

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE INQUIRY

being heard before:

SIR ANTHONY HART (Chairman)

MR DAVID LANE

MS GERALDINE DOHERTY

held at

Banbridge Court House

Banbridge

on Thursday, 29th January 2015

commencing at 10.00 am

(Day 91)

MS CHRISTINE SMITH, QC and MR JOSEPH AIKEN appeared as
Counsel to the Inquiry.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Thursday, 29th January 2015

(10.00 am)

WITNESS HIA132 (called)

CHAIRMAN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. Can I just remind everyone that their mobile phones must be placed on "Silent"/"Vibrate" or else turned off and that no photography or indeed recording is permitted either in the chamber or anywhere on the premises.

Yes, Mr Aiken.

Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

MR AIKEN: Morning, Chairman, Members of the Panel. The first witness this morning is HIA132 --

A. That's right, yes.

Q. -- who is "HIA132". HIA 132 gave evidence on Day 62 of the Inquiry's public sittings on 23rd October of 2014 --

A. Yes.

Q. -- and he is back, as I was explaining to him this morning, on what is now I believe Day 91. HIA132 took the oath on the last occasion --

A. Yes, that's right.

Q. -- and he understands he remains sworn and under oath this morning. He confirmed then on Day 62 that he wanted to keep his anonymity and that remains his position.

1 Appearing on the screen, HIA132 --

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. -- is hopefully the first page of your witness
4 statement, albeit with the redactions --

5 **A. Uh-huh.**

6 Q. -- at SNB-584. Can you just confirm that is the --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- front page of your witness statement --

9 **A. Yes, it is.**

10 Q. -- which you adopted on the last occasion?

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. If we move through to 590, that that's the last page of
13 your statement?

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. You confirmed you had signed it --

16 **A. Signed it. That's right, yes.**

17 Q. -- and wanted to adopt it as your evidence?

18 **A. I did.**

19 Q. HIA132, as I said to you, there is just a number of
20 documents I want to refer the Panel to. So just bear
21 with me for a short period of time.

22 **A. Right.**

23 Q. I should say, Members of the Panel, normally Miss Savage
24 appears for NL5. I haven't seen her as yet this
25 morning. I have asked for a call to be made just to

1 check on why that's the case, but we should be able to
2 deal with the matter by way of transcript, if necessary.

3 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

4 MR AIKEN: In addition to HIA132's statement there is
5 a response statement from the Sisters of Nazareth at
6 SNB-2015 to 2016, and HIA132 is aware from my discussion
7 --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- with him this morning that paragraph 9 of that
10 statement contains an unreserved and sincere apology to
11 him for any occasion whenever the treatment fell beneath
12 that which should have been expected, and HIA132 on the
13 last occasion gave evidence that that was one of the
14 things that he was keen to receive. So he's found that
15 positive this morning. There are some other matters
16 that he doesn't agree with and we will deal with those
17 as we go.

18 The Health & Social Care Board response statement
19 can be found at 5651 to 5652, and that statement
20 confirms that HIA132 was a privately placed child during
21 his period in Nazareth Lodge.

22 In addition, HIA132 recounts his experiences at the
23 hands of NL5, who is NL5, and she has provided
24 a statement to the Inquiry, which is at 80031 through to
25 80044. The part that relates to HIA132 runs from

1 paragraphs 70 to 81, which is on SNB-80039 and 80040.
2 I discussed those matters with HIA132 this morning and
3 we will deal with some of what NL5 has had to say as we
4 go.

5 There is then also a statement from SR52 about SR34,
6 who is the other person that HIA132 recounts in his
7 Inquiry statement, and that statement from SR52 can be
8 found at 1900 to 1901. We will look at that statement
9 briefly shortly.

10 HIA132, having said all of that --

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. -- if I can just confirm with you you were born on
13 ?

14 **A. That's right, yes.**

15 Q. You are now aged 57?

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. You were the youngest of four siblings. I am going to
18 use their names --

19 **A. Right.**

20 Q. -- for your ease, but they won't be used outside the
21 chamber and will be redacted from the transcript.

22 **A. Right. That's okay.**

23 Q. NL133 was the oldest.

24 **A. The oldest.**

25 Q. Then you had two sisters, NL134 and NL135 --

1 **A. And** NL135

2 Q. -- and then you were the youngest.

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. Ultimately all four of you, as will see, go to the two
5 different Nazareth properties in Belfast.

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. Males to the Nazareth Lodge --

8 **A. Lodge.**

9 Q. -- and the females to Nazareth House.

10 **A. Nazareth House.**

11 Q. You have been married

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- for 37 years.

14 **A. Yes, that's right.**

15 Q. She has various difficulties --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- that result in you being her carer.

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. You have three sons of your own.

20 **A. Yes, that's right.**

21 Q. We will touch on that shortly --

22 **A. Yes, yes.**

23 Q. -- for a particular reason.

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. You have four grandkids.

1 **A. Yes, that's true.**

2 Q. Plenty to keep you occupied.

3 **A. That's plenty, indeed.**

4 Q. You were in Nazareth Lodge between November 1960 --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- and August 1968.

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. So between the ages of 3 and a half for you --

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. -- and then 11.

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. As I said, all four of you went to the Nazareth
13 properties, you and your brother into the Lodge and your
14 sisters into the House.

15 **A. Sisters Nazareth House. That's right.**

16 Q. There is a particular issue you have --

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. -- that we are going to address.

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. That was on 15th November 1960. I will just give the
21 reference to the Panel at SNB-4371. You were there
22 until 20th August --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- '68, aged 11, when you moved to Rubane as part of the
25 annual transfer --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- of boys to Kircubbin.

3 **A. That's true.**

4 Q. You say in paragraph 2 of your statement, if we just go
5 back to the first page, which is at 584, please --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- that after you were left in the Lodge --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- you never saw your mum again.

10 **A. No, never, never.**

11 Q. Nor did you ever see your father.

12 **A. No.**

13 Q. Basically the four children were left.

14 **A. In care.**

15 Q. You did see your grandparents , which we will
16 come to.

17 **A. Yes, I seen them, yes.**

18 Q. But you certainly didn't see your --

19 **A. No. Mother or Father. That's right.**

20 Q. You explain in your statement that your brother went to
21 the St. Marion's group in the Lodge --

22 **A. Yes.**

23 Q. -- which was under SR47.

24 **A. SR47, yes.**

25 Q. You went to the St. Joseph's group --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- which was under SR34 --

3 **A. SR34, that's right.**

4 Q. -- and NL5.

5 **A. NL5, that's right.**

6 Q. You say in paragraph 3 of your statement --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- that you were physically abused by both of those
9 women.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. I am going to look at them individually now.

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. SR34 -- just bear with me for a moment, HIA132 --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- just till I put --

16 **A. Right.**

17 Q. -- the context for the Panel Members. If we look
18 briefly, at SNB-12151, please, and in the bottom right
19 corner of this document this is the register -- I wonder
20 can we maximise the size of that; I am just wondering if
21 that's possible -- explaining that SR34 was born in
22 1913, that she came to Nazareth Lodge in June of ■■■, ■■■,
23 when she'd have been ■■■ and she remained there to
24 October ■■■, when she was ■■■

25 --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- in the Lodge from [REDACTED]. So just as you were
3 arriving, HIA132 --

4 **A. Yes, that's right. SR34 was --**

5 Q. -- SR34 was effectively in charge.

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. She died then in [REDACTED]

8 If we go back, please, to 584, you explain in
9 paragraph 3 that she was a very angry person.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. How did she display that, HIA132? Can you --

12 **A. Well, I found her very angry with me and going to --**
13 **what would you call it -- she would have used the stick**
14 **on you if you misbehave, or if you were -- when you were**
15 **at school, if you -- she asked you a question and you**
16 **put up your hand to answer, that was okay, but if she**
17 **asked you another question and you answered it, she**
18 **shouted down at you, saying, "You're showing off. Go**
19 **into the corner and wait until the class is over", and**
20 **I found that was anger coming from her. She didn't --**
21 **what do you call it -- she wouldn't accept you -- the**
22 **answers you were giving.**

23 Q. You mention then at paragraph 5 -- can we get
24 paragraph 5 up; it is on 585 --

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. -- that -- you talk about your experiences in school.

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. You draw the contrast -- you mention when you got things
4 wrong --

5 **A. Wrong.**

6 Q. -- you got punished.

7 **A. Punished, yes.**

8 Q. Then what you are just saying to the Inquiry is --

9 **A. Yes, yes.**

10 Q. -- you also then got punished the opposite way.

11 **A. Yes, the opposite way, yes. You were seen as showing**
12 **off, giving the right answer, and then you were put into**
13 **the corner. That is my experience of SR34 teaching.**

14 Q. You mention in paragraph 5 getting smacked in the face.

15 **A. Yes, from -- from SR34.**

16 Q. Was that just with her hand?

17 **A. With her hand, yes, yes.**

18 Q. You mention the stick. Was that the bamboo cane that
19 you would have known from Rubane --

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. -- or was it a --

22 **A. No.**

23 Q. -- firmer --

24 **A. Firmer. It would have been a firmer stick -- what would**
25 **you call it -- she would have had.**

1 Q. It's not a metre ruler?

2 **A. No, no. It's an actual stick.**

3 Q. A solid piece of wood?

4 **A. Yes, solid, yes, exactly. I remember that well.**

5 Q. In paragraph 5 you give an example, HIA132 --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- of being pulled up by the hair --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- and by your cheeks.

10 **A. Yes. Well, she would have pulled you up by the locks**

11 **I remember and I remember my feet lifting off the floor.**

12 **She done that a lot.**

13 Q. Well, now I want -- as I said to you before --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- I want to show you --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- if we can bring up, please, SNB-1900, and paragraph 3

18 of the statement about SR34, and obviously one of the

19 points that I was saying to you --

20 **A. Yes, exactly.**

21 Q. -- that the nuns dealing with the Inquiry make --

22 **A. Yes.**

23 Q. -- is this lady is not around anymore --

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. -- in order to speak for herself.

1 **A. Exactly.**

2 Q. But what has been said to the Inquiry is that they
3 recognise allegations --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- have been made --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- that she grabbed children by the side locks, swing
8 them round --

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. -- punched children. Now mostly for you it is by the
11 side locks.

12 **A. Side locks and she lifted you off the floor with them,
13 yes.**

14 Q. The Sisters say this then:

15 "While the Sister may have disciplined the children,
16 it is refuted that it was as reported. We accept she
17 may have pulled at side locks, but don't accept she
18 lifted or swung the children as described."

19 **A. Well, that is wrong. I remember SR34 lifting me by the
20 locks and my feet coming -- my feet leaving the ground.
21 So that -- that's what I remember SR34 doing on me.**

22 Q. You talk in paragraph 8 of your statement, if we go back
23 to 586, please, and this is a theme --

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. -- that you describe as your experience, HIA132, as

1 I understand it --

2 **A. Yes, yes.**

3 Q. -- of a lack of affection or warmth. You say SR34 would

4 have threatened to give you six of the best --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- if you cried.

7 **A. Yes. You weren't allowed to cry or show emotion.**

8 Q. Was that just to keep everybody in check because of the

9 numbers --

10 **A. Yes. Well --**

11 Q. -- or do you have a view as to why that was done?

12 **A. Well, just to keep you quiet and not to have any**

13 **problems from you. I remember that, SR34 saying that to**

14 **me.**

15 Q. You also mention that -- paragraph 4, if we go back,

16 please, to 585 -- that she was involved -- and I know

17 that you had you attribute NL5 also to be involved in

18 this --

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. -- but at night-time that you say that she was involved

21 in using a stick if you made a sound at bedtime.

22 **A. Yes, exactly.**

23 Q. You also describe NL5 as involved in this.

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. Am I right in saying they weren't necessarily -- one was

1 on one night doing it and --

2 **A. Well, I remember SR34 -- the odd time the two of them**
3 **were on the floor, but the bulk of it was NL5. If SR34**
4 **was in her cell, then NL5 was standing outside talking,**
5 **and she just looked down the dormitory, and if she seen**
6 **your head peeping up from the blankets, you got the**
7 **stick.**

8 Q. Were there occasions whenever SR34 --

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. -- did that as well?

11 **A. There was times NL5 wasn't up and SR34 was doing that**
12 **too. She was marching round the dormitory.**

13 Q. Now I am going move on to NL5 then --

14 **A. Right.**

15 Q. -- because you describe both of them involved in this
16 issue.

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. But NL5 was born, just for the Panel -- if you bear with
19 me for a moment, HIA132 -- 1926. So she
20 was between the ages of [REDACTED] during HIA132's period
21 of time. So she would have been [REDACTED] years younger than
22 SR34, but to begin with, HIA132, what you say is in
23 paragraph 4 --

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. -- she forced you to show your underpants.

1 **A. Yes, that's right. Every night you had to strip off and**
2 **go into the bathroom and open your underpants, and if**
3 **they weren't clean, you got the stick.**

4 Q. I know you said to me earlier --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- that that sticks in your mind --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- because you --

9 **A. To this day. It's degrading.**

10 Q. -- have reared three boys of your own.

11 **A. Exactly, and there was none of that, and it wasn't the**
12 **normal thing to be doing.**

13 Q. Now at the time --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- you wouldn't have known that.

16 **A. No, no.**

17 Q. You just dealt with what was done.

18 **A. Exactly.**

19 Q. But as you reflect on having brought your own children
20 up.

21 **A. Yes, yes, yes.**

22 Q. Now she in her statement --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- to the Inquiry didn't address that underwear
25 allegation --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- in relation to you --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- but she did in relation to another witness. I am
5 just going to show you what she said. 80037, please.

6 It is paragraph 52 of her statement, where a similar
7 allegation was made --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- by another individual.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. She says:

12 "I deny that I checked children's underwear."

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. "They took their school clothes off, put the play
15 clothes on. At wash time any soiled underwear would be
16 collected and taken to the laundry."

17 So she does not accept --

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. -- that she did this checking --

20 **A. Well --**

21 Q. -- and punishing for soiled underwear.

22 **A. Yes. Well, it did happen or I wouldn't have made the**
23 **statement. This is something I remember and it happened**
24 **every night.**

25 Q. If we go back to paragraph 4, please, of your statement

1 at 585, we touched on it briefly in the context of SR34

2 --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- but you describe in paragraph 4 --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- being made to keep the blankets --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- over your head --

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. -- and if you didn't do that, then would you get hit
11 with a stick.

12 **A. Yes, yes. That happened.**

13 Q. Now can you remember -- just to put this in context --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- the group you remember was called "The Dainties" --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- and NL5 accepts that in her statement.

18 **A. St. Joseph's, yes.**

19 Q. She says that was because she kept her group clean and
20 tidy and well-behaved and well-mannered. Do you
21 remember being singled out, your group being seen as
22 different in the home?

23 **A. Yes, as different, as clean and dainties, and we weren't**
24 **allowed to mix with other groups, you know. She wanted**
25 **just us into the bedroom, into the dormitories and keep**

1 **us separate. I do remember that.**

2 Q. The point you make, just to put this all in context, you
3 say in paragraph 4 that your group had to go to bed
4 earlier --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- than the other groups.

7 **A. Well, I remember 6 o'clock she used to say after our**
8 **tea, "We are heading up the stairs to the dormitory",**
9 **and especially in the summer the sun would have been**
10 **splitting the trees, and I could hear other children out**
11 **-- from other groups out playing, but we weren't allowed**
12 **to play.**

13 Q. Now one of the things that she has said to the Inquiry
14 is --

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. -- that all the boys went to bed early --

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. -- because everyone had an early start in the morning.
19 It was necessary for the orderly running of the home --

20 **A. Yes. Well --**

21 Q. -- and that St. Joseph's wasn't treated any differently
22 than anyone else.

23 **A. Well, I find that untrue, because I could hear them out**
24 **playing.**

25 Q. That's -- just for the Panel --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- that's at paragraph 79 --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- of her statement at 80040.

5 Now you say that whenever you were put in bed --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- you were made put the blanket over your head.

8 **A. Yes, yes.**

9 Q. I was asking you did you -- were you told at the time
10 why you had to put the blanket over your head?

11 **A. No, no, no. All they wanted you was to sleep. That's**
12 **all. I wasn't told, but I got the impression, "No**
13 **problems. Just get to sleep". You couldn't sleep with**
14 **the sweat.**

15 Q. The point you make then is --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- that if you brought the blanket down --

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. -- then --

20 **A. If they seen your head above the blanket, they hit you**
21 **with a stick, NL5 and SR34.**

22 Q. In paragraph 78 of NL5's statement, if we just bring up,
23 please, 80040, she says to the Inquiry:

24 "I deny that I made any child lie covered with
25 a blanket. It didn't happen. I have now been told some

1 of the boys allege it was the older boys who bullied
2 them and made them do this. If I witnessed or had been
3 told of older boys doing it, I would have told SR34."

4 Your point is it wasn't older boys were doing this
5 to you.

6 **A. No, no, no.**

7 Q. This was --

8 **A. It was NL5 and SR34. It definitely wasn't older boys.**

9 Q. She said to the Inquiry we can see in paragraph 77 --

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. -- about The Dainties and being well-behaved and so on.

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. She said she achieved that -- you know, the good
14 manners, being well dressed and so on, clean and tidy --
15 she achieved that through encouragement, praising the
16 boys and making them feel a sense of self-worth --

17 **A. Well, I --**

18 Q. -- and that -- hold on before you --

19 **A. No.**

20 Q. She says:

21 "I think scaring a child is terrible and I don't
22 believe I instil fear in my voice."

23 What I wanted to ask you was did you feel you were
24 being encouraged --

25 **A. No.**

1 Q. -- and made feel a sense of self-worth?

2 **A. No, definitely I did not.**

3 Q. Did you feel that it was fear that was --

4 **A. It was fear, emotional, and there was no encouragement**
5 **on my behalf from NL5 or SR34. That's the way they**
6 **treated me.**

7 Q. Now NL5 has said to the Inquiry that she remembers you
8 as a good boy, easy to -- if we just scroll up, please,
9 to the start of -- just up to the next page; just stop
10 there -- a good boy, easy to work with --

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. -- the loveliest child, that after your time in Rubane
13 --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- she says in paragraph 73 you were working as
16 a salesman --

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. -- and you'd have called in for an evening meal.

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. I just want to pause there, because that's right.

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. You did do that.

23 **A. I did do that. After a day's work I went up to see**
24 **them, but I also went up to help them, help the nuns and**
25 **the staff inside the kitchen to clean pots, pans,**

1 **floors, and that is what I done, yes.**

2 Q. And --

3 **A. That was after I left Kircubbin.**

4 Q. Because you had gone to Rubane --

5 **A. Yes, yes.**

6 Q. -- and then --

7 **A. Exactly.**

8 Q. -- you were working --

9 **A. Yes, yes.**

10 Q. -- and you were calling into the Lodge.

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. I was asking why you did that, given you had some bad
13 experiences.

14 **A. Well, bad experience, I had bad experience with just**
15 **SR34 and also NL5 when I was being reared as a child,**
16 **but all the other nuns that I came in touch with after**
17 **Kircubbin were very good to me. I had no problem with**
18 **them whatsoever.**

19 Q. You had a particular fondness for SR212 .

20 **A. Yes. SR212 was like a motherly figure to me.**
21 **She would guide you and she knew that you were in**
22 **a tricky situation with your trying to make an identity**
23 **in the world. If she heard you were doing anything**
24 **untoward or stories or whatever, she would have called**
25 **in and chastised you, but in a nice way as a motherly**

1 next page, that given -- if we just look at the very
2 last paragraph, NL5 says:

3 "HIA132 would be a boy I would find it hard to
4 believe would lie" --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- "about his treatment ..."

7 Then she -- so that's the first thing.

8 **A. Yes, yes.**

9 Q. The second thing is then she says --

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. -- the lies you have told --

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- she says have hurt her deeply:

14 "Apart from this claim business "--

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. -- "I don't know why HIA132 would make this up."

17 **A. Yes, yes.**

18 Q. So she is saying you are a lovely guy --

19 **A. Yes. One way, yes.**

20 Q. -- but can't understand, therefore, because she would
21 expect you to be the one person who would tell the truth

22 --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- why you would make this up.

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. She recounts an experience -- if we just scroll up
2 please, to paragraph 76, and she says in 75:

3 "The accusations are untrue."

4 Never physically abused you. She says:

5 "I did meet another boy, NL14" --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- "and he told me that he'd met HIA132."

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. "NL14 said that he was disgusted with him", ie
10 disgusted with you, HIA132.

11 **A. Yes, yes.**

12 Q. "He told me HIA132 had said, 'Have you put your claim in
13 yet?'" --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- "meaning about his time in caring -- in care."

16 **A. Yes, yes.**

17 Q. "NL14 knows there was no ill-treatment."

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. "I hope the Inquiry are going to hear from people like
20 him."

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. I know that upset you this morning.

23 **A. Yes, it did upset me, because --**

24 Q. Can you explain to the Inquiry --

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. -- what actually took place?

2 **A. Yes. I actually met NL14 in Belfast in a friend's**
3 **house. He was calling in to see this friend who wasn't**
4 **too well, and I said to NL14 , "Have you been**
5 **in touch with HIA, the Abuse Inquiry yet, since you come**
6 **from Nazareth Lodge and De La Salle?" and he says, "No,**
7 **I am not pursuing that at all", but in no way did I say**
8 **"claim". That is totally lies. That upset me this**
9 **morning. There's no --**

10 Q. Can I ask you --

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. -- because, as I was saying to you --

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. -- obviously the Inquiry looks into these things --

15 **A. Yes, yes, exactly, yes.**

16 Q. -- and we do have the claims papers for individuals --

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. -- have you ever brought a claim against the Sisters of
19 Nazareth?

20 **A. I have never brought a claim to the Sisters of Nazareth**
21 **or De La Salle.**

22 Q. You haven't sued either of those?

23 **A. No. Haven't sued them at all. So that is totally lies**
24 **and you can check paperwork and whatever. I have no**
25 **claims in at all.**

1 Q. In fact, if we look at paragraph 9 of your statement at
2 590 --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- you explain that really until the Inquiry process
5 began --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- it's a number of years ago now that it began --

8 **A. Yes, that's right.**

9 Q. -- you hadn't spoken to anyone --

10 **A. No.**

11 Q. -- before the Inquiry --

12 **A. No.**

13 Q. -- essentially and were thankful for the opportunity --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- that the Inquiry was giving you.

16 **A. I was thankful for HIA opening this for people like me
17 to come along and voice my opinions and what has
18 happened to me on a personal basis, been reared in both
19 institutions.**

20 Q. Basically, to sum that up, HIA132, your position is what
21 you've said to the Inquiry --

22 **A. Yes.**

23 Q. -- is what you remember happening.

24 **A. Yes. That's my memories. Yes, exactly.**

25 Q. You don't accept you are telling lies to the Inquiry.

1 **A. No, I don't accept that whatsoever. That is untrue.**

2 Q. Now you also mention in paragraph 6 of your statement at
3 SNB-585 and you name an individual who is down here as
4 NL63. Now that was a teacher.

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. I am just going to write his name down, because you have
7 helpfully been able to tell us where you think he might
8 be --

9 **A. Yes, yes.**

10 Q. -- because the Inquiry hasn't been --

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. -- able to find him. HIA132, you know who I am talking
13 about.

14 **A. Yes, yes.**

15 Q. I am just giving the Panel the name --

16 **A. Exactly.**

17 Q. -- and we will follow up on the information you gave me
18 this morning.

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. But he was a teacher --

21 **A. Yes, he was a teacher.**

22 Q. -- in the school.

24 Q. The point you make is that he had a similar approach --

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. -- to --

2 **A. Abuse.**

3 Q. He was keen for the strap.

4 **A. Strap, yes, exactly.**

5 Q. But he also did the same exercise --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- with the --

8 **A. Yes, pulling you up by the locks definitely.**

9 Q. In paragraph 6 in addition to describing --

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. -- your experience with him --

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- you say that:

14 "I didn't complain. I didn't know how to complain."

15 **A. Complain.**

16 Q. "There would have been no-one to complain to and you

17 suffered the consequences if you complained."

18 **A. Yes, if you complained, yes.**

19 Q. I am just wondering what caused you to feel like that,

20 that you were to keep quiet; you were not able to --

21 **A. Well --**

22 Q. -- talk to someone about what had occurred?

23 **A. No, no.**

24 Q. What happened that made you feel that way?

25 **A. It was the fear, the fear of getting beat and the fear**

1 of nobody listening, and they would beat you for -- they
2 would say, "You're telling lies".

3 Q. And -- so no-one told you --

4 A. No.

5 Q. -- as such, "Don't complain" --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. -- "to X or Y"?

8 A. Well, you didn't know how to complain, and if you did --
9 I seen other boys at that time complaining about things
10 and they got beat for doing it -- "You're telling lies"
11 -- and that put me off complaining.

12 Q. So you just head down --

13 A. Yes, head down.

14 Q. -- and you'd get on with it.

15 A. Yes, go with the flow as such.

16 Q. Now a particular issue for you you touch on in
17 paragraph 7 of your statement at 586.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. You felt the education --

20 A. Wasn't good. It wasn't, yes.

21 Q. You felt you weren't tried or tested.

22 A. Yes, yes. I still feel that. I think there was no
23 proper education. We weren't tried and tested. There
24 was no homework, or the impression that I got was, "Yous
25 are orphans and you wouldn't get anywhere in life

1 **anyway", because we didn't have the basic hardness of**
2 **being reared with parents.**

3 Q. One of the -- we will come to the recommendation part --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- at the end --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- but one of the things you said on the last occasion

8 --

9 **A. Yes.**

10 Q. -- was that some -- I think you described it in

11 financial terms --

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- but to allow education --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- for those who wanted --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- an opportunity --

18 **A. Yes, exactly.**

19 Q. -- for what they missed out on.

20 **A. Yes, and I still maintain that, yes, so we can better**

21 ourselves and put closure to this, and also apologies

22 **from both institutions.**

23 Q. I will come back to that idea --

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. -- of maybe some form of education --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- however that would be arrived at, but you describe in
3 paragraph 8 then the routine in the home.

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. You say that that involved, amongst other things, the
6 polishing of the floors.

7 **A. Of floors. That's right.**

8 Q. I was asking you in your time had the -- was that now
9 the electric buffer arrangement?

10 **A. Well, I don't remember -- it is probably now or after**
11 **I left that probably came in, but I just remember using**
12 **blankets, cut-up blankets, and moving with your feet for**
13 **hours doing it.**

14 Q. Which was -- which part of the home did you generally do
15 that in?

16 **A. I done the dining room and also the big long corridor on**
17 **the ground floor when they were wooden.**

18 Q. Now this --

19 **A. Polishing floors in the hall, big long hall and also the**
20 **dining room.**

21 Q. Now NL5 addressed an allegation of being made clean the
22 floors --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- by another boy, not you.

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. But I just want to show you -- if we bring up, please,
2 80037; it is paragraph 53 of her statement -- she said
3 to the Inquiry that:

4 "My group had no chores, as I was fussy about the
5 beds being made properly" --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- "and preferred to make them myself. I have read that
8 NL4's group cleaned floors, but my group did not."

9 **A. Well, I disagree, because I remember the blankets on my
10 feet, cleaning the dining room and also the long
11 hallway. So that's totally wrong.**

12 Q. A particular issue for you, HIA132, if we go back to
13 paragraph 9 of your statement at 586, was to do with
14 your siblings.

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. You say in paragraph 9 that you were in Nazareth Lodge,
17 the girls were in the House and you were not allowed to
18 go and see them.

19 **A. Visit them, yes. That still -- that -- I remember
20 asking SR34 about that and she says, "No. You're not
21 going up to see them, NL134 and NL135".**

22 Q. Now we were -- as I said to you this morning --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- I was showing the Panel a document earlier this week

25 --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- that in 1968 --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- so that is the year you were leaving --

5 **A. Yes, leaving.**

6 Q. -- a social worker records a change of approach --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- by the nuns to potentially having boys and girls --

9 **A. Girls. Right.**

10 Q. -- in the Lodge and boys and girls in the House.

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. I just give the Panel the reference. That's the

13 annotated note we saw at SNB-44403.

14 But do you remember that, any change --

15 **A. No.**

16 Q. -- during your time?

17 **A. Not in my time, but after Kircubbin, coming up, the**

18 **Lodge was -- they had brothers and sisters living then.**

19 Q. That is when you came back --

20 **A. I came back, yes, yes --**

21 Q. -- to help out?

22 **A. -- to help out, yes.**

23 Q. You remember boys and girls being around?

24 **A. Yes, I do, yes.**

25 Q. Now the Sisters have said, and again this is, you know,

1 the Sisters today --

2 **A. Yes, Sisters.**

3 Q. -- assisting the Inquiry, reflecting back as best they
4 can --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- if we bring up, please, SNB-2016, at paragraph 8 of
7 their replying statement they say with regard to
8 paragraph 9 -- that's your discussion of your siblings
9 --

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. -- they can -- they say they can only apologise for the
12 separation in your family.

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. "The facilities in Nazareth Lodge catered only for
15 boys."

16 Then they say this:

17 "The congregation endeavoured to maintain sibling
18 relationships and it was a common occurrence for the
19 children to visit their siblings whenever possible."

20 **A. No.**

21 Q. Now I want to ask you: was that your experience?

22 **A. No, that wasn't my experience. I was cut out of it**
23 **completely. I asked SR34, "Can I go up and see my**
24 **sisters?" and they said, "No". I never went up, left**
25 **Nazareth Lodge to go and see my sisters when I was in**

1 **the Lodge. I seen NL135 the time I would go to**

2 **.**

3 **Q. That was in the summer.**

4 **A. Yes, that was in the summer, yes.**

5 **Q. We will come to that, but that wasn't every summer**
6 **either.**

7 **A. No, no, no. That wasn't every summer. For some reason**
8 **NL135 didn't come every summer.**

9 **Q. That was you getting to visit your grandparents?**

10 **A. Yes, yes, yes.**

11 **Q. One of the -- this is what I wanted to ask you about**
12 **this. The consequence of this for you you were**
13 **explaining to me earlier was that you have never had**
14 **a relationship essentially with -- between you and your**
15 **sisters.**

16 **A. Yes, because of that. You weren't allowed to build**
17 **a relationship with NL135 or NL134 . They were complete**
18 **strangers. At one time when I called up to see NL135**
19 **and NL134 , they done a check to see if I was their real**
20 **brother, because we didn't know each other. There was**
21 **no bond, nothing. We were complete strangers, and I put**
22 **it down to the way I was treated with this in Nazareth**
23 **Lodge.**

24 **Q. So because you that relationship --**

25 **A. Yes, yes.**

1 Q. -- was not fostered --

2 **A. Yes. No, definitely not.**

3 Q. -- facilitated --

4 **A. We should never have been separated, but that was the**
5 **thing then. They put the girls on one side of Nazareth**
6 **House and the boys in Nazareth Lodge.**

7 Q. But your recollection certainly --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- wasn't of being taken --

10 **A. No, that's wrong, no.**

11 Q. -- to see your sisters.

12 **A. No, I never seen my sister when I was in Nazareth Lodge.**
13 **It was after I left Kircubbin.**

14 Q. You also mention then in paragraph 9 of your statement
15 --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- if we go back to 586 --

18 **A. Yes, yes.**

19 Q. -- and I think I was saying to you this morning this may
20 have been unavoidable if he was adopted out --

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. -- but another issue that you have is that your older
23 brother, NL133 --

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. He was six years older than you.

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. He was your protector.

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. You didn't see him very often --

5 **A. No.**

6 Q. -- in your recollection, because he was in a different
7 group --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- but you recall that he was either fostered or adopted
10 --

11 **A. yes.**

12 Q. -- and you didn't get to say goodbye to him.

13 **A. No, never said goodbye till him. He was away and that
14 was it, and to this day I have never set eyes on him.**

15 Q. You have never seen your brother again?

16 **A. No, no, never seen my brother again and I have tried
17 to -- my other sister tried to trace him, but they can't
18 find him. So that wasn't very good either.**

19 Q. In paragraph 10, HIA132 --

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. -- you talk about the trips to visit your
22 granny --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- and your aunt.

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. You say in paragraph 11 then, if we just scroll down --

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. -- those were your happiest experiences.

4 **A. Yes, they were very happy. I would love to have stayed**
5 **there. I think I would have had a better chance in**
6 **life, because I was very happy , and my**
7 **aunt and my mother's brother seen a big change in me**
8 **whenever they said, "You're going back next week".**

9 Q. Now if we just scroll up a little so we can see the rest
10 of paragraph 10 on the page as well.

11 **A. Yes.**

12 Q. If we can keep the two. Just stop there, please. One
13 of the things you recount, HIA132, is that these trips
14 stopped at some stage --

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. -- and that was because I think you said to me earlier
17 it was NL5 --

18 **A. Yes, yes.**

19 Q. -- asked you --

20 **A. "Just describe the priests."**

21 Q. The point you were making to me was your -- one side of
22 your family --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- were of a different religion --

25 **A. Yes, that's right.**

1 Q. -- and therefore it was a minister and --

2 A. Yes. That is where we were going to every Sunday
3 instead of the Catholic Church and then they stopped it.
4 They said, "No, son. You're not going back
5 ".

6 Q. Now your recollection is that one of your relations
7 eventually intervened.

8 A. Yes, intervened. It was my uncle had
9 difficulty with SR34, because he told me years after.
10 He said, "We had difficulty getting you back out again,
11 but we had to give them guarantees that you would go to
12 a Catholic Church".

13 Q. And then the trips --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- you were able to go on them?

16 A. Go on them again, yes, but I thought that was out of
17 order questioning me, "Describe the priests", and all
18 that sort of thing, you know.

19 Q. That's something that, given this morning you have said
20 to us it was NL5 --

21 A. Yes, yes.

22 Q. -- we can ask her about --

23 A. Yes, exactly, yes.

24 Q. -- about that. Obviously SR34 is no longer with us.

25 A. Yes, exactly.

1 Q. So we can't ask her about that, but apart from that
2 blip, as it were --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- those trips are something that you have a fond memory
5 of that you --

6 **A. Yes, I have a great memory. I have -- the aunt I used
7 to go over to, I ring her every week.**

8 **I have great memories. My aunt was like
9 a mother and her husband was like a father. Great
10 memories. Six weeks in the summer.**

11 Q. There were occasions whenever your sisters were -- they
12 weren't there every year.

13 **A. No, they weren't. NL134 hardly ever came, but NL135
14 would have come every two years, and she wouldn't --
15 mightn't have stayed as long as me, but NL135 would have
16 been there.**

17 Q. As you know, HIA132, the last two questions we ask each
18 witness --

19 **A. Yes, exactly.**

20 Q. -- the first one is about recommendations --

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. -- and the Inquiry Panel --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- at the end of its work --

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. -- has to consider what --

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. -- it might say in three --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- general areas --

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- about an apology, a memorial --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- or some other means of redress.

10 **A. Yes, yes.**

11 Q. For you you wanted an apology --

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. -- and obviously the Sisters have given you personally
14 that apology.

15 **A. Yes, yes.**

16 Q. But your suggestion about finance --

17 **A. Finance.**

18 Q. -- was linked to education.

19 **A. Education, so that we can get better educated. I know
20 we are up in years and that, but to give us some chance
21 of trying to prove ourselves and possibly getting better
22 jobs and things like that, education that we never got
23 from the Sisters.**

24 Q. The other thing you said to me this morning, because we
25 were talking about the --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- what was alleged by NL14 --

3 **A. Yes, yes.**

4 Q. -- and you sharing your experience with the Inquiry --

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. -- you're --

7 **A. That's totally --**

8 Q. -- thankful that you had the opportunity --

9 **A. Yes. I am very thankful of HIA to express my situation**
10 **with regard to the upbringing in both institutions or**
11 **else I would never have shared it with anybody else, and**
12 **I appreciate that, and thank you, Panel, for listening.**

13 Q. The last question, HIA132 --

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. -- that we ask each witness --

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. -- is whether there's anything else about their time.

18 In this module we're looking at Nazareth Lodge.

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. It might be something I've touched on --

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. -- but not dealt with --

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. -- in the way you'd like --

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. -- or it may be something I haven't touched on at all,
2 or something else that you want to say --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- to the Inquiry.

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. Now's the time to do that if there's anything else.

7 **A. Yes. Well, all I want to say that was my time as a boy**
8 **in Nazareth Lodge, and after I left Kircubbin to go back**
9 **to help out I met some wonderful nuns, who were very**
10 **good to me, and that's all I have to say, and the**
11 **apology, etc, and that's it, and thank the Panel for**
12 **listening to me. I appreciate that --**

13 Q. HIA132 --

14 **A. -- and thank you too.**

15 Q. I am grateful for that. HIA132, I am not going to ask
16 you anything else.

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. The Panel Members may want to ask you something.

19 **A. Right. Right.**

20 Q. So just bear with us for a short time.

21 **A. Right. I will, yes. Thank you.**

22 **Questions from THE PANEL**

23 CHAIRMAN: HIA132, can I just ask you something more about
24 these trips to see your aunt and your grandmother in

25 ?

1 **A. Yes, yes.**

2 Q. I know the place you mean.

4 **A. Yes**

5 Q. Now you have explained why the nuns were concerned about
6 you not going to chapel --

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. -- but do you know of any reason why NL135 only came
9 every two years? I know she was -- I think she was two
10 years older than you. Is that right?

11 **A. No, I could never understand that. I got every year,
12 but for some reason NL135 only came every two years.**

13 Q. And you say NL134 , who was I think about five years
14 older than you --

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. -- she didn't come up?

17 **A. She didn't come. NL134 was never there when I was
18 there.**

19 Q. Did you ever ask them in later years --

20 **A. No, never, never asked NL135 or NL134 . I'm never in
21 touch with NL134 now, and I'm only in touch with NL135 .**

22 Q. I see, but do you know whether they went somewhere else,
23 because we know some children would go to families out
24 in the country in Northern Ireland or something like
25 that.

1 **A. No, I can't answer that.**

2 Q. You just don't know.

3 **A. No, I don't know that --**

4 Q. I see.

5 **A. -- definitely.**

6 Q. Thank you very much.

7 **A. No problem.**

8 MS DOHERTY: Thanks very much. That's really helpful,

9 HIA132.

10 **A. Right.**

11 Q. Can I just ask: do you think that the other staff,
12 including other nuns, were aware of how SR34 and NL5
13 were treating The Dainties?

14 **A. I would say someone was bound to have known. Some staff
15 must know the way they were behaving. They had to, you
16 know, but you didn't have it in you to complain, because
17 you were afraid of the --**

18 Q. Of what would happen.

19 **A. -- consequences, what was coming.**

20 Q. But there would be dormitories near you with other staff
21 around?

22 **A. No. The dormitory -- the dormitory we were in, we were
23 in the attics. So down below there would have been
24 dormitories and that, you know.**

25 Q. Okay, but your sense is they must have seen what was

1 going on?

2 **A. Oh, they knew. I would say they did know, yes.**

3 Q. Can I ask before your brother got adopted --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- were you able to socialise with him? Was there any
6 effort made to help the two of you have time together in
7 Nazareth Lodge?

8 **A. I would see him the odd time, but it would have been the
9 odd time.**

10 Q. Just in the passing?

11 **A. Just in passing, yes.**

12 Q. Nothing arranged or nothing that would --

13 **A. No, nothing, nothing at all.**

14 Q. Okay. Can I ask did you have any issues with older boys
15 in Nazareth Lodge? Was there any issues of --

16 **A. No, no, definitely not.**

17 Q. No, no, not. There was no --

18 **A. I got on well with the boys.**

19 Q. Okay. That's great. Thanks very much, HIA132.

20 **A. No problem.**

21 MR LANE: You mentioned how your group were known as The
22 Dainties.

23 **A. The Dainties.**

24 Q. Did each of the groups have its own nickname?

25 **A. I -- Marion -- there was a group called The Marions and**

1 I can recollect The Mad Marions. Just, you know, they
2 were more boisterous and things like that. That's all
3 I could remember.

4 Q. Was the boys who picked out these names or did the
5 staff?

6 A. I think it was the boys, the boys, you know. They would
7 have been out more often outside and whatever.

8 Q. Did you mind being called The Dainties?

9 A. Not -- not really. It is because we were spick and
10 span, you know. NL5 cleaned us up. You had no choice.

11 Q. You mentioned how the others would be playing outside --

12 A. Yes, yes.

13 Q. -- when you had been sent to bed.

14 A. Sent to bed.

15 Q. Would they be mixing between the different groups when
16 they played like that?

17 A. Oh, yes, they would have, yes. There would have been
18 all groups.

19 Q. So you were being kept apart?

20 A. Yes, we were kept apart, you know, which wasn't good.

21 Q. Okay. Thank you very much.

22 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA132, I am sure you will be relieved to
23 hear that we don't have any more questions for you.

24 A. Yes. Thank you.

25 Q. I am sorry that we have had to bring you back a second

1 time, but we have explained why that is --

2 **A. Yes, yes.**

3 Q. -- and we are very grateful to you for taking the
4 trouble to come to speak to us again.

5 **A. I am very grateful.**

6 Q. I know it is not easy for people to do that, but thank
7 you very much for doing so.

8 **A. Thank you all for listening to me. Thank you.**

9 Q. Thank you very much.

10 (Witness withdrew)

11 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, Ms Smith I think
12 is going to deal with a couple of matters that won't
13 involve oral evidence being given, but perhaps if we
14 took a short break for that to be --

15 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We will just rise for a few minutes anyway.
16 (11.10 am)

17 (Short break)

18 (11.20 am)

19 READING OF STATEMENT AND DOCUMENTS RELATING TO HIA210

20 MS SMITH: Good morning, Chairman, Panel Members, ladies and
21 gentlemen. The next evidence that I am going to call is
22 in relation to HIA210, who I will refer to as HIA210.
23 HIA210 is currently unfit to give evidence. He is
24 an [REDACTED] in an [REDACTED] in [REDACTED] and will be
25 there for several weeks. His former [REDACTED] is in

1 attendance today and will relate to HIA210 what is said
2 about him.

3 So if I can refer you to a number of --

4 CHAIRMAN: Is he present?

5 MS SMITH: Yes, he is in.

6 CHAIRMAN: I don't think we need to go through perhaps every
7 detail, but I am sure it will comfort Mr Montague to
8 know we have read the social work records. I think
9 I speak for both of my colleagues when I say we are very
10 impressed by the efforts you and your wife went to over
11 the years with HIA210. That is in a sense reflected by
12 your presence here today on his behalf. Excuse me.

13 MS SMITH: Thank you, Chairman. HIA210's statement can be
14 found at SNB-598 to 604.

15 The congregation's response is at SNB-1998 to 1999.

16 The Health & Social Care Board have put in
17 a response at 608 -- sorry -- 38 -- I have got the same
18 page reference down -- to 6068. That includes exhibits,
19 which show that HIA210 was received into care in
20 January 1970. There was a Fit Person Order made on the
21 application of the NSPCC on 24th February 1970, and the
22 exhibits are difficult to make out, but there is
23 a document at SNB-44131 to 44132, which shows the
24 details of all the family members and HIA210's entry can
25 be found in the second page of that.

1 There is, as you have referred to already, Chairman,
2 a large bundle of Social Services' papers in respect of
3 HIA210. They start at SNB-31441 to 31550, SNB-42191 to
4 42331, SNB-18340 to 18357, SNB-19013 to 19068, SNB-31551
5 to 31568, 44107 to 44298 and 46846 to 46864.

6 Now coming back to HIA210's statement, which is on
7 the screen, his person details are set out there.

8 CHAIRMAN: Yes. I think we perhaps should formally put on
9 the record that, although he is not here, we will
10 proceed on the basis that he wishes to maintain the
11 anonymity that the Inquiry has conferred upon him.

12 MS SMITH: Yes, indeed, and I have advised NL 188 of
13 the fact that we will be referring to him on our website
14 only by his designation --

15 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

16 MS SMITH: -- which is HIA210.

17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

18 MS SMITH: He went, first of all, to Nazareth House,
19 as a baby and then was transferred to Nazareth
20 Lodge when he was 4 years old along with his brother.
21 He said that -- he describes the medical difficulties
22 that he had in early life.

23 At paragraph 3 he said that he went to school in
24 Nazareth Lodge and that was a terrible time for him. He
25 names SR62, and I am going to give the name, who is

1 SR62, whom he believes is now deceased, and he said she
2 would beat him hard if he was thrown out of the class.

3 "She used to beat me with brush shafts, metal parts
4 of the hoover and large wooden tweezers used for
5 washing. I used to cower behind the washing machine and
6 tumble dryer to try and hide from her. She was such
7 a fierce woman. She used whatever she could to get her
8 hands on me. She hit me across the head with the shaft
9 of the brush. This happened once or twice a week and
10 I was often bruised.

11 One of the worst things was when SR62 hit you around
12 the head with her keys. She used to stick the long key
13 into your jaw bone really hard and that was so sore. It
14 seemed just as bad as getting beaten. She was very
15 vindictive. There was another boy", whose name he
16 gives there. "I remember he had not been in the home
17 for long and I saw Sister hit him with a dustpan brush.
18 No-one ever saw what happened to me, because Sister
19 always did it in private."

20 He goes on in paragraph 5 to describe that there
21 were five groups of fifteen children in the home and he
22 names them there. He said that he was SR62's pet and he
23 said -- but it was terrible. He was known as her pet,
24 but it was terrible.

25 I should pause to say that at this time between '73

1 and '81 he describes five groups of children in the
2 home, and that would accord with the evidence that was
3 given by the congregation to the Hughes Inquiry, that
4 there had been five groups, but at the time of the
5 Hughes Inquiry in the mid-'80s they were reduced to
6 three.

7 He said that:

8 "It was very lonely and I didn't have any close
9 friends. In our group we stuck up for each other. If
10 you did something wrong, Sister would make you stand in
11 front of a picture of Jesus and swear you didn't break
12 an ornament, for example. No-one would admit it,
13 because we all knew we would get beaten for it. We all
14 got punished in the end. I remember Sister was in
15 charge" -- sorry -- a different nun, whom he names there
16 -- "SR29 was in charge of one of the other groups."

17 Paragraph 6 he says:

18 "It was thought that your mother coming to visit
19 messed with your head. My mother came to visit once but
20 I found that very hard to understand. Part of me
21 realised I had a mother and the other part didn't really
22 want a mother."

23 He says:

24 "It was not encouraged for family to visit the
25 home."

1 Now in their response statement the congregation
2 have said at paragraph 3 that the nuns would not
3 discourage any visitors coming and, in fact, said that
4 all parents, siblings and families would visit the home
5 at their own discretion and that the Sisters would have
6 no control over proper visitors to the home.

7 He describes here at paragraph 7 that a lay staff
8 member, whom he names:

9 "NL66 put me in the cupboard with no light in it.
10 The only light was on the outside and she locked me in.
11 It was pure black and the only light you could see was
12 the strip coming in under the door. That strip of light
13 was the only thing that kept me going. I was locked in
14 there for a number of hours, and when I came out, I had
15 sore eyes."

16 Again the congregation would say that they had
17 employed staff in the utmost good faith and they do say
18 that they are pleased that he refers to another member
19 of staff as being a good person.

20 "In the mornings ..."

21 He describes here the routine at paragraph 8:

22 "In the mornings we got up, got dressed and then
23 went downstairs to get breakfast. Breakfast was
24 cornflakes or toast. I remember on a Saturday we had
25 chips."

1 I presume he doesn't mean, though, for breakfast:

2 "Even if I was not hungry, I was forced to eat and
3 the plate would sit there until I ate it. I always wore
4 hand-me-down clothes. I was given a bath every two or
5 three days. I remember birthdays in the home were good
6 and I had a party every year. I went to St. Michael's
7 school first, but I was lagging behind, so I started to
8 go to Harberton Special School for children.

9 If I was thrown out of the class, one of the older girls
10 would tell SR62, and she would tell me to go and wait on
11 her upstairs. I remember waiting for about an hour and
12 then SR62 would come raging at you with an object to
13 beat you with. This happened regularly in periods of
14 two to three weeks. After tea we were allowed to watch
15 television and then it was bedtime. During the week
16 each day was the same. At the weekends we were allowed
17 to go somewhere like the swimming pool or pictures."

18 He describes the dormitories in which the children
19 slept and he said he slept in a dormitory with three
20 boys to a room. He names the boys he shared his room
21 with, including his brother.

22 "The next room also had three boys and then there
23 was SR62's room. Her room had a bathroom attached.
24 Then there were the girls' dormitories where there were
25 also three girls to a dorm."

1 Everyone else had gone to school. There was no-one with
2 me and I knew then that I was probably going to be
3 a loner. I remember thinking about how my own mother
4 and father didn't want to look after me and that I was
5 all alone."

6 The congregation at paragraph 6 of their response
7 statement apologise for the fact that he did feel this
8 way and say that:

9 "Many of the Sisters were trained nurses and
10 therefore it was appropriate for these Sisters to assist
11 a sick child, if necessary, but the children would have
12 been seen by a local doctor for any serious illnesses."

13 They think that HIA210 may have been left alone in
14 order to get some rest and they apologise if he felt
15 alone.

16 He goes on then at paragraph 14 to describe being
17 sexually abused by the teacher, whom he
18 names, NL67.

19 "He did it a few times. the ,
20 , ,
21 . We also
22 . One of the times it happened was in
23 a hall where we practised on the
24 . I remember
25 going to the toilet, because I had soiled myself. He

1 can't comment other than that on the allegations that
2 are in his statement about the teacher.

3 He goes on to describe there at -- I should say also
4 that the congregation at paragraph 7 of their response
5 statement have said that they:

6 "... were unaware of any sexual abuse amongst the
7 children, staff or visitors and condemn such behaviour.
8 The Sisters are horrified and shocked that this abuse
9 took place and offer sincere and profound apology to any
10 child that suffered this horrendous act."

11 He goes on at paragraph 16 to say:

12 "I have had bad dreams ever since there was
13 an incident in Belfast when a boy got murdered in Ormeau
14 Park in 1981. We were told not to go outside because of
15 it and it scared me. In my dreams I used to run and run
16 and try to climb over the fence of Nazareth Lodge. The
17 dream changed when I left Nazareth Lodge and I became
18 big enough to climb over it."

19 Now it is true to say that his -- after he left care
20 his sleep was disturbed by bad dreams, which led to his
21 foster parents asking him about his time in Nazareth
22 Lodge, and then ultimately led to an investigation about
23 complaints that he made to his foster parents, and I
24 will come back to that shortly.

25 "My brother was sent to live with a family and I was

1 quite jealous of that. In August 1981 I was sent to
2 live with a lady who was in her 50s. She said soon
3 after I arrived that she couldn't cope with me. My
4 social worker, NL 180 , was coming to visit me.
5 At that time I had to travel across Belfast from
6 to go to school, and this placement broke down
7 because the lady said she was getting ill with angina.
8 I used to go to a school in to board and
9 I used to cry every Monday morning going. She must have
10 known that I was crying my eyes out. I was forced to go
11 and see [someone] on a Saturday. I never wanted to, but
12 I was forced to, although we never got on."

13 He said he spent a year until that placement broke
14 down. He was then sent to Rubane House in Kircubbin.

15 CHAIRMAN: I think there is a misprint. It should be
16 , judging by one of the references in
17 the documents we have.

18 MS SMITH: I think that's probably correct, Chairman, not
19 . It may just have been from -- it is
20 obviously an error on our part.

21 At paragraphs 18 to 21 he describes his time at
22 Rubane, where he says that he was bullied and beaten by
23 older boys -- other boys, but he really doesn't remember
24 very much about it. He was there for three months and
25 he never remembered hearing anything about sexual abuse.

1 He was then fostered out in March 1984 at the age of
2 13. It is at that stage that the -- his foster carers
3 became aware that he had complaints about his time in
4 Nazareth Lodge. The Health & Social Care Board response
5 at paragraphs 8 to 11 outlines the investigation by the
6 Health & Social Services Board with regard to those
7 allegations, and they say there that:

8 "Following his time, he was placed under the
9 responsibility of North & West Belfast District of the
10 Eastern Health & Social Services Board. The records
11 show that in November '84 and on 21st February '85 the
12 applicant was interviewed by Social Services following
13 concerns raised by the foster carers he had been placed
14 with at that time about nightmares he was having.

15 In the course of these two interviews the applicant
16 made a number of allegations with regard to the
17 treatment he received in Nazareth Lodge",

18 and they exhibit that at exhibit 5.

19 "The records confirm that the allegations made by
20 the applicant were considered to be of a serious nature.
21 In a letter dated 29th May '85 specific allegations in
22 relation to the lay staff member and SR62 were reported
23 to the Sisters of Nazareth. These included SR62
24 punching the applicant on the nose, drawing blood, the
25 applicant being hit by a bamboo cane and mop handle,

1 being locked in the store cupboard under the stairs and
2 being made to eat food from a waste bin.

3 The Board notes in paragraph 3 of his statement that
4 the applicant makes reference to being hit across the
5 head with the shaft of a brush, and at paragraph 7 being
6 placed in a cupboard with no light. Paragraph 8 of his
7 statement he refers to being forced to eat even when he
8 was not hungry, and he refers to SR62 punching him on
9 the nose.

10 The records further indicate that, following these
11 allegations, the responsible board set about
12 investigating the matter and, given the seriousness of
13 the allegations, also brought it to the attention of the
14 Department of Health and Social Services."

15 The Inquiry has received statements from the social
16 workers, NL 190 at SNB-6069, NL 180 at
17 6083 and NL 191 at 6087, referring to their
18 role in investigation.

19 If I could just begin with NL 190
20 statement, if we could just look at that, please, at
21 6069.

22 CHAIRMAN: These witnesses will be called later during this
23 module.

24 MS SMITH: Yes. That's correct, Chairman. I don't intend
25 to go into -- to read the statement in full, but you

1 will see here that she indicates that she was employed
2 by the Southern Health & Social Services Board from --
3 she sets out the details of her career there. I don't
4 think I need to go into them.

5 At paragraph 2 she says that she has read the
6 available documents and notes that HIA210 said that on
7 one occasion he told her that SR62 hit him, but
8 unfortunately she has no recollection of him telling her
9 -- telling her that. That's not to say it didn't
10 happen, but she doesn't remember it, although when asked
11 by NL 191 in 1985, she told her that she had
12 never told him -- that he had never told NL 190
13 about being hit, and that she had not seen any signs of
14 either HIA210 or his younger brother being punished
15 inappropriately when she was visiting him in Nazareth
16 Lodge, although today she can't even recall that
17 conversation with NL 191 .

18 She does remember visiting HIA210 and his brother at
19 Nazareth Lodge on a number of occasions and gives
20 details about the family there. She recalls SR62 was
21 the person that she usually liaised with when visiting
22 Nazareth Lodge, but doesn't have very -- a great
23 recollection of what she was like other than she was
24 middle-aged. Her general impression is that HIA210 and
25 his brother were not very happy in Nazareth, but cannot

1 recall how exactly she thought that or why she thought
2 that. At that time she said there was no special
3 fostering unit in the Southern Board, and she signed her
4 statement on 23rd January 2015.

5 NL 191 , her statement at 6086 says that
6 in relation to the -- sorry. I should start with

7 NL 180 ' statement, first of all, at 6083, who sets
8 out his qualifications and confirms he was provided with
9 files in connection with HIA210's case.

10 He said that the initial placement broke down and he
11 was placed in Kircubbin. When he was fostered, that is
12 when he became involved with HIA210, and he said that
13 HIA210 had been suffering nightmares, which led to him
14 waking the family on occasion, and he interviewed HIA210
15 in the presence of his foster parents. HIA210 made
16 a number of allegations, and he noted at the time that
17 this may have provided some explanation as to the
18 nightmares he was experiencing.

19 He says at paragraph 9 of his statement that:

20 "Having listened to HIA210, I believe there was some
21 substance to the allegations he was making",

22 and he then raised those with his Senior Social
23 Worker. She and he then subsequently met with HIA210 to
24 discuss the allegations in February 1985, and then
25 elevated that to the Principal Social Worker, **NL 223**

1 **NL 223** They also interviewed HIA210's brother, who
2 confirmed some of the practices described by HIA210, but
3 not to the same extent, and then **NL 223** and
4 NL 191 took over responsibility for the continuation
5 of the allegations.

6 He didn't have any time -- he would say that he
7 didn't have much to do with Nazareth Lodge, as they had
8 left Nazareth Lodge by the time he became involved with
9 the family.

10 NL 191 statement at 6086 indicates that she
11 was the Senior Principal Social Worker and she confirmed
12 that she interviewed HIA210 and forwarded a record of
13 her interview notes and the issues outlined to the
14 Principal Social Worker for further action to be taken
15 and those reports are in the documents that I have
16 referred to.

17 She didn't have any responsibility for any other
18 children that were in Nazareth Lodge and she did -- she
19 is aware from notes in his file that the matter was
20 reported to the Eastern Health & Social Services Board,
21 who in turn reported it to the Department of Health &
22 Social Services. She said:

23 "I clearly believe that there was credibility to
24 HIA210's complaint about Nazareth Lodge and I believe
25 that may have been a contributory factor to the

1 nightmares he related at that time."

2 Now, as I already -- in my opening to this module
3 I referred the Inquiry to SNB-19013 and the following
4 pages, which outline the investigations which were
5 carried out by Mr Hugh Connor with the Eastern Health &
6 Social Services Board, including him writing to SR 213
7 about the allegations at SNB-19023.

8 There was a memo written to DL518 by Mr Connor on
9 8th July, and he appeared to consider that the
10 allegations should not be lightly dismissed. That's at
11 SNB-19026.

12 CHAIRMAN: There are also some references, which I think
13 must be the same documents, at 6065, for example.

14 MS SMITH: These are annexed to the Health & Social Care
15 Board response, Chairman?

16 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

17 MS SMITH: Yes, they would be the same documents.

18 CHAIRMAN: But what is not apparent from what we have seen
19 is what was the outcome of this?

20 MS SMITH: Ultimately, as I recall from the opening, not
21 only HIA210's complaint but at the time there were two
22 other complaints by other children that came into the
23 investigation. There was disagreement between the Board
24 and the Department as to what ought to be done.
25 Ultimately it was left for the individuals to take the

1 matters up with the police if they wanted to pursue the
2 complaints.

3 CHAIRMAN: We will pursue that further with these witnesses.

4 MS SMITH: Yes. I am sure that there will be someone
5 perhaps higher up than the social workers from whom we
6 have already read statements that may be able to assist
7 us further with that. I am sure Ms Smyth will look into
8 that.

9 CHAIRMAN: From what you say it might rather sound as if the
10 Eastern Health & Social Services Board and the
11 Department washed their hands of it.

12 MS SMITH: Indeed it would seem that they were batting it
13 back and forward as to what should be done. The Board
14 seemed to feel that the Department ought to have carried
15 out a full investigation under their powers into
16 Nazareth Lodge. The Board didn't -- the Department
17 didn't seem to want to do that and was batting it back
18 to the Eastern Health & Social Services Board.

19 CHAIRMAN: Did they leave the children to complain to the
20 police?

21 MS SMITH: Well, ultimately that is what --

22 CHAIRMAN: Well, no doubt somebody will explain what their
23 attitude was and why they adopted it. It doesn't seem
24 very impressive.

25 MS SMITH: No, indeed, Chairman.

1 HIA210 sets out in paragraphs 21 to 24 the effects
2 that his time in care had on his life afterwards and
3 relates that he has had difficulties with his mental
4 health in later life and apparently he is receiving
5 treatment, as I mentioned, in England as an in-patient.

6 That concludes my summary of HIA210's account and
7 the complaints made by him. I should point out that the
8 documents that I opened then and the transcript of what
9 I said in my opening can be found at page 78 on the
10 website of Day 81's evidence --

11 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

12 MS SMITH: -- if anyone wishes to look at that.

13 CHAIRMAN: Ms Smyth, we want this further investigated.

14 MS SMYTH: I understand that, and witness statements --

15 CHAIRMAN: We have witness statements from three relatively
16 low ranking people.

17 MS SMYTH: I agree.

18 CHAIRMAN: We expect to get something from somebody higher
19 up to explain why this was not passed to the police.

20 MS SMYTH: Yes. That is being attended to, Chairman, and
21 will be filed as soon as possible.

22 CHAIRMAN: I expect a witness statement from somebody, if
23 they are still alive, who is concerned with these
24 matters.

25 MS SMITH: I should say, Chairman, it would not just be

1 Ms Smyth's client who would have to --

2 CHAIRMAN: The Department is in the same boat.

3 MS SMITH: Yes.

4 CHAIRMAN: No doubt we will certainly tell them. They are
5 not here today.

6 MS SMYTH: We are alive to that and have been, Chairman.

7 READING OF STATEMENT AND DOCUMENTS RELATING TO HIA16

8 MS SMITH: Chairman, there is another witness who is unfit
9 to give evidence. I can go ahead, if you wish, to
10 summarise the evidence in respect of him.

11 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

12 MS SMITH: This is HIA16. I will refer to him as HIA16. He
13 was unfit to given evidence in the last module and we
14 received a medical statement in respect of that, which
15 can be found at SNB-30406 to 30411. It is clear that he
16 would not be in a position to give evidence before the
17 Inquiry today in light of that medical.

18 His statement can be found at SNB-396 to 404.

19 The congregation have put in a response at 1936 to
20 1937.

21 There is also a statement from a SR149, SR149, at
22 SNB-1866 to 1868.

23 The Health & Social Care Board have put in
24 a statement at SNB-5515 to 5516, indicating that this
25 child's admission was a private admission.

1 His name I should say is HIA16 and, like the last
2 witness, there is nothing to suggest that he wishes his
3 anonymity to be removed. So in those circumstances it
4 will be maintained.

5 I should say that the private admission is confirmed
6 by SR149 in her statement at paragraph 7.

7 There are police papers in respect of HIA16 and
8 I will return to those later in the summary.

9 If we could just pull up HIA16's statement, please,
10 at 396, SNB. HIA16's personal details are set out in
11 paragraphs 1 and 2.

12 In paragraph 3 he talks about going into Nazareth
13 Lodge when he was about -- and staying there for eight
14 or nine years. His sisters were in Nazareth House and
15 one half-brother remained at home.

16 He describes in paragraph 4 being wakened very early
17 for mass every morning. He went to school in the home.
18 He says:

19 "The standard of education was poor. The school was
20 in the home in the school grounds. I recall I was never
21 given homework and there was very little structure to
22 the classes."

23 He says:

24 "I felt that we were taught very little."

25 Paragraph 5 he speaks about lay staff in

1 paragraphs 5 through to 8 here. He said:

2 "There were two lay staff -- there were two staff
3 members, NL4, NL5, who were very tough. They were
4 civilians employed to look after the boys. NL4 used to
5 call me names, 'Buck teeth' and 'Rabbit teeth'. She
6 would get the other boys to call me names too. She used
7 to beat me all the time. It was an almost daily
8 occurrence. She would beat me with rubber bats all over
9 my body. She was wicked.

10 She used to make you sleep with your head under the
11 blankets to make sure you'd fall asleep quickly. She
12 never stayed in the dormitory. She had her own room.
13 She used to go round all the groups bullying the boys.
14 She would hit them and call them names and she used to
15 argue with the nuns and the other staff. She lived in
16 the orphanage full time.

17 If you wet the bed, she used to threaten that she
18 would put you in the washing machine."

19 He goes on to describe:

20 "The nuns in the home were all kind apart from SR34.
21 She used to pull you up off the ground by the cheeks
22 and it was extremely painful."

23 He describes three other nuns, whom he names there,
24 as all being very good. That's SR149, 150 and 47. He
25 said:

1 "They never saw the staff hitting us. NL4 used to
2 wait until the nuns went to say their prayers and then
3 she would come into the groups. I had plenty of bruises
4 on me. I would never have received any medical
5 treatment as a result of these beatings as it involved
6 bruising rather than open wounds."

7 He goes on to describe the dormitories and there
8 were about fifteen or twenty in each dormitory.

9 "Each dormitory had a group name: St. Marion's, Our
10 Lady's, Sacred Hearts, St. Joseph's. I was in
11 St. Marion's. SR149 was in charge of St. Marion's and
12 she was very good."

13 That is SR149, who will be -- whose statement I will
14 refer to shortly.

15 He said:

16 "We had hard porridge in the morning and the food
17 was bad in the home and we were always hungry."

18 He describes then the routine at paragraph 10, if we
19 can just go back. Sorry. Paragraph 11:

20 "After dinner we would play outside for a while.
21 There were no organised sports or anything like that.

22 We were sent to bed very early, around 6.00 pm at
23 night. The beds were warm enough."

24 He recalls that:

25 "We used to go to Christmas parties outside the

1 home. Mackie's factory always had a Christmas party for
2 the boys, and girls from Nazareth House used to go too,
3 but we stayed apart and never mixed. My sisters would
4 have been there, but you weren't allowed to go near
5 them, as both groups kept at a distance from each other.
6 We got presents at the party like a toy gun, but you
7 weren't allowed to keep them, and I don't know what
8 happened to them after we got home."

9 He goes on to say that:

10 "NL5", who was another lay staff member, "wasn't as
11 bad as NL4, but she was just as rough. I was physically
12 abused on numerous occasions by both NL4 and NL5.
13 People would denote toys to the home at Christmas time
14 and I would steal a toy out of the baskets, because
15 I knew we wouldn't get them anyway, and hide it. I got
16 beaten by NL4 for doing this."

17 He names at paragraph 15 there a family who used to
18 take him out of the home every other week-end.

19 "They had children, but they were grown up. I went
20 out with them from I was 5 until I was 15. I stayed
21 with them from Friday evening until Sunday.

22 In the summertime we would go -- I would go on
23 holidays with the nuns to Ballyhornan, County Down for
24 six or seven weeks. We stayed in army type huts near
25 the beach, but I never liked those holidays as you were

1 sent to bed very early at night."

2 He then goes on to describe leaving and going to
3 Rubane. I did summarise his account of what occurred at
4 Kircubbin and his complaints about that in the last
5 module.

6 If I can just come back to the fact that HIA16 has
7 indeed -- I should say that HIA16 has made two police
8 statements. The first is at SNB-60480. This was made
9 on 5th March 1996. If we could just look at that,
10 please. That's 60480. I am going to scroll down
11 through this, if we may, but essentially just
12 summarising what he says in this, it's -- this
13 statement, I should say, was part of Operation Overview,
14 and as well as relating allegations of physical abuse by
15 two lay staff members named there, NL4 and NL5, he also
16 alleges that one of them sexually abused him, and he
17 gives details of an incident involving her when they
18 were on holiday at Ballyhornan and the carrying of hot
19 water. Scroll on down to the next page just, please.
20 He also talks again about the nickname that she gave him
21 and the comments that were made.

22 He talks here about an incident involving hot water
23 where -- one occasion where she pushed his head against
24 a pebbledashed wall which was behind him and up and down
25 the wall three or four times, cutting his head open and

1 the blood running down his back.

2 If you scroll on down, then he talks about having to
3 bring a tub, a bath-tub of boiling hot water to one of
4 the other huts, and meeting her, thinking she was going
5 to hit him, and throwing the tub down, which then
6 scalded her.

7 He also in his statement makes allegations of peer
8 sexual behaviour with another boy in his group in
9 Nazareth Lodge.

10 Now NL4 -- NL4 I think it is -- was interviewed
11 about this -- these allegations by police, and she was
12 interviewed on 8th May 1996. That interview can be
13 found at 60517 to 60532.

14 In that interview she said that she had recently met
15 HIA16 and had had a friendly conversation with him. His
16 statement was put to her and she completely denied the
17 allegations, said they were lies, said she was never
18 scalded and could not understand why he was making such
19 allegations up.

20 At interview -- the other lay person was interviewed
21 by the police on 3rd May 1996 and we have an incomplete
22 police note of that interview, but in that she said that
23 she never saw any child punished or beaten.

24 Those police investigations in the mid-'90s resulted
25 in no prosecution against either woman.

1 On 4th May 2010 in another police statement HIA16
2 again gave details of life in the home. He described
3 SR149 as a very good nun. He said Sister -- sorry.
4 That's at SNB-60815.

5 CHAIRMAN: If we just go back --

6 MS SMITH: Sorry. This statement here?

7 CHAIRMAN: -- the other interview you just told us about,
8 what is the reference to that?

9 MS SMITH: The interview --

10 CHAIRMAN: 3rd May 1996.

11 MS SMITH: 3rd May '96 is 60812.

12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

13 MS SMITH: Then at 60815 we have another police statement
14 given by HIA16 on 4th May of 2010. Again he gives
15 details there about life in the home and then, as I say,
16 he describes SR149 as a very good nun. She was very
17 kind.

18 He said there was a nun in charge before her. He
19 doesn't remember her name, but she was a tough woman.
20 He remembers that if you didn't say the rosary right,
21 that nun would have hit him with a stick. Just scroll
22 on down, please. He goes on to name the two lay people
23 again, NL5 and NL4, and gives the details of the home
24 and remembers how he was made to lie in the bed with
25 sheets over their heads, being struck round his head,

1 legs, chest, practically everywhere, with a rubber bat
2 by both women and would have been left covered with
3 bruises and very sore. Again he calls -- says that he
4 was called names. He says that NL4 was the worst. He
5 was threatened -- in this statement he says that he was
6 threatened by her that he would be put in a washing
7 machine.

8 Scroll on down, please, to the next page. There he
9 said:

10 "They used an industrial washing machine for doing
11 all the bed clothes and on a few occasions I was brought
12 down to the washing machine and told by NL4 that if
13 I wet the bed again, I was going to be put in the
14 machine and it would be turned on. At that time when
15 the beatings were almost daily, I felt this was normal.
16 That was just what happened in the home."

17 He also described the physical abuse by SR34,
18 grabbing him hard by the cheeks and trying to lift him
19 off the ground, which was done both during school and
20 outside of school. He said she wouldn't have been as
21 violent and wicked as NL4 and NL5.

22 He then goes on to discuss the fact that he didn't
23 see his sisters during that time and then being taken
24 off to Rubane. He describes in this statement as well
25 being beaten by fists and cane by NL5.

1 She was interviewed by police in March 2012 and
2 said -- I should say that's at 60822 -- and said that
3 she never assaulted any children in her time at Nazareth
4 Lodge. I can't recall if there is an interview in
5 relation to NL4 at that time. There may well be, but it
6 would be still in or around that area of documents in
7 the bundle, but again ultimately this complaint resulted
8 in no prosecution also.

9 Now both women have given their response to these
10 allegations in their Inquiry statements. NL4, which is
11 NL4, deals with the allegations in paragraphs 14 to 28
12 of her Inquiry statement. If we could pull that up,
13 please. That's at SNB-80008. Then if you could
14 highlight from paragraph 14 at the bottom of that page,
15 she says there that:

16 "HIA16 made a statement to the Inquiry about his
17 time in care and the police interviewed me on two
18 separate occasions about these allegations.

19 He came to Nazareth Lodge around '59 and stayed
20 until '67. I was working for part of the time he was in
21 the home. For substantial periods I was living and
22 working in England and Wales, although there were
23 periods when I was working as a house mother and
24 I recall him.

25 In his statement to the Inquiry he alleges I used to

1 beat him all the time. He said it was an almost daily
2 occurrence. He alleges I used a rubber bat and struck
3 him all over his body. He claimed I would go around all
4 the groups bullying the boys and would hit them and call
5 them names. He alleged I used to argue with the nuns
6 and other staff as well.

7 He claims he had plenty of bruises on him but that
8 he never received any medical treatment as a result of
9 these beatings. He claimed that I would make him sleep
10 with his head under the blankets to make sure he would
11 fall asleep.

12 I reject all of his allegations completely. I never
13 had a rubber bat. I never used excessive force or was
14 cruel to him, as he alleged. It is quite possible I had
15 to chastise him from time to time and, although I do not
16 recall it, it is quite possible I would have slapped him
17 if he was unruly or misbehaving."

18 She goes on to say that:

19 "His account to the Inquiry is inconsistent with his
20 allegations made against me in his two statements to the
21 police. In the first statement of 5th March '96 he has
22 described me as a . I do not know where he
23 got this description from as I never
24 while carrying out my duties in Nazareth Lodge and
25 I only wore civilian type clothes.

1 I was employed by the Sisters of Nazareth as
2 an assistant house mother and then was described as
3 simply a house mother. In his statement to the police
4 he states I came into his dormitory when he was asleep
5 and took him out to the shower room. He said I then
6 told him to take off his pyjamas and that I would then
7 touch his private parts and after this I would beat him
8 with a rubber bat all over his back, which left him
9 bruised and very sore.

10 He said this type of abuse, which was both sexual
11 and physical, was carried out on a regular basis from
12 when he was about 6 years up until he left when he was
13 11. He alleged he was abused sexually in this way about
14 twice a week. However, none of this is even mentioned
15 in his statement to the Inquiry. This appears to be the
16 most serious allegation he has made against me, but yet
17 it does not feature at all in his Inquiry statement.

18 However, what I recall is that HIA16 defecated in
19 his bed regularly at night. As I have already stated,
20 it was normal practice for either myself or the nun to
21 waken those children known to have a problem at
22 night-time.

23 Whilst the usual difficulty was that some children
24 wet their beds at night, I specifically recall HIA16
25 would have defecated in his bed. He might have been

1 9 or 10 years old when this happened and I recall he was
2 difficult to deal with after this occurred. I would
3 have to take him into the toilet and he would have
4 refused to clean himself. I therefore would have had to
5 wash around his bottom. For some reason he has chosen
6 not to mention this in his statement to the police, but
7 instead has suggested I was sexually assaulting him for
8 no particular reason. I am sure I was not the only
9 staff member who would have had to wash HIA16 in this
10 way.

11 In his police statement he describes what he alleges
12 is the last beating he got from me. He stated this was
13 on a holiday in Ballyhornan during the last week he was
14 in Nazareth Lodge. He was 11 at the time. He claims
15 that one day for absolutely no reason when he was
16 talking to another boy, I came over and grabbed him by
17 the throat and pushed his head against a pebbledashed
18 wall, which resulted in the back of his head being cut
19 open. He claimed blood ran down his black. He was then
20 ordered by me to go and get a bath-tub of boiling hot
21 water, but when he returned, assisted by , he
22 claims he threw some of the boiling water over my leg
23 and that I started screaming and ran off. The two
24 individuals whom he claims were present, namely
25 and , have not come forward to corroborate his

1 account.

2 Initially when the police described this incident to
3 me, I said it did not happen and could not recall
4 anything about it. This was because the police were
5 putting to me allegations that I had carried out
6 an assault on HIA16 for no reason, which resulted in him
7 sustaining an injury to the back of his head. He then
8 retaliated by deliberately throwing hot water over me.

9 Having thought about the matter subsequently, I have
10 now been able to recall some details which could be
11 related to this incident, but I deny completely any
12 allegation that he was assaulted, or indeed that he
13 deliberately poured hot water over me with the intention
14 of causing me injury. I recall there was no running --
15 no hot running water in the chalets at Ballyhornan. So
16 when it came to bathtime, which was on a Saturday
17 evening, staff members had to carry or supervise boys
18 bringing a large pot of hot water from the kitchen over
19 to the bath-tub. Some of the older boys would have
20 helped me carry this large pot. I recall on one
21 occasion a small amount of hot water spilled over my
22 foot. However, this was an accident. I believe HIA16
23 was carrying this pot and that two other boys were
24 involved. I believe one of them was , but I am
25 not sure if was also there.

1 HIA16 made a second statement to the police on 4th
2 May 2010 and said he was part of St. Martin's group and
3 that the nun in charge of this group was SR149.

4 I believe he meant to refer to the Marion group. I do
5 not recall any SR149 working in Nazareth when I was
6 there. There may have been an elderly nun called SR149
7 at one stage, but she did not actually work with any of
8 the groups.

9 In his statement he describes the regular assaults
10 and that I used a rubber bat to beat him all over his
11 body. He alleges he was covered in bruises and was very
12 sore. He claims I used to call him nicknames like
13 'Rabbit' and 'Buck teeth'. These are matters which he
14 also has described in his HIA statement, but I don't
15 recall using those expressions or nicknames about him.
16 It is always possible some of the other children called
17 him these names, but I have no recollection of this. He
18 alleges he saw me and another houseparent assaulting
19 other boys using a rubber bat like a tennis racquet, but
20 I deny this.

21 In paragraph 7 of his HIA statement he claims that
22 after he wet the bed I used to threaten to put him in
23 the washing machine. This is not true. I am aware
24 others have made a similar type of allegation and
25 I wonder if HIA16 has spoken to other former residents

1 about this. He describes this differently in his second
2 police statement. He claims he was brought down to the
3 washing machine and told if he wet the bed again, he was
4 going to be put in the washing machine and that it would
5 be turned on.

6 He concludes the statement by claiming he saw me
7 about two years earlier on the . He said he
8 couldn't approach me, as he was still in fear of me to
9 this day.

10 While I am not in a position to say whether he did,
11 in fact, observe me on the , I do recall very
12 clearly meeting HIA16 around the mid-'90s. I told the
13 police about this meeting during my interview on 8th
14 May 1996. He was a taxi driver and he picked two of my
15 sisters and myself up from premises in Belfast after we
16 had a meal. I didn't recognise him, but he dropped my
17 sister off at her home and said to me that he knew me.
18 I had a friendly conversation with him, and when I got
19 out of the taxi at my house, he said it would be nice to
20 meet up some time and have a drink. He shook hands with
21 me as I was getting out of the taxi. I remember he said
22 of his time in Nazareth that it had been hard with the
23 nuns being strict and I recall saying to him it was hard
24 there for all of us.

25 In his account HIA16 seems -- to the Inquiry HIA16

1 seems to imply that I beat him at times when the nuns
2 were not around. He stated that the nuns never saw the
3 staff hitting him and that I used to wait until the nuns
4 went to their prayers before I came over to his group
5 and started to beat him and the other boys. I note he
6 has said in his statement that the nuns at Nazareth
7 Lodge were all kind. However, if the type of physical
8 abuse he has described had, in fact, occurred, I do not
9 believe it would have been possible for the nuns not to
10 notice or be aware of it. In all of his accounts he
11 alleges I frequently left him bruised all over his body,
12 but yet no-one seems to have been aware of this and
13 I was never reprimanded by any of the nuns for using
14 excessive force or cruelty on children."

15 In her second statement to the Inquiry -- and I have
16 forgotten to get the SNB reference for that, but I can
17 give that to you later. It is dated -- actually
18 I haven't got it. It came in last week. NL5 addresses
19 the -- HIA16's statement at paragraphs 19 to 25. I am
20 just checking the reference number, if you bear with me,
21 and we can pull that up. It is not entirely clear what
22 the reference is to it, but if you bear with me, I will
23 read out -- it's from paragraphs 19 to 25 of that
24 statement.

25 NL5 says that:

1 "HIA16 was not in my group as a boy and I would have
2 seen very little of him at Nazareth except perhaps at
3 play time or meal times. I deny each and every
4 allegation of abuse by HIA16.

5 I know more about HIA16 now than I did when he was
6 a child.

7 . He then moved down south,
8 and when he got married, went down from
9 the Lodge to marry him. When his marriage broke up, he
10 returned north to live with his sister,

11 . We were all very
12 sorry to hear about his troubles, and SR149 and SR212
13 SR212 I know visited him in prison.

14 I met HIA16 once after he got out of jail. I was
15 coming out of , so it is that
16 long ago. I saw and recognised him and he greeted me.
17 He was a and we chatted. He was friendly and
18 gave me no impression that he had had a horrible time at
19 my hands. I told him to look after himself.

20 I was surprised then in 2012 when the police put the
21 allegation to me that I had supposedly hit this boy in
22 or around 1963, not the extensive allegations he now
23 makes about myself and NL4. I have always denied ever
24 striking any child and that remains my position. I also
25 can honestly say I never saw NL4 strike this or any boy.

1 I will comment further on the oral evidence as
2 outlined to me by my solicitor as soon as possible."

3 She concludes that statement.

4 I will get the page references for that statement.
5 It may be -- I think we were actually waiting -- we
6 received an unsigned statement from her and we were
7 waiting for the signed statement to arrive before adding
8 it to the bundle. I will check whether we have yet
9 received the signed version of that statement.

10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

11 MS SMITH: That concludes my summary of HIA16's evidence.

12 As I said, on the last occasion I indicated what he said
13 happened to him in Rubane and his life after care is set
14 out in paragraphs 46 to 53 of his Inquiry statement.

15 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Very well.

16 MS SMITH: Chairman, there is one further witness to give
17 evidence today. I know that Mr Aiken was consulting
18 with him. So I am not clear yet whether or not we will
19 be in a position to start that evidence yet or whether
20 we will need to wait until after lunchtime.

21 CHAIRMAN: Well, we will rise for a few minutes, and if we
22 are ready to proceed soon, we will let you know, ladies
23 and gentlemen. If not, it will be 2 o'clock or -- well,
24 say some time after 1.30 at the earliest.

25 (12.10 pm)

1 (Short break)

2 (12.45 pm)

3 WITNESS HIA25 (called)

4 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

5 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, the next witness
6 this afternoon is HIA25 or HIA25, "HIA25". He gave
7 evidence to the Inquiry on Day 66, when we were looking
8 at Rubane. That was on 6th November, and on that
9 occasion he affirmed, and he is aware that he remains
10 bound by his promise, and he confirmed then that he
11 wished to keep his anonymity, and that remains the
12 position today.

13 HIA25, before I ask you some matters, I am just
14 going to give the Panel some references to material,

15

20

but the witness statement which you
24 proved on the last occasion, HIA25 -- I am just going to
25 bring that up on the screen -- is at 611. Can we bring

1 up 611, please? I just want you to check when it comes
2 up, HIA25, that's the first page of your witness
3 statement. You will hopefully recognise it.

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. If we go to 624, which is the last page, just confirm
6 that it's the same last page and that you signed that.

7 **A. I did.**

8 Q. That's your evidence and you adopted it on the last
9 occasion.

10 The response statement from the Sisters of Nazareth
11 is at 1949 to 1950.

12 The Health & Social Care Board response is at 5561
13 to 5562, with exhibits that run from 5563 to 5568.

14 Then, as HIA25 is aware, there's voluminous Social
15 Services material that has been disclosed by the Health
16 & Social Care Board, and that runs for the record from
17 40109 to 40386 and then from 42757 to 42826, then from
18 45655 to 46580 and, finally, from 47367 to 47500.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

Just by way of background, you were born on

4

A. I was.

5

Q. You are now aged 48.

6

12 You were taken to Nazareth Lodge
13 February 1973, and the ledger entry from Nazareth Lodge
14 suggests that you remained there until August 1973.

the point that you

24 make about your time in Nazareth Lodge is that you don't

25 really have any memory of your time there.

17 Q. Just to make you aware, HIA25, publicly that the Panel
18 have in addition to all the material that I have the
19 same core material that you and I were looking at and,
20 as I said to you beforehand, it is not in your interests
21 and I am not going to bring all of that material up on
22 the screen today --

23 **A. Okay.**

24 Q. -- but you can be assured that the Panel has had that
25 material and had the opportunity to read it.

1 **A. Okay.**

2 Q. What happens then, as you recognise in your statement,
3 Nazareth Lodge doesn't work out. There is a lot of
4 absconding.

5 **A. Yes.**

6 Q. The Social Services

8 get you taken to the new Palmerston Assessment Centre.

9 The admission to there -- it seems that all seven of
10 you went there under the care of the Health and
11 Social Services Board

13 If we look at 40110, so -- if we just maximise the
14 top half of that page, so this is the reception taking
15 you into Palmerston. So the period in Nazareth Lodge,
16 of which you have no real memory, doesn't continue and
17 instead you are taken to this Assessment Centre.

18 I think the point you make in your statement in
19 paragraph 3 of your statement, if we go back to 611,
20 please, and while I haven't found any detailed record of
21 this in the social work papers, the point that you make
22 in paragraph 3 is that -- can we just move on to the
23 next page:

24 "We were only there for a short time. There were
25 various issues and a window got broken."

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. So you yourself recollect there was trouble --

3 **A. Oh, aye, yes.**

4 Q. -- with the family members who were in Palmerston, and
5 the idea of that centre was a short centre in any event
6 to work out where best for you, the children in care,
7 then to go thereafter, and this it seems was a new
8 centre that had just opened at the point that you are
9 going to it.

10 It appears that the decision was then made in
11 Palmerston for you to go to Nazareth House

Yes.

15 Q. I think you were having trouble you were saying to me
16 being sure which one we were talking about. Nazareth
17 House being the one more focused on the Ormeau Road.

18 **A. Uh-huh.**

19 Q. You appear to have gone there December 1973. So
20 you will have just turned 7, if I have got that
21 correctly --

22 **A. Yes.**

23 Q. -- when you are going to Nazareth House. You say in
24 paragraph 6 of your statement at 612 that there were
25 three of you in Nazareth House

NHB 17 . I think -- as I said to you earlier,
2 I think there maybe also was HIA 18, and then he was
3 then moved to Rubane again. Your older sisters NHB 15
4 and NHB 16 it seems went to the Good Shepherd. The
5 reference for that for the Panel is at 47433. So four
6 of you it seems went into Nazareth House together. You
7 were there ultimately for eight months.

8 You explain in paragraph 4 a particular incident,
9 HIA25, where you were given a watch by an old person.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. You say that when you showed that to the nun, you got
12 slapped for having it.

13 **A. That particular nun now, I forget her name.**

14 Q. You don't remember her name.

15 **A. No. I just remember I would bring this old man around**
16 **in the wheelchair. I was warned not to do it. No**
17 **reason given for the warning, but I kept on doing it,**
18 **and one time he gave me a watch and I was wearing it,**
19 **and the nun had seen the watch and asked where I got it,**
20 **and she became -- because I disobeyed her, she began to**
21 **slap my arm or took the watch off me, told me never to**
22 **go near them again.**

23 Q. Another particular incident that you remember is -- or
24 the incidents -- is the response in -- to you
25 absconding.

1 --

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q.

4 They are supposed to keep you in
5 this place and look after you, and you and HIA31 and
6 HIA 18 -- not NHB 17 , who seemed to settle -- but you
7 are running off, being brought back, running off, being
8 brought back. You are gravitating back to the rest of
9 the family

13 Q. Yes

-- and then the authorities would take you back to
20 Nazareth House.

21 **A. We'd run away again .**

22 Q. You would run away again. What you are describing here
23 in paragraphs 6 and 7, you -- you try -- you say you
24 tried to escape to get back to the rest of the family.
25 You remember going down the long drive. One of the nuns

1 stopped and picked you up in a car. You say:

2 "We were taken into a room with very little
3 furniture by the nun who caught us and she turned the
4 lights off. When the light was turned on again, there
5 was another nun with a broom and she swiped at us and
6 hit us with the broom."

7 This is you and HIA31 ?

8 **A. Yes, me and HIA31 .**

9 Q. "The light was then turned off again. From time to time
10 it was turned on so she could see where to hit you. We
11 called this the dark room."

12 Now the Sisters accept in their response that their
13 policy of no physical punishment wasn't always kept to.

14 **A. Uh-huh.**

15 Q. The children would have been physically punished, but
16 they don't accept this incident occurred --

17 **A. I didn't think they would.**

18 Q. -- of swiping with the broom.

19 **A. Right.**

20 Q. This is how you remember being dealt with for --

21 **A. For running away.**

22 Q. -- having run off.

23 **A. Yes.**

24 Q. The other point that you make, in an effort to stop you
25 running off, the last sentence of paragraph 7 on

1 page 613, your shoes were taken off you.

2 **A. Yes, I remember that.**

3 Q. That was to try and make it painful I suppose if you
4 ran.

5 **A. Well, you can't run far with no shoes.**

6 Q. Do I take it that that didn't really deter you?

7 **A. No, nothing would deter me from running away to try to
8 get back to my family.**

9 Q. You describe in paragraph 8 how you were constantly
10 absconding and given beatings for it. You don't
11 remember who the nuns were that punished you --

12 **A. No.**

13 Q. -- for having run away, but that's what you recollect
14 happening.

15 **A. Yes. It happened every time we ran away.**

16 Q. You were punished every time?

17 **A. Every time.**

18 Q. Now I presume the point of it was to persuade you not to
19 run away anymore, but that didn't work?

20 **A. Just didn't work.**

21 Q. You explain in paragraph 9 that you thought that the
22 intention was to split you up into ones and twos.

1 There were efforts to keep the younger members of the
2 family together

5 Certainly --

 a new home called Glenmore opened, by that
7 stage the idea was to bring you and HIA31 and NHB 17
8 and HIA 18 together again there when you had got
9 separated for various reasons prior to 1980, whenever
10 you go to Glenmore, but it appears that -- and you say
11 yourself in paragraph 10 of your statement -- that you
12 got too much to handle for the nuns and you think that's
13 why you were sent to Rubane.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. Certainly at this stage you were only 7 years of age and
16 the normal transfer age was 11. Now DL 358 and HIA 18
17 had been placed in Rubane in 1973. DL 358 had
18 absconded and had not returned, but HIA 18 was still
19 living there. It seems the idea was, "Well, if they
20 have to go to Rubane, at least that is where HIA 18 is",
21 but it appears if we look at --

22 **A. HIA 18 was only 9 at the time too.**

23 Q. HIA 18 was young as well. I think DL 358 was --

24 **A. 11.**

25 Q. -- 11. So he was the age for Rubane --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- and the idea initially it appears they were both
3 taken to Rubane, but DL 358 absconded. HIA 18 stayed
4 on, and then you were being taken there to unite with
5 HIA 18.

6 If we look at 47471, now this is a -- there were
7 progress reports by the social workers on each of you
8 every few months. This is one that actually relates to
9 your sister NHB 17, but if we move through to the next
10 page -- and this is from July 1974, and we know that you
11 leave Nazareth House in August of '74, so a few weeks
12 after this. We can see just from this section under
13 "Foster parents" the last sentence:

14 "The relationship ..." --

15 and this has been compiled by the social worker:

16 "The relationship between social worker and SR31
17 improved now that are to be removed!"

18 **A. Uh-huh.**

19 Q. So it appears -- and I am reading this into this
20 document as a result of that sentence -- but it appears
21 that the Sisters didn't feel able to keep you and
22 HIA31 any longer --

23 **A. Uh-huh.**

24 Q. -- and it appears that certainly for a period the social
25 worker tried to dissuade them of that view and have them

1 keep you, and then that view having changed, whatever
2 fall-out was taking place between the social worker and
3 the Sister got remedied when it was decided that you and
4 your brother were moving to Rubane.

5 If we just move down to the last part of this
6 document under the "Future plans", it recognises:

7 "NHB 17 is to remain at Nazareth House ..."

8 At this point she would there be on her own, as it
9 were.

10 **A. Yes.**

11 Q. You are going to be in Rubane with HIA 18 and your
12 brother HIA31 .

13 "NHB 17 is to remain at Nazareth House now that
14 family going home is impossible."

21 Q. "Thus she will be the only member of the family left and
22 this I am sure will be upsetting for her. I feel that
23 she is going to need much social work contact and
24 efforts made to keep her in touch with the other family
25 members."

1 Then if we just scroll down a little, please, under
2 the "Remarks of senior staff" -- just scroll down,
3 please -- you can see:

4 "NHB 17 seems less dependent on the family than her
5 siblings. It is clearly important that this contact
6 should be maintained, especially when
7 leaving her."

8 So in fairness to the then Welfare Authority or now
9 the Eastern Board, as it is becoming -- shortly to
10 become the Eastern Board, there is a recognition of
11 a desire to keep the siblings in contact with each
12 other

16 **A. Uh-huh.**

17 **Q.** -- and arranging for you to see them and arranging for
18 weekends out with the older brothers and sisters for you
19 to spend time with them.

20 It does -- it is the case, though, that you were
21 moved to Rubane August of '74. If we can
22 look at 46049, this is the social worker saying to you
23 who seems to have put a lot of time and
24 effort into trying to keep the family united and
25 seeing -- making sure there was contact, given that you

1 were now living in different places, and if we just
2 scroll down a little, please, so we can see -- there
3 is reference to the discussion she had with BR2. If we
4 can just scroll -- yes, it is because his name is scored
5 out unhelpfully I'm afraid. Just at that point where
6 the top of the screen now:

7 "BR2 was very reticent about coming
8 into his care ..."

9 So that's you and HIA31 .

10 **A.** HIA31 .

11 **Q.** HIA 18 is already there.

12 "... because he felt that they -- were too
13 young and would be bullied by the other older boys, who
14 perhaps would resent their more immature means of
15 getting attention. However, he agreed to give the new
16 situation a trial."

17 So there are other examples that the Inquiry has of
18 children younger than 11 going to Rubane, but it is
19 clear that BR2, who was in charge then --

20 **A.** **Uh-huh.**

21 **Q.** -- was reticent about it in respect of you and HIA31 .
22 There are various reports that I am not going to go into
23 that show that concern continuing and ultimately his
24 concern settles, but it seems to have been not something
25 that he was terribly keen on to begin with.

1 Then, HIA25, as you are aware, there's a long, very
2 detailed suite of records --

3 **A. Okay.**

4 Q. -- post your time in Nazareth House. It is Nazareth
5 House that we are looking at today.

4 The -- other than -- as I said to you, the Panel
5 have had, HIA25, the opportunity to read the core
6 material that you and I were talking about this morning,
7 and much of it relates to after the period of time when
8 you are in Nazareth Lodge for a short period and then
9 Nazareth House.

10 To summarise, your main memory of Nazareth House was
11 that physical punishment for running away --

12 **A. Yes, purely.**

13 Q. -- and then that one particular occasion where your
14 engagement with an older person led you into conflict
15 with one of the nuns.

16 **A. That is correct, yes.**

17 Q. But those are really the only memories that you have of
18 that particular period.

19 **A. Yes, yes.**

20 Q. As you know, HIA25, the purpose of asking you to come
21 back today was about Nazareth both Lodge and House.

22 **A. Uh-huh.**

23 Q. We focused on that

Okay.

3 Q. -- issue to look at the material that has been found
4 about your time in institutions, but what I want to ask
5 you in the context of Nazareth Lodge and Nazareth House
6 is whether -- you are aware the Inquiry has to consider
7 what recommendations it might make at the end of its
8 work --

9 **A. Uh-huh.**

10 Q. -- and whether that's in the form of an apology of some
11 kind, a memorial or some other means of redress, and we
12 ask each person, as I did for you in Rubane, whether
13 there was anything you wanted to say to the Panel to
14 help their thinking about what recommendations they
15 might make. Is there anything you want to say about
16 that?

17 **A. An apology? For what me and my family went through
18 I think compensation for what we went through. For
19 a young child to run away and then be
20 brought back every time, was abused by their carers,
21 what else could we ask for? Apology and something that
22 would help our life in the future.**

23 Q. The last question that I ask each witness, HIA25, is
24 whether there's anything else about the time in the
25 particular homes -- for us today it's Nazareth House and

1 Nazareth Lodge -- that I maybe haven't covered or
2 haven't covered in enough detail or something else about
3 that that they want to say. Your memories of that
4 period are limited.

5 **A. Very limited.**

6 Q. Have I covered everything you want to say about that or
7 is there anything else you want to add?

8 **A. I just want an explanation why I was taken into care,
9 and through your talk this morning I'm happy with it.**

10 **I don't want to add anything else.**

11 Q. Those who need to recognise the issue of helping you to
12 understand why decisions were made --

13 **A. Yes.**

23 Q. If you just bear with me, the Panel may want to ask you
24 some questions. So stay there for a very short time.

1 Questions from THE PANEL

2 MS DOHERTY: Thanks very much, HIA25. Just one question.

3 I realise you were very young at the time, but can you
4 ever remember talking to any social worker or any social
5 worker visiting you in Nazareth House?

6 **A. I can't remember.**

7 Q. You can't remember?

8 **A. That's not saying they didn't.**

9 Q. No, no. I understand that. I was just asking. Okay.

10 Thanks very much.

11 MR LANE: Do you think the nuns knew why you were running
12 away?

13 **A. I take it the Welfare had told them**

14 Q. But they didn't ask you?

15 **A. I can't remember. They probably could have asked the**
16 **older ones, but I think they knew why we were running**
17 **away, why we had to run away.**

Okay. Thank you very much.

7 **A. You're welcome.**

8 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA25, I am sure you will be very relieved

9 to hear we don't have any more questions for you.

19

Okay.

I gather at least the process for you has been
4 helpful today.

5 **A. It has.**

6 Q. Thank you very much for coming back to us.

7 **A. No bother. Thank you.**

8 MR AIKEN: Chairman --

9 CHAIRMAN: That's all, HIA25, as far as we are concerned.

10 We have something else to deal with. So if you wish to
11 leave now, you are free to do so.

12 (Witness withdrew)

13 MR AIKEN: I have one further matter which I'm going to
14 summarise for the Panel.

15 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

16 MR AIKEN: But perhaps if we could take a short break to
17 allow that to be organised.

18 CHAIRMAN: Yes. I think we would prefer to press on with
19 a short break, if that's convenient to you, ladies and
20 gentlemen. So we will come back when Mr Aiken tells us
21 we are ready.

22 (1.30 pm)

23 (Short break)

24 (1.40 pm)

25

1 READING OF STATEMENT AND DOCUMENTS RELATING TO HIA397

2 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, I am going to
3 summarise now the evidence of HIA397. He has explained
4 to the Inquiry why he feels unable to attend and the
5 Inquiry has accepted that explanation. His witness
6 statement, if we can bring it up, please, at 225 --

7 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, as I think I said earlier, but
8 perhaps not in your presence, Mr Aiken, where we read
9 someone's statement in these circumstances and we have
10 granted anonymity, we proceed on the basis that that is
11 still the desire of the person concerned, just for
12 everyone's benefit.

13 MR AIKEN: The statement runs through to page 232. If we
14 can bring up page 232, please. It is not my intention
15 to read out the statement, which the Panel has already
16 had the opportunity to consider, but in addition to that
17 there is a response statement from the Sisters of
18 Nazareth at 1888 to 1889, and that contains an apology
19 to HIA397 and also a recognition that bedwetting what
20 not appropriately dealt with.

21 The Health & Social Care Board response, which is at
22 to 5799 to 5801, has exhibits from 5802 to 5830, and in
23 addition an extensive social work file has been
24 provided, which runs from SNB-43293 to 43450.

25 Now HIA397 is now 46. He was

1 placed in Nazareth Lodge as a child, but
2 ultimately adopted from Nazareth Lodge. He is someone
3 who has gone on to marry and have children of his own
4 and a career that has led to him being always in work.

5 He describes in the latter part of his statement,
6 which I am not going to open, the trauma for him and his
7 siblings of discovering each other and the difficult
8 formation of a relationship with his mother after he
9 left care, but from birth he was admitted to the care of
10 Nazareth Lodge ultimately through the Belfast County
11 Welfare Committee on the basis that unfortunately his
12 mother had abandoned him, and the Admission to Care form
13 of 25th September '73 -- 25th September '68 -- my
14 apologies -- explains that. That's at 43418 and 9.
15 I am not going to bring that up. The admission was
16 arranged through the -- a voluntary organisation and
17 ultimately then he was taken into care.

18 He was in St. Joseph's Babies' Home initially from
19 September '68
20 until May of '73, when at aged 4 he moved into Nazareth
21 Lodge, and he remained there until March 1978, aged 9.

22 He was formally admitted into care of the Western
23 Health & Social Services Board in September of '73. The
24 reference for that is at 47356. From that point, as
25 disclosed in the social work file, there are regular

1 social work contacts with HIA397 that run from late
2 1973. They're at 43416 and 43447. Then records to
3 mid-'74 at 43417 and three-monthly reviews at 43423.

4 In September '74 the records show by that stage I
5 think it's the DSSO within the Board reviewing his case
6 and asking about whether permanent arrangements for him
7 could be made if the position was going to remain that
8 his mother was not going to take an interest, and that
9 can be found at 43422.

10 The social work visits then continue in '75 at 43447
11 and '76 and '77 at 43441 to 43450. Then a report, which
12 I am not going to bring up now, is prepared to assist
13 the Board in obtaining a Parental Rights Order to
14 facilitate HIA397 being fostered out and ultimately
15 adopted. That report can be found at 47356 through to
16 47358. That sets out in detail the efforts to engage
17 mum without success and therefore the decision to look
18 to foster with a view to potential adoption.

19 That Order is obtained by the Eastern Health in
20 September of '77 and that Order is at 43371. The
21 extensive handwritten notes show the engagement of NL5,
22 who -- HIA397 has some very positive things to say about
23 her in his statement and it is clear that she was
24 heavily involved with the Social Services in setting up
25 of the fostering arrangements.

1 The social work visits continue in '77 and '78 at
2 43395 to 7. Ultimately HIA397 was fostered out on
3 a full-time basis from March '78 -- that can be
4 found at 43301 -- and ultimately that same couple then
5 adopted HIA397 in September of 1980. The references for
6 that can be found at 5799 and 43301.

7 What the material that has been provided
8 demonstrates is that those foster parents, who became
9 adoptive parents, had to undergo in late '77 and '78
10 assessments over a number of visits and interviews and
11 then a bedding-in period, where HIA397 would leave the
12 Lodge and go to spend time with them at the weekends --
13 that's at 43391 -- and then ultimately reporting from
14 the Wel... -- from the Board that led to his discharge
15 from Nazareth to be adopted.

16 When he was leaving -- this shows the contrast for
17 the Panel in terms of the record-keeping -- when he was
18 being discharged from Nazareth to foster care, there was
19 a Discharge and Transfer of Children in Care form.
20 That's at 47366. That included with it relevant
21 documentation being provided alongside it. It also had
22 to have a medical record accompany him -- that's at
23 43382 to 43385 -- which was completed on him in order
24 for him to go to the foster parents. The foster parents
25 themselves had to execute an agreement at 43376, and he

1 reference for that can be found at 61277.

2 If we look at paragraph 7 of her statement,
3 please -- his statement at SNB-226, he says of NL19,
4 NL19, that:

5 "She was not as nice as NL5. She wore shoes with
6 cork on the heels and she would pull the children up
7 from whatever they were doing in a rough and abrupt
8 manner."

9 He recalls as a child doing handstands and she came
10 over and stuck her stiletto heel into his hand. He
11 remembers crying.

12 In paragraph 8 he remembers getting slapped by her
13 for his nails not being right.

14 In paragraph 9, moving on to 227, he talks about
15 bedwetting and that he was regularly beaten by NL19. He
16 says in paragraph 11 that she instilled a fear in him
17 that was just unhealthy. He says that she was someone
18 that he really hated.

19 He describes in paragraph 12 that:

20 "She would grab you roughly by the hair and stand
21 over you."

22 From material the Inquiry has received from the
23 police there is another individual who makes -- who was
24 there at the same time as HIA397. He made a statement
25 to the police initially in June of 1995 and he said

1 there was no sexual or physical violence in the home.
2 That is at SNB-61269, but he made a further statement to
3 police on 27th April 2010 and that is at SNB-61270. If
4 we can bring that up, please, 61270. He says -- if we
5 just scroll down, please, that he was looked after by
6 NL5, that she didn't abuse him, but describes being
7 physically abused by NL19 in relation to bedwetting and
8 being trailed out of bed.

9 In paragraph 16 of the statement of HIA39... --

CHAIRMAN: Just before we leave that page I take it the

11 Sister referred to four lines up from the bottom, that's
12 a misunderstanding

13

AIKEN: There is a SR202 , who I think that's meant
15 to be.

16 CHAIRMAN: SR202 ?

17 MR AIKEN: Yes. That is something that I can have checked.

18 If we go back to SNB-228, please, and HIA397 then
19 speaks of SR31 in paragraph 16, who is SR31. Now SR31
20 is believed -- SR31, who in latter years was known as
21 SR31, and she was in Nazareth House from '59 to '75 and
22 then in Nazareth Lodge from '75 to '80, which is the
23 period that HIA397 is in the Lodge. There are
24 previous -- there are other complaints, which I am not
25 going to open, but by way of example you will recall

1 from Rubane hearing me talk about the 41 files
2 . File 30 of 41 related to SR31 or
3 SR31. That runs from SNB-60289 to 60408. That file
4 contains material from seven different complainants, of
5 which HIA397 was not one. There is other police
6 material relating to her. I will have to work out how
7 best to communicate that in due course, but SR31 died in
8 2012.

9 In paragraph 16 HIA397 says that:

10 "She would have wore a bulky ring and had a habit of
11 walking past a group and scraping the ring into the
12 backs of their heads."

13 Now as to that, the Sisters of Nazareth say, if we
14 can bring up 1889, please, paragraph 6 -- the
15 congregation has pointed out that:

16 "The Sisters didn't wear rings until the 2000
17 General Chapter and then it was stipulated that 'Sisters
18 may wear a simple silver congregational ring'."

19 So the congregation is drawing attention that
20 a Sister wearing a bulky ring in this period we are
21 dealing with would appear out of the ordinary in the
22 '70s.

23 Then in paragraph 17 of the statement of HIA397, if
24 we could go back, please, to SNB-228, paragraph 17,
25 HIA397 speaks of SR30, who is SR30, who is SR30. He

1 says of her that -- having being told off for bad
2 manners, he questioned it to another staff member and
3 was then hit across the side of the face, bursting his
4 lip.

5 Now SR30 is in a position to provide a response to
6 the Inquiry. If we look, please, at SNB-2184, and in
7 respect of this -- if we just take the statement back
8 down, please. Just go back to 228. What she says is
9 that at no time did she have any responsibility for any
10 physical contact with this person and what is alleged of
11 her in paragraph 17 did not happen. That's SNB-2184.

12 In paragraph 18 of the statement of HIA397 he makes
13 reference to Father Brendan Smyth. He says in
14 paragraph 18 that he was interfered with by him and that
15 that took place in presumably the dormitory. He would
16 sit on the bed and play with his genitalia. He says he
17 remembers him doing the same to the guy in the bed next
18 to him and remembers the guy shaking his head from side
19 to side. That may be a slightly different modus
20 operandi than the Inquiry will see from other material
21 relating to Brendan Smyth, but in addition he says in
22 paragraph -- well, I should say to that the Sisters have
23 pointed out in paragraph 7 of their response at 1889
24 that nobody other than staff members should ever have
25 been in a child's dormitory, and at the same time NL5

1 has provided a statement to the Inquiry recently where
2 she accepted Brendan Smyth would have done a retreat in
3 the home and also on occasion visited. It was towards
4 late at night and would have stayed over and she would
5 have assisted with his tea, and she makes the point she
6 was completely unaware of him engaging in any activity
7 that was inappropriate, but it's places in addition to
8 what others have said, him in the home. The suggestion
9 certainly in paragraph 17 is of something taking place
10 in the bedroom or the dormitory rather than elsewhere.

11 In paragraph 19 of the statement at SNB-229 HIA397
12 says he recalls another boy being upset in the company
13 of Father Brendan Smyth.

14 That is something there might be
15 greater clarity on in the next period of time with
16 another witness, but he says he remembers knowing why he
17 upset and doing nothing about it. He says he remembers
18 to this day. It is one of the foremost memories of his
19 mind, because he remembers associating the tears with
20 thinking to himself about what he understood Brendan
21 Smyth was likely to have been doing to this boy.

22 Members of the Panel, unless there is anything else
23 I can assist with, that's the material I propose to open
24 to you in respect of HIA397.

25 CHAIRMAN: Yes. I see Miss Savage has arrived. She will be

1 comforted by the fact that in this instance there are no
2 allegations against her client, but we rather
3 anticipated matters by going on. Yes.

4 MR AIKEN: Chairman, that concludes today's evidence.

5 CHAIRMAN: Well, ladies and gentlemen, we will resume not
6 Monday coming, but Monday week in the normal way. I am
7 afraid the timetable is subject to a degree of flux due
8 to the matters I dealt with on Monday. We will let
9 everyone know just as soon as possible what the running
10 order for the witnesses will be during that week.

11 MR MONTAGUE: I am obliged.

12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

13 (2.00 pm)

14 (Hearing adjourned until 10.00 am
15 on Monday, 9th February 2015)

16 --ooOoo--

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25