement that  
20 you have given to the Inquiry.

21 **A. It is.**

22 Q. If we can move through, please, to 9041, and if we  
23 just -- can you confirm that's the last page of your  
24 statement?

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. And you want to adopt the contents as your evidence to  
2 the Inquiry?

3 **A. I do.**

4 Q. The Panel have had access and considered your statement  
5 already, Marion. What I am going to do is summarise  
6 a number of matters and then ask you to deal with some  
7 particular issues rather than spend a very long time  
8 going through the various steps.

9 You explain that you came -- I will just get you to  
10 confirm for the record if you would. Your date of birth  
11 is?

12 **A. 13th November 1950.**

13 Q. You had been prior to 1992 working in the Eastern Board?

14 **A. I worked in the Down Lisburn Unit of Management of the  
15 Eastern Board.**

16 Q. And that included having responsibility for a children's  
17 home?

18 **A. That's right.**

19 Q. And that was a small unit of eight beds which would have  
20 been typical of the type of residential provision within  
21 the Eastern Board that the Eastern Board itself  
22 provided?

23 **A. Yes. It was one of the new builds that the Board built  
24 in -- I think in and around the 1970s/'80s under a  
25 standardised plan for a children's home.**

1 Q. Then you decided to move over to the Department and took  
2 a post in the Social Services Inspectorate as  
3 an Inspector in 1992?

4 **A. That's correct.**

5 Q. Ultimately that led to you being involved in the  
6 January 1993 inspection of Nazareth Lodge?

7 **A. That's right.**

8 Q. You were explaining to me earlier that really prior to  
9 that you -- your area had been the Western Board homes.  
10 You had taken over from Kevin O'Brien?

11 **A. Dennis O'Brien.**

12 Q. Dennis O'Brien, and that -- that was the area of -- the  
13 children's homes from that area that you would have  
14 normally inspected?

15 **A. Yes. When I went to the Department, I was given  
16 the lead role for the Western Board, which was all of  
17 our family and childcare services, but in addition to  
18 that I was responsible for inspecting children's homes.  
19 So in 1993 I inspected as one-off inspections Nazareth  
20 Lodge and St. Joseph's Children's Homes on the Ravenhill  
21 Road, but that would have been unlike the Western  
22 Board's children's homes, where I would have had  
23 an ongoing role.**

24 Q. So this was an unusual thing, that you moved out of the  
25 area that you normally looked after, and you don't

1 recall why you were asked to deal with Nazareth Lodge  
2 and St. Joseph's on this particular occasion?

3 **A. No, I don't. It was unusual, because inspectors usually**  
4 **would have had a period of time inspecting in an area so**  
5 **as they built up expertise about the homes.**

6 Q. Your -- just so we get the order of this correctly, the  
7 Assistant Chief Inspector who was above you was Norman  
8 Chambers.

9 **A. That's right.**

10 Q. And then the Chief Inspector who was above him at your  
11 stage in 1992 was Kevin McCoy.

12 **A. Correct.**

13 Q. That's the structure that there was within the Social  
14 Services Inspectorate.

15 **A. That's right.**

16 Q. Am I right in saying that you understood the function of  
17 the Social Services Inspectorate to be carrying out the  
18 Department's statutory obligations to make sure that  
19 children's homes were being run in a manner and in  
20 keeping and on principles that were in the best  
21 interests of children?

22 **A. That's right.**

23 Q. The discussion we were having earlier, I was asking you  
24 about what training or guidance you were given about how  
25 you were to do this job. You were saying to me, which,

1 as you know, came as a surprise to me, that there was  
2 written guidance that was made available to assist you  
3 with how to do this. You have agreed kindly to lift off  
4 your shelf whatever version it is that you still have  
5 and that will come across to us. You are not sure  
6 whether that's the version that would have applied in  
7 1992, but we'll begin then a course of enquiry with the  
8 Department to see if we can get the series of guidance  
9 that would have been available.

10 **A. There were inspection manuals which were updated from**  
11 **time to time.**

12 Q. And you know you have --

13 **A. So the one I have I am not sure which period it covers.**

14 Q. Because you remained as an Inspector until 2006.

15 **A. That's right.**

16 Q. And then --

17 **A. Well, that's -- it's right in that I was employed by**  
18 **Social Services Inspectorate until December 2005, but**  
19 **the Inspectorate lost its inspection function in**  
20 **relation to children's homes in and around '96 --**

21 Q. '96?

22 **A. -- because they set up their arm's length inspection**  
23 **units after the Children Order. So we weren't**  
24 **an Inspectorate at that stage.**

25 Q. Thereafter you returned to the Eastern Board?

1 **A. That's right.**

2 Q. So you're an individual who has moved from Board to  
3 Department and back to Board again?

4 **A. Correct.**

5 Q. Therefore, you'd have some understanding of the various  
6 tensions that the Inquiry has been hearing about about  
7 who was to do what, how to do with managing complaints  
8 and getting to the core of what was happening.

9 **A. Well, I was never conscious in my practice that there**  
10 **was a tension between the Board and the Department in**  
11 **relation to the investigation of complaints.**

12 Q. So that's not something you were aware of?

13 **A. It wasn't something I was conscious of, no.**

14 Q. And just so that we identify the documents, if we move,  
15 please, to 14307, this is a summary report, which is  
16 a shortened bullet point form of your much more detailed  
17 inspection report from January 1993. That finishes --  
18 it's a four-page document. It finishes on 14310 with  
19 your list of recommendations.

20 **A. Uh-huh.**

21 Q. If we just look at the recommendations. Then we also  
22 have, if we move on to the next page, what is described  
23 as a Checklist for Inspection of Children's Units.

24 I presume this was a document internal to you that was  
25 just to assist you in making sure you'd done all the

1 things you were supposed to do. It's presumably set out  
2 in the manual you're describing.

3 **A. Uh-huh. Yes.**

4 Q. Then if we can move through, please, to 15298, and that  
5 is the first page of the actual full report.

6 **A. Uh-huh.**

7 Q. If we look at 15331, which is page 29 of the report,  
8 this is the end of section 13. The page before at 15330  
9 has the start of the seventeen recommendations --

10 **A. Uh-huh.**

11 Q. -- that you made, and then you have appendices that run  
12 from 15332 and they go through to 15352. That includes  
13 you exhibiting various certificates of fire, the type of  
14 matters that are recorded in the 1975 Voluntary Home  
15 Regulations.

16 One of the -- I just want to ask you before we leave  
17 this document, if we look at 15343, just so you can give  
18 the Inquiry some context, you set out in Appendix 4,  
19 which runs for about five pages, a list of the untoward  
20 incidents that were recorded for the year that you were  
21 inspecting, and I was asking you whether this was in  
22 terms of the level of untoward incidents typical of  
23 a home of this size or whether there was anything  
24 exceptional about it. You were saying to me this was --  
25 in fact, it was low for the number and size of the home.



1    **A. Well, in my view it would have been, because at some**  
2       **stage during the year prior to the inspection the home**  
3       **was operating at over thirty children, and they were --**  
4       **they had a large number of teenagers admitted for short**  
5       **periods of time, and I think two of the children**  
6       **accounted for fourteen of the untoward events. So it**  
7       **didn't strike me as a high number.**

8    **Q. Yes, and one of the systems issues that we were**  
9       **discussing earlier, I was asking you whether when you**  
10      **were tasked with doing this job of looking at Nazareth**  
11      **Lodge, there was any central resource in terms of**  
12      **a chronology, knowledge within the Department, that you**  
13      **could reach for and see in the '83 inspection there were**  
14      **the following problems. In the '84 one there were these**  
15      **issues, which was a repeat of what the position was in**  
16      **'83, and so on through to your period of 1993.**

17            You were saying to me there was no such central  
18      resource that you could access to know some history of  
19      what difficulties the home had been having and whether  
20      those difficulties had ever been properly dealt with.

21    **A. No. There was no central resource. One would have**  
22      **expected if there had been something of concern that you**  
23      **would have had a briefing in respect of that from the**  
24      **inspection manager. As I explained to you earlier, when**  
25      **I was taking over the inspection of the Western homes,**

1       the previous Inspector, who had inspected for many  
2       years, he briefed me on each of the homes. So that was  
3       the process whereby you would have acquired information,  
4       but there was no formal departmental register of  
5       incidents, no.

6    Q. Yes. What I was saying to you when we were having that  
7       discussion, what if that person is off sick and you are  
8       given this job? How are you going to know, and even in  
9       that handover where they are giving you a general feel,  
10      they are not going to be in a position, for instance,  
11      like this home, to tell you about the various  
12      difficulties that arose in 1984/1985 --

13   A. Uh-huh.

14   Q. -- the specifics of that, perhaps five, ten pages for  
15      you to read to prepare yourself in terms of a chronology  
16      of what had gone before. That just didn't exist.

17   A. No, there didn't and, I mean, as I explained to you  
18      earlier, there has to be a balance between having  
19      information that you need to have and also not being  
20      coloured particularly by past information, I mean, which  
21      would have maybe not given you the opportunity to judge  
22      organisations as they currently were operating. So  
23      I think there is a balance, but there isn't -- there  
24      wasn't a central repository of information, no.

25   Q. Therefore, for instance, you wouldn't have known the

1 views from the -- we will call it the first document  
2 back from 1983 that gave you some idea of the feel of  
3 the place against which could you judge how you found it  
4 when you turned up ten years later?

5 **A. No, there was nothing that would have done a direct**  
6 **comparison between ten years previously.**

7 Q. Or anything in between?

8 **A. No.**

9 Q. Therefore you are -- this is not a home that you were  
10 yourself necessarily familiar with when you are coming  
11 to it to do this job.

12 What was it like for you coming into it in 1993?

13 Now I say that, and before you answer it I will  
14 acknowledge the caveat you gave me -- you are smiling  
15 over it -- which is you were not a fan of the large  
16 institutional type structures like this one.

17 **A. No. Well, I have been fortunate in my practice to work**  
18 **in a unit of management which had a range of small**  
19 **children's homes. So, therefore, I wasn't used to**  
20 **visiting larger children's homes or institutions. So**  
21 **that was my experience.**

22 When I went to these larger homes, which were large  
23 institutions, and in the case of Nazareth Lodge really  
24 in quite an institutional setting, because it had  
25 a primary school, a nursery school, a secondary school,

1 and another large children's home all on the one campus,  
2 so that would have been not my expectation of  
3 a children's home, but having said that, once you got  
4 into the homes the Sisters had made considerable effort  
5 to personalise the homes, to make them domestic in  
6 nature, and they had done that as much as they could,  
7 given the structure of the buildings and the premises  
8 that they had, but I felt that because of where policy  
9 was going, that these homes were in the transition.  
10 They had been very large. They were reducing in size,  
11 and to me it was inevitable at some stage in the future  
12 these homes would no longer have a function, but in the  
13 meantime that they should operate in a way which was as  
14 domestic as they could make them, and I do think that  
15 considerable effort was put into making them as domestic  
16 as they could within each of the units.

17 Q. Yes. So the unit itself did reasonably resemble what  
18 a small children's home would look like, albeit when you  
19 went out that double door, you were into something that  
20 obviously wasn't a small children's home?

21 A. That's right.

22 Q. I'm going to use a colloquial phrase. Cutting to the  
23 chase, because there is 29 pages of your report and I am  
24 not going to pour over it, but you will probably tell me  
25 understandably you don't have an acute memory of the

1 detail, what's written there is what you found at the  
2 time and what you did.

3 I want to ask you about things you might remember  
4 even now, which is your impression of -- there is three  
5 units. As I understand it, at the time they were headed  
6 up by three Sisters: SR194, SR10 and SR18. I want you  
7 just to explain to the Panel, cutting to the chase, your  
8 analysis of how each of those units were headed up.

9 **A. Well, the only thing I can really remember about this**  
10 **inspection is my perception of the three Sisters.**

11 I remember thinking that SR10 was a very motherly  
12 person and very warm towards the children. SR194  
13 I thought was professional, but a bit aloof. SR18 I --  
14 there was something about her that I felt I couldn't  
15 rely on what she was saying was totally accurate.  
16 I have no evidence to support that feeling. It was just  
17 my gut instinct at the time.

18 Q. Just stepping back before we -- dealing with SR10, you  
19 gave me an example when we were speaking earlier of  
20 a family that had been looked after by her. Can you  
21 just tell the Panel what they said to you about --

22 **A. Uh-huh.**

23 Q. -- their experience with her?

24 **A. Well, when I moved to the Eastern Health & Social**  
25 **Services Board, one of my principals had adopted two**

1 girls from Nazareth Lodge when they were in their upper  
2 end of primary school. I had -- she was talking to me  
3 about them being in Nazareth, and I said when  
4 I inspected, I thought SR10 was a very motherly person,  
5 very warm with the children. She said, "My girls loved  
6 her", and she said, "and they would talk very positively  
7 about her". I know both of those girls have gone on.  
8 One of them is now vice head of a primary school in  
9 England. The other is married here in Northern Ireland  
10 with children. I know from talking to their mum that  
11 she would herself say that they got a very good standard  
12 of care from SR10.

13 Q. So that's an anecdotal endorsement --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- as it were, of the impression you had from spending  
16 a week in the home. All of it wouldn't have been spent  
17 with SR10, but in the time you spent with her that's the  
18 impression you formed.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Similarly SR194 you regarded as professional, but your  
21 impression was of an aloofness. Can you just explain to  
22 the Panel what you mean by that?

23 A. Well, she wouldn't -- I didn't get the feeling that she  
24 was chatty, you know. She kept our relationship on  
25 a very formal Inspector/head of unit basis. So I didn't

1           **feel I got, you know, that sort of rapport with her.**

2           **That's what I mean by "aloof" --**

3    Q.    Yes.

4    A.    -- but there was never anything in her practice that  
5           **alerted me to anything untoward at all.**

6    Q.    And --

7    A.    I don't mean cold by "aloof". I just mean, you know,  
8           **she kept what she probably saw as a proper distance**  
9           **between herself and an Inspector.**

10   Q.    Yes, and there is nothing in what you are describing  
11           that you are suggesting that was her approach to the  
12           children she was looking after?

13   A.    No, and, I mean, I would have read the voluntary  
14           **visitors' reports on each month that they visited the**  
15           **home and each of the units, and I think there is none of**  
16           **those where in relation to any of the Sisters there's**  
17           **any concerns expressed about the nature of their**  
18           **relationship with the children.**

19   Q.    I'm going to park that issue for a moment, because that  
20           was the second surprise that you brought me this morning  
21           about the voluntary visitor reports. So leave that and  
22           we will come back to that.

23           So that was your experience of SR194. Your  
24           experience of SR18 you have explained was different.  
25           You gave me one example of a test that you gave where

1           you were sure she was telling the truth.

2   **A. Uh-huh.**

3   Q.   Would you just explain to the Panel what you were asking  
4       and what reply you received?

5   **A. Well, I had a feeling that she wasn't really a**  
6       **particularly straightforward lady, and the home**  
7       **sometimes took children in who were not Roman Catholic**  
8       **children. I am asking the Sisters about this in**  
9       **relation to promoting the religious and cultural**  
10      **practice of non-Catholic children. Then after that**  
11      **I said to her, really to test what respect she had for**  
12      **the parents of children and their views, I said, "Well,**  
13      **if a Roman Catholic mother asked while her child was in**  
14      **your unit that they shouldn't practise, what would you**  
15      **say and what would you do?" She said, "While they were**  
16      **here, they would practise". So I realised that she was**  
17      **-- in terms of her faith that's probably the right**  
18      **answer, but really what I was trying to test was what**  
19      **her respect was for the parents of children.**

20   Q.   And the views whether their approach --

21   **A. Views.**

22   Q.   -- to life would be respected --

23   **A. Respected and promoted in the home.**

24   Q.   -- or they would have to do something different.

25   **A. Uh-huh.**



1 Q. You said to me with a smile that that was an occasion  
2 where you were sure she was telling you the truth --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- about her approach, but, as you say, there was  
5 nothing that you felt you were in a position to write in  
6 a report.

7 **A. No, there wasn't.**

8 Q. This was a personal feeling that you had, which we all  
9 have, and maybe it is no more than how human beings  
10 react. This was not a person that you had that  
11 connection with that you had a different connection, for  
12 instance, with SR10.

13 **A. Uh-huh. I think all of us assess people and we have**  
14 **a gut instinct and really that was my gut feeling about**  
15 **the three sisters. I hadn't previously known them.**  
16 **I hadn't previously met them and that was my feeling**  
17 **about them.**

18 Q. You raise in your report -- I will just use the summary  
19 for this, because it is an issue that has -- at 14308,  
20 please, this is on the issue of staffing, because in  
21 fairness at this stage the home is -- the children in  
22 the home, if we just scroll down, please, to the  
23 section on staffing -- there's I think less than 30.  
24 There's 26 children in the home. There is 15 and  
25 a half -- I don't know how that quite works -- maybe it

1 is 15 and a part-time person or number of part-time  
2 people, residential social workers in post.

3 Now you are still not terribly satisfied. The level  
4 is still regarded by you as low, but just for the Panel,  
5 who have seen some very different figures in terms of  
6 the ratio at an earlier point in time, this was more  
7 resembling a typical children's home now in terms of the  
8 staff complement. It was on the low side, but not  
9 sufficient to have you saying, "Well, they can't look  
10 after the children properly here".

11 **A. No, it was low and it meant there had to be**  
12 **an over-reliance on the Sisters when there was staff**  
13 **leave or staff sickness or resignations. So it put --**  
14 **because there wasn't any spare capacity, it meant that**  
15 **the Sisters were having to make up for any deficits in**  
16 **the staffing arrangements, and then that had a knock-on**  
17 **effect on their ability to discharge their management**  
18 **functions.**

19 Q. We will come -- it's not a matter for you, but two years  
20 later we will hear from a witness later on who is  
21 describing there only being one member of staff on at  
22 night and having to cover. So those are the types of  
23 problems that you are identifying --

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. -- that perhaps weren't necessarily then fixed by 1995,

1 but it certainly was a more realistic proposition than  
2 might have been the case in the past --

3 **A. Uh-huh.**

4 Q. -- by this point in time.

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. You'd carried out your week of being in the home in  
7 early January --

8 **A. Uh-huh.**

9 Q. -- of 1993. Then out of the blue you receive  
10 a telephone call from a gentleman called **NL 269**.  
11 I'm just going bring up your note. That's at 19070,  
12 please. The note moves on to the second page. If we  
13 just move on to the second page for a moment, 19071, we  
14 can see at the bottom that it's signed by you. Then  
15 there's an annotation from Norman Chambers that we'll  
16 come back to.

17 So if we go back up, please, to the first page, and  
18 just to summarise the position, it was unusual for you  
19 or a Social Services Inspectorate Inspector to get  
20 a call like this.

21 **A. I had never had a call like that before and I hadn't one**  
22 **subsequent to it. So I think it was -- it wasn't that**  
23 **we would have been regularly having vexatious people**  
24 **phoning in to make complaints in my opinion.**

25 Q. So this was -- if I said this was an exceptional thing,

1 that's probably fair?

2 **A. In my view, yes, that would be right.**

3 Q. You had no knowledge of this person, didn't know  
4 anything about him.

5 **A. No.**

6 Q. He wanted to say to you what he said. He raised  
7 a series of matters that -- is it fair to say most of  
8 them were in the serious category for the conduct of --  
9 in a children's home?

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. If we scroll down, please, the type of issue, for  
12 instance, that he's recording about not telling social  
13 workers of children about things that have happened in  
14 the home --

15 **A. Uh-huh.**

16 Q. -- that was something that he was expressing that --

17 **A. Which paragraph?**

18 Q. At the very bottom he is talking:

19 " **NL 269** claims that the field social worker had  
20 told him that she did not feel she was 'told the whole  
21 story' by residential staff."

22 **A. Uh-huh.**

23 Q. " **NL 269** stated it would have been general practice  
24 in his unit not to contact field social workers without  
25 the team leader's consent."

1     **A. Uh-huh.**

2     Q. Was that an unusual practice? Before you answer that,  
3     can I just put the context of this? By now they were  
4     operating the key worker mechanism --

5     **A. Uh-huh.**

6     Q. -- where you would have a particular relationship with  
7     the child and then you would have that liaison with the  
8     social worker.

9             Would that have been regarded as unusual by you,  
10     that the head of unit, as it were, would have to  
11     sanction communication with the field social worker?

12    **A. There was a different practice in the home. Some units'**  
13    **staff could, but in the unit that [REDACTED] NL 269 [REDACTED] was**  
14    **employed in obviously he couldn't. I personally would**  
15    **have felt that the key workers should have been able to**  
16    **talk freely to the social workers. Maybe if there was**  
17    **something controversial, they might want to discuss how**  
18    **to discuss it with the social worker with the team**  
19    **leader, but in my view it would have been preferable**  
20    **that they would have built up their skills and expertise**  
21    **by having direct contact with the field social worker.**

22    Q. If we scroll down on to the next page, the bullet point  
23    (iv) of paragraph 2 of your note, there's a name the  
24    Panel are aware of from events that happen after this  
25    period of time. That will be dealt with by another

1 witness, but this is a point that he was making to you  
2 on the phone --

3 **A. Uh-huh.**

4 Q. -- that this individual was -- and he gave the a  
5 particular context for the individual, and then they had  
6 the run of the house. Now that's a generic phrase that  
7 people would use --

8 **A. Uh-huh.**

9 Q. -- which may not necessarily have been intended to  
10 convey he is running around every unit in the place, but  
11 it denotes a freedom to move around, come and go.

12 **A. Uh-huh.**

13 Q. That type of message was what was being conveyed by  
14 **NL 269**. Is that a fair assessment of how you would  
15 have understood what he was saying?

16 **A. Yes. I would have understood that he meant that. I'm**  
17 **not sure I wouldn't have taken it that it wasn't**  
18 **necessarily the whole unit, but I would have found that**  
19 **very difficult to understand, because of the way each**  
20 **unit worked --**

21 Q. Yes.

22 **A. -- separately and independently of each other, but I'm**  
23 **not sure with hindsight how I interpreted the run of the**  
24 **house, whether it meant all of the units or the unit he**  
25 **had been resident in.**

1 Q. Whatever it was, that was the message he was conveying.

2 A. Uh-huh. Yes.

3 Q. This person, who was no longer a child in the home,  
4 although he had been previously --

5 A. Uh-huh.

6 Q. -- had a degree of freedom that was not considered  
7 normal by this gentleman who was making the call.

8 A. Uh-huh.

9 Q. Is that a fair assessment of what's recorded?

10 A. Yes. I mean, he obviously felt that it was untoward  
11 that he had that degree of freedom, but if you look at  
12 the voluntary visitors' reports, which you don't have,  
13 they record other children who had left the care coming  
14 back to do visits and being quite regularly in the home.  
15 So it wouldn't be unusual for a child who had spent  
16 a considerable period of time in a residential unit to  
17 come backwards and forwards after they've left. NL165  
18 aged out of Nazareth Lodge. He was not put out because  
19 of his predatory tendencies towards children. So  
20 I don't know why the previous sexual abuse of the child  
21 that he was referring to was of concern to him and it  
22 would be useful to have more information about that.

23 Q. You have mentioned -- we have mentioned the voluntary  
24 visitor reports twice now.

25 A. Uh-huh.

1 Q. I am just going to -- let's pause for a moment and deal  
2 with that. You have had sight of and did have sight of  
3 at the time a suite of voluntary visitors' reports that  
4 -- I think you characterised the Management Committee as  
5 being made up of some very high-powered people and the  
6 voluntary visitor reports you were reading were prepared  
7 by individuals of high calibre.

8 **A. Uh-huh.**

9 Q. Those reports, they had two visitors in effect doing the  
10 work --

11 **A. Uh-huh.**

12 Q. -- and every six months it seemed that one of them did  
13 the writing up and then the next six months the other  
14 one did the writing up. You felt that was a particular  
15 advantage, because then you had more than one person's  
16 perspective and assessment in terms of how they wrote.

17 **A. Uh-huh.**

18 Q. Whatever had happened in the past about how their  
19 regulation 4.2 duty had or had not been carried out,  
20 when you were reporting -- and you deal with this in the  
21 report. I am just going to give the reference, because  
22 it was a question I was going to ask you when we first  
23 met this morning and you explained that you had these  
24 documents. You say:

25 "Members of the Management Committee visit each of



1 the units on a monthly basis. Each unit has two  
2 visitors, one with the remit to talk with staff and  
3 children while the other fulfills the regulatory aspects  
4 of the visit. At the end of six months the two visitors  
5 exchange roles. As required, a report on the visit is  
6 made. Generally all statutory records are signed as  
7 required."

8 That's to be found at SNB-15327. It is section 12  
9 of your report, which deals with the compliance with  
10 statutory regulations. We had a bit of a difficulty  
11 over whether we had those reports. I understand they  
12 exist and we are going to have to sort that wrinkle out.

13 **A. Uh-huh.**

14 Q. But you were in a position to have those documents in  
15 advance of carrying out your inspection.

16 **A. Uh-huh. Before the inspection commenced we would have**  
17 **had all the voluntary visitor reports, the annual**  
18 **monitoring statement and the fire certificate and the**  
19 **medical officer's report. Those would have been**  
20 **provided in advance of the inspection.**

21 Q. Yes. So what you're saying in the context of the  
22 document that's on the screen is there had been  
23 nothing -- as you were listening to what you were being  
24 told, there had not been anything in the monthly visitor  
25 reports that had caused you any concern prior to going

1 to do the inspection.

2 **A. No.**

3 Q. You carried out the inspection and this call then is  
4 coming through two weeks after you've completed the  
5 inspection, but this is what is being said.

6 **A. Uh-huh.**

7 Q. He describes then a series of further issues. So there  
8 were nine issues in total that he was raising with you.

9 **A. Uh-huh.**

10 Q. Then you in your paragraph 3 indicate that you told  
11 **NL 269** that you preferred if he placed his views on  
12 record by writing to you. You read back the notes to  
13 check he was in agreement. He queried what would happen  
14 to his comments. Now he had only worked there for two  
15 months and it would be fair to say he was a young person  
16 starting off in his professional life in social work.  
17 I think he went on to work for or within one of the  
18 Boards. Is that right or --

19 **A. He told me when he phoned that he was at the Gransha  
20 Hospital. I have a feeling, but I would not like to  
21 swear to this really -- it is just an impression -- that  
22 he was on a temporary contact in the Gransha. So it  
23 wasn't a permanent post, but that's an impression that  
24 I have.**

25 Q. Yes, but this is the -- he was a young man --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- having worked for a short period in Nazareth Lodge,  
3 who for whatever reason felt the need to pick up the  
4 phone in a fairly for you exceptional way. He's listed  
5 out his nine complaints. You said to him about putting  
6 them in writing, which presumably would have been  
7 an entirely normal thing to request, that he effectively  
8 put in a statement to you with this so you could take it  
9 forward referring specifically to him?

10 **A. Well, I think it was to make sure that what I had**  
11 **written, although he had confirmed it verbally, that**  
12 **there was a written record that what I had written**  
13 **actually was more than verbally confirmed by him. That**  
14 **was the purpose, not because it would add weight or**  
15 **detract from what he had said if he didn't write in.**

16 Q. That sentence:

17 " **NL 269** queried what would happen to his  
18 comments",

19 does that essentially convey he was a bit concerned  
20 about getting caught up in this? He felt the need to  
21 tell you about it, but didn't necessarily want to become  
22 Witness A?

23 **A. I don't -- I did not take it as that. I thought he**  
24 **wanted to know he would be taken seriously. That's how**  
25 **I think I interpret what I've written there.**

1 Q. Right. If we just scroll down a little further, you  
2 said that the draft report was written and would be with  
3 the home in the near future. Some points that he'd  
4 raised had already been covered in that format.

5 Now can I just pause there? For you at the time the  
6 fact that -- in terms of assessing, "What weight should  
7 I put on this. Is this a crank call? Is this a ....?",  
8 he was telling you I think in all but three instances  
9 that we will briefly look at the same things that you  
10 had yourself found. Presumably for you then that gave  
11 weight to what he was telling you that perhaps you  
12 didn't know.

13 **A. I think that's right, yes.**

14 Q. You indicate his comments would, however, be followed up  
15 in discussion. He asked to receive a copy of the report  
16 and you said he would have to write in, because it  
17 was --

18 "I advised him to write in requesting a copy of the  
19 summary report, as at this time the main report was the  
20 property of the administering authority."

21 Now did the summary report get published --

22 **A. The summary --**

23 Q. -- at this point?

24 **A. The summary report was provided to the staff and to**  
25 **parents. At some stage -- now I don't know if it was --**

1 I had thought I always prepared a children's format of  
2 the report, but there isn't any on the file for this.  
3 So it might have been --

4 Q. A later development.

5 A. -- a later -- but I used to prepare a one-page summary  
6 of the findings for the children. So I would have been  
7 quite happy for him to have had a copy of the summary  
8 report --

9 Q. Yes.

10 A. -- because he was an ex-member of staff.

11 Q. But can I just pause there at that last sentence where  
12 you say it's the property of the administering  
13 authority? Perhaps that's not -- the language of that  
14 is not quite -- it's obviously the Department's report.  
15 You share it with the administering authority of the  
16 home. Was it still the position that even by 1993 the  
17 report that you had prepared as the regulator, as it  
18 were, was not given to the Boards who were placing  
19 children in the home?

20 A. I think that's right. I think we encouraged the  
21 administering authority at that stage to share them.  
22 I think it was after that that then the reports went to  
23 the Boards as well, but I can't -- I honestly don't  
24 know. I can't recall.

25 Q. Well, is it fair -- do you recognise an issue feeding

1 into the -- I was making you aware there have been lots  
2 of evidence about the complaints mechanism, the Board  
3 doing -- having to investigate things --

4 **A. Uh-huh.**

5 Q. -- instead of the Department investigating things. Here  
6 you have the Regulator of the Department doing the  
7 inspecting and preparing a very detailed report.

8 **A. Uh-huh.**

9 Q. Is there not a problem with that not being available to  
10 the Boards who are placing children in the home?

11 **A. Well, as I say, I do think and I know from my experience**  
12 **with Sisters of Nazareth in Derry that they did share**  
13 **their reports with the Western Board. I just -- I don't**  
14 **recall. I know that the view was that the report was**  
15 **the property of the administering authority and that we**  
16 **encouraged them to share it with the Board, but**  
17 **that's --**

18 Q. Where did that view come from, because it couldn't  
19 possibly be the property of the administering authority?

20 **A. I must have been -- I must have been told that.**

21 Q. That's what I am -- I just want to ask you about that,  
22 because it's the Department is the Regulator with the  
23 statutory function --

24 **A. Uh-huh.**

25 Q. -- to inspect and are producing a report on their

1 inspection.

2 **A. Uh-huh.**

3 Q. How could that ever be the ownership of the  
4 administering authority, but that's something you  
5 clearly were told?

6 **A. Well, it's something I clearly believed and I must have  
7 been told it, because I don't know where I would have  
8 formed that view otherwise, but I -- I don't recall, but  
9 I know we did encourage and I know that the Nazareth  
10 home in Derry did share their report.**

11 Q. Let's say we were dealing with a children's home that  
12 didn't do that.

13 **A. Uh-huh.**

14 Q. You were -- you as the Regulator were relying on the  
15 voluntary home that you're inspecting, that you might be  
16 for all anyone knows very heavily criticising, and the  
17 people who are putting children in this home will only  
18 get the report if you've persuaded the administering  
19 authority sufficiently to share it.

20 **A. Well, that sounds bad, but I don't -- I honestly don't  
21 know the answer. So I don't want to speculate, but  
22 I was of the view that it was a matter for the  
23 administering authority to share the main report, but in  
24 terms of the summary I had no difficulty with anyone who  
25 replied to the questionnaires or staff getting that and**

1           **they were prepared really for those -- for that purpose.**

2    Q.   Am I right in saying, if I have understood what you are  
3       saying about that, again the summary didn't necessarily  
4       go to the Board either?

5    A.   **No, it didn't.**

6    Q.   Now going back to the issue that's embedded in this  
7       note, you've had this call. You've got the nine issues.  
8       You've talked to him about putting it in writing. You  
9       obviously go and talk to your boss about this call.

10   A.   **Now I can't recall the conversation, but it would be  
11       very unlike me to have got that note and not to have  
12       gone and talked to him about it.**

13   Q.   Because he then writes a note. This is Norman Chambers  
14       annotates. As we have come to see from civil service  
15       documents, one writes their response on it. It is:

16           "Ms. Reynolds,

17           While **NL 269** expression of concern confirms  
18       your own findings, I don't think it can be used unless  
19       he makes specific complaints in writing.

20           **NL 269** is not entitled to access to the  
21       inspection report or to the summary."

22           So you are being told -- your gut instinct would  
23       have been, "Give him the summary". You are being told  
24       you can't do that. Then just slightly further on:

25           "Should he request in writing, please decline" --



1 scroll down, please -- "and advise him that his comments  
2 have been noted."

3 Now going back to the first paragraph:

4 "While **NL 269** expression of concern confirms  
5 your own findings, I don't think it can be used unless  
6 he makes specific complaints in writing."

7 Then taking the last sentence:

8 "And you can tell him that his comments have been  
9 noted."

10 There wasn't any suggestion in this that you were  
11 going to do anything with the information that you'd  
12 got.

13 **A. No. I mean, I would have taken it that that meant**  
14 **really not to proceed as I would have wanted to, because**  
15 **my practice would have been, regardless of whether it**  
16 **was in writing or whether it had even been anonymous,**  
17 **that we should have pursued it. I would imagine that**  
18 **I have spoken to Norman once I've received this note,**  
19 **but I can't recall.**

20 **Q.** You can't recall. If I put it this way, you tell me if  
21 I'm being unfair. Your directness and modus operandi  
22 would have been on receipt of this note there would have  
23 been quite a reaction by you.

24 **A. I wouldn't have liked it. I wouldn't have liked it,**  
25 **because my instinct, as is obvious from my conversation**

1 with **NL 269**, was that something would be being done.

2 So I had given the commitment that something would be  
3 being done.

4 Q. Not only because of giving the commitment. He was  
5 raising serious issues.

6 A. **Of a child protection nature, yes.**

7 Q. Some of those -- yes. Some of those serious issues were  
8 not things that were covered in your report.

9 A. **That's right.**

10 Q. For whatever reason you are being told, "It is not in  
11 writing. Let him know his comments are noted."

12 A. **Uh-huh.**

13 Q. You say -- if we just look at paragraph 14 of your  
14 statement, at 9041, you say:

15 "My practice prior to this date and subsequently  
16 would have been to make no distinction between either  
17 a written or verbal complaint or an anonymous or known  
18 source of a concern regarding children's well-being and  
19 protection."

20 Now I presume by that you mean, Marion, that you  
21 would have -- you would have carried out an assessment.  
22 You know, if it was an anonymous person who was  
23 complaining about the colour of the sign on the  
24 children's home door, then you would have said, "Well,  
25 that's for the bin", but if it was an anonymous person

1 or an unattributable source who is telling you something  
2 very serious about -- that had an effect on the welfare  
3 of a child, then whether you could use that person as  
4 the source of the information, you would have wanted to  
5 take steps to investigate was there any validity to this  
6 and satisfy yourself that he was a crank calling you, if  
7 that was the position.

8 **A. Well, that was my practice and in previous posts where**  
9 **I had moved where there was a practice if an anonymous**  
10 **complaint came in that we wouldn't investigate, I was**  
11 **very impressed by -- early on in my practice by reports**  
12 **like Maria Colwell where there were thirty anonymous**  
13 **complaints and nobody reacted. So I always told staff,**  
14 **"No matter whether it is anonymous or not, we'll decide**  
15 **if there's a substance to it, but you can't decide**  
16 **unless you make some enquiries". So that was my --**  
17 **always my approach.**

18 Q. Your position was, "What is the issue this person is  
19 raising?", not who the person is or what name they did  
20 or did not give.

21 **A. Or what their motivation was. None of that mattered.**  
22 **Unless you made some enquiries you weren't -- you**  
23 **couldn't rule it out.**

24 Q. Now Norman Chambers has analysed -- and I am not going  
25 to go through the issues. You and I looked at them this

1 morning. I just going to give the Panel the reference.  
2 In paragraph 4.11 through to 4.13 of his statement,  
3 which is at 9164 to 9165, he sets out the three things  
4 that were different in **NL 269** communication.  
5 The first was about NL165, his history, having the run  
6 of the place --

7 **A. Uh-huh.**

8 Q. -- whatever that phrase ultimately meant.

9 The second element was his description of a regime  
10 of fear. The discussion I was having, you weren't aware  
11 of the 1983 documents that the Inquiry has seen.

12 The third element then was this particular family  
13 issue of a co-habitee having interfered with children  
14 having access to the children in the home.

15 Those were the three issues that he --

16 **A. Uh-huh.**

17 Q. -- was raising. Of course, you could, as seems to have  
18 happened at various times, have engaged in a debate,  
19 "Well, is that just a child issue specific to a child?  
20 The Board can investigate that, or are these practice  
21 issues about the attitude of staff and how the home is  
22 run, because if this is happening for one child, is that  
23 not the case that it's happening for potentially all of  
24 the children?" Is that how you -- is it fair to  
25 characterise them as they are practice issues here; they

1 are not just single complaints about a single  
2 individual?

3 **A. They could be evidence of a practice issue, but without**  
4 **having a bit more detail, and if you take the culture of**  
5 **fear --**

6 Q. Yes.

7 **A. -- in the unit that [REDACTED] NL 269 was employed in --**

8 Q. Yes.

9 **A. -- if you look at the voluntary visitors' report,**  
10 **they're talking about that unit having a relaxed**  
11 **atmosphere between the staff and the children. I mean,**  
12 **the voluntary visitors undertaking that and reporting**  
13 **were very eminent people in their own field.**

14 Q. Yes.

15 **A. So --**

16 Q. The unit he was referring to, can you remember --

17 **A. It was SR194's. He worked in SR194's unit.**

18 Q. So you had some basis for assessing whether anything  
19 really more needed to be done about that.

20 **A. Well, I had -- there were bits and pieces of information**  
21 **that I would have had from the voluntary visitors'**  
22 **report and from untoward incidents that I would have**  
23 **known. For example, his comment about the child who was**  
24 **taking drugs --**

25 Q. Yes.

1 A. -- I know that in February of '92 when he was taking  
2 drugs that SR194 reported it to the social worker. She  
3 had contacted a psychiatrist at the Young People's  
4 Centre, who was working with the child.

5 Q. Yes.

6 A. So, therefore, his sanction might not have been in  
7 keeping with the programme that the psychiatrist had set  
8 out. So I had bits of information which were additional  
9 --

10 Q. Yes.

11 A. -- to **NL 269**, but it didn't take away from the  
12 fact that he was raising significant concerns.

13 Q. Yes. I am more looking at the three issues --

14 A. Uh-huh.

15 Q. -- that didn't form part of something you'd already  
16 uncovered.

17 A. Uh-huh.

18 Q. What you have said to the Inquiry is you are unable to  
19 recall -- this is paragraph 15 of your statement at 9041  
20 -- you are unable to recall what further discussions or  
21 action occurred following receipt of the -- this  
22 communication.

23 Now what there is -- because Mr Chambers then said  
24 to the Inquiry that he definitely didn't do anything  
25 with this information. He couldn't say -- let's see if

1 I can find the right language for what ... If we just  
2 look at his statement, please, at 9166, at the end of  
3 paragraph 4.17 he is referring to the circular and makes  
4 reference to complaints in -- he says it is implicit in  
5 this complaints '85 document that the Panel will have to  
6 grapple with that it had to be in writing. he makes  
7 reference to the fact that any other statutory authority  
8 needs things in writing. You explained how that wasn't  
9 your view, but he even acknowledges, 4.18:

10 "Nevertheless it would not have been prudent not to  
11 have taken account of information and concerns that had  
12 been passed on."

13 Then he says this at 4.20:

14 "Whilst I am unable to recall whether I personally  
15 raised **NL 269** concerns with the Management  
16 Committee, I have no reason to think that Ms. Reynolds  
17 would not have pursued with equal rigor the findings of  
18 the inspection and any matters of concern articulated by  
19 **NL 269** when she met the head of Nazareth Lodge.  
20 This view is based on my knowledge of Ms. Reynolds' work  
21 as an Inspector over a number of years."

22 So he had a high view of you. He was expressing you  
23 were a thorough individual who would do her job, but the  
24 note we looked at and the annotation at the end of your  
25 memo was not suggesting you were to do anything. In

1 fact, it was essentially shutting the thing down.

2 **A. Well, I -- my -- if I can start off with the complaint**  
3 **circular, I didn't see this as a matter being dealt with**  
4 **under the complaints circular. I saw this as a child**  
5 **protection matter. So I didn't see the relevance and**  
6 **I still don't see the relevance of that reference.**

7 In terms of -- my instinct would have been on  
8 receipt of the complaint that we should have written to  
9 the administering authority asking them for a report on  
10 the allegation as -- before we signed out the  
11 inspection. That would have been how I would have  
12 envisaged dealing with it, but ...

13 **Q.** His speculation in saying he didn't do anything but he  
14 thinks you might have because of his view of you, if we  
15 look at 9515, this is a letter -- I think you do make  
16 reference to it, but in a different context in  
17 paragraph 15 or 16 of your statement -- this is a letter  
18 written to **NL 269** on 29th March. So this is two  
19 months after the telephone call.

20 **A. Uh-huh.**

21 **Q.** You are saying -- you are referring to the telephone  
22 call and you are saying:

23 "I haven't yet received your written comments ...",  
24 because in the telephone call you said to him about  
25 writing in on the issues raised:



1            "... and I am unable to seek the views of either the  
2            Order or the home's Management Committee on the matters  
3            you raised."

4            So if one takes that letter at face value,  
5            Mr Chambers' hypothesis that you would have in any  
6            event, regardless of this issue about it not being in  
7            writing, have raised it with the Management Committee,  
8            that wouldn't be how one could read this letter, which  
9            is saying, "Unless you put it in writing", which, of  
10           course, is exactly in accordance with your instructions  
11           that are in the memo, "Unless you put it in writing,  
12           I can't take this forward".

13    **A. Well, after the draft report was issued to the**  
14    **authority, as you reminded me, the locus for me --**

15    Q. I was being fair to you, you will confirm to me, Marion.  
16    You were going to concede something that I didn't think  
17    was proper.

18    **A. I didn't really have the locus for being in the home to**  
19    **raise things. So I don't know that I would have had**  
20    **an opportunity to inform them, but I can't recall,**  
21    **because I -- there would have been -- there would have**  
22    **been factual accuracy checks and things like that, but**  
23    **I find it very difficult, because I really do not**  
24    **recall. I know that it would be contrary to every way**  
25    **I worked not to have dotted every I and crossed every T,**

1           **but I don't recall.**

2       Q.   Well, would you have been in the habit of dotting every  
3           I and crossing every T if you had been told not to dot  
4           them and cross them?

5       **A.   Regardless.**

6       Q.   Am I right then in saying, all that being said, there  
7           doesn't seem to be a record that suggests that is what  
8           happened?

9       **A.   I think that's right.   There's no record.**

10      Q.   And your practice would also have been to -- you have  
11         kept, if I may say, a very full note of the call that  
12         you had.   Where you have been told on one view, "Let's  
13         leave this alone now", if you had gone ahead and done it  
14         anyway, maybe it wouldn't have gone on the inspection  
15         file, but you might have kept a note if that is what you  
16         did.

17      **A.   Well, I kept notes of everything and I kept -- I made my**  
18         **own supervision notes.   So after I would have a meeting**  
19         **with my manager, I would have always written down in**  
20         **bullet point form what was discussed and what action**  
21         **I had to take, and I kept those until 2006 when I moved**  
22         **to the Eastern Board, and at the same time all my work's**  
23         **diaries I destroyed except for the preceding ten years,**  
24         **which was the period that I was intended to keep it,**  
25         **because I felt, "My house can't be and archive for**

1 **everything". There's quite an archive in it already.**

2 **So I would have had --**

3 Q. But you don't have and you can't say --

4 **A. -- but I don't have them any more, but I did record**  
5 **supervision with all of my managers over the years.**

6 Q. Is it fair to say, Marion, this is, as far as the  
7 records go, something you are not comfortable about in  
8 terms of how this was dealt with at the time, if the  
9 records are accurate?

10 **A. Well, I -- it would be contrary to my practice and**  
11 **I would have felt we should have written to the Order,**  
12 **yes.**

13 Q. I think you have support for that -- and I will take it  
14 up with Mr McCoy -- you have support for that in what he  
15 has said to the Inquiry. I'll just give the Panel the  
16 reference for completeness. It is at 9144,  
17 paragraphs 35 and 36. Mr McCoy has said to the Inquiry,  
18 as you know:

19 "The matters raised by **NL 269** were of a serious  
20 nature and should have been followed up with the home.  
21 No protocol either within the SSI or the wider  
22 Department that required such concerns to be conveyed in  
23 writing before being acted upon."

24 Those are views that you would agree with?

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. Marion, I also -- just for completeness, I did say to  
2 you and you agreed that you would look in what remains  
3 of your archive to see what other departmental material  
4 you might have that would assist the Inquiry, and you  
5 will come back to me on what you find in addition to  
6 whatever version of the manual you have. We may need to  
7 ask your assistance further and I hope you will be  
8 prepared to do that.

9 **A. Thank you.**

10 Q. I am not going to ask you any further questions now,  
11 Marion. The Panel Members may want to ask you  
12 something. So if you just bear with us for a short  
13 time, please.

14 Questions from THE PANEL

15 CHAIRMAN: Marion, I would like to pursue, if I can, two  
16 quite distinct matters with you. In your report, if  
17 I have noted it correctly, you noted that the staff  
18 during the inspection of Nazareth Lodge were on the low  
19 side. So there was a lack of -- there was over-reliance  
20 on the Sisters to step into the gap if there was a gap  
21 created by a sickness or holiday leave or resignation or  
22 whatever. So the picture, as I understand it, from what  
23 you found at the time was the staffing level was just  
24 about adequate.

25 **A. (Nods.)**

1 Q. It couldn't be condemned as inadequate, but it wasn't  
2 ideal. Is that a fair summary?

3 **A. That would be fair, yes.**

4 Q. Another aspect of the staff attitude was that -- we have  
5 heard ten years before was they felt they weren't --  
6 their views weren't even asked, let alone given any  
7 weight at all. Did you get any impression that was the  
8 position as far as the staff vis-a-vis the Sisters were  
9 concerned?

10 **A. Well, there was different views expressed by staff, and**  
11 **in the report I mention that some staff did feel that**  
12 **their views were of secondary importance. Now as part**  
13 **of the inspection I would have spoken to as many staff**  
14 **and children, visiting social workers and if there were**  
15 **parents visiting as possible. So by my action I sought**  
16 **to give staff the impression and the view and the**  
17 **acknowledgment that their points of view and their**  
18 **comments were as important to me as the managers of the**  
19 **home.**

20 Q. But some of the staff, but not all, therefore, indicated  
21 a degree of unhappiness with the position. Is that what  
22 you picked up?

23 **A. Yes. Some of them obviously felt they weren't being**  
24 **given enough freedom to act or their views weren't taken**  
25 **into account --**

1 Q. And was it --

2 **A. -- but, as I say, that wasn't overall. That was ...**

3 Q. No, no. That's exactly what I want to ask you. Was it  
4 your understanding or impression that that unhappiness  
5 was confined to one of the -- or more of the three  
6 groups or was it a pattern across all three? In other  
7 words, some staff might have been happy across all three  
8 groups, others might not have been happy, or was it just  
9 emanating from one group and therefore from one Sister?

10 **A. I can't recall. The fact that the report is written to**  
11 **cover the whole home rather than each unit --**

12 Q. Yes.

13 **A. -- makes it very difficult. I couldn't recall.**

14 Q. I know it's twenty years ago.

15 **A. I know. I can't even recall doing the inspection I have**  
16 **to say.**

17 Q. Well, fortunately we do have your very thorough report.

18 Can I take you to a different and more generic  
19 question about the ownership, as it's described, of  
20 these reports? If we stand back for a moment, there are  
21 a number of separate components of the picture. The  
22 first is here you have a voluntary home, in this  
23 instance run by a religious order. They carry it out  
24 day-to-day, but they do it subject in the last analysis  
25 to the permission of the State to allow them to do it,

1 because they can only do it if they're registered. If  
2 they're not registered, it's unlawful to do it. So  
3 withdrawal of resignation (sic) effectively would close  
4 the house down. The ultimate statutory responsibility  
5 for that state of affairs in allowing them to continue  
6 rests with the Department, whose function it is to  
7 satisfy itself that the home was being run to  
8 an acceptable standard. That's why you were there and  
9 that's why your colleagues inspected other homes. Isn't  
10 that right?

11 **A. That's right.**

12 Q. But there's a third element in that picture, which is  
13 those who placed children in the care of the Sisters in  
14 the home in years gone by, they could be members of the  
15 Catholic community who just for family reasons placed  
16 the child there and the State had no responsibility  
17 other than the inspection responsibility, but by this  
18 time all the children in Nazareth Lodge had come from  
19 the public sector. They were placed there by various  
20 Boards, predominantly but not exclusively I think the  
21 Eastern Board.

22 **A. Uh-huh.**

23 Q. So the Eastern Board stood in the position of parents in  
24 a sense. There may still have been parents of the  
25 children in some cases, but the body which legally stood

1 in the parental shoes was the Board. Isn't that right?

2 **A. As the placing authority, yes.**

3 Q. As the placing authority. Why would the Department not  
4 give the Boards the reports as a matter of form?

5 **A. I honestly don't know the answer to that, but similarly**  
6 **the Boards contracted with the voluntaries, and it would**  
7 **have been perfectly within their rights to ask for**  
8 **a copy of the inspection report as part of their**  
9 **commissioning arrangements.**

10 Q. From the home?

11 **A. From the home directly. So there was nothing which**  
12 **would have prevented a Board from asking for that report**  
13 **and if -- as part of the inspection process we wrote to**  
14 **the main board asking for their views about the**  
15 **operation of the home and what their future plans was,**  
16 **and in relation to the '93 inspection, although I wrote**  
17 **to the Eastern Board asking them, seeking their views,**  
18 **I never had a response.**

19 Q. You did tell us that the Sisters in the Western Board  
20 area --

21 **A. They did share.**

22 Q. -- in your view did share.

23 **A. They did.**

24 Q. But as an outsider looking at the situation, some might  
25 think it very strange that another part of the public



1 sector, which is what the Boards were, were as a matter  
2 of policy not being told by the regulatory part of the  
3 Public service what it had found, because if the Boards  
4 knew, for example, in this instance what you had been  
5 told, a possible reaction might have been, "We won't put  
6 any more children into that home". I am not saying it  
7 would have been, but that's a possibility --

8 **A. Uh-huh.**

9 Q. -- because we know that in relation to the De La Salle  
10 home in Rubane that is exactly the response that the  
11 Eastern Board adopted for a while. It wouldn't place  
12 children. They had their own both moral and legal and  
13 administrative responsibility, but in your experience  
14 you can't throw any light on why the Department adopted  
15 that position?

16 **A. I can't help you in that regard. The only thing I know**  
17 **is I was always told that the inspection reports were**  
18 **the property of the administering authority. I don't**  
19 **know on what basis that information was provided to me,**  
20 **but I know I believed that.**

21 Q. If I can now take you back to this particular specific  
22 situation, as I understand your view, it is and was at  
23 the time here -- this was not an anonymous complaint.  
24 It was from somebody who worked in the home. It may not  
25 have been valid in every respect, because he was very

1 new in his profession. He had only been in the home two  
2 months, but he was sufficiently concerned to raise with  
3 you three new concerns that you hadn't picked up,  
4 concerns which had significant child protection  
5 implications. You reported them to Mr Chambers. One  
6 way of reading Mr Chambers' note is, "He is to be given  
7 the brush-off". Isn't that right?

8 **A. Well --**

9 Q. He is told, "It is noted", which is normally a way of  
10 saying, "Thank you very much".

11 **A. To close it down. Yes, it could read like that.**

12 Q. Yes. Thank you very much.

13 MS DOHERTY: Thank you very much, Marion. Can I just  
14 clarify did you do the inspection by yourself?

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. Was that unusual that an Inspector would work as  
17 a single ...?

18 **A. Yes, at that stage it was.**

19 Q. Right. Okay. Can I just ask Mr Chambers, his role was  
20 the inspection manager?

21 **A. Uh-huh.**

22 Q. How did he assist you? Did he look at the report and --

23 **A. He would have made a visit in the course of the**  
24 **inspection to see how I was progressing and then he**  
25 **would have looked over the draft report and provided**

1 comment on that, and then if we were meeting with the  
2 Management Committee afterwards, he would have been in  
3 attendance at that meeting, and if there were any -- any  
4 controversies, people would have written to the  
5 inspection manager rather than to me.

6 Q. So, I mean, he had his hand kind of directly in it in  
7 relation to the --

8 A. Well, the inspection manager had an active role in the  
9 inspection process.

10 Q. Can I ask -- I mean, I'm aware that in your responses  
11 there was no kind of general database that said,  
12 "Nazareth Lodge, we found this this year, this that  
13 year", but was there an expectation that as part of  
14 preparation for the inspection you would have gone to  
15 the most recent inspection before to see what --

16 A. Yes. I mean, it would have been trying to garner, but  
17 you wouldn't have gone back ten years.

18 Q. No.

19 A. I mean, that wouldn't have been realistic, but there was  
20 a lot of pre-inspection work that was done before we  
21 ever went into the home in terms of the documentation.  
22 So being familiar with the previous report would have  
23 been part of that.

24 Q. Okay. So the most immediate recommendations, there was  
25 the opportunity to check if they had been met?

1    **A. Uh-huh.**

2    Q. Can I ask -- I mean, I know it's a long time ago, but  
3       the untoward incidents and the fact that, given the  
4       population of the home, adolescents, short placements,  
5       you were surprised at the low number, was that raised  
6       can you remember? Was it discussed?

7    **A. No, it wasn't raised. I mean, I think the home that**  
8       **I had previously had responsibility for, and it was only**  
9       **an eight-bedded unit, we would have had more than 80**  
10      **untoward events. So -- and the range of untoward events**  
11      **was very typical of a residential unit: running away,**  
12      **physical/verbal aggression, peer abuse. That would have**  
13      **been standard, you know. There was nothing that was**  
14      **well out of the expectation that you get in a children's**  
15      **home.**

16    Q. But there was a certain surprise for you that there was  
17      so few, given the population in the home at the time?

18    **A. Well, I don't know that it was surprise, but I would**  
19      **have noted that it wasn't a big number. That would have**  
20      **made me feel they were managing to manage the behaviours**  
21      **relatively well.**

22    Q. It wouldn't have made you think they maybe weren't  
23      recording everything that had happened?

24    **A. Well, I don't think they were not recording the untoward**  
25      **incidents. I think they were poor at recording the**

1        **complaints, because if they dealt with something**  
2        **informally, they didn't view it as a complaint. So**  
3        **I did notice that, but I would have gone through the**  
4        **children's records and the daybooks. So if there were**  
5        **behaviours that I thought were untoward that hadn't been**  
6        **recorded, I would have picked that up, because I did**  
7        **check those.**

8        Q. That's very helpful. That's a helpful clarification for  
9        me. Can I just ask in terms -- and this is the final  
10       one you will be glad to hear -- in relation to the  
11       hierarchy you have obviously got Dr McCoy above  
12       Mr Chambers.

13       **A. Uh-huh.**

14       Q. Was there the potential within the Inspectorate, if you  
15       and Mr Chambers had a different view about something, to  
16       go forward and escalate it up to Dr McCoy or would that  
17       not just have been the thing to do?

18       **A. It wouldn't have been the thing to do.**

19       Q. Okay. Thanks very much.

20       MR LANE: When you were discussing the staffing and you said  
21       that the staffing wasn't ideal, it was a bit thin in the  
22       event of problems, were you making this observation just  
23       simply on what people had said to you and your own  
24       reading of the situation or did you actually apply any  
25       sort of formulae or guidance that there was on the

1 staffing levels for residential homes?

2 A. Well, we always looked at the levels using the Castle  
3 Priory measures.

4 Q. Right.

5 A. So they were within the requirements, but it didn't --  
6 there was no -- because of the size of the home, it  
7 didn't give them any margin of error. That was  
8 basically the problem, particularly at school holiday  
9 times, where you've staff going on leave and you've  
10 children at home, so those sorts of things, but once you  
11 get the voluntary visitors' reports, you will see that  
12 over the summer holiday period that the team leaders did  
13 use considerable imagination to keep the children  
14 occupied during the day outside of the home. So that  
15 probably helped them to cope with not having a staffing  
16 level that I would have thought would have given them  
17 a bit more ...

18 Q. What sort of assumption was made about the number of  
19 hours that the Sisters would work?

20 A. The Sisters seemed to work all hours. They did -- they  
21 were on -- they manned the roster during the day and  
22 then they did sleeping. So it just seemed to be that  
23 the slack was taken up by the Sisters. They didn't have  
24 a set working week from what I could gather.

25 Q. I appreciate they may have actually worked all hours,

1 but if you're applying Castle Priory, you would have  
2 needed to say, "Well, they were the equivalent of a  
3 full-timer", or something like that.

4 **A. We only counted them as one. We didn't count them in**  
5 **terms --**

6 Q. Yes. Right.

7 **A. No. Sorry. I didn't pick that up.**

8 Q. The other question I had was you mentioned you were the  
9 sort of regular person for the Western children's homes.

10 **A. Uh-huh.**

11 Q. Was there a regular person for Nazareth Lodge at that  
12 time?

13 **A. There was. Felicity Beagon had been the Inspector who**  
14 **had previously inspected and I think in and around that**  
15 **time Felicity took on a role for disabled children and**  
16 **whether that's why I was drafted in to do these**  
17 **inspections I really don't know, but she had been the**  
18 **Inspector for quite a number of years in Nazareth.**

19 Q. Would it not have been reasonable then for the points  
20 made by **NL 269** to have been taken up by her as  
21 part of the ongoing support of the home?

22 **A. Well, she didn't go back to being the Inspector.**

23 Q. Oh, right.

24 **A. It then moved I think to Judith Chaddock.**

25 Q. Right.

1     **A. But my inspection was a one-off and didn't follow the**  
2     **pattern that we had.**

3     Q. But the complaints were seen almost as something  
4     separate from your inspection and something that had  
5     come subsequently and was being dealt with differently  
6     we have heard, not part of the inspection as such.

7     **A. Well, in my opinion they -- I feel -- I am saying this**  
8     **as part of my normal practice and it would have been**  
9     **normal for me then -- that those should have been**  
10    **bottomed out before we issued the final report, because**  
11    **the draft report went out for factual accuracy checking.**  
12    **I think the final report went on in February. So it**  
13    **didn't really permit us to bottom out what was happening**  
14    **--**

15    Q. Thank you very much.

16    **A. -- as part of the inspection.**

17    Q. Right. Thank you.

18    CHAIRMAN: Well, Marion, normally at this stage I'd say to  
19    someone in your position those are all the questions,  
20    but I gather, in fact, Mr Aiken is going to ask you  
21    about something else.

22            Further questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

23    MR AIKEN: Very briefly, Chairman. Thank you.

24            Mr O'Reilly has drawn to my attention a letter that  
25    -- authored by you, although not signed by you, which



1 picks up on a point you were making to the Chairman.

2 It's a letter of 30th December 1992 and it appears it  
3 may form part of the file that is going to cause some  
4 angst between the Inquiry and the Department over its  
5 provision, but the letter indicates -- it is a letter  
6 from you to Robert Moore of the Eastern Health Board,  
7 the Director of Social Services. You are saying:

8 "The annual inspection of the voluntary children's  
9 home is planned" -- this is for Nazareth Lodge -- "on  
10 4th January. Given the Eastern Health & Social Services  
11 Board is the main user of the facility, I would be  
12 grateful for your views on:

13 1. The service provided.

14 2. The planned future use of the facility.

15 I would welcome your views and the opportunity to  
16 meet with you or your staff and discuss those issues in  
17 more detail."

18 So that's you communicating with the Board. Then  
19 the last sentence in the letter is:

20 "In due course I shall forward to you a copy of the  
21 inspection report."

22 So that at least gives the suggestion that you  
23 thought you were going to provide and perhaps may have  
24 done and, as I understand it, the Department are going  
25 to say that by now they were in the practice of

1 providing reports to the Boards that used the home, but  
2 you don't have any memory of that?

3 **A. I have no recall.**

4 Q. It's a matter then we'll have to take up and pursue  
5 further with the Department.

6 **A. Uh-huh.**

7 Q. But certainly that's a letter that you drafted, and  
8 there's a note attached to it to Norman, because it is  
9 pp'd and signed by Norman Chambers then on your behalf:

10 "Anne would like you to have a look at this as she  
11 is pp for Marion who is out next week on an inspection."

12 So he would have seen the letter going out. So it  
13 is an issue we will have to come back to.

14 **A. I'm glad there's files.**

15 CHAIRMAN: Can we just have a look at it before ...?

16 MR AIKEN: We'll get it copied and added to the bundle.

17 CHAIRMAN: Could you show that to Marion, please? Have you  
18 any recollection of whether the Eastern Board responded  
19 to the invitation?

20 **A. Well, there's nothing on the -- I have to say that  
21 everything I'm saying is from reading files, because  
22 I have absolutely no recall. There's nothing on the  
23 file that shows I got a response. I'm glad there's  
24 the file. Thank you.**

25 MR AIKEN: Chairman, perhaps if we -- we can get that added

1 to the bundle and then no doubt Ms Smyth will see a copy  
2 of the letter and can examine with the Health & Social  
3 Care Board whether they ever received a copy and what,  
4 if anything, they did with it. That's a matter that can  
5 be looked into.

6 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, , thank you very much for  
7 coming to speak to us today about these matters, which  
8 were a long time ago. We found it very helpful indeed.  
9 Thank you.

10 **A. Thank you.**

11 **(Witness withdrew)**

12 MR AIKEN: Chairman, I know that we have three more  
13 witnesses today. Perhaps if we took a short break to  
14 see what the position is with Ms Smith, who has a long  
15 witness.

16 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

17 (12.15 pm)

18 (Short break)

19 (12.30 pm)

20 WITNESS NL5 (called)

21 MS SMITH: Good afternoon, Chairman, Panel Members. Our  
22 next witness today is NL5, and there is an appearance to  
23 be announced.

24 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Potter?

25 MR POTTER: Yes. Chairman, Members of the Inquiry, I appear

1 for this witness, instructed by Savage & Company  
2 Solicitors.

3 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

4 MS SMITH: Chairman, NL5 has some mobility -- can you hear  
5 me all right, NL5?

6 **A. I can hear you.**

7 Q. I will make sure I talk into the microphone so that you  
8 do hear me.

9 NL5 has some mobility issues, Chairman. She wishes  
10 to take a religious oath, but I suggest that she remain  
11 seated while she does that.

12 **A. Thank you.**

13 Q. She also wishes to maintain her anonymity.

14 **A. Thank you.**

15 **WITNESS NL5 (sworn)**

16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

17 **A. Thank you.**

18 Q. Now perhaps I can just make it clear to you, NL5, that  
19 I know you've been here already speaking to Ms. Smith.  
20 There's a lot no doubt you will wish to say to us. So  
21 we are not going to keep you here all day and we will be  
22 stopping for a break at lunchtime.

23 **A. Thank you.**

24 **Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY**

25 MS SMITH: Yes. I have explained to Michelle and your

1 counsel, NL5, that we will go as far as we can today and  
2 see if we can get through your evidence, but it may not  
3 be possible, because we do realise that you have had  
4 a very long day. You are now 88 years of age. Isn't  
5 that right?

6 **A. That's right.**

7 Q. You have certain medical difficulties also.

8 **A. That's right. That's right.**

9 Q. NL5, you -- I am just going to tell the Panel Members  
10 where there are a lot of documents relevant to your  
11 evidence in our bundle, if I may, first of all, before  
12 I come to talk to you about some of the things about  
13 Nazareth Lodge.

14 NL5 has given the Inquiry three statements. They  
15 are at SNB-80031 to 80044. That was a statement of 12th  
16 January 2015. There is a statement at 8006... something  
17 to 800... -- ...65 to 80067 -- thank you -- on 26th  
18 January 2015, and the third statement at 80091 to 80092  
19 and that's 8th February 2015.

20 There's also police material, including interviews,  
21 two interviews with police by NL5 (sic), and that's at  
22 SNB-60713 to 60734, with NL5's interview being at 731,  
23 60731 to 60734. That's an interview of 3rd May 1996.

24 There is a bundle of police material at SNB-60801 to  
25 60862, with an interview of 13th March 2012 at 60822 to

1 60830. There's further material at SNB-60905 to 60917,  
2 61035 to 61045, 6927 to 6... -- sorry -- 60927 to 60928,  
3 60957 to 60990 and 60487 to 60488.

4 Now, NL5, as I have explained to you, we have  
5 received three statements that you have signed about  
6 your time in Nazareth Lodge and addressing complaints  
7 that were made about you.

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. While I refer to some of the matters, and I'll try to  
10 summarise them, I'm not going to read out of all of the  
11 statements and we'll try to just highlight a few issues  
12 from them. All right?

13 **A. Thank you.**

14 Q. In the first statement at 80034 -- sorry -- ...32 --  
15 I beg your pardon -- you describe -- ...31 -- you  
16 describe in paragraphs 5 to 10 your background, your  
17 personal background, and describe how you came to work  
18 in Nazareth Lodge. You set out the detail of that  
19 there.

20 Now the Inquiry has received a personnel file from  
21 the Congregation of the Sisters of Nazareth relevant to  
22 you, which I am not going to pull it up, but it is at  
23 SNB-2005 to 2007. That was dated in 1993. It's  
24 recorded in that personnel file that you were employed  
25 from 1988, but you were there long before that, NL5.

1 **A. 1956.**

2 Q. In fact, you told the police that you were there from  
3 7th January 1956.

4 **A. That's correct.**

5 Q. Is that right? It was SR104 who --

6 **A. SR104 .**

7 Q. SR104 --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- who asked that you come and work there after you had  
10 volunteered for a short time?

11 **A. For a week, yes.**

12 Q. She know SR104 was there between 1952 and 1958.

13 **A. Yes, she would have been, yes.**

14 Q. So you were there right up until the doors closed in  
15 1999?

16 **A. That's right.**

17 Q. So over forty years?

18 **A. That's right.**

19 Q. You saw huge changes in Nazareth Lodge over that time,  
20 NL5?

21 **A. I did indeed.**

22 Q. One of the things that you talked -- I asked you about  
23 when we were talking earlier was whether or not in the  
24 time in the early days when you were there from 1956 do  
25 you remember boys going to Australia?

1    **A. Yes.**

2    Q. In fact, when you were speaking to the police at  
3       SNB-60823, you, in fact, told police that you took  
4       fourteen children to Hammersmith --

5    **A. That's right.**

6    Q. -- at Christmas 1956.

7    **A. That's right.**

8    Q. Is that right?

9    **A. That's right.**

10   Q. I just wondered if you would -- without going into too  
11     much detail, because I know we talked about finding your  
12     way on the tubes and that, but what do you remember  
13     being -- what were you asked to do, first of all?

14   **A. Well, I was -- I first -- well, I took them. We were**  
15     **taken to the boat. Sisters were with me and a**  
16         **was there with me and we sat in the boat, were**  
17     **put in a lounge for the night. We had nice**  
18     **accommodation to sleep, and he said to me that, "Now,**  
19     **NL5, in the morning before you get off the boat I want**  
20     **you to take the children for a good breakfast, so about**  
21     **6 o'clock in the morning before they get off the boat",**  
22     **which I did, and then we had our breakfast, our good**  
23     **breakfast, and we were off the boat. Then I took them**  
24     **through the tubes and different ways. I don't know how**  
25     **I did it, but I did it, and I arrived in Hammersmith**



1 with the six -- the fourteen boys. We stayed there for  
2 two nights.

3 Then the morning they were to leave I took them to  
4 Tilbury and handed them over to a gentleman on a ship  
5 that was coming to take the children, and he thought  
6 I was going with them, but I said -- he says, "Are you  
7 not coming with me?" I said, "No, this is as far as  
8 I go".

9 Q. Can you remember was there great excitement about the  
10 boys going to Australia?

11 A. I think they were sad. I don't know. No, they didn't  
12 know any emotion really, but we were sad, you know, but  
13 I don't know about the children now, you know, how they  
14 felt really. They didn't say.

15 Q. Well, paragraph 10 of your statement here, again you are  
16 talking about how you came to work there. You said that  
17 you were paid 3 pounds per week.

18 A. That's right. That was the wage at the beginning, yes.

19 Q. You remember that within 1956 you got a pay rise. It  
20 went up to 4 pounds.

21 A. That's right.

22 Q. Although when we were talking you did make the point  
23 that there were some people, some of the lay staff, who  
24 were only paid a lot less than that.

25 A. That's right.

1 Q. Some got 5 pounds a month. Is that right?

2 **A. That's right. That's right.**

3 Q. Now when you went in 1956, if I've got what we were  
4 talking about right, there were four groups in the Lodge  
5 --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- and there were two groups in Bethlehem, which catered  
8 for children aged 3 to 5.

9 **A. That's right.**

10 Q. I was asking you do you ever remember it going down to  
11 three groups, but I think that maybe happened after your  
12 group was disbanded.

13 **A. That was maybe when we were starting -- going to close,  
14 maybe coming up to that time, yes. Things -- they had  
15 to dwindle the children out, you know. It could have  
16 went down, but I don't remember -- three groups. I just  
17 don't remember now.**

18 Q. We were talking about some general matters in the home  
19 and what you do remember about that. One of the things  
20 that you know that people have talked to us about the  
21 chores that children were expected to do. You said in  
22 your statement at paragraph 56 at 80038 that your group  
23 didn't do any chores.

24 **A. No. Well, I was a perfectionist and nobody could do  
25 anything perfect for me. So I did everything myself.**

1 I wouldn't even let a child make a bed, because he  
2 wouldn't make it properly. So that's just the way I was  
3 and I could not do anything about it. I just liked to  
4 have to do everything myself. I never asked the  
5 children to do anything, never. There wasn't much to do  
6 anyway. It was only a dormitory and a sitting room, you  
7 know. There wasn't that much work to be done. It was  
8 always in order and ...

9 Q. I was asking about -- children have said that they were  
10 made to polish the floors. You have some memory of  
11 that.

12 A. Yes. I'll tell you what that ... That would be  
13 a Saturday, you know. You did a wee bit of extra on  
14 a Saturday, but you did most of it yourself, but now the  
15 children -- you weren't allowed -- the Sisters would be  
16 out collecting on a Saturday. Well, you had all these  
17 children five storeys up. We weren't allowed to let the  
18 children out, out of your sight in case anything would  
19 happen them. So the way you did -- I was -- we would  
20 have -- doing the work, but they take these wee  
21 polishers and run up and down the dormitory, but it was  
22 just to keep them occupied to keep them beside you,  
23 because we had nobody else to mind them. We had to do  
24 that until we got the place finished, but there was no  
25 work to it. There was a bit of joy in it. They call

1           **that exercise today, you know.**

2    Q.   Well, NL5 --

3    A.   **(Inaudible.)**

4    Q.   -- another thing that I asked you about was whether  
5           children had to go to mass every day.

6    A.   **No, they didn't go to mass every day. Two groups went  
7           maybe one morning and two groups went another morning.  
8           SR34 and SR152 would have went one morning. SR71 and  
9           SR47 would have went the other morning, not all the time  
10          but most of the year. In the summertime now we didn't.  
11          We were on holidays then.**

12   Q.   NL4 has said you couldn't leave the children behind in  
13          the dormitory and that's why they would have gone to  
14          mass. Is that --

15   A.   **No. Sure they wouldn't -- you got the groups up to go  
16          to mass. The children weren't up. You got them up to  
17          go, you know. They weren't left behind.**

18   Q.   Well, you talk about bath time, NL5, when you were  
19          speaking to the police at SNB-60825. I was -- you  
20          didn't say very much about it, but you have a memory of  
21          showers being put into the home.

22   A.   **When I went there in '56, they were putting showers in  
23          the two sets of bathrooms upstairs and they had to use  
24          like a big changing room downstairs I remember with two  
25          or three baths in it. So that's where the children had**

1 to be bathed for quite a while until the showers were --  
2 it took two years nearly to do those showers. So it  
3 wasn't easy. It was very hard.

4 Q. Children were bathed once a week.

5 A. Once a week on a Saturday.

6 Q. I asked NL4, when I was speaking to her yesterday -- and  
7 I know you were here and heard her give her evidence  
8 yesterday -- about the use of Jeyes Fluid in the home.

9 A. I never saw Jeyes Fluid. It has never been used in  
10 Nazareth Lodge. NL151 might have used it out on  
11 the drains around the house, but I never saw it in the  
12 house, never.

13 Q. Was it the case that the boys would have used the same  
14 bath water and that it might have got cold for some of  
15 the later ones?

16 A. No. I think it was connected maybe to the kitchen. You  
17 know, the kitchen was beside the room. So I think the  
18 water came from there. I'm not sure, but we changed the  
19 water, but I don't know where it came from. The big  
20 boiler house was outside the door, not far from us. So  
21 maybe it came from there. I wouldn't know at that time.  
22 I was only there in the Lodge just then, you know. That  
23 all happened just in '56 when I went there.

24 Q. So it was '58 before you were using the bathrooms  
25 upstairs?

1 A. I would say it would have been near -- yes, there were  
2 parlour, yes.

3 Q. I was asking you about bed wetting and whether that was  
4 a difficulty for your group.

5 A. No, I hadn't really much difficulty. I used to get --  
6 I did -- they went to bed early in the winter. You  
7 know, went at quite a reasonable time around 6/7 o'clock  
8 maybe, but a child being there all night, I would say it  
9 is humiliating for a child. I wouldn't like a child to  
10 lie in bed all night with wet pyjamas or a wet sheet.  
11 I think that would be terrible. I think that's cruelty.  
12 I would get them up before I went to bed, any child that  
13 would like to go to the bathroom, and that's what I did,  
14 because I thought it was the right thing to do.

15 Q. But you don't remember it being an issue in your group  
16 at all?

17 A. I don't, no, not really.

18 Q. Just on that point, NL5, you said somewhere in your  
19 statement that you worked long hours. You worked from  
20 6 o'clock in the morning to 10 o'clock at night.

21 A. That was my own choice. That was my own choice. I just  
22 liked working there. I never took hours off. I just  
23 kept going. I helped around. I wasn't just in the one  
24 place. The children were in the school all day.

25 I might go down to SR34 and do a wee bit -- make the tea

1           **for the nuns and for the teachers at break time.**

2           **Anything that would be done I would do it.**

3    Q.   That brings me on really to ask about your relationships  
4           with the nuns.  You said at SNB-60830 that the Sisters  
5           treated you like themselves.

6    A.   **Just like themselves.**

7    Q.   You were particularly close to SR34.

8    A.   **Yes.  We worked in the one group, you see, and she was**  
9           **principal of the school too, and she was in charge of**  
10          **the children, the whole children.**

11   Q.   I was about to ask you about her being in charge of the  
12          children.

13   A.   **Yes.**

14   Q.   What did that entail?  I mean, she had your group --

15   A.   **Well, she'd have been in charge of admitting the**  
16          **children, discharging the children, the money end of it.**  
17          **She is in charge of all that, keeping the books, the**  
18          **children's records, and she would do all that.**

19   Q.   Just about children's records, were there many records  
20          kept?

21   A.   **Oh, aye.  The Sisters kept the records up in the**  
22          **convent, yes.**

23   Q.   This is the big books, the big registers?

24   A.   **I think they are in the Good Shepherd Centre now as far**  
25          **as I know since we closed.  Somebody said that's where**

1           **you can get your particulars. So I think they must be**  
2           **there, you know.**

3    Q.    Okay. Well, we will certainly follow that up with the  
4           Congregation, NL5 --

5    **A.    Aye.**

6    Q.    -- and see if there is anything more than what we've  
7           seen.

8    **A.    I don't know whether there is any truth in it, but**  
9           **I know there were records kept definitely.**

10   Q.    Did you yourself fill in any records for children at  
11          all?

12   **A.    Oh, no, we had nothing to do with that. The sisters did**  
13          **that. No.**

14   Q.    Just in relation to the other staff that you worked  
15          with, not the nuns now --

16   **A.    Yes.**

17   Q.    -- but the lay staff, I was asking what level of  
18          interaction you would have had with them.

19   **A.    Och, we were -- we were great friends. We worked**  
20          **together. We were always good friends, never fell out,**  
21          **never a word.**

22   Q.    We heard yesterday from NL4 that she had to take  
23          everybody in the home on a Saturday on her own to the  
24          cinema.

25   **A.    Well, I can't say if that's the truth. I don't know.**



1 I can't imagine 100 children going with one staff, but  
2 I don't remember. I don't -- I can't remember.

3 Q. You yourself didn't leave the house on a Saturday?

4 A. I didn't, because the Sisters were out collecting on  
5 a Saturday, and I was always asked to see -- keep an eye  
6 to the house, you know. There were old Sisters upstairs  
7 that -- you know, but they had nothing to do with the  
8 children or anything, but I looked after the phone and  
9 the front door and kept an eye to the house till the  
10 Sisters came in at 5 o'clock in the evening after being  
11 working all day.

12 But they didn't go to the pictures that often, you  
13 know. Maybe -- I remember maybe about two or three  
14 times they were invited over to the Curzon --

15 Q. Uh-huh.

16 A. -- free, you know, but I don't think they went, but,  
17 like, I don't know whether NL4 went on her own or not.  
18 I can't imagine it, because there were four other staff.  
19 There was four other staff. I am sure some of them went  
20 with her.

21 Q. What she said to us yesterday was those staff would have  
22 gone home to their country homes at the weekend.

23 A. No, they didn't. They lived all down in the  
24 . They got home once a month for a weekend. Each  
25 Sat... -- they got home once a month for a weekend and



1 and that's the way -- most nights we were down -- SR34  
2 and I were in the parlours, because there were so many  
3 meetings and we had to stay till the end. Well, SR34  
4 went to bed a wee bit earlier, but I would lock up and  
5 I put the keys upstairs.

6 Q. NL5, just about that, you are saying that you and SR34  
7 would have been down at committee meetings most  
8 evenings.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Is this when you still had charge of a group of  
11 children?

12 A. Aye, but, you see, there'd be -- a Sister took turns at  
13 night coming back to look after the four groups. One  
14 Sister, SR47, would be back one night, SR71 one night,  
15 SR152 another night. They took their turns. So SR34  
16 didn't have to worry, because a Sister -- there's always  
17 a Sister there, always.

18 Q. The boys would have been in bed at this stage?

19 A. Oh, they'd have been in bed, yes, yes, the younger --  
20 when they were younger now, 3 to 5 -- 3 to 11 -- 5 to  
21 11, yes.

22 Q. Now in paragraph 11 of your statement at SNB-80034 --  
23 ...32 -- I beg your pardon -- you make the point that  
24 you never received any training for the work that you  
25 did.

1 **A. Och, no, didn't, no. You just used your common sense.**

2 Q. You said you were trained on the job, as it were.

3 **A. Aye. You just -- yes, you just did what -- I don't**

4 **know. Just -- aye, we got no training, no. I didn't**

5 **have to.**

6 Q. You go on to talk about how you got a job in a nursery  
7 in Islandbawn Street. You explain how that came about.

8 **A. That was a play group. Uh-huh.**

9 Q. You went there for one week. It turned into six years.

10 **A. Six years travelling over every day at 8 o'clock in the**  
11 **morning and back at 1.30 every day.**

12 Q. Then after that you went to do the same job in Harrogate  
13 Street I think.

14 **A. That's right. He built another -- built**  
15 **another play group and asked me to take it over, which**  
16 **I did.**

17 Q. But all of this -- when you were doing this, this was a  
18 morning job and you came back to Nazareth Lodge.

19 **A. Just from 9.00 to 12.00. Just from 9.00 to 12.00.**

20 **I was back home before the children came out of school.**

21 Q. What we heard from SR52 is when she arrived in 1975, you  
22 were working in the nursery school.

23 **A. I was just a week there. I had just come -- started**  
24 **a week before SR52 came.**

25 Q. So that would have been -- you thought it might have

1           been 1976, but when we checked, it was 1975 when she  
2           arrived.

3   **A. Yes, I would agree with that. I wouldn't --**

4   Q. You were there when she did come.

5   **A. I wouldn't remember that, yes.**

6   Q. You were there you think for about two or three years  
7           maybe.

8   **A. I'd say it was more. I'd say it was a wee bit more.**

9   Q. To the end of the '70s?

10  **A. I would say so. Well, let's say that anyway.**

11  Q. As far as you can remember.

12  **A. As far as I can remember. I can't remember. I have no**  
13       **-- I can't remember dates, you know.**

14  Q. Well, the best that we can work out --

15  **A. Yes, yes.**

16  Q. -- that seems to be consistent.

17  **A. SR52 would know, you know.**

18  Q. At that stage you had -- whenever you were going to the  
19       nursery school, you had seven children in your care.

20  **A. That's right.**

21  Q. Those were -- that little group was broken up --

22  **A. That's right.**

23  Q. -- in the sense that some of them were fostered and  
24       others were split in the other groups.

25  **A. That's right.**

1 Q. Isn't that right?

2 **A. That's right.**

3 Q. One of the things that I was wondering about -- sorry.  
4 I should say after that, NL5, when you came back from  
5 the nursery school, you didn't have childcare  
6 responsibilities. Isn't that right?

7 **A. No. Receptionist in the parlour. SR211 wanted me for**  
8 **there, and that's what I did, looked after visitors and**  
9 **that priests and so forth. That's what she wanted me**  
10 **for.**

11 Q. Well, the children that you cared for over the years,  
12 were you ever told anything about their backgrounds?

13 **A. Och, no, no, not really, no.**

14 Q. I mean, there was one --

15 **A. We didn't ask questions. We weren't interested really.**  
16 **You never thought of asking anything about any child.**  
17 **I would never have thought of. Never were told**  
18 **anything, no.**

19 Q. One of the things -- you described yourself, NL5, as you  
20 a great organiser.

21 **A. Well, I was a bit of a perfectionist, which was bad. If**  
22 **I had to do it over again, I wouldn't be as good. I'd**  
23 **be a bit wiser. Take life a bit easier.**

24 Q. You -- the Sisters seem to have relied very heavily on  
25 you --

1 **A. Very, very much.**

2 Q. -- in Nazareth Lodge.

3 **A. Very much.**

4 Q. I was also asking just were there any staff meetings at  
5 all?

6 **A. No. I don't remember having meetings, no.**

7 Q. The other thing I was asking about was whether you  
8 yourself had any contact with social workers?

9 **A. No, no, no, no.**

10 Q. We did -- we will talk about one child who you had  
11 special care for. That was NL28

12 **A. NL28 yes.**

13 Q. I'm going to use the full name, but, NL5, just so you  
14 know, the names are not to be used outside this room, so  
15 that NL28 identity and privacy is protected also.

16 **A. Oh, right.**

17 Q. That was NL28 . He was a child with very  
18 special needs. I was asking you did the welfare officer  
19 come and check up on him when you were caring for him?

20 **A. Well, I wouldn't know. I would say SR34 and that would  
21 have dealt with that. I wouldn't have really dealt with  
22 anything like that, you know. SR34 would have dealt  
23 with that, you know.**

24 Q. Another issue for a number of people who have spoken to  
25 us was the issue of food. You say in your statement in

1 paragraph 14 that staff had the same food and that all  
2 the children in your view were fed and nourished.

3 **A. Fed on the best.**

4 Q. Now when you arrived in 1956, was there still rationing?

5 **A. No, no, I don't think so.**

6 Q. You don't remember that?

7 **A. No, I don't remember any rationing. No, no, no. We got**  
8 **the best of everything. There were wonderful sisters in**  
9 **the kitchen, and they had staff in the kitchen. Not in**  
10 **'56 now but later on we had a lot of staff, you know.**

11 Q. And toys is another issue.

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. People have said toys were taken off them.

14 **A. Uh-huh.**

15 Q. You were explaining to me that people used to turn up  
16 and give you donations of toys which you describe --

17 **A. At Christmas time. Just before Christmas they would**  
18 **bring all their old toys from their homes, you know,**  
19 **that they wanted rid off. I would phone round the**  
20 **groups and tell the sisters. I would say, "Would you**  
21 **like to come down? There is some bags of toys". They**  
22 **would come down and take what they want. They took then**  
23 **what they wanted, and then NL151 would dump the**  
24 **rubbish, toys that was no good.**

25 Q. There were some --



1 A. Then the Sisters would keep some of them in their  
2 stores, and when they had the bazaar at Christmas, they  
3 would bring some of them down for the table, you know,  
4 for the girl that ran it, just to give her some toys on  
5 the table. They were only old toys that came in. They  
6 weren't the children's toys. They went out and had  
7 their own toys. They went out for Christmas. There was  
8 no children in the lodge at Christmas. They were taken  
9 into families. Always took them at Christmas and came  
10 back loaded. Then we went to parties before Christmas,  
11 quite a few, and they came back loaded with -- and that  
12 was their own toys, but the other toys were only toys  
13 that people brought in from the street for Christmas.  
14 They thought they were helping us, thought it was  
15 a great thing, but we didn't really need them. We had  
16 enough.

17 Q. Just about the issue, did the Sisters or did yourself or  
18 any of the other lay staff take the toys off the  
19 children?

20 A. No. Well, I wouldn't know the other groups. I don't  
21 think so. I wouldn't say so.

22 Q. What -- in your own case what --

23 A. No, no, no, we didn't.

24 Q. Now you have said -- I think we have dealt with your  
25 role changing over the years, because you went to the

1 nursery. At that stage there were only seven children.

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. You in 1976 -- just coming on to this child that I was  
4 talking about, NL28 --

5 **A. NL28**

6 Q. -- in 1956 he came to Nazareth Lodge.

7 **A. He did.**

8 Q. You were explaining to me about his arrival. We don't  
9 need to go into the details of that, NL5 --

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. -- but you remember him and you still care for him. You  
12 describe this in your statement there, paragraphs 16  
13 through to 19. We heard yesterday from NL4 that you  
14 ended up badly hurt by NL28 .

15 **A. Yes. Just a wee breakdown. He had it when he was 19,**  
16 **but it was -- it was between NL28 and I.**

17 Q. You did -- you ended up in hospital getting treatment --

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. -- as a result of that.

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. That meant that he then was removed from Nazareth Lodge,  
22 which, as you described to me, broke your heart.

23 **A. Broke my heart. I still go down to him. I was there**  
24 **just before Easter. Still visit him, take him out, take**  
25 **him for meals. Still I do all that, yes. We are in**

1 **great contact. He just looks for me the whole time.**

2 **I don't know why, but he does.**

3 Q. You consider him to be the next thing to the child you  
4 never had really.

5 **A. Child I never had.**

6 Q. You also cared for another child who also had --

7 **A. Aye.**

8 Q. -- disabilities.

9 **A. . He was , ,**  
10 **yes.**

11 Q. Now just one thing, NL5, just talking about -- when we  
12 were talking earlier about your group being disbanded.  
13 This is -- you said that SR211. Now was that SR211 or  
14 --

15 **A. SR211. She was Superior then, yes.**

16 Q. She wanted you then to come back. When you were made  
17 redundant from the nursery school, she wanted you to  
18 come back --

19 **A. For the parlours.**

20 Q. -- and look after the parlours.

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. But before that -- your group had been disbanded before  
23 you went to the nursery school --

24 **A. Oh, yes.**

25 Q. -- or when you went, but you remember one child crying

1 to you.

2 A. Yes. Little NL97. I was making the priest's breakfast  
3 one morning in the kitchen. He came over to get some  
4 extra bread for the breakfast, and he broke down and he  
5 cried, and I says, "NL97, what's the matter?" He says,  
6 "NL5, why did you give us up? Why did you give us up?"  
7 I broke my heart after that. I never forgot it, never  
8 forgot it. It wasn't my choice. It was poor Sister,  
9 but I thought if I knew it had affected the children so  
10 much, I would have asked her not to disband it, you  
11 know. It seemed to affect them a lot. We were a happy  
12 wee group together. Life changed just for them, but  
13 then , this lady that does fostering, fostered the  
14 . She said, "NL5, now you are not  
15 with them I am going to start foster -- I am going to  
16 start foster". So she started and took them and  
17 fostered them, educated them and kept them up to the  
18 left, and one of the them ended at university. I am in  
19 contact with one of them yet, but the boy now I think  
20 there's a wee problem, a wee drinking problem, but apart  
21 from that, reared them. She fostered them. She  
22 didn't want them left when I wasn't there with them.

23 Q. She was someone who worked in the home also?

24 A.

1 **is still fostering, yes.**

2 Q. NL5, just coming back to your group, you say at  
3 paragraph 13 of your statement that you were strict  
4 about good morals and manners, but you never felt it  
5 necessary to hit a child.

6 **A. No, I never in my life. In all my years I never lifted**  
7 **my hand to a child and I can say that before God.**

8 Q. Certainly at the very outset of your statements to the  
9 Inquiry you make that point right at the outset --

10 **A. I never, never.**

11 Q. -- and you made that when you spoke to the police.  
12 I was just asking about how -- if the boys were good --  
13 sorry. You were insistent on good morals and good  
14 manners --

15 **A. Oh, yes.**

16 Q. -- for the boys and I wondered how you achieved that,  
17 how you managed to ensure their good behaviour.

18 **A. I don't know. I don't know. It's just whatever power**  
19 **I had. I don't know. I just was able to do it. I used**  
20 **to talk to them and (inaudible) tell them how to behave**  
21 **when we were out and all that, talk to them like that,**  
22 **but morals, we were very particular about morals, the**  
23 **way they were dressed, and, you know, the Sisters were**  
24 **very particular too, you know. You made sure they were**  
25 **modest and the best they could and all that, you know.**

1           **That's just the way. That's the way I was brought up**  
2           **too, like. We were brought up that way in my home.**

3    Q.    I was --

4    A.    **Our morals were very high.**

5    Q.    Sorry. I did not mean to interrupt.

6    A.    **To this day it is the same, my family. All our morals**  
7           **are very high.**

8    Q.    NL5, I was asking earlier were your boys better behaved  
9           than others?

10   A.    **Well, I don't know. They used to call them "The**  
11           **Dainties". So I don't know why. I don't know. Well,**  
12           **now there was some a wee bit wild, you know, but they**  
13           **were just ordinary boys, but they were just a wee bit**  
14           **wilder -- in other groups now I am talking about --**  
15           **a wee bit Wilder than some of them, you know, but**  
16           **they're only -- it's only boys. It was nothing vicious**  
17           **or nothing, anything. It was just wee boys.**

18   Q.    Boisterous?

19   A.    **Just boys. They would maybe be somewhere where they**  
20           **shouldn't be or doing something they shouldn't be. You**  
21           **know, boys. That was it, but there was very few of them**  
22           **now.**

23   Q.    You say your group had the nickname "The Dainties".

24   A.    **The Dainties. Well, we were --**

25   Q.    "Mad Marions" I think was another nickname.

1 **A. Yes, we was Mad Marions. There was a few there. We'd a**  
2 **few wee wild ones there, but not -- only -- nothing to**  
3 **talk about.**

4 Q. Now I am going to move on. We may just finish with this  
5 next topic, NL5, and then we will take a break for  
6 lunch, but the first statement -- sorry. This is about  
7 an issue of Father Brendan Smyth --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- coming to the home.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. You talk about this at 80066 --

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- from paragraphs 13 to 18. Now we have heard from  
14 someone else that one of the nuns thought that this --  
15 he had first come there to do a retreat for the Sisters.

16 **A. A retreat, a three days' --**

17 Q. That' correct?

18 **A. A three days' retreat, yes.**

19 Q. You said he was involved in vocations for boys.

20 **A. That's right.**

21 Q. SR71, if I've got you right, was involved in vocations  
22 for girls.

23 **A. That's right.**

24 Q. She met him --

25 **A. That's right.**

1 Q. -- at some seminar or something --

2 **A. That's right.**

3 Q. -- to do with that aspect of their work. She thought,  
4 as you put it, he was the greatest.

5 **A. She did.**

6 Q. She invited him then to come and give a the Sisters a  
7 retreat.

8 **A. No. She told the Mother Superior too she thought he was**  
9 **a great man and he would be great for the retreat for**  
10 **the weekend, and that's why we got involved with Father**  
11 **Smyth.**

12 Q. And that was a weekend retreat you think.

13 **A. A week... -- it was just three days. I think it was the**  
14 **weekend, because the Sisters would be in school during**  
15 **the week and they wouldn't be able to go to lectures and**  
16 **that. So it must have been the weekend.**

17 Q. Unless it was maybe school holidays.

18 **A. No, I don't think it was. I think it was a weekend all**  
19 **right.**

20 Q. During that time he stayed over in the house for those  
21 three days.

22 **A. Oh, two nights he would have been overnight. Uh-huh.**

23 Q. You said that he then came back and would call in at  
24 about 6 o'clock some evenings.

25 **A. An odd time he would appear and he would say mass.**



1 I would go to the kitchen to ask the girl in the kitchen  
2 to make a nice meal for him. I would give it to him,  
3 but then he would go away, you know, but I said to him  
4 at one stage -- I couldn't understand why he could come  
5 up to Belfast so much, and I said to him, "Father, why  
6 do you -- how can you get away from the monastery so  
7 much?" He says, "NL5, I come up here to go to my doctor  
8 and get my tablets and that's why I come up to Belfast".  
9 I said, "Because it is funny travelling all that way",  
10 you know, just in conversation --

11 Q. Uh-huh.

12 A. -- but that's what he said.

13 Q. But when he did call in the evenings and say mass, he  
14 never stayed over on those times?

15 A. Oh, no, he never stayed over, no. He went away again.

16 Q. During the time either -- first of all, during the time  
17 when he came to say the retreat, did he have access to  
18 all of the convent?

19 A. Oh, not the convent, no. He wouldn't have been near the  
20 convent, no, but parts of the house, the children, the  
21 different flats, I suppose he would have, yes. He  
22 would, yes.

23 Q. There would have been no difficulty with him going in to  
24 talk to the children --

25 A. No, no, I would say not.

1 Q. -- in their sitting rooms or whatever?

2 A. No, no.

3 Q. Apart from -- what about when he came back and didn't  
4 stay over? Would he have had access to the house then?

5 A. Well, it would be late at night. I don't think so.

6 I don't think he went near it at night. I think he just  
7 went away. He had -- he had a brother living on the  
8 Falls Road and I think that's where he went after and  
9 stayed there maybe, you know. I don't know. I'm only  
10 thinking that.

11 Q. Apart from him there were other priests. There were  
12 chaplains to the home.

13 A. Oh, yes. Oh, we had a priest every morning for mass,  
14 which had his breakfast. He left the house  
15 straightaway, because he was chaplain to City Hospital  
16 and he had duties there. They never went near the  
17 children, no. They went straight home after their --  
18 straight to the hospital after their breakfast.

19 Q. And did they ever stay overnight?

20 A. No, no, no, no, no, no.

21 Q. And we were just talking. I was wondering was there  
22 a difference between the Lodge and the priests in  
23 Nazareth House, and you said --

24 A. Well, I don't know much about Nazareth House now.

25 Q. Right.

1 **A. You see, you had the old people in Nazareth House and**  
2 **you have to have priests going in for confession,**  
3 **anointing, looking after the old people mostly. I would**  
4 **say priests had to go in and out of Nazareth House.**

5 Q. And I'm right in thinking that there was the church, the  
6 Holy Rosary, was beside Nazareth House. Is that right?

7 **A. It was. That's right.**

8 Q. The priests lived beside the church?

9 **A. Aye. There was a house, yes. Two houses really on the**  
10 **Ormeau Road.**

11 Q. Now, NL5, I'm going to go on to talk about allegations  
12 that have been made against you --

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. -- but I think this might be an appropriate time to  
15 break for lunch.

16 CHAIRMAN: Well, I think might be easier, given that NL5 is  
17 covering a lot of ground, if we ask her some questions  
18 now and then we break for lunch.

19 MS SMITH: Yes.

20 Questions from THE PANEL

21 CHAIRMAN: NL5, can I just ask you to go back to what you  
22 were telling us about taking the party of children to  
23 Hammersmith and then to the boat in Tilbury?

24 **A. Yes, yes.**

25 Q. You came to the lodge in 1956.

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. So you were only there I take it -- what?

3 **A. Just the year. This is -- the children went at**  
4 **Christmas.**

5 Q. That's right.

6 **A. Uh-huh.**

7 Q. They sailed on Christmas Eve.

8 **A. Christmas Eve. You're right. That's right.**

9 Q. So you had been there for the better part of a year by  
10 then?

11 **A. That's right. That's right.**

12 Q. Were you aware of how the decision was made as to which  
13 child would go?

14 **A. No, no.**

15 Q. In other words --

16 **A. I had --**

17 Q. -- how were the children chosen?

18 **A. When I went there, I knew things been going on in the**  
19 **Lodge, meetings and that about them. I remember SR34**  
20 **saying there were 24 to go, but then there was some**  
21 **children they couldn't contact their people and that and**  
22 **it had got down to 14. That's all I know about it now.**

23 Q. Apart from what SR34 said about that, were you aware of  
24 whether or not the families were contacted?

25 **A. Oh, no. I knew nothing about anything like that. No,**

1           **no, no.**

2       Q.   Do you remember any visit before the children went by  
3           a Christian Brother from Australia, for example, or  
4           anything like?

5       **A. No, no. I don't any there was anything like that, no.**

6       Q.   Were there any discussions with the children that you  
7           knew of in the sense that there'd be a meeting and  
8           they'd be asked, "If you want to go, put up your hand"  
9           or anything?

10      **A. You see, as far as I know the Social Services did all**  
11       **that. I remember them being in a room with these women,**  
12       **you know, something to do with the government, you know.**  
13       **I suppose they had something to do with sending the**  
14       **children out. It must -- they must have had, but I was**  
15       **only back -- I was only into the lodge then --**

16      Q.   Yes.

17      **A. -- but I can remember that, but I don't know anything**  
18       **about that, because that wouldn't have been discussed**  
19       **with me, you see.**

20      Q.   No.

21      **A. We -- the staff wouldn't know anything about that.**

22      Q.   But does that mean that there were some people who came  
23           who seemed to have something to do with the government  
24           --

25      **A. Yes.**

1 Q. -- as opposed to --

2 A. Yes. To me it seemed to be something like that, you  
3 know. I don't know.

4 Q. Might they have been Australians?

5 A. No, I wouldn't say. No, I'd say it's from our own place  
6 here.

7 Q. Yes.

8 A. I wouldn't say so. I would say it would be social  
9 workers or something. I don't know.

10 Q. Now you have described how you took them to Tilbury and  
11 so on, but just before you leave Northern Ireland to get  
12 the boat, were you aware of any of your children going  
13 for medical examinations or anything like that?

14 A. Oh, I'd say that was all done beforehand. No. We  
15 weren't have been talked about. We wouldn't have known  
16 about. I wouldn't have known anything about that. It  
17 would only be the sisters that would know what was going  
18 on there, you know.

19 Q. So if a child were taken out for any reason to go and  
20 see a doctor, you weren't consulted or told about it?

21 A. Do you mean a child if it was ill or anything?

22 Q. No, no, for any reason to go and see a doctor.

23 A. Oh, aye. Well, sometimes the doctors would have to  
24 come. If the children had a bad 'flu or anything in  
25 bed, the doctors would come. I remember Dr and

1           **that coming to children if they weren't well, and you**  
2           **would take -- if they had to go to the -- about glasses**  
3           **or about anything, you took them out. We took them**  
4           **everywhere they had to go.**

5    Q.    I see.

6    A.    **Uh-huh.**

7    Q.    So if a child had to go down to a doctor for a medical  
8           examination to go to Australia, if it was from your  
9           group, would you have gone with the child?

10   A.    **I would have had if I had had to do it, but I didn't**  
11         **have to do anything like that.**

12   Q.    I see. Then you have described the journey itself. You  
13         got the boat from Belfast to where? Liverpool or  
14         Heysham?

15   A.    **Liverpool I think it was.**

16   Q.    And then a train to London?

17   A.    **And then the underground. I remember the underground.**

18   Q.    Well, I don't think you would have got the underground  
19         from Liverpool.

20   A.    **I don't know how I did it, but I did it anyway.**

21   Q.    Anyway you found yourself in London and --

22   A.    **Yes. Then in Hammersmith.**

23   Q.    Made your way through the tube. Was that your first  
24         visit?

25   A.    **That was my event with children and I knew nothing about**





1 A. In Hammersmith.

2 Q. Then you went down to the docks at Tilbury.

3 A. The next morning then we were taken -- I took them to  
4 Tilbury and handed them over to whoever was -- came off  
5 the boat. It was a big gentleman I remember. He  
6 thought I was going with him --

7 Q. Yes?

8 A. -- and he said to me, "Surely you're coming with me".  
9 I says, "No, I'm not". I says, "I'm leaving them here.  
10 You're next to ...", and he got such a shock. I think  
11 the poor man clearly died. So --

12 Q. Was he --

13 A. -- I don't know how he got there, but he must have got  
14 to Australia.

15 Q. Was he a lay person or a priest?

16 A. He was a lay person, yes. A big stout man he was  
17 I remember.

18 Q. Was he the only person that you handed --

19 A. That's all I saw.

20 Q. -- the children to?

21 A. That's all I saw, yes, unless there was anybody else on  
22 the boat. He came off the boar.

23 Q. But in any event just the one man came down --

24 A. Came down. That was --

25 Q. -- the gangplank, presumably --

1 **A. That's right.**

2 Q. -- took the fourteen children --

3 **A. That's right.**

4 Q. -- and away they went. After you went back to the Lodge  
5 was there ever any word back from Australia about how  
6 they were getting on?

7 **A. Oh, some of the boys came back. HIA 308 came**  
8 **back.**

9 Q. No, I meant in the next year, few months or whatever.

10 **A. Och, no, no, no, we didn't hear anything about that, no,**  
11 **but a few of the boys have some back. The .**

12 Q. Oh, I know they have come back in later years --

13 **A. Visiting, yes.**

14 Q. -- but in 1957/'58?

15 **A. Oh, no.**

16 Q. So there was nothing like the Mother Superior calling  
17 all the children together and saying, "We have heard  
18 from Australia and so-and-so is doing this".

19 **A. No, no, no.**

20 Q. "Somebody else is in this home." Nothing like that?

21 **A. No, no, nothing like that, no.**

22 Q. Did any letters ever come back to the other children?

23 **A. No. The night -- the first night we were in**  
24 **Hammersmith, the children were all lying in bed, and**  
25 **I -- they all wrote a letter to each of their Sisters.**

1 I said, "Now you'll all write a letter to like SR71,  
2 SR47 and I'll bring them home". They all sat up in  
3 their wee beds the first night and wrote a letter to  
4 every Sister thanking them for looking after them.  
5 I brought them home to the Sisters.

6 Then the next night the Sisters had a big concert  
7 for them and we had a great night and the old people  
8 were at it and novices and postulants and all were at  
9 it. They gave them all a box of chocolates. We had  
10 an opera just before that, Snow White and the Seven  
11 Dwarfs". Some of the children took part in it. They  
12 got up on the stage that night and did their party  
13 piece. What they did in the Lodge they did it that  
14 night for the Sisters and all and we had a great night.

15 Q. I see.

16 A. That was the night before we left for -- what do you  
17 call it -- Tilbury.

18 Q. Tilbury. Was that concert in Hammersmith as opposed --

19 A. In Hammersmith House --

20 Q. I see.

21 A. -- the Mother House, yes.

22 Q. Thank you.

23 MS DOHERTY: Thanks very much, NL5. Can I just check: can  
24 you hear me okay?

25 A. I can hear you now.

1 Q. Okay. Can I just check if I understood you right? Were  
2 you saying that the nuns, the Sisters took it in turn to  
3 be sleeping with the children every night?

4 **A. The Sisters did sleep with the children every night.**  
5 **They had their cell -- what you called cells. You know,**  
6 **you called the nuns' bedrooms cells. SR47 was in her**  
7 **dormitory. SR34 was in her dormitory. SR152 was in her**  
8 **dormitory. SR47 (sic) was in her dormitory.**

9 Q. So when you were saying that they took turns --

10 **A. No.**

11 Q. -- you meant they took turns to be checking on the  
12 wains?

13 **A. At night when the Sister -- we would be at the meetings**  
14 **or the Sisters would be at recreation, one Sister always**  
15 **came back at night to look after the children.**

16 Q. Okay.

17 **A. There was always one Sister on duty, and she looked**  
18 **after the four groups, kept going about and, you know,**  
19 **keep checking things.**

20 Q. Just kept her eye on things.

21 **A. Always. The children were never left on their own.**

22 Q. And where did you sleep, NL5?

23 **A. Our dormitory was up in the attic. Well, two flights of**  
24 **stairs down I had a room down beside the sitting room.**  
25 **I didn't sleep with the children at all.**

1 Q. Okay.

2 **A. No, no.**

3 Q. Now one of the things we have heard about SR34 was that  
4 she had a wee inclination to pull the boys by their side  
5 locks to --

6 **A. Well, unless she did that in school and that. You know**  
7 **what they do in school, but I don't think -- I never saw**  
8 **her doing it about, but it could happen in school, and**  
9 **it happened in every school.**

10 Q. But you didn't see it --

11 **A. I saw it in our own school.**

12 Q. Uh-huh.

13 **A. You know what I mean?**

14 Q. I know.

15 **A. So that could have happened. I wasn't in the school.**  
16 **So I couldn't tell you anything what happened in the**  
17 **schools, you know.**

18 Q. But you're saying in the -- in the home in your group --

19 **A. I never saw SR34 -- SR34 hadn't time for that kind of**  
20 **carry on. She had too much to do, God love her!**

21 Q. Did you see any of the children ever being physically  
22 punished in the home?

23 **A. No, no.**

24 Q. So you -- in all the time you were there you didn't see  
25 anybody lifting their hand or ...?

1 **A. I can't say I did, being honest --**

2 Q. Okay.

3 **A. -- because you may even let a shout at them, you know,**  
4 **and a natter if they did anything, but I never saw**  
5 **a child being beaten or anything, none of us. We**  
6 **wouldn't do that in the first place.**

7 Q. Okay. Thank you.

8 **A. If it happened in school, I don't know.**

9 Q. Okay. Thank you, NL5.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 CHAIRMAN: Well, NL5, that's all we want to ask you about  
12 what you've said so far. So we'll take a break now and  
13 we'll sit in about three-quarters of an hour or  
14 an hour's time. So that will give you a break in the  
15 meantime.

16 **A. Thank you.**

17 Q. So not before 2 o'clock.

18 (1.15 pm)

19 (Lunch break)

20 (2.00 pm)

21 MS SMITH: Good afternoon, Chairman, Panel Members, ladies  
22 and gentlemen. NL5, can you hear me all right?

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. NL5, just before luncheon I was going to go on and talk  
25 about people who have complained about you --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- but before I do that you were very kind to bring  
3 along an album of photographs to the Inquiry. We have  
4 managed to scan them into our system. Some of them  
5 aren't as clear as they are in the original, but I am  
6 just going to look at a few of them, if I may, with you.  
7 Perhaps you can explain what it is.

8 Now there are a number of photographs that relate to  
9 the child you had special care of, **NL28**, but if we can  
10 look first of all, please, SNB-9520, these were  
11 photographs from 1958. The top one, that's you, is it,  
12 with --

13 **A. That's me walking up the road, yes, up the path to the  
14 Lodge and one of the boys took the photograph.**

15 Q. So that is actually the driveway up to the Lodge?

16 **A. That's right, up to the Lodge, yes.**

17 Q. If we can just scroll down that page, please, the nun  
18 here, as I say, it is not very clear but she actually  
19 does have glasses on.

20 **A. SR34.**

21 Q. SR34. Then if we look then, please -- there are some  
22 more photographs of NL28 at the next page, 9521.

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. Now the reason I am showing these is not so much of the  
25 child, but to show the background, and that's -- you can

1 see curtains with bows and the furniture and that.

2 Where was this taken?

3 **A. That's up in our sitting room, the children's sitting**  
4 **room.**

5 Q. So that's your group sitting room?

6 **A. That's the group sitting room.**

7 Q. If we can scroll on down, just there should be a few  
8 more there. That's armchairs and that in the sitting  
9 room.

10 **A. Yes, that's the group sitting room, yes.**

11 Q. Then if we go to -- yes -- 9524. If we can just scroll  
12 down through some of these quickly. Sorry. Just that  
13 last one there, is that outside the Lodge? Is that --

14 **A. That's outside the Lodge, yes.**

15 Q. And then the next one. This is yourself with the apron,  
16 is it, NL5?

17 **A. That's NL28 birthday -- one of NL28 birthday**  
18 **parties.**

19 Q. And this is SR34?

20 **A. That's SR34 --**

21 Q. If we can scroll down the next one --

22 **A. -- and myself.**

23 Q. -- this is the group of boys in your group?

24 **A. That's right. They joined us with NL28 birthday**  
25 **always.**



1 Q. I was wondering did they each have their birthday  
2 celebrated?

3 **A. No, they -- not separately, but they tried to do it all**  
4 **together, because we couldn't afford to do all the**  
5 **children separately, you know.**

6 Q. So if I'm right in understanding, there would have been  
7 one birthday celebration a year for each group?

8 **A. Well, I don't know about the other groups now. I am**  
9 **only talking about our group, what we did.**

10 Q. That's fine. Then the next photograph is at 9527.  
11 I think this is a different year.

12 **A. That's the year I took them to Bangor for a week's**  
13 **holidays.**

14 Q. And then this is another birthday party.

15 **A. That's another birthday party.**

16 Q. Again one of him on his own and then --

17 **A. The children, all the children together.**

18 Q. This room, that's -- is that the sitting room in the  
19 Lodge?

20 **A. The sitting room upstairs.**

21 Q. So --

22 **A. It's our own sitting room, yes.**

23 Q. There's -- I'm just -- because you will appreciate, NL5,  
24 that the Lodge no longer exists --

25 **A. That's right.**

1 Q. -- and we have heard a lot about it. So it is useful  
2 for us to get an idea of what it was like inside. There  
3 is a television there and a fireplace. Was that a --

4 **A. That was the children's sitting room upstairs on the**  
5 **third floor.**

6 Q. Yes, and the fireplace, was that an open fireplace or  
7 was it gas or electric or --

8 **A. Och, no. Well, we never used it. It was an open, but**  
9 **it was never used.**

10 Q. And there's windows with curtains and that there.

11 **A. Yes, yes. Uh-huh.**

12 Q. The next page is 9532, please. Could you maybe rotate  
13 that, please? Now this, NL5, what is -- when was this  
14 photograph taken?

15 **A. We had -- they had put on a show, Snow White and the**  
16 **Seven Dwarfs, for three days. The people from the area**  
17 **came in too, and we took the photograph afterwards of**  
18 **the children after the show was over, and that's the**  
19 **sisters and the girls that worked with us.**

20 Q. Can I just ask you, if we can go just from the extreme  
21 left-hand side, there's a member of staff there, is  
22 there?

23 **A. That's -- standing, the one?**

24 Q. Yes.

25 **A. That's . She worked in the church.**

1 Q. Okay, and then just the back row then if I could ask you  
2 to move from left to right.

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. If you could try and identify people, that would be  
5 helpful.

6 **A. Yes, I will surely. Wait till I see now. Is that  
7 SR152? SR71. That's SR47, SR152 and I never can  
8 remember that girl's name.**

9 Q. Okay. Moving --

10 **A. That's myself.**

11 Q. Yes. You see there's a little marker moving across the  
12 screen there.

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. Okay. So that's you, and the girl beside you?

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. And then moving across?

17 **A. That's -- that's NL4's sister.**

18 Q. Her sister and?

19 **A. , that worked in the laundry.**

20 Q. Yes.

21 **A. SR34 and SR71.**

22 Q. And you think -- do you know roughly what year that was?

23 **A. Oh, no, I couldn't tell you that now. I don't know what  
24 year we did that --**

25 Q. Okay.

1 **A. -- but it was Snow White and the Seven Dwarfs anyway.**

2 **That's what I remember.**

3 CHAIRMAN: Look at the nurse in the middle in the back row.

4 MS SMITH: Yes. The girl with the nurse's headdress in the  
5 middle, can you see?

6 **A. Well, they all -- -- they did wear those with the**  
7 **groups. The children with the -- the staff with the**  
8 **groups did wear the little hats and white thing. I**  
9 **didn't, but they did.**

10 Q. So in other groups they would have worn like a nurse's  
11 uniform?

12 **A. They all wore those, yes. They wore those, yes.**

13 Q. Then, NL5, if we go on to the next one, which is 9533.  
14 I think it's just the next one down actually. Now if we  
15 could rotate that, please. It's the photograph at the  
16 left that I am more interested in. You see at the top  
17 of this --

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. If we could maybe enlarge that slightly. Now is that  
20 you in the photograph, NL5?

21 **A. That's me, yes.**

22 Q. This is the dining room?

23 **A. That was the children's dining room at one time.**

24 Q. Now the way it's laid out here you were saying you had  
25 organised a reunion and that was --

1 **A. I did that every year for eighteen years. I got that**  
2 **room ready.**

3 Q. For the reunion. Now we heard yesterday from NL4 that  
4 this room was partitioned and that was right?

5 **A. I got them taken down.**

6 Q. They were actually fixed partitions --

7 **A. They were.**

8 Q. -- to the floor.

9 **A. They were. They were wooden, yes.**

10 Q. Can you recall what height they were?

11 **A. Wooden. They were just wooden structures.**

12 Q. Yes, but --

13 **A. They were easy pulled down.**

14 Q. But what height were they?

15 **A. Oh, not very high. You could see over them, yes.**

16 Q. Then you sent -- you left some photographs of -- sorry.

17 Just the next one. Yes, 9535. Now this is a photograph  
18 of the corridor, NL5.

19 **A. That's the corridor. That's the kitchen down there --**

20 **no, the parlour right up coming up to the kitchen.**

21 Q. So you're looking down the corridor and what you're

22 looking at right at the far end is the parlour --

23 **A. That's the parlour.**

24 Q. -- or the sitting room?

25 **A. Aye, the parlours, yes, the front of the house.**

1 Q. To the left-hand side you were telling me the  
2 dormitories are along that side.

3 A. **Aye, to the left. That is the last crowd, the seven  
4 children, that's where we moved down to when we had to  
5 move out of our own place, and that's where we were in  
6 there. There's a sitting room there and then  
7 a dormitory and then SR34 had a room at the end.**

8 Q. On the right-hand side?

9 A. **There was just a visitors' bathroom really, which we had  
10 to use, but then sometimes I would take them up to  
11 Bethlehem and bath them up there, sometimes up to the  
12 nuns' -- not the nuns' department, but the staff and the  
13 Sisters slept. I would bring them up there an odd  
14 Saturday and bath them there, you know.**

15 CHAIRMAN: Just before we leave that photograph, NL5, if we  
16 look at the floor, the pattern, are those -- is that  
17 a tiled floor or are those carpet tiles?

18 A. **No, that's carpet.**

19 Q. Carpet.

20 A. **The children's places were all carpeted at that time.**

21 Q. But before the carpet was laid was that a tiled floor?

22 A. **It is -- I think it was wooden. There was a time they  
23 had tiles, but I think it was before my time, but there  
24 was wood too, but now they got the place carpeted then.**

25 Q. Well, when there were wooden floors, they had to be

1 polished I take it?

2 **A. Yes, I suppose it would. That was at the beginning of**  
3 **my time, you know.**

4 Q. Thank you.

5 MS SMITH: Have you any idea when the carpet went down, NL5,  
6 at all?

7 **A. Oh, it was quite a few years before we left. Quite a --**  
8 **oh, yes. After the dormitories were turned into little**  
9 **bedrooms. They were converted into bedrooms for two**  
10 **children, and every place was carpeted, downstairs and**  
11 **upstairs and everywhere.**

12 Q. Just another photograph. 5... -- 9537. We've heard  
13 about the children at the bottom there, the bottom  
14 photograph, please.

15 **A. The bottom one? That's the field now where the care**  
16 **village is built.**

17 Q. Yes, but this is where the boys would have gone to play?

18 **A. That was their play field, yes.**

19 Q. Thank you, NL5. I know you've given us other  
20 photographs and -- there's actually just a couple of  
21 Nazareth House. If we might just look at those at 9539.  
22 Just the bottom one. Sorry. That, yes.

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. That's before it was demolished in 2000, isn't it?

25 **A. That's before it was demolished, yes. That was --**

1 Q. Then I think over the next page there's a sort of  
2 slightly larger one.

3 **A. That's the same. That's one of the same photographs.**

4 Q. That's sort of just from up the top of the Ravenhill  
5 Road there, looking back down.

6 **A. It is, yes. I think my brother took those photographs**  
7 **really.**

8 Q. Well, NL5, thank you very much. It is very good of you  
9 to have brought those, because they have been very  
10 helpful to the Inquiry.

11 **A. Not at all. Thank you.**

12 Q. Now, NL5, going back to -- you have said -- we were just  
13 talking about the fact that in your first statement to  
14 the Inquiry you describe the effect that the allegations  
15 have had on you.

16 **A. Yes, very badly.**

17 Q. You say at paragraph 4 of that first statement that you  
18 never saw any abuse or excessive punishments of any  
19 child by any Sister.

20 **A. I could say that, yes.**

21 Q. Or by NL4.

22 **A. No.**

23 Q. You said that corporal punishment was for the nuns and  
24 it always seemed reasonable and appropriate to you.

25 **A. That's right.**



1 Q. I was wondering did that mean then that you had on  
2 occasions seen the nuns exercise corporal punishment?

3 **A. No. I couldn't say -- I couldn't say yes. I couldn't**  
4 **say yes, because I didn't.**

5 Q. NL4, as you know, has said that she did smack children  
6 --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- and hit them with a ruler.

9 **A. Yes, she did.**

10 Q. She said the boys were most difficult to control in the  
11 dining room.

12 **A. I wouldn't say that. I would not say that. There was**  
13 **a system there and there was four staff there. The**  
14 **children were quite good. The children, they might have**  
15 **been noisy, but apart from that ... That's all.**

16 Q. You never saw her smack a child in the dining room?

17 **A. Oh, no, I never. I never experienced that, no.**

18 Q. Now the individuals, NL5, who have complained about you,  
19 by and large their allegations are to do with you  
20 physically abusing them.

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. There's some allegations of emotional abuse. I am not  
23 going to go through the allegations. I know you have  
24 gone through them with your solicitor and you have  
25 answered --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- what you remember about those particular individuals

3 --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- in your statements to us, but just to be clear there  
6 are sixteen people have spoken to the Inquiry and twelve  
7 of those also spoke to police. There were another three  
8 individuals complained to the police.

9 Now in respect of the three individuals who  
10 complained to the police, I know you haven't addressed  
11 those in a statement, but you are going to submit  
12 another statement to the Inquiry dealing with those  
13 allegations.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. Isn't that right?

16 **A. All right. Yes.**

17 Q. We talked about that with your lawyers this morning.

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. Do you remember?

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. Now that makes a total of nineteen people, and you  
22 denied all the allegations both in your interviews with  
23 the police and in your statements to the Inquiry. As  
24 I've said, I am not going to go through them all again,  
25 but in your Inquiry statement you made it quite clear

1 that you wish to address everything that anybody said  
2 about you when they came here. Isn't that right?

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. Well, I am going to go through the individuals and I am  
5 going to use the names, but just like your name can't be  
6 used outside here, their name can't be given outside.

7 The first was HIA16. His -- he was unable to come  
8 and give evidence. His statement of evidence was at  
9 SNB-396 to 399. He is HIA16. As he was unable to come  
10 and speak to us, I don't need to tell you what more he  
11 said, because he didn't say anything more than what you  
12 knew about anyway.

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. The next person was HIA19. His statement is at 905  
15 to -- sorry -- 405 to 415. He is HIA19. His transcript  
16 can be found at 91371. If we can look at that, please.  
17 Now this is -- this is -- if you can see this clearly,  
18 NL5, you will see that for the question -- that would be  
19 me asking him the question just as I'm doing with you  
20 now and then his answers. If we can scroll on down that  
21 page, please, you will see here that:

22 "Q. Well, at paragraph 12 of your statement you  
23 talk about one of the members of staff there, NL5.  
24 NL5 -- and I am just going to use her first name -- was  
25 one of the civilian staff. She wasn't a nun. You say,

1 'She is elderly' and you give her age, but:

2 'She was wicked herself and was not nice to  
3 children. She used to hit us with the edge of wooden  
4 rulers and stuff like that on the knuckles and back of  
5 the hands for no reason. I think she lived in the  
6 building and was in St. Joseph's group'."

7 Can I just be clear: you were in St. Joseph's group,  
8 NL5. That is right?

9 **A. She was in St. Joseph's group did you say?**

10 Q. No, you were in -- you weren't in the group, but  
11 St. Joseph's group was your group that you had?

12 **A. Yes, that's right.**

13 Q. Yes. Okay. Now it goes on. I will just keep reading  
14 out from what he said in his statement, NL5. If we can  
15 scroll on down. He also made a statement to the police.  
16 If we can scroll on down through the next page. He says  
17 -- sorry -- just at the top of that -- he wasn't  
18 actually in your group and he said:

19 "That's right."

20 But he said that you took him -- there was a copper  
21 laundry machine, washing machine in the laundry in  
22 Nazareth Lodge.

23 "If they wet the bed, they would scare you by saying  
24 that if you wet the bed again, would you be thrown in  
25 with the sheets."

1           If you can scroll on down. I am going to come to  
2           you in a wee minute, NL5. I know you are anxious to say  
3           something about that. Scroll on down, please, to the  
4           next page. It seemed to be suggesting from his  
5           statement that both you and NL4 took him together into  
6           the laundry, but he clarifies that that wasn't the case  
7           --

8   **A. No.**

9   Q. -- that that wasn't what happened, that you would  
10       have -- it would have been separate occasions. NL4  
11       might have taken him to the laundry and you might have  
12       taken him to the laundry. If we can just scroll on  
13       down. I put to him what you had said in your statement  
14       and he said:

15            "It was definitely a big machine, a big copper  
16            machine. It wasn't switched on. It was just closed and  
17            then lifted up again. So obviously you weren't  
18            suffocated. If you were put in it, you wouldn't be dead  
19            at all. Of course that's why I'm here."

20            If we can scroll on down to the next page. Yes. He  
21            talks about a pillow fight, but again that's relating to  
22            NL4 rather than you.

23            Now you were saying in your statement that you were  
24            not in the laundry with NL4 and you didn't do what he  
25            said that you did. He said that you had been alone in

1 their group:

2 "... manys a time coming in and out, because her  
3 group was right beside ours. So she has come in there  
4 if there was a noise or anything like that on her own.  
5 So she's not telling the truth there."

6 **A. Did they say St. Joseph's group was near his?**

7 Q. Yes.

8 **A. No. We were separate up in the attic. They were down  
9 on the next floor. We weren't --**

10 Q. When you moved down to the floor where we saw the  
11 corridor, would you have been beside him?

12 **A. That's -- well, we were down at the latter end down  
13 there in that corridor, but they were upstairs.**

14 I wasn't even near -- our group wasn't near another  
15 group. We were up in the attic. You had to come down  
16 two flights of stairs to go to SR47's group. She was on  
17 the next floor, and then the next floor was SR71 and  
18 SR152. That was another floor down. So we weren't near  
19 them at all.

20 Q. You were saying that the groups kept very much separate.

21 **A. Oh, yes. We were independent.**

22 Q. Then this is the business about meeting this boy HIA19  
23 at a funeral.

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. Sorry. Just scroll on down. He had said he met you at

1 a funeral and you said -- you'd brushed him off and  
2 didn't want to talk to him. What he said about that was  
3 -- when I put it to him that you said that didn't happen  
4 --

5 **A. No, that didn't happen.**

6 Q. -- well, he then said:

7 "Well, I went over to speak to her and she said,  
8 'The sacrament light is on. I haven't got time to talk  
9 to you'. There was -- everybody was leaving the chapel  
10 at the time. That's what she said to me and I turned  
11 and walked away again, but I did go over to speak to her  
12 not specifically about the home, just a 'Hello'  
13 actually, and she just says, 'I haven't got time. The  
14 sacrament light is on here'."

15 **A. No.**

16 Q. "That's what she said to me."

17 **A. No, no. He asked me where he would get -- he came back  
18 and asked me where -- he came out of the seat -- there  
19 was only two of them -- and I asked him why he was  
20 there. I said, "Who has died, HIA19?" He says,  
21 "A friend, a mother of some of the old boys". He didn't  
22 say who it was. So we just talked for a second. We  
23 were in the church, and then he came back up to me and  
24 he said, "NL5, where would I get a leaflet?" and I says,  
25 "Go over to the side of the church there and you'll**

1       **likely get a leaflet", and that's what he did and he**  
2       **went out. I never saw him again. That was it.**

3    Q.   Okay. I think that's probably the last page of that.  
4       If I could just scroll down to see what the next  
5       page reference is. Oh, it is up at the top there.  
6       That's -- yes. That was about NL4. If we can just  
7       scroll on down to the bottom of the next page then.  
8       Sorry. Just if we could pause there.

9                "I'm not suggesting ..."

10              As I say, he was clarifying about the laundry and  
11             I~was going to ask you about the laundry.

12    **A. Yes.**

13    Q.   What was the position about the laundry, NL5?

14    **A.                ran the laundry, nobody else.                had the**  
15       **keys of the laundry. She ran the laundry. The staff --**  
16       **wouldn't let anything go on in the laundry. The**  
17       **staff would bring down whatever they had to get washed**  
18       **in the morning to                .                did the washing for each**  
19       **group, the sisters and all. Then the staff would**  
20       **collect them before the children came up. The children**  
21       **didn't have to go near the laundry. Now maybe some of**  
22       **the staff, the younger ones, if they were going down to**  
23       **collect clothes or that, they might take one with them,**  
24       **you know, just like that, but the children didn't do**  
25       **anything in the laundry.**



1 Q. I was asking you -- I mean, NL4 told us yesterday that  
2 she might have been standing beside you at these delft  
3 sinks washing clothes.

4 A. I never washed in the laundry. I washed in that -- that  
5 room that you say the children -- there was two big  
6 sinks there. I would wash mine and bring them down and  
7 hang them on the horses. She might meet me in the  
8 laundry, but I never washed in the laundry.

9 Q. When did \_\_\_\_\_ come to work in the laundry? Do  
10 you remember?

11 A. Oh, dear, dear!

12 Q. I think when we were talking earlier you said that she'd  
13 come from --

14 A. She came from

15 Q. -- and you thought it was some time in the 1950s.

16 A. Yes, she would, yes.

17 Q. Would it be long after you arrived?

18 A. No, it wouldn't be long after. I would say after the  
19 water and all came on again I think they must have sort  
20 of looked for staff then. \_\_\_\_\_ came from The Good  
21 Shepherd's in \_\_\_\_\_ and was there until she got married.  
22 She got married from the Lodge. She had her breakfast  
23 -- marriage breakfast and all in the Lodge. We did the  
24 whole thing.

25 Q. Well, if we can just scroll on down to the bottom of

1 that page, I think that's in relation to NL4, but at  
2 13... -- sorry -- 91392 this is -- this is still HIA19  
3 speaking, and Mr Lane was asking him a question after he  
4 had given his evidence there. Just scroll on down. He  
5 is asked:

6 "People like NL5 and so on, what job title did you  
7 give them? Were they ever known as charge girls or  
8 anything like that?

9 **A. They were staff. NL5 was staff. She said she**  
10 **never came into another group on her own. I'm sorry.**  
11 **She's not telling the truth there. Definitely not."**

12 **A. Sure I had no need to go into the other groups. The**  
13 **children were in school all day. We didn't go in in the**  
14 **mornings. They seen to their own children. We seen to**  
15 **our own group, got them up, dressed and got them down to**  
16 **their breakfast. Each group did their own. We never**  
17 **went near other groups, nor they never came near ours**  
18 **either.**

19 Q. The next person, NL5, is HIA21, who is HIA21.

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. I know that you have -- you are quite close to HIA21.

22 **A. Yes.**

23 Q. He comes and visits you. Since he became an adult you  
24 got friendly with him.

25 **A. That's right.**

1 Q. He spoke to the Inquiry. His statement was at 631 to  
2 647, but the transcript of what he said is at SNB-90985,  
3 please. He wasn't in your group.

4 **A. No. HIA21 wasn't.**

5 Q. He was in NL4's group.

6 **A. He was in the Sacred Heart -- Marion group for a while.**  
7 **I think he went into the Sacred Heart group some time**  
8 **after.**

9 Q. Just if we can just scroll down to there, about line 12,  
10 please. I am asking him about you and what he said  
11 about you and:

12 "She is in her 80s. She contacted you when this  
13 Inquiry was set up. You have had contact with her many  
14 times since you left Nazareth Lodge in 1968."

15 He says:

16 "That's right."

17 Then if you just scroll on down, I put it to him --  
18 because he told the Inquiry that:

19 "You told NL5 that you had seen NL4, the other  
20 woman, abuse you."

21 Sorry. Let me get this right. He said to you that  
22 he had seen -- you had seen him being hit by NL4, if  
23 I can --

24 **A. I am sorry. No. I've never seen -- I never saw her.**  
25 **She might have done it, but I never saw her doing it.**

1 Q. I said that to him:

2 "She replied in saying she didn't witness the abuse  
3 either to him."

4 You told him that at the time as well. Isn't that  
5 right?

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. Scroll on down if we can, please. I put it to him that  
8 you had had a standing ovation at the reunions when you  
9 went back and he said that he accepted that. He said:

10 "I mean, the fact that this particular person -- the  
11 reason why I have her my statement is that she saw NL4  
12 punishing me or physically assaulting me, and I was more  
13 annoyed by the fact that while she may have maybe done  
14 nothing there and then, she should have reported to the  
15 powers that be to have her removed, and for that alone  
16 I have trouble with NL5 in that regard, that she had  
17 ownership on her part to take some responsibility for  
18 what this other person was doing to me.

19 Certainly many years later and even prior to  
20 Christmas I and another friend had called to see her,  
21 because she is frail, and I am very much mindful of the  
22 fact that she is vulnerable in many ways."

23 He said that while you would be an observant of what  
24 happened to you on occasions, he felt for you, because  
25 he felt that you were being tarnished because of what

1 was being said about NL4.

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. He said that -- I asked could you have worked alongside  
4 NL4 in the home and he responded:

5 "They impossibly could not have been. They had to.  
6 Certainly in the dining room" --

7 **A. That's right.**

8 Q. -- "and if not in the recreational side as well."

9 **A. That's right. That's right.**

10 Q. "I think if NL5 was to say something to the contrary,  
11 then I would contradict that",

12 but you are not saying anything to the contrary to  
13 that.

14 **A. No, no.**

15 Q. "She certainly would have had in that capacity of  
16 overseeing when the nuns, either at prayer time or meal  
17 time. In respect of what NL5 is saying in regard to the  
18 reunions, yes, by all means many of the boys would have  
19 appreciated NL5, what she did for us, but equally we  
20 would say she was very strict and we would leave it like  
21 that."

22 **A. Well, I was particular, yes.**

23 Q. I said:

24 "You describe the kind of things she would have done  
25 to the boys. Was that a punishment, that she would have

1       been doing that because the boys had stepped out of line  
2       or --"

3             He said:

4             "She would, like. I used the term she was no angel  
5       and maybe that's exaggerating to a certain extent, but  
6       the fact she was a control freak as such, that  
7       discipline was the essence of her curriculum, and  
8       therefore if you didn't toe the line, NL5 would put you  
9       in the line. I think you have to accept that there has  
10      to be some issue of being accountable. I think NL5 was  
11      doing that in relation to us."

12            In other words, he was saying he didn't really mind  
13      you being strict if they stepped out of line. Okay?

14            I said:

15            "Well, just to be clear, she would say through her  
16      lawyers to me that she never slapped any child."

17            HIA21's answer was:

18            "Well, NL5 has to live with that. If that's what  
19      she is preparing to give out through her statement,  
20      through her solicitor, then that's what she has to do,  
21      but I know NL5 did slap including me and others, but,  
22      I mean, it wasn't a big factor in my life compared to  
23      the likes of NL4, no stretch of the imagination."

24      **A. But HIA21 wasn't in my group. So I wouldn't interfere**  
25      **with HIA21. He was in the Marion group. We wouldn't**

1           **have interfered with another child in another group.**

2    Q.   Just scroll down a bit.  The final page, NL5, there.  
3           That's to do with NL4.

4           "So, therefore, just to keep it -- in respect to  
5    NL5, I spoke to NL5 about this many times years after in  
6    regard to NL4.  So NL5 is very aware.  I am sort of  
7    disappointed that if she didn't see what was going on,  
8    you know, I have to accept that is what she believes,  
9    but I know what I saw and I know what she saw as well."

10   **A.  I never experienced it.  I could always say I never --**  
11       **she said she did it, but I never experienced it, and**  
12       **I can't say "Yes", if I didn't see it.**

13    Q.   The next person -- that's what HIA21 said.  The next  
14           person to speak about you to the Inquiry was HIA104 --

15    **A.  Yes.**

16    Q.   -- another [name redacted].  He is HIA104.  His  
17           statement can be found at SNB-492 to 499.  If we go to  
18           the transcript, please, it starts at 91240.  You see  
19           he's talking there about a nun.  If we can scroll on  
20           down.  This is -- he was talking about a nun and having  
21           a particular experience with one nun, just a one-off  
22           incident, as he described it.  It is put to him:

23           "Q.  But your experience with her with this  
24           particular singular incident was not the same as your  
25           experience with NL5?"

1           A. No, no."

2           If we can scroll on down, please, he said there was  
3           an occasion when he was supposed to be an altar boy and  
4           someone was visiting the home, but he stayed outside and  
5           played football. He said he was very good at football.  
6           Is that right? Do you remember HIA104 being good?

7           A. I don't know. You didn't know anything about football.  
8           I mean, he played football in the school yard and maybe  
9           out -- but I never took any notice of it, you know.  
10          I didn't notice anything about it.

11          Q. Somebody was coming to the home to say mass. He was  
12          supposed to be the altar boy. He said when he  
13          eventually came into the house, you took him into a  
14          small room and gave him a serious beating, which he  
15          remembers to this day. If we can just scroll on down,  
16          he said you had slapped him before the incident but  
17          never with the same severity. If we can just scroll on  
18          down. If we just scroll on down through this, please.  
19          There's different pages, but he said -- he said that:

20                 "The person who had come to say mass was like  
21                 a special person that came, maybe a big bishop or  
22                 something. I'm not sure. So that's why it was  
23                 an afternoon mass."

24          Now you talked about Brendan Smyth coming to say the  
25          retreat mass. That was an afternoon mass.



1    **A. No. I don't think -- they had lectures a couple of**  
2       **times a day, but I don't think they had mass at night.**  
3       **They had mass in the morning as far as I -- now there**  
4       **could have been a mass during the lecture. I don't know**  
5       **what they did during the lectures, you know.**

6    Q. I am putting to him what you said in your statement,  
7       NL5.

8    **A. Yes.**

9    Q. I said that you didn't remember him being a altar boy.

10   **A. I didn't remember one any of them being on the altar, to**  
11       **be honest.**

12   Q. He said he was one of the top altar boys is what he  
13       said.

14   **A. I don't remember him at all.**

15   Q. When I put it to him that you said you loved the  
16       children in your care and never hit them in any form, he  
17       said, "That's total lies", and he doesn't accept that in  
18       any way. If we can keep on scrolling down, please.

19       There was talk about the dining room, which was on the  
20       ground floor.

21   **A. That's right.**

22   Q. And -- scroll on down. He talks about you and SR34 and  
23       he couldn't remember which of you it was:

24       "I would love to know" -- sorry -- "I would love to  
25       be able to know exactly which, but there's no point in

1 saying one when it mightn't be, but I know it was either  
2 one of them."

3 He and some boys were in the dining hall and they  
4 were kicking the rubber things that were on the bottom  
5 of the chairs he said like a little -- he pointed to a  
6 walking stick. It stops the chair from sliding.

7 **A. There was no rubbers on the chairs. The chairs were**  
8 **just there. There was no rubbers on the feet of the**  
9 **chairs --**

10 Q. He said that that was the type of thing --

11 **A. -- that I can remember. Not at all. Not in my time**  
12 **anyway.**

13 Q. Well, he was able to pull it off the bottom. I am just  
14 telling you what he is saying, NL5.

15 **A. Yes, I know.**

16 Q. "... and just kick them all over the place, because you  
17 hadn't got a ball."

18 He says:

19 "We weren't playing football. We were just playing  
20 with the wee rubber thing."

21 He also talks about a time when -- about bed making.

22 He said that:

23 "When you made the bed, you had to tuck them in at  
24 the bottom, get your corners, take your corners up.

25 That gets you an angle, and then fold everything in. If

1           you didn't do that right, slap. So that was every  
2           morning until you got it perfectly that could you do it  
3           yourself."

4     **A. No child in that -- in St. Joseph's group ever made**  
5     **a bed, because they wouldn't make them the way I wanted**  
6     **them. I did the beds myself. No child ever made a bed**  
7     **in St. Joseph's. I don't know about the other groups,**  
8     **but in St. Joseph's they didn't.**

9     Q. He said it had to be done in a very particular way.  
10           When you tucked it in, you had to tuck it in the whole  
11           way.

12     **A. No.**

13     Q. As you said in your interview to the police, you said  
14           you never hit your little ones and you main the beds  
15           yourself --

16     **A. That's right.**

17     Q. -- as you were so particular.

18     **A. That's right.**

19     Q. If we can scroll on down, there was a small number in  
20           the group.

21            "She liked things perfect and she would have made  
22           the beds",

23            and he said:

24            "If it is drummed into you and beat into you over  
25           the years, you soon pick it up."

1           He said when he first went to the house, your group  
2           was actually at the very top of the house.

3   **A. We were in the attic, that's right, until we had a fire**  
4   **in it, yes.**

5   Q. There were big wooden floors.

6   **A. That's right.**

7   Q. There was a bumper, a shiner thing that you hold.

8   **A. I used that, yes.**

9   Q. It was an electric machine he said.

10  **A. That's right.**

11  Q. "Once that done its work, then we went to work on it  
12       with dusters on our feet."

13  **A. Well, the only reason they would put them on, it was to**  
14  **keep the children with us, not to let them go out**  
15  **without being supervised. We had to do -- but that was**  
16  **going on before I ever went to the Lodge, you know.**

17  Q. He said it was just over their slippers these cloths  
18       were put on.

19  **A. Yes, over their shoes. They had their shoes on.**

20  Q. "You kind of tucked it into your slippers",  
21       he said.

22       "Yes, we definitely done that. Very much so."

23       I say -- it is put to him that you were telling the  
24       Inquiry that that wasn't a task that those you looked  
25       after had to do.

1     **A. Oh, no.**

2     Q. But it was.

3     **A. Well, the only reason we kept -- is to keep the children**  
4         **with us, because we'd nobody to go down to the fields to**  
5         **supervise them. You weren't allowed to let them out**  
6         **without being supervised. Anything could have happened**  
7         **them. So you kept -- did something just, but we had**  
8         **three lines of bed in the attic. You could hardly move**  
9         **in it. There was three lines. So there was very little**  
10        **floor. Do you know what I mean?**

11    Q. So I've understood you rightly, NL5, what you are saying  
12        is you couldn't let -- you had to get on with this work.

13    **A. Yes.**

14    Q. This work had to be done.

15    **A. Yes. That was really only on a Saturday, because I was**  
16        **at the play groups during the week. We didn't do any**  
17        **work upstairs. We just made the beds and that was it**  
18        **and left the place tidy.**

19    Q. HIA104 is saying here that -- you were telling police  
20        that you can say with a clear conscience you never  
21        assaulted any children during your time in Nazareth  
22        Lodge.

23    **A. Yes.**

24    Q. He said:

25            "I thought she was the worst."

1           He said -- you were telling the police -- there was  
2 bits of your police interview were being read out to him  
3 about how children were disciplined in the home, and you  
4 said that they may have been deprived of pocket money  
5 and you didn't see them being hit at any time. It's put  
6 to him that that didn't reflect his memory of what took  
7 place and he says:

8           "No, it does not, no."

9           If we can just scroll on down. Sorry. If we just  
10 pause there. Yes. He talks about being wakened in the  
11 middle of the night to go to the toilet.

12 **A. Sure, we'd be in bed in the middle of the night. We**  
13 **wouldn't be up in the night -- middle of the night.**  
14 **SR34 wouldn't be up either. She slept in the dormitory**  
15 **with the children. I didn't. I had just NL 8 and the**  
16 **wee fella down in my room, because we couldn't leave**  
17 **them in the dormitory, but we weren't up. I wasn't near**  
18 **the children at night -- during the night.**

19 **Q. I think maybe, NL5, the middle of the night may be for a**  
20 **child not necessarily --**

21 **A. Well, maybe around 10 o'clock maybe I would have lifted**  
22 **them if they wanted to go to the toilet, because they**  
23 **were in bed early. So, you know, children would need to**  
24 **go to the toilet before morning. I always thought it**  
25 **was humiliating for a child, you know, because I like**

1       them to get up feeling all right in front of their  
2       friends.  If they wet the bed, they would feel  
3       disgusted, you know, and maybe feel it.  I always  
4       thought children in wet pyjamas or a wet sheet was  
5       cruelty.  It was better to lift them and let them use  
6       the toilet and make sure they are all right for the  
7       night.  I used to go round and tuck them in after they  
8       got back into bed.  I went round every bed and tucked  
9       them in.

10    Q.  I think, NL5, what he is saying is that you got  
11       everybody up and they had to wait until they went to the  
12       toilet until they got back to bed.

13    A.  Sure, there was only three toilets.  I mean, you  
14       couldn't let them all go into -- we wouldn't let them go  
15       into the toilets together, number one.  They had to  
16       stand out and then when they were finished, they'd go  
17       back to bed.  There was only three toilets at the time.  
18       There were 25 children.

19    Q.  He says --

20    A.  But I wouldn't have got them all up now.  Only some of  
21       them would have to get up.

22    Q.  He says:

23                "On a winter's night you were just standing outside,  
24       the row of you, just absolutely freezing, just a vest  
25       and underpants on, and then when you get cold, sometimes

1 it's hard to go to the toilet."

2 **A. They had their pyjamas on them. They hadn't underwear**  
3 **or anything on at night. They got into their pyjamas.**  
4 **They took everything off and put it on their chair.**  
5 **They had a locker and a chair beside their beds. They**  
6 **just fold -- put their clothes on until the morning.**  
7 **Put their pyjamas on. They always had pyjamas in bed.**  
8 **They never had anything else.**

9 Q. I mean, it is being put to him what you've said to us,  
10 that you wouldn't let a child lie on a wet mattress or  
11 sheet.

12 **A. I wouldn't. No, I wouldn't. I think that's --**  
13 **I thought that was cruelty if it did happen, but I would**  
14 **never let it happen.**

15 Q. He said that:

16 "You had to line up, and then if you couldn't go to  
17 the toilet, you got a clip across the ear for not  
18 going."

19 **A. Not at all. That's untrue. So untrue.**

20 Q. You said that to the police. You said that that was  
21 ridiculous --

22 **A. Oh, ridiculous.**

23 Q. -- when the police put that to you.

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. Then he was -- when you were talking to the police, they



1 asked you about putting a pillow -- protective cloth  
2 down over a pillow to stop someone from drooling.

3 A. I will tell you what that was. There was one little boy  
4 and he used to slabber a lot at night. I thought his  
5 pillow -- I couldn't let a child lie on it. So I used  
6 to throw them out. They are only small pillows now, not  
7 a pillow we would use today, but they were half that  
8 size. I thought, "What will I do to try to save this  
9 for the child?" So I thought I'd put a wee bit of cloth  
10 on it at night, take it off in the morning, wash it and  
11 have it clean for the next night just to save his  
12 pillow.

13 Q. You didn't remember who that person was.

14 A. Somehow I think it was HIA104.

15 Q. That's what -- he was -- he has told the Inquiry it was  
16 him.

17 A. I thought now -- I have a picture of him and, God love  
18 him, his pillow would be very soiled and I thought that  
19 was terrible. You couldn't let him lie on it the next  
20 night. So I just put a nice wee cloth over it, took it  
21 off in the morning, put it into the wash and put it back  
22 on at night again. He was the only child.

23 Q. He was saying it was like a little towel.

24 A. Just a wee bit of cloth or a towel. You know, something  
25 -- I can't remember, but something anyway.

1 Q. Well, he was saying -- if we can just scroll on down.  
2 I mean, this is what you were saying, pretty much as you  
3 told the police, that you would have thrown out the  
4 pillow and then put the cloth down?

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. It was put to him you thought that might be him --

7 **A. That's right.**

8 Q. -- and that you did put this down. If we can scroll on  
9 down, you said it wasn't intended as a punishment, just  
10 the opposite. He said it didn't just happen to him. It  
11 happened to all of them.

12 **A. Oh, no. That's not true.**

13 Q. It was -- sorry. I beg your pardon. I think that's  
14 right.

15 "Everything had to be ..."

16 It was put to him:

17 "Q. You think it was more to protect the pillow?

18 **A. Oh, yes, definitely, definitely. Everything had  
19 to be -- as I said to you earlier, everything was white,  
20 pristine white. She had a fascination with this."**

21 **Were you very particular about --**

22 **A. Well, I like clean beds. I like them to have nice clean  
23 beds, but HIA104 was the only one that got that little  
24 cloth. He was the only child that suffered that way,  
25 you know.**

1 Q. Well, he said that you and NL4 were pally. Scroll on  
2 down, please. There was one occasion when NL4 was  
3 hitting him in the dormitory and he can't remember why  
4 it was, but it might have been something to do with the  
5 beds or something, and you don't particularly remember  
6 why NL4 was hitting you (sic), but what he remembered  
7 was you came in and spoke to NL4. He thought it was  
8 something to do with you telling NL4 about her mother or  
9 her father dying and her leaving in tears.

10 A. No, I didn't know about her mother and father, but  
11 I knew about her brother that had been electrocuted.  
12 That was the only one. SR34 got that messages.

13 Q. You didn't tell NL4 herself?

14 A. Oh, no, no, no, no. SR34 was the one got the message  
15 about that.

16 Q. But might you have come in looking for NL4 to say, "SR34  
17 wants to talk to you"?

18 A. I would have come down to sympathise with her or  
19 something, you know. I likely did, you know, go down  
20 and say -- I likely found out what had happened -- but  
21 I did know what happened. So I likely went down to say  
22 I was sorry, you know --

23 Q. Okay. If we can just scroll on down, please.

24 A. -- because she had to go home then, like. She was home  
25 quite a while until after his ...

1 Q. What -- he also said there seemed to be two stories that  
2 were put together. One he is saying he remembers being  
3 in a bedroom and you coming in and getting NL4 and going  
4 out, but he remembered another time when he was being  
5 hit. If we can scroll on down, please, through this.

6 **A. I never saw her hitting him.**

7 Q. I mean, what you said in your statement was put to him.  
8 If we can just keep on scrolling down through this for  
9 a moment, please. Makes the point there were two  
10 separate incidents. I put to him that you'd said, as  
11 you've just said to us, that there were no rubber things  
12 on the chairs.

13 **A. No.**

14 Q. He says:

15 "That's a blatant lie."

16 **A. Oh, no. There's no rubbers on our chairs anyway.**  
17 **There's no rubbers on the chairs. Where would we get**  
18 **all those rubbers?**

19 Q. He said -- just scroll up the preceding page for  
20 a moment. He said -- I said:

21 "But your experience with NL5 was not ever  
22 a positive one?"

23 He said:

24 "Never, no. Just too strict. Very, very strict.

25 She was very, very strict."

1           If we can scroll on down, please, then, what he said  
2           was the rest of the time was not like that. He said:

3           "Around NL5 basically you were walking on eggshells.  
4           That's how bad it was."

5   **A. That's not true. That's not true. That's not true.**

6   Q. The next person who spoke to the Inquiry, NL5, was  
7   HAI110. That was at -- he is HIA110. His transcript is  
8   at 91292. Yes. I think -- scroll on down. He is  
9   talking about the food. He said that:

10           "If you didn't like the food, you had to eat it or  
11           you were hit across the face by either NL4 or NL5."

12           That was in the refectory. It's -- go on. Scroll  
13           on down, please. He said you weren't as bad as NL4, but  
14           his memory is that you would hit him across the knuckles  
15           with a wooden ruler.

16   **A. No, definitely not. I never had wood in my hand.**

17   Q. He said -- it was put to him that maybe this was  
18   something happened to him in school and said:

19           "No. I remember NL5 doing it. I remember her."

20   **A. I wasn't in the school.**

21   Q. No. He's not saying that it happened in the school. It  
22   was being suggested to him, "If you remember being hit  
23   by a ruler, maybe that happened to you in school".

24   **A. Oh, yes. That's right, yes. I am sorry.**

25   Q. He said, no, that he remembered you doing it to him.

1 **A. No, no, no.**

2 Q. Now the next person, NL5, is HIA132. One of the  
3 photographs of the birthday party, he is actually in  
4 that photograph.

5 **A. He is in it. He is in it, yes.**

6 Q. That's HIA132. Sorry. I beg your pardon. That was his  
7 reference number. I have not given you -- the  
8 transcript is -- the first page of that is at 91010. If  
9 we can just scroll on down, please. Sorry. Just move  
10 back up. He describes you as being involved in using  
11 a stick if you made a sound at bedtime.

12 **A. No.**

13 Q. If we can scroll on down, he remembers SR34.

14 "The odd time the two of them were on the floor, but  
15 the bulk of it was NL5."

16 That would be consistent if SR34 was at these  
17 meetings. Then you would be up looking after the  
18 children. Isn't that right?

19 **A. Could you repeat that? I just didn't hear.**

20 Q. Sorry, NL5. Can you hear me all right?

21 **A. I can hear you, yes.**

22 Q. He is talking about SR34 and you, and the odd time the  
23 two of you were on the floor at night, but the bulk of  
24 it -- the bulk of the time it was you.

25 "If SR34 was in her cell, then NL5 was standing

1 outside talking and she just looked down the dormitory,  
2 and if she seen your head peaking up from the blanket,  
3 you got the stick. There were times when NL5 wasn't up  
4 and SR34 was doing that too. She was marching around  
5 the dormitory."

6 Okay?

7 **A. That's all untrue, every bit of it.**

8 Q. We can scroll on down, please, just. He said:

9 "Every night you had to strip off and go into the  
10 bathroom and open your underpants, and if they weren't  
11 clean, you got the stick."

12 He said:

13 "To this day it's degrading."

14 **A. No.**

15 Q. He said it wasn't normal, because he has children of his  
16 own.

17 **A. That's untrue, completely untrue. Never anything ever  
18 happened in the Lodge like that. I don't think in any  
19 other group either. We didn't do things like that.  
20 That's ridiculous.**

21 Q. So we can scroll on down, it was put to you that when  
22 you were talking about somebody else that the children  
23 took their school clothes off, put play clothes on. At  
24 wash time any soiled underwear would be collected and  
25 taken to the laundry.

1    **A. Not every day, no. That would be on a Saturday now and**  
2            **then would do the washing. She didn't do it on**  
3            **a Saturday. She did it on a Monday and that.**

4    **Q. It was put to him that you didn't accept that the**  
5            **underwear was checked or anybody was punished for having**  
6            **--**

7    **A. No.**

8    **Q. -- soiled underwear and he said:**

9            **"Well, it did happen and I wouldn't have made the**  
10           **statement. This is something I remember and it happened**  
11           **every night."**

12   **A. No. That is totally untrue, totally unclear. I was**  
13           **mostly down the parlours at night. I wasn't even**  
14           **upstairs at night. Is there --**

15   **Q. He is talking now about -- sorry. NL5. I didn't mean to**  
16           **interrupt you.**

17   **A. Who?**

18   **Q. I didn't mean to interrupt you.**

19   **A. Sorry. I was downstairs at night at meetings and doing**  
20           **things. I wasn't up. There would be one Sister, as**  
21           **I told you, up at that time of night looking after them.**  
22           **We wouldn't even be up there, SR34 either, because we**  
23           **went to all the meetings. I had to do the supper for**  
24           **them and do the wash-up and be there to lock up after**  
25           **the committees went out. It was mostly nights, because**



1 we had that much going on. We weren't even up in the  
2 dormitories at night, but there would be one Sister  
3 there in charge, you know. Every night there'd be  
4 a different Sister: SR47, SR34, SR71 and SR152. SR34  
5 wouldn't even be there, because she had to go to the  
6 meetings.

7 Q. Okay. Well, in any event just coming back to what  
8 HIA132 is saying here, he said:

9 "If you didn't keep the blankets over your head, you  
10 would get hit with a stick."

11 He said that happened.

12 "The group you remember was called The Dainties.  
13 That was St. Joseph's group."

14 He remembers you being called "The Dainties".

15 A. That's right. We were called "The Dainties" all right,  
16 because they were all -- I liked them in their shirts  
17 and ties and keeping them nice. That's why they called  
18 them that.

19 Q. He was asked:

20 "Do you remember being singled out, your group being  
21 seen as different in the home?"

22 A. Yes, as different, as clean and dainties, and we  
23 weren't allowed to mix with other groups, you know. She  
24 wanted just us into the bedroom, into the dormitories  
25 and keep us separate. I do remember that."

1 A. They played in the fields with the other children and we  
2 never went near the dormitories from we left in the  
3 morning until we went back to the night. They were up  
4 in the attic. There was no reason to go back to the  
5 dormitory. We never went back to ours. Now the other  
6 groups might have, because they were nearer, you know,  
7 the downstairs and that, but we were away up in the  
8 attic. We never went back up again until night until  
9 you went to bed, you know.

10 Q. He says he remembered:

11 "At 6 o'clock she used to say after our tea, 'We're  
12 heading up the stairs to the dormitory' and especially  
13 in the summer the sun would have been splitting the  
14 trees and I would hear other children out from other  
15 groups out playing, but we weren't allowed to play."

16 A. The children never came in -- they all came in together.  
17 That would be for their tea. All came in in the  
18 afternoon, you know, when they were playing in the field  
19 and to get washed and so on, but every child in the  
20 house came in together, and the Sister came in with them  
21 and the staff came in. Now they never -- we never came  
22 in individually like that, never.

23 Q. I mean, it is put to him that you didn't think your  
24 group was treated any differently to anybody else.

25 A. Not at all. They weren't treated.

1 Q. He says:

2 "I find that untrue, because I could hear them out  
3 playing."

4 **A. No, no, that's not true. That's not true. That's**  
5 **untrue, totally untrue. The children came in together.**  
6 **They did everything together. Went to the dining room**  
7 **together. Went to get washed together.**

8 Q. If we can scroll on down, please, and about this  
9 business about putting the blanket over the head, he  
10 said:

11 "All they wanted was to sleep. That's all.  
12 I wasn't told, but I got the impression, 'No problems.  
13 Just get to sleep'. You couldn't sleep with the sweat  
14 of having a blanket over your head"

15 is what he's basically saying.

16 "If they seen your head above the banket, they hit  
17 you with a stick, NL5 and SR34."

18 **A. Oh, totally untrue. Never had a stick in my hand in**  
19 **my life. That is totally untrue. I never saw SR34 with**  
20 **one either.**

21 Q. Just scroll back up a moment, please. Talking about  
22 older boys bullying them. You said that if you  
23 witnessed or had been told of older boys doing it, you  
24 would have told SR34. He is saying it wasn't the older  
25 boys who were doing this to them. It was you or it was

1 SR34. It definitely wasn't older boys. If we can  
2 scroll on down.

3 **A. The children --**

4 Q. Sorry, NL5.

5 **A. It is all right. I was just saying the children were**  
6 **only from 5 to 11. I never saw them bullying. They**  
7 **might have fought with each other and argued, but there**  
8 **was no such thing as bullying that I know of. They were**  
9 **too young. You know, they were only up to 11 years of**  
10 **age, you know.**

11 Q. If we can scroll on down. I'm trying just to deal with  
12 this. There's quite a lot, I am afraid, NL5, of this  
13 and I know that -- he said that he definitely didn't  
14 have a sense of self-worth:

15 "... that it was fear, emotional and there was no  
16 encouragement on my behalf from NL5 or SR34. That's the  
17 way they treated me."

18 **A. The children didn't do anything. In my group they**  
19 **didn't do anything.**

20 Q. No, but what he's saying is he was -- what he felt was  
21 fear and he didn't feel he was encouraged by either you  
22 or SR34 growing up.

23 **A. But, sure, he was never picked out -- he wasn't picked**  
24 **out of a group of 25 children to be treated like that.**  
25 **HIA104 was just one of the children and he was treated**

1           **like every other child. I don't know what why he is**  
2           **saying these things.**

3    Q.   This is HIA132, NL5. I don't want to confuse you.

4    A.   **Pardon me. I thought it was HIA104 you said.**

5    Q.   We have moved on. This is HIA132 has been telling us  
6           this.

7    A.   **Oh, I'm sorry.**

8    Q.   Perhaps I didn't --

9    A.   **What did he say?**

10   Q.   What he is saying at this point -- but he was the one  
11           who was talking about being hit by the stick if he put  
12           his head out from under the blankets and talked about  
13           hearing other boys outside playing. He is also saying  
14           that there was no encouragement from you or from SR34,  
15           that he felt fearful and that's how he was treated.

16   A.   **Well, I'm surprised. I was so good to HIA132. He was**  
17           **a lovely child. He wasn't treated like that. He was**  
18           **treated like the others. Not at all. That is totally**  
19           **untrue.**

20   Q.   I mean, you actually say that in your statement and that  
21           was being put to him. If we can just scroll on down.  
22           You said he also went to help the nuns and staff inside  
23           the kitchen to clean pots and pans and floors and that  
24           was after he'd come back. He came back up.

25   A.   **He was married. Even at that -- he used to call in at**

1 night coming from his work. The girls would -- wasn't  
2 finished up. HIA132 would go in and help to  
3 finish up. That was his own choice. He was a man then.  
4 He was married at that time, and Saturday, he came in  
5 every Saturday. that worked in the kitchen  
6 was awful -- she was like a mother to him. He had his  
7 problems, terrible problems at home. He always brought  
8 her home in the car. used to give him his meals.  
9 He used to bring her into town. She was just like  
10 a mother to him.

11 Q. So he is right in saying he did come back and help out  
12 in --

13 A. Well, he also went in -- he'd say he'd help to do  
14 that, to finish up or something. That was his own  
15 choice. He was -- he would come in just to the kitchen  
16 at night and he'd something to eat and then he'd go in  
17 and help to tidy up, you know.

18 Q. If we can scroll on down, please.

19 A. He might have done that all right.

20 Q. He said:

21 "Well, I had bad experience with just SR34 and also  
22 NL5 when I was being reared as a child, and all the  
23 other nuns that I came in touch with after Kircubbin  
24 were very good to me. I had no problem with them  
25 whatsoever."

1           He goes on to talk then about a particular nun who  
2           he was very friendly with. I think it was  
3           SR212

4   **A. SR212                   was in the kitchen, yes.**

5   Q. If we can scroll on down. Keep scrolling, please. He  
6           is talking about the nice people he met. Again what you  
7           said to him was you felt what he had said about you was  
8           lies and you were hurt deeply about that.

9   **A. Yes.**

10   Q. There was an incident about a claim business.

11   **A. Yes.**

12   Q. If we can scroll on down, please, this is something you  
13           were told by another boy. I think it was NL14, was it,  
14           who said to you --

15   **A. Yes. Met him, yes.**

16   Q. -- said to you this was something about a claim. So if  
17           we can scroll on down through this, please. Sorry.

18           "Whenever -- just as we were speaking earlier before  
19           you came in to give your evidence, HIA132 was spoken to  
20           and he said this upset him, because he had met NL14 in  
21           Belfast at a friend's house. He was calling in to see  
22           this friend who wasn't too well and I said to NL14,  
23           'Have you been in touch with HIA, the abuse inquiry yet,  
24           since you come from Nazareth Lodge and De La Salle?' and  
25           he says, 'No, I'm not pursuing that at all', but in no

1 way did I say 'claim'. That is totally lies. That  
2 upset me this morning. There's no ..."

3 He goes on to say and to make it plain that he has  
4 never brought a claim to the Sisters of Nazareth or De  
5 La Salle.

6 "Haven't sued them at all. That is totally lies and  
7 you can check paperwork and whatever. I have no claim  
8 in at all."

9 So he was upset.

10 **A. Well, he told me that.**

11 Q. NL14 told you that?

12 **A. I met him, yes. He got out of his car to talk to us.**  
13 **My sister-in-law was with me. He said he met HIA132.**  
14 **He said, "NL5, I am very upset with him. He says to me,**  
15 **'Have you put in your claim yet?' and I said to him,**  
16 **'Claim for what?' I was so annoyed I went away and left**  
17 **him". That's what NL14 told me.**

18 Q. That's what NL14 told you, but HIA132 is quite clear he  
19 has never brought a claim or asked for compensation.

20 **A. Well, my sister-in-law was with me at the time. We were**  
21 **walking up the road.**

22 Q. If we can go to 91029, please. Now again this is still  
23 HIA132, NL5, and he is talking about the floors and the  
24 polishing. He remembers using blankets, cut-up  
25 blankets, moving with your feet for hours doing it, he



1       said, polishing floors in the hall, the big long hall  
2       and also the dining room.

3     **A. Well, because -- I had nothing to do with that. Now the**  
4     **dining room, there was a girl in charge of the dining**  
5     **room. She seen to the dishes and the cleaning up of the**  
6     **dining room and all of that. So I suppose they helped**  
7     **in there too.**

8     Q. Scroll on down -- sorry -- just to the next page. Yes.  
9     The next section of this transcript -- and I will see if  
10    I can shortcircuit this, NL5, because walked about this.  
11    It is at 91035 to 37. He talks there -- maybe -- sorry.  
12    I will just check it is the right section before I move  
13    on. He is talking about somebody leaving, his brother  
14    leaving the home. Scroll on down.

15       Yes. He starts to talk about trips to visit his  
16    grandmother and his aunt. He loved to stay there and he  
17    thought he would have had a better chance in life if he  
18    had been happy, but he said those trips were stopped  
19    because of something you did, and that that was -- there  
20    was talk about you asked him to describe the priests.

21    **A. No. He -- we were talking, just asking him about his**  
22    **holiday. He was just back. He happened to say to me**  
23    **about the priest wearing this white, you know, which our**  
24    **priest didn't do, and I knew -- I said, "Oh, the granny**  
25    **must be bringing him to the other church", and I just**

1 happened to mention to Sister. I didn't say anything to  
2 the child, to HIA132, but I said to SR34, "I think the  
3 grandmother is mixed up. She mustn't be bringing HIA132  
4 to mass on a Sunday when he is over there". So that was  
5 all. Never heard anything more about it.

6 Q. He says as a result of that he stopped going to --

7 A. No. His trips were not stopped. They still went over  
8 for their holidays. That is not -- SR34 did nothing  
9 about that or nothing.

10 Q. The reason he said that, NL5, is because when -- he said  
11 that his uncle actually had difficulty with SR34,  
12 because his uncle told HIA132 years later -- he said:

13 "We had difficulty getting you back out again, but  
14 we had to give them guarantees that you would go to  
15 a Catholic Church."

16 A. I don't remember anything like that, no. The only time  
17 I ever saw the uncle was the day they brought them in,  
18 the morning they brought them off the boat, him and  
19 I think it was a grandmother. There was four of them.  
20 There was , his brother, who he lost contact with  
21 completely, two daughters -- two sisters which went up  
22 to Nazareth House and I think they did very well.  
23 I haven't heard anything about them. You know, they  
24 were a lovely family. That's the only time I ever saw  
25 the uncle. He brought them over that morning from

1           **Scotland.**

2       Q.   The other -- just finally with regard to HIA132 at 91043  
3           to 91045.  This is in answer to the Panel, who were  
4           asking him questions after he had given his evidence.  
5           He was asked:

6                 "Do you think that the other staff, including the  
7           nuns, were aware of how SR34 and NL5 were treating The  
8           Dainties?",

9                 and he said:

10                "I would say someone was bound to have known.  Some  
11           staff must know the way they were behaving.  They had  
12           to, you know, but you didn't have it in you to complain,  
13           because you were afraid of the consequences, what was  
14           coming",

15                and he said:

16                "The dormitory was in the attic.  So down below  
17           there would have been dormitories and that, you know.

18           Q.   And they knew what was going on?

19           A.   **I would say they did know, yes."**

20                **Talk about his brother then after that.**

21                **Then Mr Lane then asked him about the nickname "The  
22           Dainties".  He said:**

23                **"There was a group called the Marions and I can  
24           recollect the Mad Marions",**

25                **as you said this morning.**

1 **A. That's right.**

2 Q. "They were more boisterous and things like that. That's  
3 all I remember."

4 **A. That's right.**

5 Q. It was the boys who would have given them the nicknames  
6 outside.

7 **A. That's right.**

8 Q. He said:

9 "Q. Did you mind being called The Dainties?"

10 He said:

11 "Not really. It was because we were spick and span,  
12 you know. NL5 cleaned us up. You had no choice."

13 **A. Just kept clean and tidy, what you wanted.**

14 Q. Then talking about playing outside, he said they were --  
15 others were mixing between -- there was mixing between  
16 the different groups and they played outside. There  
17 would have been all the groups, but they were kept very  
18 much apart, which wasn't good.

19 **A. No, they all played together. They all played together**  
20 **in the field. No child was separated from any other**  
21 **child. There was a Sister there and the staff with them**  
22 **and they played about. There was swings and all there**  
23 **for them and they mixed. No, that's not true. That's**  
24 **untrue.**

25 Q. Well, NL5, that's as far as we have got with HIA132.

1 Now I'm conscious that this is a long day. I am not  
2 sure whether we are going to go any further with you  
3 today, but maybe it might be an appropriate time to take  
4 a short break and see where we are.

5 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We will just rise for a few minutes, NL5,  
6 to see whether we will carry on or ask you to come back  
7 on another day. So if you'd just like to --

8 **A. I don't want to come back another day.**

9 Q. I'm sure you wouldn't.

10 **A. I couldn't come back another day.**

11 Q. We will just consider the position.

12 MS SMITH: Thank you, NL5.

13 (3.22 pm)

14 (Short break)

15 (3.35 pm)

16 MS SMITH: Chairman, Panel Members, ladies and gentlemen, we  
17 are going to try to cut things short, NL5.

18 **A. Thank you.**

19 Q. Now as you have seen, all of the people who made  
20 complaints about you gave their evidence in a similar  
21 way to what we have been looking at. I have been  
22 reassured you have been told exactly what they said when  
23 they came to the Inquiry about that.

24 **A. That's right.**

25 Q. So therefore I am not going to go through it all with

1 you, but you don't accept anything that they said.

2 Isn't that right?

3 **A. Absolutely not.**

4 Q. Okay. Now just to be clear, the ones that I haven't  
5 gone through were HIA 152 , HIA 259 -- and do  
6 you remember I was saying to you he was the boy who you  
7 don't remember at all, but he happened to know you went  
8 to work at a job outside.

9 **A. So he must have been there all right in the group, yes.**

10 Q. He, in fact, said that the group was called "The  
11 Whippets", and there was -- in the papers there's  
12 a statement from another boy, a DL45 , who was  
13 complaining not about you but about SR34, but he said  
14 the group was called "The Whippets" as well.

15 **A. And it was another boy that made that poem up. That's  
16 why he called us -- it was only the seven children and  
17 they were only young, from 3 year old to 7, and he made  
18 that wee poem up.**

19 Q. You talked about that in your witness statement.

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. The boy you thought said that was DL40.

22 **A. It was DL40, yes.**

23 Q. But just to be clear, when DL40 said -- when he gave  
24 evidence to the Inquiry, he said he wanted to put the  
25 record straight that he had not made the poem up. He

1 said that "The Whippets" was a derogatory word used to  
2 describe the children in your group, and the first time  
3 he ever heard of it was when he was out in the playing  
4 fields and they were playing football, and the author of  
5 that title was NL14, the man you have been talking  
6 about.

7 **A. Well, it could have happened, yes. It could have**  
8 **happened. I wouldn't know that now.**

9 Q. And he said --

10 **A. He might have got it there. I don't know.**

11 Q. He said that your group was always called in before the  
12 other groups --

13 **A. No, never. The children all came in together.**

14 Q. Oh, no, he said they did, but, you know, yours was  
15 called in first and then -- they were called in by their  
16 religious names. He said yours was always the first  
17 group called in. NL14 then just laughed and said,  
18 "There's NL5's whippets running after her". That's  
19 where that name came from.

20 **A. Well, they did call them "Whippets", because they were**  
21 **so young and so small. They were only from 3 year old**  
22 **up to 7. They were little whippets, but I didn't see**  
23 **any harm in that.**

24 Q. Well, the other people who spoke to the Inquiry about  
25 you, NL5, were HIA422, HIA 36 , HIA 147 and

1 HIA41. Now just -- we were talking about it earlier and  
2 just in respect of HIA41 --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- he gave evidence, and you said that there was never  
5 an intercom and no child ever worked at the front door.  
6 Isn't that right?

7 **A. I never remember a child being down working at the front  
8 hall.**

9 Q. I was telling you that SR30, when she came and spoke to  
10 us, had said well, that wasn't true. HIA41 did -- she  
11 did give HIA41 the job to answer the door and the phone  
12 and that there was a little intercom that she devised  
13 and used.

14 **A. I didn't know SR30 had anything to do with the front  
15 hall.**

16 Q. No, no. This was so that if her -- HIA41's evidence was  
17 that if her brother rang up, he could use the intercom  
18 rather than run all the way up the stairs and let her  
19 know.

20 **A. Well, you see, I'll tell you. We had a special phone  
21 for the children in the hall. You see that hallway that  
22 you saw? There was a phone there for the children, and  
23 if a call came through for them or they wanted to make  
24 their own calls, they came down to that phone. That was  
25 in the front hall.**



1 Q. Okay. Just the other small point about that was that  
2 HIA41's social worker's records show that he did have  
3 that wee job at the front door.

4 **A. I don't know. I never saw him.**

5 Q. Okay, and the other two people, there was HIA 64 ,  
6 HIA225. Now you wouldn't have answered that in your  
7 statement, because he didn't say anything about you in  
8 his statement, but did give some evidence to the  
9 Inquiry, and the other person was DL 269 . You  
10 have answered --

11 **A. I can't remember or DL 269 . I can't remember**  
12 **those two. They weren't in our group anyway. They must**  
13 **have been in one of the other groups.**

14 Q. I don't think they said they were, NL5, but they  
15 remembered you and gave some evidence about you.

16 **A. Uh-huh. I don't think so.**

17 Q. The three people who complained to the police or who  
18 spoke to the police about you were NL 30 ,  
19 NL 8 and HIA 455 . Now I know you had  
20 not -- you have seen their statements and you are going  
21 to provide another statement about what they have said  
22 about you to the Inquire?

23 **A. I don't remember a .**

24 Q. NL 8 . NL 8 was her married name.

25 NL 8 .

1 **A. Well, she must have been in another group. She wasn't**  
2 **in my group.**

3 Q. I think she was there much later, NL5, when you were in  
4 the parlour.

5 **A. Maybe she was. I don't remember her, no.**

6 Q. The other person was HIA141, who had said something to  
7 you about -- said something in her statement. She  
8 didn't give evidence to the Inquiry but she said  
9 something in her statement but you using a fist to wave  
10 at the children in the nursery.

11 In any event, NL5, there were a couple of other  
12 things that I just wanted to deal with with you. You  
13 remember the [name redacted] family with fondness and  
14 you were talking earlier about how NL 97 had said to you  
15 about, you "Why did you let us go?"

16 **A. Why did I give them up?**

17 Q. It is true to say that in looking through material the  
18 Inquiry has seen Social Service records relating to the  
19 [name redacted] family, and in those it is recorded that  
20 you are very fond of NL 97 and NL 30 --

21 **A. Very fond.**

22 Q. -- and that they speak Now I don't  
23 --

24 **A. That's right. I was very fond of them. They were only**  
25 **young -- yes, they were just young children too like the**



1 Glad to see you after all these years.

2 Thank you for looking after us when we were younger.

3 I thought the world of you. You're a really kind lady.

4 You were really like a mum to us.

5 Take care.

6

7 PS. Was thinking of you all these years, but

8 I remember the good times we all had."

9 **A. That's right. That's true.**

10 Q. That's something you received recently or --

11 **A. Well, it's about two years now I suppose since**

12 **I received that, after I met for the first time**

13 **after thirty-five years.**

14 Q. She then sent that card to you?

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. I was explaining to you earlier that two nuns spoke to

17 the Inquiry this week and they mentioned you in their

18 evidence to the Inquiry. One of those was Sister

19

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. She would have been -- she would have been, if I can put

22 it this way, your vintage. She would have been about

23 a similar age to yourself. You, in fact, were older

24 than her I think.

25 **A. I am 88. I don't know what age she is.**

1 Q. I think she is 80 now. So ...

2 A. I am 88, yes.

3 Q. She spoke to us, and if we can look at what she said.

4 It is 918399 -- 39. Sorry. Just down there at line 14

5 it says -- she didn't remember NL4. I was asking her

6 about that and she said she had no memory of her:

7 "Q. But do you remember NL5?

8 A. Oh, I quite definitely remember NL5, yes, and

9 I certainly wouldn't remember NL5 as a cruel person."

10 I said to her:

11 "You know from information that's been given to the  
12 Inquiry a number of people have complained about how you  
13 (sic) treated them",

14 and she said -- I said:

15 "But that doesn't accord with your memory of her?"

16 She said:

17 "That certainly doesn't. I could, you know, be  
18 quite strong on that point really."

19 I asked if she'd worked with you and she said:

20 "She would have actually worked with the Sister who  
21 was in charge of her group, SR34, SR34 and a Sister who  
22 is now dead -- both are dead actually -- and all of us  
23 would have had contact with NL5, because she went  
24 through the dining room, because she had been there  
25 quite a while, and she would have taken on duties as

1        regards going to the kitchen, seeing that things were  
2        right, seeing that, you know, food -- she had extra  
3        duties as regards -- that she took on herself as regards  
4        -- and I have never -- I certainly -- I mean, she  
5        certainly -- there was never any child in my care that  
6        I would have had occasion to -- she wouldn't have had  
7        occasion to. That was the idea of having Sisters in  
8        each group, that they would ..."

9                She was trying to explain to me that the Sisters  
10        were in charge of discipline:

11                "Is that what you're saying?"

12                She said:

13                "Discipline, yes. That was it really, yes."

14                Then she went on to speak about something else at  
15        that point, but just in relation to the discipline, was  
16        there ever any occasion that you had you thought, "Well,  
17        I can't handle this child" or "He's done something so  
18        bad" --

19        **A. No, never.**

20        Q. -- "that I am going to say to SR34"?

21        **A. No, never.**

22        Q. The other person who spoke to the Inquiry was SR52.

23        **A. Yes.**

24        Q. That's at SNB-91842, please. If we could go to that.

25        Yes. Just down there at, yes, 16, line 16:

1 "You do believe ..."

2 Oh, no. Have I got that right? Yes.

3 "You do believe NL5 worked with SR34 and you think  
4 she took care of a small group of younger children in  
5 the late '70s when you were there.

6 **A. She did."**

7 **We talked about NL28 , who was very deprived and who**  
8 **you looked after. Sorry. When you first were in the**  
9 **nursery school in 1975, she was one of the nursery**  
10 **assistants there, and you say she came a week after you**  
11 **had started.**

12 **A. She came a week after I started, yes.**

13 Q. I went on:

14 "You describe her as a gentle, efficient lady who  
15 was generous with her time. You say she was very good  
16 at settling the new children, especially those who were  
17 coming into the care of the Sisters.

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. You were saying that she had been you thought  
20 with SR47" --

21 **A. That's right.**

22 Q. -- "at one point.

23 **A. She did. When I first went there, she had**  
24 **a group of children. She worked with SR47 within the**  
25 **group -- with the group of children and then she came to**

1 the nursery school as an assistant."

2 I asked when you went to the nursery school, did  
3 your group of children diminish.

4 She said:

5 "There were only seven in it and one family of three  
6 were being fostered out. So she was left with just four  
7 and they were divided up between the four groups."

8 A. That's right.

9 Q. Then I asked did you come back after -- at any stage?  
10 You (sic) said:

11 "She was made redundant really, because they were  
12 cutting back really. Belfast Education & Library Board  
13 were cutting back and just leaving two nursery  
14 assistants, and we weren't to have any more than 52  
15 children then, so we had to reduce our intake from 58 to  
16 52.

17 Q. So [your] services weren't needed. Did [you] go  
18 to the back to the Lodge?

19 A. Oh, she was still in the Lodge, yes, but she did  
20 reception work."

21 She thought the group had been disbanded by that  
22 stage.

23 A. That's correct. That's right. That's true.

24 Q. So, NL5, just going back to your statement at 80092,  
25 paragraph 13, if I can use this to sum up, you say that



1           you:

2           "... feel sick that [you] devoted your life to  
3           raising these boys in their time of need, only many  
4           decades later to be accused of being someone I am not.  
5           I worked long hours on little or no salary to help raise  
6           many dozens of boys to be decent young men and I was  
7           proud of my role in doing that. I am saddened by that  
8           any boy would feel that I was rough or violent and do  
9           not accept that I was."

10       **A. I agree with that.**

11       Q. Well, this is what you have told us, NL5.

12       **A. Oh, yes, yes.**

13       Q. Is there -- does that fairly sum up how you feel about  
14       the allegations that have been made against you?

15       **A. I just feel that I have been stabbed in the back after  
16       all my hard work all my life. I thought I did a good  
17       job, but I didn't realise these things would come up.  
18       I can't understand it and I never will, never will  
19       understand it, but anyway it's said and that's it.**

20       Q. Well, NL5, you'll be glad to know that after a very long  
21       day there's nothing else that want to ask you, but the  
22       Panel may have some questions for you.

23       **A. Yes.**

24       Q. But before I hand you over to them --

25       **A. Yes.**

1 Q. -- is there -- I mean, I know we didn't go through every  
2 single person's evidence, but we know that you have  
3 denied what they have said.

4 A. Oh, yes.

5 Q. But is there anything that's you feel you haven't had  
6 the opportunity to say to the Inquire that you would  
7 like to say now? This is your opportunity.

8 A. What really about now? What more could ...?

9 Q. Anything about your time in Nazareth Lodge or anything  
10 more that you want to say to us.

11 A. A great time, a very happy time in Nazareth Lodge.

12 Lovely Sisters. Happy with the children. We had ups  
13 and downs. That's not to say you had ups and downs, but  
14 that didn't matter. But we worked together. We worked  
15 with each other. There was nothing was anybody's job,  
16 your job or my job. We helped. We always mingled. The  
17 staff were lovely. Kitchen, I used to go in and help  
18 there in the kitchen. Answer the phone for the -- do  
19 anything, because we were so happy. The times -- you  
20 know, there's times that you had wee ups and downs, but  
21 they weren't anything to talk about.

22 But the children were great. We had lovely children  
23 then. I always said to the Sisters -- do you know, many  
24 a time I'd say, "Sister, these children really belong to  
25 lovely people", because they were lovely children. It's

1           only during the Troubles that the Lodge got a lot of  
2           trouble. We got very, very -- I hadn't children then.  
3           Thank God I hadn't, but they were very troublesome  
4           children that came in during the Troubles and the  
5           Sisters had an awful time and you could do nothing with  
6           them, but ... I saw them on the roof one night pulling  
7           all the slates off the roofs. Nobody could do anything  
8           about it, but these were children that came from  
9           troubled areas, but this was during the Troubles, but  
10          before that we had lovely children, and to me I think  
11          they all came from lovely backgrounds. They were --  
12          they seemed to be lovely children. You could manage  
13          them. They had manners. Yes, there's a few wee wild,  
14          ones but -- not wild, you know, just boys, but they were  
15          good children.

16        Q.    Okay.

17        A.    But they would do wee things maybe that they shouldn't  
18              be doing or somewhere they shouldn't be, you know, but  
19              that was it, but I couldn't say a thing, but I was very  
20              happy in Nazareth Lodge and I spent -- I wouldn't have  
21              spent forty years in it if I wasn't happy. I did my  
22              best and I hope that I have done my best, and I thought  
23              I did, and I thought I gave my life for them. I left  
24              Nazareth Lodge that day. We locked the front door and  
25              I thought, "Well, you've gone a good" -- I said to the

1       **Sisters, "Now we have nothing to worry about. We gave**  
2       **all we could to the children and we looked after them**  
3       **and we brought them up morally. We taught them**  
4       **manners", and we thought we did a good job. We didn't**  
5       **think things were going to be said about us like that,**  
6       **because those things never, never happened --**

7    Q.   Well, thank you --

8    **A.  -- and before God I can say that.**

9    Q.   NL5, thank you for that.

10   **A.  Thank you.**

11   Q.   As I say, I have nothing else I want to add, but the  
12       Panel may have some questions for you.

13   **A.  I would live Nazareth Lodge over again. Just that. I'd**  
14       **go back again if I had to do it again. That's it.**

15   Q.   Thank you.

16   **A.  If I was able.**

17   CHAIRMAN: Well, NL5, it's been an extremely long day for  
18       you. You have been giving evidence throughout the  
19       public session and I know you spoke to Ms Smith for  
20       a long time beforehand. So I am sure you will be very  
21       relieved to hear --

22   **A.  Very relieved. Thank you.**

23   Q.   -- that we don't have any more questions for you. Thank  
24       you very much for coming to speak to us and tell us  
25       about your time there.

1 **A. Thank you. Well, I hope I have told all I know the best**  
2 **I could, what I know.**

3 Q. Would you mind if we just have another look through your  
4 album of photographs --

5 **A. No. Do what you want. Do what you want.**

6 Q. -- because they don't always come through very well when  
7 they are copied. If we don't finish with it today,  
8 we'll get it back to you through your solicitor very  
9 quickly.

10 **A. Well, it's in good hands. So I'm all right.**

11 Q. I know there are other pictures in it as well. Thank  
12 you very much.

13 **A. Oh, aye. There's other wee pictures there, yes.**

14 MS SMITH: Chairman, there were to be two other witnesses to  
15 give evidence today, but obviously with how things have  
16 gone, that has not been possible. We have rescheduled  
17 both I think for next week.

18 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, as Ms Smith has just explained, we  
19 have gone as far as we really can this afternoon and we  
20 will resume on Tuesday, Monday being a Bank Holiday, and  
21 I think it is our current intention to have at least one  
22 of the two witnesses this afternoon -- who were  
23 scheduled for this afternoon to be called on Monday  
24 morning -- sorry -- Tuesday morning.

25 **A. Thank you very much.**

1 Q. If the parties wait -- well, that can be confirmed with  
2 the parties in due course. So thank you all.

3 MR MONTAGUE: Thank you.

4 **A. Thank you now.**

5 (Witness withdrew)

6 (3.53 pm)

7 (Hearing adjourned until 10 o'clock  
8 on Tuesday, 5th May 2015)

9 --ooOoo--

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25