
HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE INQUIRY

being heard before:

SIR ANTHONY HART (Chairman)

MR DAVID LANE

MS GERALDINE DOHERTY

held at

Banbridge Court House

Banbridge

on Wednesday, 16th December 2015

commencing at 10.00 am

(Day 171)

MS CHRISTINE SMITH, QC and MR JOSEPH AIKEN appeared as
Counsel to the Inquiry.

1 Wednesday, 16th December 2015

2 (10.00 am)

3 (Proceedings delayed)

4 (2.30 pm)

5 WITNESS BAR14 (called)

6 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

7 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen. I am sorry
8 that we are starting somewhat later than anticipated for
9 a variety of reasons, but can I remind everyone if you
10 have a mobile phone, please ensure it is either turned
11 off or put on "Silent"/"Vibrate", and I must also remind
12 everyone photography is not permitted either in the
13 chamber or anywhere else on the premises.

14 Yes, Mr Aiken?

15 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, good afternoon.

16 The next witness today is BAR14 -- the first witness
17 today is BAR14, who is "BAR14".

18 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

19 MR AIKEN: BAR14 gave evidence previously to the Inquiry in

20 his capacity as [REDACTED]

21 [REDACTED] and was sworn on that occasion. So he
22 remains under oath. He wishes to keep his anonymity.

23 BAR14, as you know, thank you for the flexibility
24 you have shown today, because you have been assisting
25 the Inquiry by providing information in terms of

1 statement. We have worked with you to change how we are
2 going to deal with this. So I am grateful for that.
3 You are going to finish your evidence tomorrow in
4 relation to a particular part that relates to your third
5 statement. We will make as much progress today as we
6 reasonably can.

7 I am going to bring up on the screen, BAR14, the
8 first statement you provided to the Inquiry of 29th
9 November. You just can check and make sure you
10 recognise that as the first page of the first statement.

11 **A. I do.**

12 Q. If we move through to 1023, please, can you confirm that
13 is the last page? What we will do, BAR14, is we will
14 get you to sign it --

15 **A. Yes.**

16 Q. -- and then we will reupload it with the signed version,
17 but --

18 **A. That is the last page.**

19 Q. Yes, and you are going to adopt it as part of your
20 evidence to the Inquiry?

21 **A. I will.**

22 Q. Then your second statement is of 2nd December 2015. If
23 we go to 1079, please, you will recognise that as the
24 first page of the second statement.

25 **A. I do. Uh-huh.**

1 Q. Then if we move through on to 1080, please, and again,
2 BAR14, we'll get you to append your physical signature
3 to that, but that's the second page, and you want to
4 again adopt that statement --

5 **A. I do.**

6 Q. -- as part of your evidence to the Inquiry?

7 **A. I do.**

8 Q. Then there's a third statement, BAR14, which is
9 detailed, looking at the wider issues arising from the
10 Martin Ruddock report from 2004. If we can bring up
11 1139, please.

12 EPE OPERATOR: I don't have that.

13 MR AIKEN: A technical hitch, BAR14, that we will resolve.
14 I will come back to that statement. You have provided
15 a third statement. If I can give the Members of the
16 Panel the reference, it runs from 1139 to 1145 in the
17 bundle. In any event, BAR14, that's a matter that we
18 will return to tomorrow morning.

19 Now, BAR14, you explain in your first statement that
20 you started working for Barnardo's in [REDACTED] --

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. -- as the [REDACTED].

23 **A. That's correct.**

24 Q. And who was [REDACTED] at that point in
25 time?

1 **A.** [REDACTED] -- [REDACTED].

2 Q. And he was coming towards retirement?

3 **A.** He was, yes.

4 Q. And you then applied for and were promoted to the
5 [REDACTED] role --

6 **A.** That's correct.

7 Q. -- later in [REDACTED]

8 **A.** I believe so, yes.

9 Q. And you performed that role for [REDACTED] years until you
10 believe [REDACTED].

11 **A.** I think that's correct. Uh-huh.

12 Q. And the Inquiry is aware that [REDACTED] was your
13 successor, but he didn't take up his post until [REDACTED]
14 [REDACTED]. So there was a period of time during
15 which your successor is being looked for --

16 **A.** Yes.

17 Q. -- it would appear. The role of [REDACTED],
18 that's what I want to talk to you about, the structure
19 that existed. I am going to bring up on the screen,
20 BAR14, a diagram that you have prepared for the
21 assistance of the Panel. If we can bring up 19153,
22 please, and this is the first of two diagrams, BAR14,
23 that you have prepared. This one deals with the
24 position up until [REDACTED], and it's looking at the
25 structure of the Irish Division of Barnardo's.

1 **A. That's correct.**

2 Q. And the [REDACTED] of the Irish Division was
3 ultimately responsible for not just Macedon but a series
4 of homes that Barnardo's were operating during that
5 period.

6 **A. Yes, homes and other services which weren't the
7 residential: day care services, foster care, etc.**

8 Q. So there were four homes, but then wider other services
9 --

10 **A. Yes. Uh-huh.**

11 Q. -- which were being operated and provided --

12 **A. Uh-huh.**

13 Q. -- which ultimately you had responsibility for as well.

14 **A. That's correct.**

15 Q. And as far as Macedon was concerned, the structure that
16 existed was you had an Assistant Divisional Director in
17 Northern Ireland and then you also had one in the
18 Republic of Ireland.

19 **A. That's correct.**

20 Q. The one in Northern Ireland would have been more
21 involved with Macedon.

22 **A. That's correct. Uh-huh.**

23 Q. And the [REDACTED], can you remember
24 who they were in that period [REDACTED]? There was

25 [REDACTED].

1 **A. The [REDACTED] initially was [REDACTED]**
2 **[REDACTED], later followed by BAR24. The [REDACTED]**
3 **[REDACTED] was BAR111 [REDACTED] and the Assistant**
4 **Director in the Republic of Ireland was Andrew Logue.**

5 Q. When we were speaking earlier, you weren't clear just
6 when **BAR111** began **[REDACTED]**. He
7 came after you were already in post.

8 **A. Yes. I can't put a date to his arrival.**

9 Q. It's something we'll check out with Barnardo's and see
10 can we identify who had the role in advance of him, but
11 I am going to bring up on the screen, BAR14, a plan that
12 I think you also might have been involved in preparing,
13 although it is many years since you saw it, if we look
14 at 678, and it to a degree mirrors what we have just had
15 on the screen, but it sets out the roles --

16 **A. Uh-huh.**

17 Q. -- of the different individuals, because you mentioned
18 the senior residential officer. Their role was
19 different from the Deputy Director or the Assistant
20 Director in that the senior residential officer was
21 supposed to be a close support, as it were, with
22 a line manager of the superintendent. Is that right or
23 is that --

24 **A. That's my recollection, yes.**

25 Q. And if we just scroll down a little bit, we can see

1 there was then a Senior Social Worker, who was involved
2 more in the other services --

3 **A. That's correct.**

4 Q. -- that you are describing was also ultimately coming to
5 be part of your role.

6 The role of the [REDACTED] had two parts to
7 it. It had an inward facing one [REDACTED]
8 [REDACTED], but then it was also
9 liaising with the headquarters, if I can call it that,
10 or Barnardo's London, the main part of the organisation.

11 **A. Well, it was a little bit more than liaison. We were**
12 **part -- there were I think six divisions and we were**
13 **part of a national management team, which met each**
14 **month, and all policy work was evolved from those**
15 **meetings.**

16 Q. I am going to ask you about that, because the structure
17 in London, you had the council, and you were explaining
18 to me that the council were not necessarily hands-on in
19 the micro sense, but you would have had council members
20 who would have come over, who were well-informed
21 individuals, but would have been taken by you to visit
22 the different homes that you had operating.

23 **A. Yes. The council is the governing body of the national**
24 **organisation. One or two council members was assigned**
25 **to each division for the purposes of I suppose**

1 familiarisation but also support and they would have
2 visited once or twice a year. They didn't have
3 a monitoring role, not as I understood it, because they
4 didn't necessarily visit every facility each time they
5 came. It was impossible, but they came for
6 familiarisation and they took quite a detailed interest
7 in what was going on.

8 Q. So that was the Board involvement.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. One step out or down was the Director of Childcare in
11 Barnardo's based in headquarters.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. That's a person that you would have had close
14 interaction with.

15 A. Yes. The National Director was a senior executive in
16 the organisation and she had a deputy, [REDACTED]

17 [REDACTED].

18 The deputy would probably have visited the division more
19 often than the National Director, but yes, we had close
20 contact with both of them.

21 Q. In terms of the visiting by the deputy, for instance,
22 was that something once a year or would -- is your
23 impression that it was something that happened more
24 often than that?

25 A. It would have been more often than that. Obviously if

1 **there was a need to visit for a particular reason, then**
2 **that would have been attended to, but yes, it was**
3 **much -- it was more than once a year.**

4 Q. And when the Deputy Director Childcare would have come
5 to Northern Ireland, [REDACTED] been showing that
6 person round the homes as well as the two council
7 members on the occasion they came?

8 A. **Yes. The two senior members of staff from London would**
9 **have been fairly -- they would have been familiar with**
10 **all of our facilities in the sense that they would**
11 **certainly have seen them any time they came or at least**
12 **a combination of them, but yes, they would have**
13 **recognised them quite well.**

14 Q. In terms of the design of policies, what was to be in
15 the Barnardo's policy in relation to corporal punishment
16 or care and control, you weren't designing those
17 policies. They were coming from headquarters for each
18 of the divisions to implement.

19 A. **They were designed in principle at any rate by the**
20 **month... -- at least through the monthly meeting of**
21 **divisional directors and all of the senior headquarters**
22 **staff. It was quite a democratic organisation in that**
23 **sense.**

24 Q. I want to look at that meeting that you have referred
25 to, because you were explaining to me that quite often

1 that would have been a two-day meeting --

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. -- that took place in England, where each of the heads
4 of the divisions came together with the senior staff
5 from headquarters.

6 **A. That's correct.**

7 Q. I just want to look at the senior staff from
8 headquarters, because in addition to the divisional --
9 sorry -- in addition to the Director of Childcare and
10 their deputy, headquarters also had a series of experts
11 performing roles. So you had a medical adviser.
12 I think you were able to rhyme them off better than me.
13 If you want to list them off as you remember them.

14 **A. I remember a few of them. There was a chief architect,**
15 **medical officer, education officer, someone who**
16 **specialised in the domestic provisions, the appliances**
17 **and catering and all of that kind of thing, and also**
18 **there was a senior administrative officer, and there was**
19 **a senior finance officer, and there was what was**
20 **referred to as a management -- I think he was called**
21 **a management auditor. He was more than a financial**
22 **auditor. He did an audit of all of the systems in the**
23 **organisation at that time, and also there was a research**
24 **and development officer.**

25 Q. Was there a social work adviser as such or was that the

1 Director of Childcare's ...?

2 **A. I don't think there was a social work adviser outside of**
3 **the national -- the national childcare executive, Mary**
4 **Johnson.**

5 Q. The way that -- these experts or advisers would have
6 assisted the directors, together with the senior
7 management team in London, working on policy and
8 strategy for the organisation that would then be
9 approved by the council and then implemented in the
10 various divisions.

11 **A. That's correct, yes.**

12 Q. [REDACTED] for instance, the care and control
13 policy would have been something ultimately approved by
14 Barnardo's council, but would have been worked up
15 through that senior meeting that took place each month?

16 **A. Yes, and my recollection is that the main policy**
17 **document was developed through what was referred to as**
18 **the Four Cs' Meeting, that is the monthly meeting.**
19 **Then, if I recall, the division -- at division level**
20 **each facility was required to have its dedicated, as it**
21 **were, care and control policy, because obviously what**
22 **was appropriate in school was rather different to what**
23 **might be appropriate in a foster care scheme or**
24 **a children's home, but each facility was required to**
25 **have one.**

1 Q. You and I were discussing the particular -- just bear
2 with me for a moment. The -- we were looking together
3 at I think what's called The Assisted Homes Guide or
4 Handbook that seems to have been implemented in and
5 around 1978/'79. It contains the corporal punishment
6 circular that the Panel and I looked together at during
7 the opening, and also the care and control policy at
8 that stage, but you were explaining to me that that
9 Assisted Homes Handbook was more for what here would
10 have been known as training schools that were operated.

11 **A. Yes. In England they are referred to as community homes**
12 **with education, but they would have been the equivalent**
13 **I think of our training school system.**

14 Q. I am just going to show the Panel. If we can look,
15 please, at 626, just so we ground what I'm referring to
16 that we looked at during the opening. Your own
17 recollection, BAR14, is -- if we just rotate that,
18 please -- your own recollection, BAR14, is that there
19 was another handbook, which was the bible or the guide
20 for children's homes in the traditional sense.

21 **A. Yes. I believe that there was, but to be honest,**
22 **I mean, I cannot remember that in detail. I haven't**
23 **seen it for many years.**

24 Q. And I know Barnardo's have explained to the Inquiry that
25 only 10% -- of homes that are closed only 10% of their

1 records, and it's a random sample, are retained. So the
2 point you are making is your belief is Macedon, for
3 instance, would have had its own care and control
4 document --

5 **A. It would.**

6 Q. -- that would have mirrored the general Barnardo's care
7 and control policy.

8 **A. That's my best recollection. I think that is the case.**

9 Q. But in any event there would have been a more generic
10 guide, because I think it is actually referred to in
11 some of the superintendent minutes that we'll come to,
12 that would have been available, and it is not
13 necessarily this one, which you think was more to do
14 with the English training schools, if I can call them
15 that --

16 **A. Yes. Uh-huh.**

17 Q. -- although it does have the same -- if we can move
18 through on to the next page, please, and rotate it as
19 well, from the contents we can see it sets out the basic
20 matters that would be involved in the running of a home,
21 and it does contain the care and control circular that
22 the Panel were shown during the opening, but the
23 position was that that monthly meeting in England would
24 have designed these types of policies --

25 **A. It would.**

1 Q. -- and they would have then been implemented across the
2 divisions.

3 **A. That's the case.**

4 Q. When we come back down into the Irish Division,
5 obviously there are four that you've set out for us
6 children's homes that were operating. If we bring back
7 up, please, 19153. In terms of the contact with the
8 individual home and the individual superintendent,
9 correct me if I get this condensing of it wrong, BAR14,
10 but the senior residential officer was effectively to be
11 the support for the superintendents.

12 **A. He was their support and effectively he was their line**
13 **-- their line manager.**

14 Q. And then the [REDACTED] -- sorry -- the
15 [REDACTED] --

16 **A. Uh-huh.**

17 Q. -- [REDACTED], would have also had
18 a hands-on role, but of a different type from the senior
19 residential officer.

20 **A. I really don't recall accurately whether the**
21 **superintendents would have reported in management terms**
22 **to the ADD, the Assistant Divisional Director, or to the**
23 **senior residential officer. The senior residential**
24 **officer would certainly have had very frequent,**
25 **certainly weekly, contact with them, but perhaps their**

1 line manager was the ADD. I can't remember exactly [REDACTED]
2 [REDACTED].

3 Q. Well, if I can ask you this, for instance -- and you are
4 aware of this from assisting the Inquiry in the earlier
5 module -- the Voluntary Homes Regulations 1975, dealing
6 with this period in Macedon in particular, '77 to '81,
7 had a requirement for the administering authority,
8 however that's determined to be -- the Hughes Inquiry
9 referred to effectively you would have been the
10 administering authority. This Inquiry will obviously
11 look at that issue in and of itself, because you were
12 taking your direction ultimately from London.

13 A. Uh-huh.

14 Q. But the carrying out of that voluntary visitor role,
15 that the administering authority had to under regulation
16 4 appoint someone to go in and satisfy themselves each
17 month that a voluntary home was being run in the best
18 interests of the children, can you remember -- because
19 unfortunately there are no documents that cover this
20 from the time -- can you remember how that requirement
21 to comply with the regulations was dealt with within
22 Barnardo's?

23 A. Barnardo's in Ireland or Northern Ireland did not have
24 a local committee. They didn't have a voluntary
25 committee. The other voluntary organisations that did

1 would have appointed one of their voluntary committee
2 members to do the visits. The administering authority
3 as far as Barnardo's was concerned I believe was their
4 headquarters in London, ultimately their council. The
5 responsibility for monthly visiting was dedicated to the
6 division and in our case that was carried out by the
7 [REDACTED], who made a monthly
8 monitoring report [REDACTED]

9 Q. You were discussing with me what form that was likely to
10 take. You explained to me that it would have included
11 the number of places, how many places were filled. You
12 couldn't be sure whether it would have had tick boxes
13 for "Fire book looked at", "Menus checked", but your
14 belief is that [REDACTED] would have been
15 checking the books, if I can put it that way, of the
16 homes that they visited.

17 A. I cannot produce you any evidence on this. [REDACTED] BAR111
18 was very fastidious. I do recall the monitoring reports
19 containing the information you've just mentioned, number
20 of children, number of vacancies, because that was
21 important for financial reasons, the number of staff
22 employed, the number of vacancies. How much detailed
23 information of incidents was contained in the form that
24 I received I simply do not remember. Whether there were
25 tick boxes for the statutory records which he was

1 **required to sign, that I don't remember either.**

2 Q. Well, in fairness to you -- and I drew your attention
3 to -- I am going to show a superintendent's meeting,
4 because as well as the London-based monthly meeting it
5 appears that within the division you had
6 superintendent's meetings, which look like they happened
7 each month. Again there's not a complete set
8 unfortunately. There are records from [REDACTED] I think
9 into [REDACTED] I am going to look at a particular one from
10 [REDACTED] if we look at 26095.

11 Can you remember these meetings, BAR14? I don't
12 mean what happened at a particular one, but you remember
13 having these superintendent/deputy superintendent
14 meetings each month?

15 A. **I do. They were really an important instrument in the**
16 **management of the division. It was a point of contact**
17 **with all of the senior staff on a wide range of issues,**
18 **including issues that we were reporting on, at least**
19 **feeding information to headquarters, that is the monthly**
20 **Four Cs' Meeting, and also there was an opportunity [REDACTED]**
21 **[REDACTED] to bring information from the Four Cs' Meeting on**
22 **matters that were being considered, policy matters, etc.**
23 **So it was a method of communication backwards**
24 **and forwards as well as an instrument of management. My**
25 **recollection is that we did hold them monthly.**

1 Q. It looks from the series of minutes that are available
2 that they rotated. There were held in different --
3 a different home, a different one of your four homes on
4 each occasion. Do you remember it rotating round in
5 that way so that they were being conducted, for
6 instance, one in Macedon on one occasion, another one in
7 Manor House?

8 **A. This is over thirty years ago, but I'm quite sure that**
9 **is the case.**

10 Q. If we scroll down through this version, we can see
11 [REDACTED]. There is [REDACTED]
12 [REDACTED]. So she might have been [REDACTED]
13 before **BAR111**. Would that be right?

14 **A. I honestly can't remember whether [REDACTED] was**
15 **appointed before or after him. I can't remember her**
16 **date of appointment.**

17 Q. I think she may be before.

18 **A. Quite possibly.**

19 Q. If we look, we can see reference to divisional
20 development.

21 **A. Uh-huh.**

22 Q. I want to pick that up with you first, because you were
23 explaining to me that in addition to the type of
24 meetings that you have described Barnardo's operated --
25 you had to produce a divisional plan annually.

1 **A. That's correct.**

2 Q. I think from speaking to the Barnardo's legal
3 representatives there may be a couple of those, but not
4 from this period unfortunately, but the idea of that was
5 to set out, "Here's what we plan to do and why. Here's
6 what we need", and then that would be submitted to
7 headquarters and would be the subject of I think you
8 smiled as you said great debate and scrutiny about what
9 you were doing and how it was going to be done.

10 **A. Well, it really was a strategic planning document, which**
11 **was prepared in some detail. One had to give, if**
12 **I remember correctly, a resumé of where each project was**
13 **at, where you wished to see it going, and on that basis**
14 **eventually you got approval for next year's budget. So**
15 **it was the underpinning document for decisions about --**
16 **about budgets.**

17 Q. So you're having some discussion and explaining that
18 precisely what's going to be granted would be a matter
19 for the Barnardo's council ultimately. If we scroll
20 down a little further, please, we will see some of the
21 topics that are covered. You are outlining here the
22 development of the division. You refer to the red book.
23 I am not sure whether that is the handbook that you are
24 talking about or is that a different ...?

25 **A. I don't remember it in detail. I suspect that it was**

1 **the nearest we had to a bible at that stage, that is**
2 **containing all our policies.**

3 Q. That may be something that can be looked into for me by
4 the representatives for Barnardo's, but you set out the
5 different aims that there's going to be, and you can see
6 there's then discussion. [REDACTED] raised a particular
7 type of group, as to whether you would work with them.

8 If we scroll down a little further, please, you then
9 go on according to this to describe the relationship
10 between the voluntary and statutory bodies.

11 If we scroll on further down, please, we then get to
12 look at specific developments within the division and
13 what's covered are described as preventative services.
14 Then you've got residential work.

15 **A. Uh-huh.**

16 Q. There were time implications for some of the units.

17 "Beginning to look at the long-term future of
18 Carraigfoyle, having reviewed its progress and what's
19 already been achieved for the young people who were
20 first admitted there. Manor House, at least a five-year
21 commitment."

22 Then you go on:

23 "Macedon is in the early throes of replacement.
24 Mention was made of a development in the Tyne Tees and
25 North-West divisions where residential work was going

1 into the small group idea with essential resources and
2 support in-built. This would be part of the features of
3 the Macedon replacement with the parent unit and
4 satellites."

5 Then it goes on to talk about Tara Lodge.

6 **A. It might be helpful for the Panel to be aware of this.**
7 Whenever I arrived in Barnardo's in [REDACTED], they were in
8 the final stages of going out to contract to build
9 a brand new children's home to replace Macedon, because
10 they knew the land was being vested by the Department of
11 the Environment and that the home would have to be
12 replaced. So it was at -- in [REDACTED] it was at the final
13 stages of development, that particular home. It so
14 happened that the first six months that I was there
15 I thought it was unwise, what they were proposing to do.
16 I thought it would become a white elephant. I didn't
17 think it was appropriate, the design and the whole
18 concept of it, and indeed the first thing that happened
19 on my appointment, at Barkingside I went to the chief
20 architect's office and we agreed there and then to scrap
21 it. That began a process of again thinking through the
22 kind of service that was needed for children who needed
23 substitute care. That process took a few years. It was
24 done along with staff. A lot of the thinking about it
25 came from staff who were employed in Macedon at that

1 **time, and if I recall correctly, BAR24 produced**
2 **a document called "The Sharonmore Project", which he had**
3 **worked up with the staff. So that took a few years.**

4 Q. So what -- The Sharonmore Project, as we know it now,
5 was not what was initially envisaged to replace Macedon.

6 **A. No, it wasn't, no.**

7 Q. But what's there is as a result of that thinking work
8 having gone on from [REDACTED].

9 **A. Uh-huh. That's correct.**

10 CHAIRMAN: May I just intervene? I see in one of the
11 documents -- I think it is your statement -- a reference
12 to Ballyhanwood. Is that what you are referring to?

13 **A. Yes. That was the site for the new home.**

14 Q. For those who don't know, that's somewhere on the
15 outskirts of Dundonald. Is that right?

16 **A. That's correct. Uh-huh.**

17 MR AIKEN: Then, BAR14, if we scroll down a little further,
18 we see restorative work, a particular type of work that
19 was being done, being discussed. Then if we move down
20 a little further, please, there's reference to research
21 evaluation. You explain that this was becoming
22 increasingly important in the work of Barnardo's.

23 "A part-time post had been included in the
24 divisional plan, although it can be some time yet before
25 the appointment will be made due to the other pressing

1 developments which are taking place."

2 Was that about the strategic thinking as to what
3 services a voluntary organisation could offer in a
4 changing landscape of childcare?

5 **A. Are you referring to the research paper?**

6 **Q. Yes.**

7 **A. No. At that time there was a recognition in social work**
8 **generally, but certainly in Barnardo's, that we needed**
9 **to know more about what works, and unless information**
10 **was analysed in a -- and evaluated in a systematic way,**
11 **one was largely guessing and it was impressionistic what**
12 **the results were. So Barnardo's nationally appointed**
13 **a research and development officer, and there was**
14 **an intention to appoint a research and development**
15 **officer in each division. [REDACTED]**

16 **[REDACTED]. We did embark**
17 **on work in that field assisted from headquarters, but we**
18 **didn't actually appoint a research officer.**

19 **Q. And there's then discussion about Ballyduff House, which**
20 **was -- I think that was to be one of the Sharonmore**
21 **units.**

22 **A. Ballyduff House was a -- originally a large family**
23 **house, which the Newtownabbey Council had used for**
24 **a period as offices. In time Barnardo's would purchase**
25 **that house and its precincts and that would become The**

1 **Sharonmore Project.**

2 Q. So that ultimately was the site --

3 **A. It was.**

4 Q. -- where the -- I think one of the two units -- one was
5 Ravelston and the other was Ballyduff.

6 **A. Ballyduff House became the administrative base for the
7 project and then there were two residential units
8 purpose-built on the site.**

9 Q. If we scroll down a little further, please. Now if we
10 move down, "Afternoon session", there's reference to
11 annual reviews taking place. The -- which would now be
12 done on the anniversary of a person's commencement of
13 employment.

14 Then we get the departmental handbook:

15 "This is a new handbook being issued by Barnardo's,
16 which covers all their areas of work and has helpful
17 information."

18 So it seems there was reference earlier to a red
19 book and then also a handbook. I am not sure that we
20 have seen either of them, I am afraid. What we have is
21 this one that seems to be more about English training
22 schools.

23 **A. I'm really guessing here. I think it's possible the
24 handbook might have been the kind of composite document
25 which emerged out of all of the divisional plans at that**

1 point in time. Then the handbook seemed to me to be
2 a different document altogether. That probably included
3 policies on a wide range of matters.

4 Q. The red book?

5 A. No, no, the handbook I think.

6 Q. The handbook would have had --

7 A. But I'm really guessing. I cannot remember exactly.

8 Q. So there were possibly two books that would have
9 existed. One would have been the divisional plans --

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. -- brought together, so there was one place you could
12 see generally what was happening across the piste in
13 Barnardo's.

14 A. I think that's possible.

15 Q. And then another book that was the resource for what the
16 policies were that were to be implemented across the
17 divisions.

18 A. I think that's possible.

19 Q. If we scroll down further then, please, now this is the
20 part that I wanted to draw attention then to, BAR14.
21 You explain --

22 "BAR14 began by referring to a booklet of the
23 regulations which governed voluntary homes and was
24 issued by the Department of Health and Social Services."

25 And then -- so that carries the implication that

1 there's another publication that's a guidance book on
2 the regulations or at least --

3 **A. I suspect that what is being referred to there is, in**
4 **fact, the Department's Voluntary Homes Regulations 1975.**

5 Q. Just the regulations themselves?

6 **A. I think that may be the case, yes.**

7 Q. Then you go on to say:

8 "Barnardo's have additional regulations adding to
9 that of the law of the land."

10 Now I am not sure whether at thirty years' remove
11 you are going to be able to say what sort of things you
12 might have been talking about in addition to the
13 regulations.

14 **A. I have absolutely no idea. Barnardo's was a progressive**
15 **organisation and, as you know, statutory regulations and**
16 **statutory policy tend to follow good practice, and**
17 **I think, to be fair to Barnardo's, they always have been**
18 **a progressive and leading organisation in developing**
19 **thinking and policies and practice guidance. I think**
20 **that's probably what we were referring to there.**

21 Q. You can see the suggestion:

22 "A photocopy of the section in the handbook dealing
23 with registers should be circulated to the branch
24 homes."

25 Now that's why I am saying it may be more than just

1 a copy of the regulations, or maybe it is, but certainly
2 there's reference here:

3 "Discussion on the daily register, diet books,
4 visitors' books, petty cash records, also punishment
5 books. The end result of discussion on the latter was
6 that it was regarded as very healthy if a member of
7 staff could tell the superintendent of punishment which
8 had been given.

9 It was agreed that punishment should include
10 sanctions which were used with the young people in care.
11 As far as corporal punishment was concerned,
12 superintendents could use his or her discretion as to
13 differentiating between punishment and physical
14 restraint."

15 Now we will come to see, BAR14, that the following
16 year you are describing the corporal punishment that
17 Barnardo's sanctioned was a slap on the hand for a child
18 under 10, but not beyond that.

19 **A. Yes. I think that's where the organisation was at that**
20 **time.**

21 Q. And we see you're making reference then to a document
22 from the Scottish division, which unfortunately I don't
23 believe we have seen, but it refers to:

24 "... four degrees of seriousness of an incident that
25 might be helpful if it were circulated to

1 superintendents."

2 So it looks like some work was done in the Scottish
3 division --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- looking at the level of incidents that there were.

6 Then it looks like -- and maybe you can assist with
7 this -- was there already a supervision mechanism of
8 staff in place, because the next section:

9 "The use of log sheets was discussed, and it was
10 suggested that they should be marked for the supervising
11 member of staff as confidential, so that there would be
12 no apprehension to who all would be reading them."

13 Can you help with what -- and if you don't remember
14 what that's about now, you can just say so.

15 **A. I really -- I would need to give that a lot of thought.**

16 I think I read an earlier -- a document while I was
17 waiting supplied by [REDACTED] which detailed --
18 which was a detailed document on staff supervision. So
19 staff supervision was an important element in the
20 running of any establishment of Barnardo's. Again
21 I think Barnardo's were progressive in their development
22 of methods of supervision. It certainly was
23 a requirement of senior staff.

24 Q. If we just scroll further down, please, then we get into
25 holiday budgets. I think if we scroll further down,

1 please, we come to the end. I am not going to go
2 through -- there are others that the Panel will be able
3 to look at. I know, BAR14, I have given you what are
4 available --

5 **A. Uh-huh.**

6 Q. -- and overnight you will point out to me anything in
7 particular that we have not covered that you want to
8 draw attention to, but equally what's available, if we
9 can look at 26033, please, which is a small set of
10 documents that give some indication of the involvement
11 of the advisers in what was coming down into the
12 divisions.

13 **A. Uh-huh.**

14 Q. So this is from [REDACTED], who at the time, as
15 I understand it, was the medical --

16 **A. That's correct.**

17 Q. -- adviser. This is notes on medical elements of
18 supervision. If we just scroll through -- I am not
19 going to spend time on the document itself -- looking at
20 particular groups of children. Then if we move on down,
21 please. If we scroll on to the next page, please, we
22 can see this is the supervision of domestic arrangements
23 in Barnardo's establishments. So again that's the
24 domestic adviser, as it were --

25 **A. That's right.**

1 Q. -- setting out particular issues that they want dealt
2 with. If we scroll down further, please. Just keep
3 going, please. Move on to the next page. This then is
4 about supervision of staff. If we just scroll down,
5 please, to the next page, and then talking about
6 education.

7 So these are the types of documents that would have
8 come out from the advisers that would have ultimately
9 made their way into the divisions to be implemented.

10 **A. That is correct. We were -- we were expected to comply**
11 **with all documents -- all policy documents from the**
12 **centre. It may have been appropriate, as I said, to**
13 **amend them to suit a particular situation, but**
14 **nevertheless that was the tenor of the organisation,**
15 **very good professional support and policy and practice**
16 **guidance from headquarters.**

17 Q. Now what I want to -- I want to ask you two more things
18 about governance, if I may, before I move on. The first
19 is I am going to take you outside Barnardo's for
20 a moment. [REDACTED], before you leave in [REDACTED], you
21 join the [REDACTED].

22 **A. Uh-huh.**

23 Q. In that period [REDACTED], or during your period [REDACTED]
24 [REDACTED], can you remember the Social Work Advisory Group
25 playing any role in the life of Barnardo's in any of

1 their homes and Macedon in particular?

2 A. You are asking me about the period [REDACTED] are you?

3 Q. Yes, [REDACTED], if
4 that's easier to ...

5 A. Yes. Okay. I started work with Barnardo's [REDACTED]

6 Q. Yes.

7 A. I was there for [REDACTED] years. I think it's safe to say
8 that during that period I personally never met
9 an adviser in a professional capacity or an official
10 capacity. I would have been aware that one or two of
11 the advisers visited the children's homes from time to
12 time, and when they were doing that, I would have been
13 made aware probably by the superintendent. I don't
14 recall the advisers writing to me saying, "We're going
15 to be visiting Macedon". Maybe they did, but I don't
16 remember that, but I would have been aware on occasions
17 that they visited, and I think I do recall on two
18 occasions writing to the Chief Social Work Adviser,
19 Mr Wilde, asking for feedback following the recent
20 visits to the homes. I never received any feedback,
21 because I don't think it was the practice at that time
22 to do so.

23 Q. The two people that you -- when you were discussing it
24 with me that you remembered are names that the Panel
25 will have come across from other modules, other homes

1 that we have looked at. I think you said Ms Mabel Hill.

2 **A. Ms Mabel Hill and Ms Kay Forrest.**

3 Q. You are the two people that you can, doing the best you
4 can, taking yourself back to [REDACTED], that
5 you can remember being in the homes from time to time --

6 **A. That's correct.**

7 Q. -- alongside the superintendent. So it may be it seems
8 inspections were not necessarily happening in that old
9 style and we had not yet got what would happen post
10 Kincora, but there was some involvement from the
11 Department --

12 **A. There was.**

13 Q. -- in the work of the Barnardo's home.

14 **A. There was.**

15 Q. The other issue that I want to ask you about is slightly
16 complicated, but we will try and work through it step by
17 step. In terms of setting the context for the period
18 that [REDACTED], and in particular the period
19 [REDACTED] the role of [REDACTED] in terms
20 of recruiting staff -- the Panel are aware that
21 **BAR49** [REDACTED] did three years, BAR24 did three years
22 between [REDACTED]. Between [REDACTED] BAR23 was the
23 [REDACTED]

24 **A. Uh-huh.**

25 Q. Then between the end of or middle of [REDACTED] and I think

1 [REDACTED], when BAR36 is appointed, there are a series
2 of individuals who perform the role. BAR7 acts up for
3 a period. [REDACTED] comes across from Tara Lodge for
4 a period. BAR24 comes back for a short period --

5 A. Uh-huh.

6 Q. -- while working out his notice I think from the
7 organisation, because he is there in [REDACTED], and we
8 will look at a particular reason about that in due
9 course, but in terms of staff generally where was the
10 social work at in terms of recruiting qualified people
11 to run children's homes in that period when [REDACTED] the
12 [REDACTED]

13 A. I think it's fair to say that throughout the province
14 during those years it was difficult to recruit quite
15 honestly any staff, but certainly qualified staff, into
16 the residential care service. Barnardo's nevertheless
17 had a core of people who had done what had been -- at
18 that time was the recognised qualification for working
19 in residential care. It was called the Certificate of
20 Qualification -- not Qualification -- CR... --

21 Q. CR...

22 A. -- the Certificate in Residential Care of Children and
23 Young People. That was the recognised qualification,
24 and we had quite a few people who were qualified in that
25 way, but beyond that we were committed to having a fully

1 qualified work force and appointing staff in residential
2 work who had the recognised professional qualification
3 in social work. It was easier -- well, it was easier to
4 recruit those people to fieldwork services, because they
5 didn't have to work unsocial hours. In fieldwork
6 services they were paid at a higher salary rate. So
7 Barnardo's adopted a policy of paying them the
8 equivalent of fieldworkers if they worked in residential
9 care, but it was very difficult to recruit suitable
10 people.

11 My recollection over that period -- and it's fairly
12 general, I'm afraid -- was that during BAR24's period,
13 that is [REDACTED] -- was
14 a relatively stable period in Macedon, partly because of
15 his management style and his ability both to staff and
16 young people. Then there followed a period when his
17 successor was there from [REDACTED] My recollection is
18 that during that period that we had quite a high staff
19 turnover. We were able to recruit some capable people
20 with potential. I don't wish to be unfair to anyone,
21 but I do think that period was less stable because of
22 staff tending to leave shortly after appointment.

23 Q. If I stop you there, BAR14. I know you don't want to be
24 unfair to anyone, but am I right in saying that, if we
25 just take this step by step, even though Barnardo's were

1 recognising and had a principle of, "We want qualified
2 staff", even though they were paying an equivalent rate
3 for residential --

4 **A. Uh-huh.**

5 Q. -- compared to fieldwork, which might not have been
6 reflected elsewhere, it was -- you still couldn't get
7 a fully qualified complement of staff?

8 **A. I don't know what the figures look like. We certainly**
9 **had a -- I think a higher proportion of qualified staff**
10 **than certainly any other voluntary home.**

11 Q. Yes. What I am getting at is even if that is so, and it
12 may well be on the material that that is the case, even
13 an organisation with that aim, taking those steps in
14 terms of money, it still at that particular time was not
15 possible to get a fully qualified staff.

16 **A. I think it increased considerably. It certainly was not**
17 **possible to get a fully qualified work force at that**
18 **time.**

19 Q. The particular point you make about [REDACTED], is it
20 fair if I say that some [REDACTED], like any
21 organisation, anyone running anything, are better than
22 others as it turns out, and the period in [REDACTED] the
23 leadership in Macedon may not have been as good as you
24 might have viewed it in the earlier period?

25 **A. BAR24 had worked all of his life with young people in**

1 a residential setting from the training school system
2 through to his time at Barnardo's. He had a lot of
3 experience and he was very good. The person who
4 succeeded him didn't have that kind of experience. It
5 was a very challenging time in residential social work
6 and it's fair to say at times I think he struggled.

7 Q. Looking at that, because obviously you want the best
8 person you can to run the children's home and make your
9 life easier amongst other things, but how difficult was
10 it to get a high quality leader, as it were, to head up
11 the likes of Macedon in [REDACTED]?

12 A. This is a period in the public service where there is
13 enormous potential for advancement, and naturally
14 people, if they wanted to move into mainstream social
15 work management, had those opportunities, mainly in
16 fieldwork services. There was a minority of people who
17 had the aptitude and interest in working in
18 a residential setting. So, yes, it was very difficult
19 to find those unusual people, and they were very
20 unusual.

21 Q. Leaving the [REDACTED] position aside, just
22 residential staff generally, even when you recruited
23 them in that period [REDACTED], from the
24 documents available it looks like quite a number of
25 staff would have stayed for a year or two years and then

1 moved on. Can you, looking back, reflect on why that
2 was so? Was that unusual to Macedon or was that fairly
3 typical of people getting jobs that they regarded as
4 better than even Barnardo's could give them?

5 **A. I think it's fair to say that there was a haemorrhaging**
6 **out of residential work into fieldwork services during**
7 **those years for people who were qualified to do so.**

8 Q. Is that because the availability of the fieldwork jobs
9 was increasing a lot?

10 **A. I think that was -- that was a big factor in what was**
11 **happening at that time.**

12 Q. I want to look with you, BAR14 -- you can remember and
13 have had an opportunity to look at some of the documents
14 around the [REDACTED] incident whenever HIA101 was struck by
15 three different members of staff.

16 **A. Uh-huh.**

17 Q. And you -- the Panel have looked at these documents
18 during the opening, and there was a memo written by you
19 which sets out your involvement, if we can look at 132,
20 please. The central core of this, if I can summarise it
21 in this way, BAR14, is ultimately at some point in early
22 February a theft takes place of money belonging to BAR1.
23 It may be, looking at the punishment book and one of the
24 entries, that money was also taken from another member
25 of staff who engaged in the punishments, but at some

1 later date from the theft itself it was decided that
2 HIA101 was responsible, and as it turns out from the
3 flow of material it may well be ultimately he was
4 responsible, but it appears that three different members
5 of staff who were involved in so BAR35, who
6 was [REDACTED], BAR1 and [REDACTED], each
7 struck him with a wooden spoon on different parts of his
8 body on the same day but at different times without any
9 planning between them to do with his stealing.

10 **A. Uh-huh.**

11 Q. This may have been -- there may have been history to
12 that particular type of behaviour.

13 It appears that that came to the knowledge of BAR7,
14 who was the [REDACTED], and she then brings
15 that to you, and there may also as part of it have been
16 his, as in HIA101's, granny was aware from him
17 complaining to her that he had been hit and she wanted
18 to see you. It appears that you prepare this minute
19 then setting out an incident report, as it were, what
20 you were being told had happened, and then you set out
21 -- if we scroll down, please, you can see HIA101 is
22 questioned about the incident. There is a partial
23 admission and then an admission and then a retraction
24 and so on. If we scroll down, please, we can see that
25 you recognise here:

1 "In addition to being physically punished HIA101 was
2 not allowed to go to his grandmother's for the weekend
3 and BAR7 had said she wanted him -- wanted to keep him
4 at Macedon in order to try to sort out the matter and
5 that it was not necessarily intended as a punishment."

6 Then there is reference to BAR8 having bought him
7 a bicycle and the potential mixed message out of the use
8 of that bicycle. Then the reference to visiting the
9 grandmother and the grandmother being unhappy about that
10 when BAR8 visited her.

11 Then you identify the issues arising:

12 "The reason for the use of physical punishment in
13 this incident is unclear. While a slap with the hand on
14 a younger child may be allowed, the use of a wooden
15 spoon on a child of HIA101's age is not acceptable. He
16 was punished approximately two weeks after the alleged
17 event and therefore his punishment lacked immediacy and
18 was inappropriate in relation to the offence which he
19 accepted responsibility for."

20 That was the first issue. The second issue:

21 "Three members of staff punished HIA101 it appears
22 without consultation with each other or without
23 reference to the superintendent. Two of the members of
24 staff involved are experienced residential social
25 workers and one was personally involved in the incident.

1 Their response to HIA101 did not arise out of any
2 sustained provocation and is completely indefensible."

3 Third issue:

4 "Another measure was suggested by BAR7, the repaying
5 of the money effectively over time. It seems to me" --
6 and this is you, BAR14, saying -- "It seems to me this
7 was the only form of punishment which **HIA101** was liable
8 for and in the circumstances it was the only sensible
9 one."

10 Then reference to his granny and visiting his granny
11 and that she should have had it discussed with her,
12 because that was likely to produce a greater chance of
13 getting to the bottom of what had occurred, but it
14 wasn't discussed with her. She raised the matter with
15 staff. Then you recognise at 5:

16 "Petty thieving is a pretty regular occurrence in
17 most children's homes and I would expect that staff and
18 children should have a common understanding of how
19 incidents are dealt with. They should not be dealt with
20 impulsively by the staff. On the contrary the
21 implications for the individual and the members of the
22 group if responsible individual does not own up should
23 be worked out with the children so that they know where
24 they stand. Any form of punishment must carry real
25 meaning for the children and this can only be achieved

1 if the rules of the group are worked out between staff
2 and children."

3 So you've identified a series -- there are five in
4 total -- of things you are not happy about about how
5 this was handled by the three members on the ground, as
6 it were, in particular. Then you set out the action
7 that you want to see taken:

8 "The details should be set out in a report prepared
9 by BAR7 for BAR24",

10 which she did do. Then:

11 "It should be discussed with the other members of
12 staff."

13 That does happen with BAR24 meeting with them
14 a number of days later:

15 "Staff must understand that not only were their
16 actions unprofessional, but that as they were in breach
17 of Barnardo policy, that this is unacceptable.

18 A note should be made in each member of staff's file
19 to the effect that the accident -- that the incident
20 occurred and that it has been discussed formally with
21 them by a senior member of staff.

22 It is not the intention to discipline the staff
23 beyond this, but it is important that they are made
24 aware that in this type of situation outlined above they
25 cannot expect the support of senior staff."

1 Now before I ask you about them, we can then -- we
2 see that BAR7 had also involved the police over the
3 theft.

4 **A. Uh-huh.**

5 Q. You then I think meet with the grandmother, and on
6 ██████████ then BAR24 meets with the staff. If we just
7 scroll down, please, to the next page. Yes. If we move
8 through to 146, please. So BAR24 has the meeting with
9 them. If we scroll down, please:

10 "The reason for my visit to Macedon was to express
11 senior staff concern for the handling of the incident in
12 general and the punishment administered to HIA101 in
13 particular.

14 I expressed some concern that three members of staff
15 punished the boy for the same offence, that it was
16 administered three weeks after the money had been taken,
17 and a wooden spoon was used, which was a breach of
18 Barnardo's policy. The three members of staff admitted
19 using a wooden spoon to punish HIA101 in a final bid to
20 deter him from stealing and they suggest it was done in
21 a retributive manner."

22 If we scroll down, please. So they dealt with the
23 point about it would have been beneficial to involve the
24 grandmother and they denied that there had been any
25 removal of food from him:

1 "After the formal meeting was over, we continued to
2 discuss children's and young people's acting out
3 behaviour, in particular stealing and lying, which seems
4 to be a major problem for some time at Macedon. Staff
5 went on to recall very vividly their experience during
6 the summer holidays with their group in [REDACTED] and how
7 their morale was very low. This was due to the upset --
8 spate of stealing by the children from the local store
9 and having to deal with the complaining shopkeepers."

10 The -- there are a number of issues then, BAR14,
11 that come out of this sequence of events. One is three
12 members of staff have behaved in an indefensible way, in
13 your own words, in Macedon in punishing in this way at
14 this time and using this implement to do it. Can you --
15 am I right in saying you don't recall -- you can see
16 from the documents what happened, but you don't yourself
17 recall this sequence of events?

18 **A. I certainly don't. I read this document, you know,**
19 **today for the first time. Nevertheless that is where we**
20 **were at at that time, and I suppose it is encouraging**
21 **that BAR7 and BAR24 handled it in the way that they did.**
22 **For me the -- while the detail is important, the last**
23 **paragraph I think is quite telling. The work that staff**
24 **were doing at that time was very challenging. It was**
25 **very difficult and at times very demoralising. It**

1 seemed to me that BAR24 correctly had admonished the
2 staff. A record -- they admitted it. A record was to
3 be made on their files and that was correct.

4 He then gave them time to talk through the
5 difficulties they were having. I have no doubt that he
6 continued to offer them -- offer them professional and
7 moral support. That is the way he worked, and I think
8 in the context of what had happened that was
9 appropriate, and I am glad to see that it's referred to.

10 Q. One of the issues that might come out of the material is
11 whether if all three of them independently of each other
12 reached for a wooden spoon, as to whether the Barnardo's
13 policy was being breached on a more widespread basis
14 than this particular incident. Can you recall being
15 aware of having to deal with breaches of the discipline
16 policy, the non-striking, if I put it that way?

17 A. Sitting here thirty-odd years later, no, I don't. I do
18 not recall the use of corporal punishment as being
19 a major issue in Macedon. I am not saying it didn't
20 happen or that staff from time to time didn't do
21 something like that. What did concern us a lot at that
22 time in the context of totally eliminating corporal
23 punishment was the problem that arises when more than
24 one member of staff decides to deal with the same
25 incident, particularly if they are allowed to use any

1 form of corporal punishment. It means the child gets it
2 multiple times. I mean, that is totally unacceptable
3 and extremely difficult to manage, but in answer to your
4 question, no, I do not remember it as being a major
5 issue. One would have to go through the punishment book
6 or the incident book and do a careful analysis to see if
7 there was a pattern.

8 Q. When you look back at this now, obviously this is [REDACTED].
9 I don't want to demean it any. It is use of a wooden
10 spoon and children in homes would have received the
11 wooden spoon after [REDACTED]

12 A. Uh-huh.

13 Q. Would you have anticipated any further action beyond the
14 level of action that was taken or do you regard that
15 certainly at that point in time as being an appropriate
16 way to deal with the fact that a member of staff used
17 a wooden spoon?

18 A. It certainly has implications for supervision of staff
19 and it really is important that managers look very
20 closely at any form of punishment and the circumstances
21 that precede it, that they do look at that carefully
22 with staff for supervisory purposes, for the protection
23 of children, and for learning purposes. That I would
24 have expected to be an ongoing process, and I would be
25 very surprised if it wasn't the case while BAR24 was

1 **involved.**

2 Q. But you wouldn't have expected them to be suspended or
3 sacked over that?

4 **A. Not for this incident. As I've said, I think they were**
5 **admonished. A record was made on their files.**

6 **Personally I think that was appropriate.**

7 Q. Then we come, BAR14, to an event in [REDACTED], which involves
8 BAR46 and BAR3 and BAR24. You have already made clear,
9 working with him, you have a high regard for him --

10 **A. Uh-huh.**

11 Q. -- and his work. This is a particular matter that we
12 are going to have to look at. If we look, please, at
13 BAR-4242, now BAR46 at the time of these events was [REDACTED]
14 BAR3 had worked in Macedon from [REDACTED] through to
15 [REDACTED] so a period of about [REDACTED]. The
16 Panel are aware of various members of staff both to the
17 police and then to the Inquiry talking about his guise
18 [REDACTED], [REDACTED]
19 [REDACTED], ultimately stealing from
20 staff. I am going to look at what you knew and what you
21 wrote in a moment, but it appears from this record that
22 BAR46 complained, if this record is accurate, to BAR2
23 that BAR3 had tried to kiss him. Now he seems to bring
24 that forward after BAR3 had left.

25 At some point BAR2 tells that to BAR8 and then after

1 some period she brings that information to BAR24. He
2 records that:

3 "As these reported incidents took place some months
4 ago, the member of staff concerned has now left our
5 employment. On considering the situation, in my
6 judgment any well-intentioned cross-examination at this
7 late stage might do damage to all concerned, especially
8 in view of the climate in the province at present."

9 I am right in saying, BAR14, BAR24 in 2001 told the
10 police he doesn't believe he ever told you about this.
11 You were asked in 2001 and you don't -- you told the
12 police you don't believe you were told about it and you
13 have said that to the Inquiry as well.

14 Barnardo's have accepted that this is perhaps, to
15 quote -- and I will come back to him for different
16 reasons tomorrow -- to quote Martin Ruddock:

17 "If there's a crucial moment when Barnardo's failed
18 to address potential child abuse, this is it",

19 because this is something that should have been
20 brought to your attention so that you could decide what
21 should be done about BAR3. Is that a fair assessment?

22 **A. I don't think it was brought to my attention, as you've**
23 **said, otherwise the report that I wrote on BAR3 to**
24 **Barnardo's Head of Personnel would have been very**
25 **different.**

1 Q. Yes.

2 **A. I am in no doubt, even looking at it retrospectively,**
3 **that it should have been brought to my attention.**

4 Q. I know that, given the view you had of BAR24 or do have
5 of BAR24 -- and you comment on this in I think your
6 third statement. I am not sure. I can't bring it up on
7 the screen yet. You make the point that you don't
8 understand why he didn't tell you. Is that fair?

9 **A. That's correct. There are other things that I don't**
10 **understand about it, looking at the note, because in the**
11 **first instance it appears that BAR2 got this information**
12 **and didn't do anything about it. Now whether he was**
13 **colluding or he had some other reason for doing it**
14 **I wouldn't know, but nevertheless there was a delay in**
15 **him telling BAR8. BAR8 then said, "BAR2 -- some months**
16 **ago staff member BAR2 told me that ..."** So before
17 **she --**

18 Q. If I can just pause you there before we move on, in
19 fairness to BAR2 there doesn't seem to be anything in
20 the document that implies he held on to the information.

21 **A. Okay.**

22 Q. It is suggested:

23 "BAR8 reported to me that some months ago staff
24 member BAR2 had said to her ..."

25 Now if that's right --

1 **A. Okay.**

2 Q. -- he only left in [REDACTED] This is [REDACTED]. It looks
3 like BAR8 might have received the information --

4 **A. Yes.**

5 Q. -- a number of months ago.

6 **A. Right.**

7 Q. But the point you are making about timing, you explain
8 BAR8 seems to have not passed the information on
9 immediately.

10 **A. Well, apart from timing, BAR2 didn't report it to BAR24**
11 **-- to BAR24 --**

12 Q. No, he seems to have reported it to BAR8.

13 **A. -- or to his -- or to his team leader. He would have**
14 **had a team leader. So that was his response to it.**
15 **Then there seemed to be a delay for whatever reason in**
16 **BAR8 telling BAR24 -- BAR24 about it.**

17 Q. Am I right did BAR8 -- although she was the [REDACTED]
18 [REDACTED] to Macedon, her office was in where you
19 were.

20 **A. That's right.**

21 Q. But were you in the same office? Was it an open plan
22 set-up or was she in a different ...?

23 **A. I was on the top floor and she was on another floor.**

24 Q. She was in a different part of the building?

25 **A. Yes.**

1 Q. It is not you are sitting beside one another. She
2 brings it eventually to BAR24 and he doesn't tell you
3 about it. You are saying of course he should have told
4 you about it.

5 You looked -- in paragraph 25 of your third
6 statement -- I don't know if we can yet bring it up on
7 the screen. Right. We will give it a try. If we can
8 try 1143. There we are. We can manage it. You look at
9 his last paragraph, BAR14, doing the best you can. You
10 don't know what BAR24 had in mind in making this
11 judgment, but you don't think he was referring to the
12 political climate or The Troubles in Northern Ireland.

13 "It seems more likely he had in mind the turmoil
14 that existed amongst residential care staff as a result
15 of the Kincora saga and the range of allegations
16 and disclosures that were emerging at that time in
17 a number of other homes. Residential staff felt
18 undervalued, mistrusted and low morale was widespread."

19 You make the point:

20 "Up until that time and for a further two decades
21 Barnardo's in Northern Ireland was untainted by
22 allegations of abuse."

23 You mean staff abusing children?

24 **A. Yes. Uh-huh.**

25 Q. "It is conceivable that BAR24 simply tried to avoid

1 implicating both staff and young people in the negative
2 climate of mistrust that was prevalent in many
3 organisations."

4 You then say in paragraph 28:

5 "I cannot fully understand how he came to the
6 conclusion that he did. Nor do I understand why he did
7 not make me aware of what had been brought to his
8 attention regarding BAR3. I am content that he made his
9 decision in good faith, motivated by his desire to do
10 what he felt at that time was in the best interests of
11 a young person."

12 In fairness to him, he, when he was speaking to the
13 police, if we just look, please, at 45... -- I think it
14 is 4526 -- sorry -- 4525, if we just scroll up to the
15 page before, he says:

16 "I can confirm that I wrote the report. I vaguely
17 remember BAR8 coming to me. At that point in time
18 I dealt with the incident and I felt it was the right
19 decision at that time. Kincora was on the go at that
20 time. I felt that it was important to record the
21 incident. I would have thought that when I made the
22 decision that that was the end of the matter. I have no
23 recollection of informing the Divisional Director for
24 Childcare, BAR14, or the police",

25 or indeed the Social Services, who -- in whose care

1 the boy was, but in addition to him, one of the issues
2 is, well, BAR3 has gone off, could be anywhere working
3 with children, and that opportunity to do something
4 about him wasn't taken and you weren't given the
5 opportunity to do something about it, although -- is
6 that a fair analysis?

7 **A. Well, th certainly is a consequence of it not being**
8 **reporting -- reported. Sorry.**

9 Q. But you yourself had written a memo, if we look at 5924.
10 You were referring to this, BAR14.

11 **A. Uh-huh.**

12 Q. This is the memo that actually predates BAR24's file
13 note by four days. The genesis of this -- I haven't
14 seen a document that explains how this memo comes about
15 and I don't know if you will be able to recall at this
16 stage. BAR8 has said in her police statement, said to
17 the Inquiry that she did come and talk to you about
18 BAR3.

19 **A. Uh-huh.**

20 Q. She said she didn't tell you about him doing -- trying
21 to kiss BAR46 or in her mind it was trying to get into
22 a bed with him in Dublin or get into a bed. Whether it
23 was in Dublin or not may have been a second occasion,
24 but she doesn't claim she told you that. She claims she
25 talked to you about his stealing money and general

1 demeanour. Can you -- have you any recollection of how
2 this file note came about that you would be writing
3 about him in this way?

4 **A. I am not absolutely sure on this one. It was standard**
5 **practice in Barnardo's when someone left that a file**
6 **note was made just to close the personnel file. Whether**
7 **this was that -- was -- was the final personnel note I**
8 **am really not sure, because it seems to have been**
9 **written three months after BAR3 actually left. I think**
10 **it is more likely that, having had a conversation with**
11 **BAR8, that I thought it was important, as she thought it**
12 **was important, to make sure that he couldn't be employed**
13 **again by Barnardo's or indeed any other similar**
14 **organisation. I think that is probably the explanation,**
15 **but I cannot be sure.**

16 **Q.** And in that regard, BAR14, you then set out that it had
17 come to light that he owed money to the petty cash and
18 taken the money to -- of children, pocket money.

19 "When these matters were discussed with him, he
20 acknowledged his responsibility, agreed to pay the
21 outstanding amounts. Having repaid the loans, he
22 resigned."

23 Is it likely that -- you are recounting here
24 somebody discussed with him the fact he had stolen the
25 money and it was repaid and then he resigned. You would

1 not have been involved in that --

2 **A. No.**

3 Q. -- sequence of events?

4 **A. No.**

5 Q. That's more likely to have been the superintendent?

6 **A. I would have thought so, yes.**

7 Q. "Since his resignation he has indicated a willingness to
8 return to Barnardo's."

9 So it looks like, however it has come about,
10 conversations had taken place and he has wanted to come
11 and work some more --

12 **A. Uh-huh.**

13 Q. -- and that he wants to continue in childcare, or that's
14 the impression you got from it. You then draw attention
15 to a number of other matters of concern that explain why
16 you would not be prepared to re-employ BAR3 in any
17 position. You describe his effeminate manner:

18 "One is inclined to the view that he is most
19 certainly homosexual. This was never a problem as far
20 as his work was concerned except that children made
21 reference. Following his resignation, there was some
22 evidence that he brought alcohol to the premises. In
23 addition to borrowing money referred to above it is
24 known he borrowed a large sum of money from one member
25 of staff and this wasn't repaid."

1 It sounds like actually from speaking to BAR7 there
2 may have been more than one member of staff he had
3 borrowed or tried to borrow money from.

4 "It is recognised" -- I don't know whether this is
5 something you were told about him as opposed to you
6 knowing it -- "BAR3 had the ability to work through
7 difficult experiences with the children and there was
8 never any doubt as to his childcare ability. He
9 appeared to be supportive to staff, but tended to become
10 involved in their personal lives. Having done this, he
11 tended to work on these for the purposes of gaining
12 their confidence. I have grave doubts as to BAR3's
13 reliability and certainly would not recommend him for
14 a position of trust or of any post in a social work
15 setting."

16 Would it be fair to say that's very strong language
17 from you, looking back at [REDACTED]

18 **A. I don't think it is strong language. I think it's**
19 **factual, I think it's specific, and my clear intention**
20 **I think in writing it was to make sure that this man**
21 **could not be employed again.**

22 **Q.** That's what I mean by "strong". I don't mean you used
23 language that's intemperate. I mean that you're
24 basically doing what you can as far as writing in your
25 organisation is concerned. He is never going to work in

1 Barnardo's again.

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. In terms of whether it should have got beyond Barnardo's
4 at this -- based on what you knew -- he has obviously
5 been taking money from the kids' pocket money, but he
6 has paid it back.

7 **A. Uh-huh.**

8 Q. Would that have been why the police would not
9 necessarily have been spoken to about him in the sense
10 that he'd done -- he had done the act of taking the
11 money, but he repaid it, and that was the end of it?

12 **A. I think if he repaid the petty cash, Barnardo's wouldn't**
13 **have taken it to the police. The money that he took --**
14 **allegedly received from other people, individuals, it**
15 **would be a matter for them how they proceeded with that.**
16 **I don't think there was anything -- on the basis of what**
17 **I have written there I don't think there is anything**
18 **there which would have caused us to think about going to**
19 **the police at that time.**

20 Q. And in fairness to you the point you are making is, "If
21 I had been told that he had approached a boy, tried to
22 kiss him or tried to get into his bed, this memo would
23 have looked totally different from it does"?

24 **A. Well, that information would have been contained in it,**
25 **to say the least.**

1 Q. And it's also unlikely, is it not, that you would be
2 saying:

3 "He had the ability to work through difficult
4 experiences with the children. There was never any
5 doubt as to his childcare ability"?

6 That's not a phrase you would be likely to use if
7 you had been told he had actually tried to kiss one of
8 the children?

9 **A. Had I had information, there would have been a dedicated**
10 **paragraph to it. I'm quite sure it would have been**
11 **discussed with someone at Barnardo's headquarters and**
12 **other action would have followed.**

13 Q. I am not sure -- if we scroll down -- sometimes on the
14 memos they have -- if we scroll up again -- there is
15 maybe no cc. This document is just -- oh, yes, there
16 is. It's -- you are sending it to or copying in the
17 London personnel, if I can put it that way.

18 **A. Yes, yes.**

19 Q. There are a couple more matters, but it may be we could
20 pick those up --

21 CHAIRMAN: We will take a short break at this stage. We'll
22 rise for ten minutes.

23 (3.55 pm)

24 (Short break)

25 (4.10 pm)

1 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

2 MR AIKEN: BAR14, before the break we were looking at BAR3
3 in the context of BAR24's memo and then your own memo
4 around [REDACTED]. There's one more matter relating to
5 him I am going to mention to you. We talked about it
6 beforehand. It came up in BAR7's evidence yesterday,
7 and I just want to allow you to confirm what you
8 remember about this.

9 She was explaining that she wasn't comfortable about
10 BAR3, like others it seems, and he had asked to take
11 a group of children in the minibus somewhere, and she
12 explained that at that stage the superintendent had to
13 fill in a form and confirm they had checked the driving
14 licence of the member of staff to make sure it was
15 proper to allow them to go. She explained that she had
16 asked him to produce his licence and he hadn't done that
17 and then he had gone over her head to you and spoken to
18 you, and whatever was said, the result of it was she
19 came back to him -- he came back to her and said, "BAR14
20 said it is okay. I can take them", and she then says
21 she spoke to you about it and you told her it was okay,
22 that he could go ahead and take them, even though he
23 hadn't produced his licence.

24 I was asking you earlier do you remember anything
25 about BAR7 being in touch with you about BAR3 and being

1 unhappy about this driving licence issue and him getting
2 permission?

3 **A. I have absolutely no recollection of that. It doesn't**
4 **make sense to me. Barnardo's insurance would have been**
5 **invalidated had he been allowed to drive without**
6 **a licence, but I have no recollection.**

7 Q. The last issue that I want to deal with tonight relates
8 to HIA516. I know you remember the [REDACTED] children and
9 you were describing to me earlier their behaviour was
10 amongst the most difficult that you recall Barnardo's
11 having to deal with in your time. Is that a fair
12 assessment?

13 **A. Yes. I think that's fair comment.**

14 Q. It's his involvement with a [REDACTED] called then
15 BAR12 or BAR12. The Panel have looked at the material
16 relating to this and there is a file note from you in
17 [REDACTED] if we look at 156, please, and it appears
18 that BAR8 was asking you how should she deal with
19 in [REDACTED] wanting to set up a trust fund, and it
20 looks like you discussed it with somebody called
21 [REDACTED] about how to do that. Now it is not
22 specific at this point relating to BAR12. Had that type
23 of thing happened before, organisations or groups
24 wanting to donate money in a particular way to children?

25 **A. Well, I certainly don't remember anything of this order**

1 **where someone wished to set up a trust in the interests**
2 **either of a particular home or certainly a particular**
3 **child. I would have thought it was fairly unusual.**
4 **I don't actually remember the event.**

5 Q. What then seems to happen -- I was asking you -- there's
6 a sequence of events where in [REDACTED] -- so you
7 would still have been [REDACTED] at that point -- then
8 [REDACTED], now [REDACTED], who was I think
9 the [REDACTED] at Tara Lodge at the time --

10 **A. Uh-huh.**

11 Q. -- was asked to do and carry out a befriending
12 assessment, even though in the document we looked at she
13 explained you normally do the assessment before there is
14 any contact --

15 **A. Uh-huh.**

16 Q. -- or before it gets established whereas the contact was
17 already established between BAR12 and HIA516. I was
18 asking you: do you remember having any involvement in
19 saying, [REDACTED], will you do a befriending assessment
20 here so we can look at this?"

21 **A. No. I read the papers today for the first time**
22 **I believe. I have no recollection of that at all.**

23 Q. And it seems then that during the months of [REDACTED]
24 [REDACTED] this was kept under review and it
25 ultimately led to Barnardo's telling BAR12 he couldn't

1 have any further contact with HIA516. There is detailed
2 reports, but I am right in saying you don't yourself
3 remember any involvement you had with any of those
4 events?

5 **A. I certainly remembered the name when you mentioned it to**
6 **me today, but I don't remember the detail, and I don't**
7 **remember it being terminated. It's quite possible I had**
8 **some involvement, but I don't see anything being copied**
9 **to me. I have no recall on this.**

10 Q. No. In fairness, if we look at letters, just so you
11 can -- you pointed that out to me, that it doesn't look
12 like they were copied to you. We look at 157, please,
13 this is the letter in [REDACTED] which is setting
14 conditions on the continued involvement between BAR12
15 and HIA516. You can see at the bottom it is authored by
16 **BAR111**, who is then in post, and it is copied to
17 BAR36, BAR9, [REDACTED], and then copied
18 into the APSW in the Eastern Health & Social Services
19 Board. So it looks like **BAR111** was dealing with
20 it.

21 **A. Yes.**

22 Q. Whether he had any conversation with you about it you
23 don't remember, but he appears to have been taking it
24 forward.

25 Then if we look at 158, please, he is setting up

1 a meeting to have discussion about the fact the
2 conditions haven't been met, and again it doesn't seem
3 to be involving you.

4 If we look at the last one at 16113, this is the
5 letter telling him that the contact has to be
6 terminated. If we scroll down, again it doesn't seem to
7 relate to you.

8 Am I right in saying that at this point, at the time
9 that this is happening, the befriending assessment, the
10 letter regulating conditions, then the meeting and
11 terminating the relationship, there's no suggestion at
12 that point of any impropriety by BAR12, so it's dealt
13 with on the basis of what is known -- I am right in
14 saying that at that point in time children in care
15 having a befriender was seen as a positive or
16 potentially a positive thing. It wasn't something to be
17 discouraged.

18 **A. No. I think that -- I mean, it was unusual for it to be**
19 **done in this order. Normally the process would take**
20 **place of approval or vetting before the relationship was**
21 **established. So in that sense it was very unusual, but**
22 **it does seem to me that it had been given very thorough**
23 **consideration by both Barnardo's senior staff and the**
24 **senior staff of the North & West Belfast District. So**
25 **there was consultation. I think it was probably well**

1 **handled.**

2 Q. In fairness, it would have -- it came about by, just
3 picking that point up for you, HIA516 had been
4 absconding and this particular had
5 returned him on a number of occasions.

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. So that seems to have been the genesis of it, but the
8 relationship seems to have begun in the early part of
9 ██████ and then the befriending is done -- the assessment
10 is done in ██████, but you yourself don't recall having
11 any involvement in this that you recollect?

12 **A. I certain don't remember any involvement other than the**
13 **name, and in that there is no evidence of my having seen**
14 **the documents, there's nothing to prompt my memory on**
15 **it, no.**

16 Q. Okay. What I am going to do then, obviously there's the
17 Macedon Police Inquiry and that results then in a review
18 being conducted by Barnardo's, which I am going to talk
19 to you about. You have a third statement. We are going
20 to leave that until tomorrow, BAR14 --

21 **A. Thank you.**

22 Q. -- I think in fairness to you so that what you have had
23 to say can be reflected on rather than a reflex response
24 to it from everyone who is reading it today.

25 **A. Thank you.**

1 Q. It is the nature of IT I am afraid. It didn't come
2 through. So if we -- unless the Panel want to ask
3 anything, if they want to leave that until tomorrow, if
4 we leave it there for this evening, and I will see you
5 again tomorrow to finish this off.

6 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We will reserve any questions we may have
7 until tomorrow. Can we start promptly at 10 o'clock
8 tomorrow? Is that convenient to you, BAR14?

9 **A. It is. Thank you.**

10 CHAIRMAN: Yes, because tomorrow looks like being a fairly
11 busy day.

12 MR AIKEN: Yes.

13 (4.25 pm)

14 (Inquiry adjourned until 10 o'clock tomorrow morning)

15 --ooOoo--

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I N D E X

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

WITNESS BAR14 (called)2
Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY2