
HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE INQUIRY

being heard before:

SIR ANTHONY HART (Chairman)

MR DAVID LANE

MS GERALDINE DOHERTY

held at
Banbridge Court House
Banbridge

on Monday, 8th February 2016

commencing at 10.00 am

(Day 183)

MS CHRISTINE SMITH, QC and MR JOSEPH AIKEN appeared as
Counsel to the Inquiry.

1 Monday, 8th February 2016

2 (10.00 am)

3 Opening remarks by CHAIRMAN

4 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen, and welcome
5 to this, the 183rd day of the Inquiry's public sittings.
6 This morning we intend to commence our consideration of
7 the Training School for Girls at Middletown, Co. Armagh,
8 which was known as St. Joseph's, run by the religious
9 order known as the Congregation of the Sisters of
10 St. Louis. In a moment I will ask Ms Smith, QC, Senior
11 Counsel to the Inquiry, to open this module.

12 Before I do so, can I just make two routine, but
13 important, points? The first is -- and these are for
14 the benefit of those who have not attended our sessions
15 before -- if you have a mobile phone, please ensure that
16 it is either turned off or placed on "Silent"/"Vibrate",
17 and, secondly, in the course of this morning's opening
18 perhaps and certainly later in the proceedings those
19 people referred to who have been given designations will
20 often be referred to by their ordinary names for ease of
21 reference here in the chamber. Those names cannot be
22 used outside the Inquiry chamber in any circumstances
23 unless the person concerned has formally waived their
24 anonymity.

25 Now, Mr Hamill, you have an appearance to give.

1 MR HAMILL: Thank you, Mr Chairman. Members of the Inquiry,
2 I appear for the Sisters of St. Louis instructed by
3 Carson McDowell and attended by solicitors Orlagh
4 O'Neill and Claire Harmer.

5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Hamill.

6 Yes, Ms Smith.

7 Opening statement by COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

8 MS SMITH: Good morning, Chairman, Panel Members, ladies and
9 gentlemen. As you just said, Chairman, we are going to
10 start to look at St. Joseph's, Middletown in Co. Armagh.
11 At the outset of Module 7 last September I outlined the
12 relevant legislative provisions -- those provisions
13 relevant to the operation of training schools during the
14 period covered by the Inquiry's terms of reference.
15 I do not propose to repeat them again.

16 Further, in the course of that module the Inquiry
17 has heard evidence from witnesses from the core
18 participants which will be useful in considering what
19 you will hear about St. Joseph's and how it operated.

20 The Inquiry will recall that in the case of the
21 Catholic training schools while the Ministry of Home
22 Affairs, and subsequently the Northern Ireland Office,
23 was responsible for the regulation of a training school,
24 the day-to-day management of the institution fell to the
25 congregation in charge.

1 This is the first time that the Inquiry has looked
2 at a home run by the Sisters of St. Louis. So I will
3 say a little about the history of the congregation and
4 the history of St. Joseph's itself.

5 The origins of the Sisters of St. Louis can be
6 traced back to 1797 to Turkenstein near Strasbourg when
7 three people, Abbe Louis Joseph Colmar, Marie Madeline
8 Louise Humann and Therese Brek, signed a spiritual act
9 of union whereby, according to the Sisters of St. Louis
10 website, they promised to remain united together in the
11 heart of Christ until death to fulfil Christ's prayer.

12 In 1842 a priest named Louis Bautain, influenced by
13 this trio's spiritual path, officially founded The
14 Institute of St. Louis outside Paris to promote
15 Christian education for young people. The Institute of
16 Men and Women was approved by Rome in July 1844, but by
17 1850 the priests disbanded, leaving the Sisters
18 remaining in the Order.

19 In 1859 the first Irish foundation was established
20 by Mother Genevieve in Monaghan at the request of the
21 Bishop of Clogher, and two years later they separated
22 from France on his orders, as he did not wish for them
23 to be governed from there.

24 The Irish and French institutes expanded separately
25 across Ireland and France. In 1903 the first Belgian

1 foundation was established by the French institute and
2 in 1912 the first English foundation was established
3 from Ireland. By the end of the Second World War
4 numbers in the French institute had declined
5 significantly and in 1952 it amalgamated with the
6 St. Louis Institute in Ireland.

7 In preparation for this module the Inquiry has
8 received helpful statements from Fionnuala McAndrew,
9 which can be seen at SJM324 to 331, on behalf of the
10 Health & Social Care Board and Karen Pearson on behalf
11 of the Department of Justice, which is at SJM344 to 411.
12 The joint departmental statement provided to the Inquiry
13 by Ms Pearson and Dr Hilary Harrison in Module 7 at
14 SPT1723 to 1998 is also relevant to this module.

15 Sister Canice Durkan provided a statement on behalf
16 of the congregation in response to a rule 9 request from
17 the Inquiry. Her statement can be found at SJM22714 to
18 22919. I found it of particular assistance in preparing
19 my opening remarks.

20 St. Joseph's was originally an industrial school and
21 orphanage and dates back to 1881. It was, in fact, the
22 second industrial school in Ireland, and while it mainly
23 admitted Ireland (sic) from the nine counties comprising
24 the province of Ulster, it also took in children from
25 Dublin and Carlow. Prior to partition the facilities

1 offered on the site expanded to include a boarding
2 school and a primary school as well as the industrial
3 school and an orphanage. After 1922 no further children
4 were admitted from the Republic of Ireland.

5 Before 1952, when St. Joseph's operated as
6 an orphanage, both the orphanage and primary school were
7 housed in one building with the classrooms downstairs
8 and the dormitories upstairs. In 1946 the Order closed
9 the boarding school, and in 1950, after the passage into
10 law of the Children and Young Persons (Northern Ireland)
11 Act 1950, the Ministry of Home Affairs invited the Order
12 to have St. Joseph's registered as a training school.
13 That was done in 1952.

14 A useful note on the establishment of St. Joseph's
15 as a training school can be seen at SJM26372. If we
16 could put that page up, please. It is 26372. You will
17 see here that it sets out:

18 "1950 Act establishing training school and remand
19 home."

20 It says:

21 "In 1950 St. Joseph's became a training school and
22 remand home. Under this Act the Ministry was obliged to
23 set up remand homes and training schools which would
24 cater for Catholics and Protestants. The name 'training
25 school' was the new name given to replace the 1908 Act,

1 which designated such institutions as 'reformatories and
2 industrial schools'. In 1950 St. Patrick's, Glen Road,
3 St. Joseph's, Middletown, together with two
4 establishments for Protestant girls and boys, were in
5 existence and accepting young people from the courts.
6 In order to implement the Act the Ministry of Home
7 Affairs required two recognised Catholic institutions
8 within the terms of the Act. Both St. Joseph's and
9 St. Patrick's were invited to become remand homes and
10 training schools. Since they were already doing the
11 work, their agreement meant the registration of
12 St. Joseph's together with St. Patrick's and two
13 Protestant institutions by the Department and the name
14 submitted to the courts. However, registration under
15 the new Act had certain conditions. These are laid out
16 in the Act. The major changes were:

17 (1) no voluntary children could be taken in and the
18 schools could not refuse to take a child.

19 (2) since St. Joseph's was meeting a statutory need,
20 100% revenue expenditure could be met by the Department.

21 (3) a Board of Management had to be set up to act on
22 behalf of the trustees."

23 This note encloses some notes on voluntary homes
24 which highlight the difference. It goes on to explain:

25 "In 1952 training schools rules were drawn up and

1 this completed the establishment of training schools.
2 The management was vested with wide responsibilities.
3 Under the Act local authorities could not set up
4 a training school unless there was evidence of
5 a deficiency of bed space. Actually no further training
6 schools have been set up with the exception of Lisnevin,
7 which is jointly managed by the existing training
8 schools.

9 The Act decreed that a training school could be
10 closed by the Department if it failed to comply with the
11 Act. Since the trustees of the Catholic schools owned
12 the property, they could also withdraw from the scheme
13 on giving six months' notice."

14 It goes on to talk then about St. Patrick's and the
15 preparation of the new legislation in 1965 whenever the
16 1968 Act was being drafted and then passed.

17 The orphanage then closed once St. Joseph's was
18 registered as a training school, but those children who
19 had been placed in it remained until they reached
20 adulthood or were discharged and from then until the end
21 of the Inquiry's terms of reference one of those who
22 will give evidence this week falls into that category.
23 That's HIA178.

24 St. Joseph's operated as a training school and
25 remand home until 1995 following the passage of the

1 Children Order (Northern Ireland) 1995 the facility
2 became St. Joseph's Adolescent Centre and formed
3 separate units for those admitted for care reasons and
4 those admitted on the justice side. St. Joseph's
5 eventually closed in 2000.

6 If we look at SJM24699, please, we can see two
7 photos of the convent and school. It is not quite clear
8 from when these date, but the building with the cross at
9 the end would have been the chapel and the building to
10 the right-hand side of that in the top picture I believe
11 is the convent. Then the building at the bottom would
12 have been part of the school. If I have got that wrong,
13 I am sure that one of the members of the congregation
14 who gives evidence later this week will be able to
15 correct me.

16 Between 1952 and 1972 the training school was housed
17 within one building. There were three dormitories, each
18 accommodating eleven or twelve girls. Each girl would
19 have been placed in a dormitory according to her age.
20 There was, therefore, a dormitory for senior,
21 intermediate and junior girls.

22 In 1972 there was extensive reconstruction of the
23 training school, resulting in four individual housing
24 units. These had formal names but quickly became known
25 by all the girls and staff as Houses 1, 2, 3 and 4.

1 Each house usually accommodated up to eight girls, but
2 sometimes as many as ten were resident. House 1 was
3 a reception, assessment and short-term unit. Houses 2,
4 3 and 4 were long-term units. In addition, there was
5 a modern bungalow designed to be an independence
6 training unit and this was used as a hostel for older
7 girls to help prepare them for life after care,
8 although, as is clear at SJM3531, not all girls availed
9 of this facility. Only those girls who were unable to
10 return home and who would have had to fend for
11 themselves after leaving were given preference. This
12 page is part of a 33-page policy document relating to
13 St. Joseph's, which from internal content appears to
14 date from the 1990s, and may have been prepared in
15 advance of the move to becoming an adolescent centre.
16 I shall refer to this document again shortly.

17 The congregation also had an after care base in
18 Belfast, firstly on the Upper Falls Road and later on
19 the Glen Road, not far from St. Patrick's Training
20 School. There was also a network system of befriending
21 families, voluntary workers as well as collaboration
22 with voluntary agencies and women's groups.

23 The Inquiry has heard before about SJM22, who
24 brought girls to St. Joseph's from Nazareth Lodge and
25 Nazareth House. According to Sister Canice, this lady

1 appears to have acted in a semi-voluntary capacity from
2 the 1950s. Among other things, she helped to source
3 jobs and accommodation for the girls who were leaving,
4 and according to the Board minutes she retired in
5 October 1985, SJM24446. You will see there that it is
6 said:

7 "SJM22.

8 SJM22 retires officially in October. SR240 reported
9 that Cardinal Thomas O'Fiaich had recommended to Rome
10 that SJM22 be honoured with the Benemerenti Medal in
11 recognition of her long and faithful service to the
12 youth of the province."

13 The papal award was granted and a special mass was
14 held in St. Joseph's. If we look at 3434, please, you
15 will see that there was a special celebration on 15th
16 May, presumably in 1985, in St. Joseph's School,
17 Middletown, when SJM22 was conferred with the papal
18 award by the cardinal.

19 In later years St. Joseph's also had an intensive
20 care or secure unit, which could house two girls for
21 short periods, and was designed to provide secure
22 accommodation for children who absconded or who were
23 potentially a risk to themselves or others. The unit
24 was 100% funded by the Northern Ireland Office and was
25 built in accordance with its blueprint.

1 We can look at some correspondence relating to the
2 intensive care unit. If we look, first of all, at
3 SJM1586, please, we will see this is a letter from
4 SR240, who was then manager of St. Joseph's, Middletown,
5 and if we can just scroll down through that, please, it
6 is directed to the Training Schools Branch in the
7 Northern Ireland Office. I think this actually may
8 be -- yes:

9 "The other area of major need is the provision of
10 a small unit, which we call loosely an intensive care
11 unit. This unit would be used as a temporary respite
12 for a girl or girls who may be emotionally disturbed,
13 suicidal or need safe space in a confidential setting to
14 express grief, anger, etc. We have a group of severely
15 disturbed adolescents, who indulge in self-injury and
16 self-mutilation and who at times need a safe, secure
17 environment for short periods. We have girls who are
18 the victims of sexual abuse and who require at times
19 a waking staff member during the night to help them cope
20 with their fears and nightmares.

21 There is, as you are aware, a growth in the
22 incidents of violence in all residential establishments
23 and we have evidence of this in Middletown also.

24 At present if a girl is seriously disturbed or in
25 need of confidential space, we are at times forced to

1 bring the young person to the convent for a brief period
2 or to use the classroom block, which is neither suitable
3 or safe.

4 What we have in mind is a small unit where a child
5 can be safe and receive individual support in a time of
6 crisis. It's main security will be the staff presence.
7 When the Board envisaged the building of a new
8 assessment centre, it had in mind the inclusion of such
9 a small intensive care unit as part of this facility.

10 It is the view of the Board that the provision of
11 a small intensive care unit is an urgent need, and
12 I have been directed to request an urgent meeting to
13 investigate the feasibility of setting up such a unit."

14 It goes on. It's signed by SR240.

15 Then at SJM1577 this is a response about a year
16 later from the Northern Ireland Office, agreeing to the
17 proposed unit. Second paragraph there:

18 "The need for an intensive care unit at St. Joseph's
19 is accepted by the DHSS, who support the proposal on the
20 understanding that the new unit will not be used to
21 provide secure accommodation as defined in paragraph 13
22 of the consultative paper 'Use of secure accommodation
23 for children in care in Northern Ireland' issued in
24 December 1986 or to restrict the liberty of children in
25 care in any of the ways specified in paragraph 15 of

1 that paper.

2 This Department agrees to the proposed new unit for
3 which there is provision in the 1988/89 PES and
4 an approximate cost of £40,000 has emerged from the
5 feasibility study. If you decide to incorporate the
6 second staff bedroom, this will add to the cost and
7 there will be in addition fitting out costs. Please
8 confirm immediately your accommodation requirements so
9 that ESD can be instructed to proceed to contract
10 stage."

11 According to Sister Canice, staff used the ICU at
12 St. Joseph's for very short, intensive periods of
13 assessment and treatment and when the behaviour of girls
14 could not be managed within the house environment. The
15 ICU had three bedrooms, two for the children who had
16 been sent there and one for the member of staff
17 allocated to stay with the child. According to the
18 statement provided there is no living memory of more
19 than one child being in the ICU at any time. It had
20 a living room, a kitchen, a dining area and a bathroom.
21 A member of staff always stayed with the girl, either
22 her key worker or another member of staff who was
23 familiar with her, and failing that, the task fell to
24 a senior member of staff.

25 Use of the ICU is referred to at SJM3529, please.

1 Again this is the policy document. If we can scroll
2 down, it says:

3 "The nature of this unit is seen as an intensity of
4 staff care rather than any form of security.

5 Admission to the intensive care unit may be
6 permitted by senior staff on duty in the following
7 situations:

8 (i) Admission of a new child after 11.00 pm or
9 during the night when such an admission might seriously
10 disturb the admission unit.

11 (ii) The admission of a long-term girl during the
12 night who is under the influence of solvents, alcohol,
13 etc.

14 In both cases the girls are to be returned to their
15 unit in the morning. Long-term girls who return during
16 the night should sleep in the hostel unless they are
17 a danger to themselves or others."

18 If we can scroll down, please:

19 "(iii) Admission to the intensive care unit may be
20 permitted in a crisis situation for a period not
21 exceeding 24 hours. The reasons for admission would be:

22 (a) Suicidal: there must be sufficient evidence
23 that the girl is in danger of seriously injuring
24 herself.

25 (b) So disruptive or unmanageable that she may

1 endanger others.

2 Only the Director or Assistant Director may permit
3 a child to be placed in the unit. In the case of
4 assessment children, permission must be sought from the
5 social worker. Time in intensive care should be for the
6 shortest possible duration. In the event of a period in
7 excess of 24 hours being envisaged a meeting of the
8 following shall be summoned immediately."

9 It is listed there who should be at that meeting.

10 "The referring unit must furnish the committee with
11 a full report outlining:

12 Reasons.

13 Plan.

14 Expectations.

15 Durations.

16 Review procedures.

17 Staffing and programme.

18 There are no permanent staff in the intensive care
19 unit. The onus of responsibility is on the referring
20 unit to provide the major input into any programme of
21 care."

22 The guidelines say that there should be:

23 "(a) Two members of staff must always be on duty in
24 the unit.

25 (b) Programmes of care are to be made on a daily

1 basis and presented to senior staff and girl in advance.

2 (c) These must reviewed each day.

3 (d) Programmes must be individual and demonstrate
4 that they are geared to meet the particular needs of
5 a girl.

6 (e) In addition to daily monitoring there will be
7 weekly monitoring of the programme by representatives of
8 the Board, the Review Committee, Social Services,
9 psychologist and unit staff.

10 Intensive care unit may in special circumstances be
11 used not as an intensive care unit, but as a facility
12 for independent training, mother/baby, etc."

13 In 1992 the Social Services Inspectorate regulatory
14 inspection report states that from its opening in 1990
15 until the inspection in July 1992 the ICU had been used
16 five times. We see that at SJM2151 at paragraph 8.
17 I think it is actually -- if we can just scroll back up
18 the page, it says:

19 "A small two-bed intensive care unit adjoins the
20 hostel building. This unit has been added to the range
21 of resources since the time of the last general
22 inspection. It is geared to meet the needs of seriously
23 emotionally disturbed girls for a very short period.
24 According to the school's policy document the unit is
25 described as follows."

1 I am not going to read it, as I have just done that:

2 "The unit has the potential to function as a small
3 secure unit, but is not operated as such. It is only
4 used in the following circumstances and with the
5 authority of the senior staff on duty:

6 (1) Admission of a new child after 11.00 pm or
7 during the night when such an admission might seriously
8 disturb the young people in the admissions unit; and

9 (2) The admission of a long-term girl during the
10 night who is under the influence of solvents, alcohol,
11 etc.

12 In all cases girls are returned to their own unit in
13 the morning. There are no permanent staff in this unit.
14 Should a girl be placed there, it is for the referring
15 unit to provide staff cover, which must be a minimum of
16 two at all times. This resource appears to be used
17 sparingly. There are only five recorded incidents of
18 use since October 1990."

19 It goes on to say:

20 "The unit may be used for other purposes ... It is
21 self-contained, which includes a lounge, kitchen,
22 bathroom, WC, etc."

23 It goes on then to describe other facilities on
24 site. There were also recreational facilities,
25 including a swimming pool, which was completed in 1974,

1 a gym and a general purpose hall.

2 A good description of the location and layout of
3 St. Joseph's can be found in the 1987 SSI inspection
4 report at SJM1511. You will see that:

5 "St. Joseph's is located about ten miles south-west
6 of Armagh city on the fringe of the village of
7 Middletown. The main road from Armagh to Monaghan in
8 the Irish Republic, which is about twelve miles from
9 St. Joseph's, passes through the village. The training
10 school occupies a large open site and is surrounded by
11 farmland. It stands unobtrusively behind a small wood
12 and is approached by a winding, shrub-lined drive. The
13 grounds close to the buildings are set out in
14 well-maintained lawns with young trees planted here and
15 there. The centre-piece of the site is the
16 three-storeyed convent of the Sisters of St. Louis,
17 which is finished in red brick and roofed with Bangor
18 blue slates. The chapel with its distinctive rounded
19 chancel is to the left of this building. To the rear
20 are garages and outhouses, an enclosed garden and
21 a small private cemetery. A statute of St. Joseph is
22 situated on the lawn at the front of the convent.

23 Complementing the convent and in juxtaposition to it
24 is the main school/administrative block. In the past
25 this contained dormitory accommodation for the

1 residents, but in recent years the interior was adapted
2 to provide school, office and cooking/dining facilities.
3 The main kitchen is on the ground floor and this
4 provides the midday meal for the young persons. Modern
5 kitchen equipment has recently been purchased and is
6 awaiting installation. There is a serving hatch through
7 to the dining room, which is bright and spacious.
8 Tables and chairs are arranged so as to provide four
9 place settings for each meal.

10 The main building also includes two classrooms,
11 a domestic science block, a library, and
12 an art/craft/pottery centre. On the first floor there
13 is office accommodation for the Director and the three
14 senior staff and a lounge. The administrator's office
15 is on the ground floor and this includes a small
16 telephone exchange. A portakabin to the rear of the
17 building provides an office for one of the
18 administrative staff and for the psychologists who
19 attend the school on a sessional basis.

20 To the left of the convent are the two-storeyed
21 houses in which the girls are accommodated. There are
22 two blocks, each comprising of two houses which are
23 linked together by a connecting corridor at ground and
24 first floor levels. The four houses are named as
25 follows:

1 House 1. La Sallette.

2 House 2. Lourdes.

3 House 3. Fatima.

4 House 4. Banaux.

5 Each house is a self-contained unit for eight girls
6 but can provide for nine or ten in an emergency. All
7 four have the same architectural features and interior
8 design. The ground floor accommodation consists of
9 a large living space, including a lounge, dining area,
10 kitchen and utility room. There is also an office and
11 store, two small reception rooms, toilets and
12 a cloakroom. There is an open coal fire in the lounge,
13 around which are placed easy chairs resting on a flotext
14 carpeted floor. The dining area has a table large
15 enough for the group of staff and children to sit around
16 it together for their evening meal. The kitchen is
17 small but functional with a serving hatch through to the
18 dining area.

19 A wide, well-lighted staircase leads from the front
20 hall to the first floor, where there are two four-bedded
21 rooms for girls, a staff duty room, two showers,
22 a bathroom and toilets. The girls' bedrooms are divided
23 into single cubicles and have fitted wardrobes, cupboard
24 space, a vanity unit, dressing table and mirror, a chair
25 and a bed. The large bedroom windows and the entrance

1 to each cubicle are curtained with material chosen to
2 match the duvet covers on the beds and to complement the
3 carpeting on the floors. The cubicle divisions stop
4 short of the ceiling, creating an impression of
5 spaciousness, and the walls are painted in soft pastel
6 colours. The spare bedrooms and a sewing/laundry room
7 are located along the connecting corridor between the
8 houses at first floor level.

9 The inspectors found the house units to be bright,
10 airy, clean and comfortable and tastefully decorated
11 throughout. Wallpaper is used extensively in the living
12 area at ground floor level and the walls have been
13 decorated with pictures, hanging baskets, plants, etc.
14 Television and radio/tape recorders are provided in each
15 lounge. The girls take pride in their own bedrooms,
16 many of which have been personalised with soft toys,
17 posters, pop memorabilia, etc.

18 On the ground floor between the Houses 1 and 2 there
19 is a small medical room occupied by the nurse when she
20 is on duty. It is also used by the medical officer when
21 he calls. The room is equipped with an examination
22 couch, desk, chairs and a locked filing cabinet. There
23 is also a regulation medicine cabinet with a secure
24 inner compartment for storing dangerous drugs. The
25 senior social worker (fieldwork) has an office on the

1 ground floor between Houses 3 and 4."

2 It goes on to describe the hostel:

3 "A modern bungalow situated on a slightly elevated
4 site to the rear of the complex is used to provide
5 independence training for girls who are preparing to
6 leave St. Joseph's. Known as the hostel, it can
7 accommodate eight girls and amenities provided include a
8 sitting room, dining room, a reception room, kitchen,
9 bathroom and toilets. In addition, there are four flats
10 comprised of a bedroom and sitting room with shared
11 kitchen and bathroom and toilet facilities. This area,
12 which can be separated from the main hostel, can be used
13 flexibly to accommodate a mother and her baby,
14 a particular girl or a group of girls, etc. One of the
15 flats is used by a senior member of staff who is on call
16 overnight."

17 It goes on to describe the recreational facilities
18 and the staff accommodation.

19 The basic principles and ethos which govern the
20 operation of a training school in later years of its
21 operation are set out in a policy document of St.
22 Joseph's, which is at SJM3519 through to 3520. It says:

23 "The only reason Middletown or any house unit exists
24 is for the children ... to meet the children's needs as
25 far as possible. We are here to provide physical,

1 emotional, psychological and social care for the girls
2 in our care. The ultimate aim of the girls' stay in
3 Middletown is to enable them to come to terms with their
4 problems, to slowly accept responsibility for their
5 future and to help them return to the community as soon
6 as is possible and safe.

7 Institutions can be dangerous in that a lot of
8 energy can be spent maintaining institutional
9 structures. We must be vigilant that rules, regulations
10 are not first made to keep the unit running smoothly.
11 We must never forget that for many of our girls
12 St. Joseph's is home -- the only home they have or are
13 likely to have for some time.

14 We will never be the home that the good nuclear
15 family provides, but if the overriding ethos of each
16 unit is one of love, empathy and genuine care, then our
17 intention in each girl's life -- intervention" -- sorry
18 -- "in each girl's life will be positive and hopefully
19 healing.

20 Equally, we must not live a pattern of institutional
21 life that is totally remote from the girl's background.
22 Each unit should be well cared for, but we should not
23 have what approximates to a middle class standard of
24 living which is unattainable when the girl leaves.

25 The major contribution each staff member has to

1 offer to the unit is that of her own unique charism and
2 talent. The quality and presence of each is of the
3 utmost importance. When on duty we must be open,
4 listening, using our initiative skills and of course
5 vigilance. As we are dealing with individuals with
6 various presenting problem and hurts, whose emotional
7 and social development have been seriously impaired, we
8 have to expect situations to arise whereby intervention
9 and speedy action may be necessary. Staff have to be
10 able to cope with heavy demands, accept ambivalence,
11 help the child express anger and accept misdirected
12 anger. Staff involvement with the child is not merely
13 to supervise and manage difficult situations and
14 circumstances but also to create an atmosphere of
15 understanding, affection and honesty. It is important
16 to be aware of mood changes in the group or individuals
17 or situations that could become dangerous or explosive."

18 The ethos then is to be:

19 "The environment should be one of warmth, openness,
20 acceptance and trust. Each unit aims to create a
21 progressive programme within a structured, yet flexible,
22 environment so that each girl can develop as far as
23 possible personal and social adequacy, enabling her to
24 work through her difficulties and face the reality of
25 her own individual problems. It is hoped that each girl

1 will achieve a genuine readjustment whereby she can lead
2 a normal life and be accepted by social groups at home,
3 at work and in the community."

4 It goes on to give details of how that ethos can be
5 put into action.

6 Staffing levels are set out in Sister Canice's
7 statement at SJM22719 at paragraphs 16 through to 18.
8 It is said:

9 "Staffing arrangements changed over time. Prior to
10 1952 our records confirm that staffing was made up
11 primarily of religious Sisters. There were lay members
12 of staff, some of whom were qualified teachers. I am
13 also aware of SJM22, who worked in a semi-voluntary
14 capacity for St. Joseph's as an after care worker
15 sourcing jobs and accommodation for our girls to assist
16 them when they were leaving St. Joseph's.

17 From 1952 onwards the numbers and qualifications of
18 staff for St. Joseph's was determined by the Ministry of
19 Home Affairs/Northern Ireland office. The inspection
20 report from '87 sets out that the staff at that time
21 would have included a Director, an Assistant Director, a
22 Deputy Assistant Director, senior assistant, five senior
23 residential workers, 19 residential social workers, one
24 senior field social worker and one part-time
25 nurse/residential social worker. A member of staff

1 would have slept in each house unit at night. Staff
2 worked a 39-hour week under a split shift rota. In
3 addition to care staff there would have been four
4 teachers, administrative officers, a cook, a caretaker,
5 a swimming pool attendant and a part-time domestic.
6 A nurse and medical officer would also have been
7 available.

8 All appointments and promotions to the staff of
9 St. Joseph's, including requests for unpaid leave or to
10 attend professional training courses, had to be
11 submitted in advance to the Ministry of Home
12 Affairs/Northern Ireland Office for prior approval."

13 I should say there is also in the bundle an internal
14 memo at SJM2036. This is from Miss Kathleen Forrest,
15 who the Inquiry has heard of frequently in its work.
16 I am drawing it to your attention as this is perhaps the
17 first occasion where there is a recommendation that
18 staff in an institution could be reduced. She describes
19 here the routine in St. Joseph's in 1956 when she visits
20 in February of that year. I am not going to go through
21 the routine, but if we can scroll down, please, she sets
22 out what the routine is, and the purpose of that is to
23 show the engagement of staff and what is required of
24 them. If we can scroll down through the next page, if
25 we can just pause there, at the top it says -- just if

1 you scroll up a little bit more, please. No. The other
2 way:

3 SJM 248 sees each girl
4 individually and gives out mark money.

5 Nearly all the girls have individual music lessons
6 several times a week so that SR 263
7 is occupied with ..."

8 I can't make the next word out:

9 "... and has a full programme with nine or ten girls
10 for lessons of 15 or 20 minutes or sometimes 30 minutes
11 every weekday."

12 Then it goes on to set out the staff programme of
13 duties, which include SJM 248 , who
14 at this stage was the manager of the facility; Sister
15 SR 264 , who was in the workroom; Sister
16 SJM 249 I think that might be SJM 249 in the
17 laundry; SR 263 , who is in charge of
18 music; SR 265 -- I can't quite make
19 that out -- SR 265 might be -- in charge of the
20 kitchen; SR 266 , who is the
21 nurse; SR 76 , who is PT instructress;
22 SR237, who was the clerk at that stage.

23 In the next paragraph Ms Forrest says:

24 "It is difficult to arrive at an exact timetable of
25 hours of duty as the duties for some of the nuns are so

1 split up. However, I think it is clear that they are
2 somewhat overstaffed at present. I gather that even if
3 we were to tell them to dispense with the services of
4 one member of staff, the probable outcome would be that
5 she would stay as an unpaid member of the community and
6 still be available. If they have to do without one,
7 they can best spare SR 76 , whose duties would
8 be spread over other members of staff. I would
9 recommend then that the staff be reduced by one,
10 preferably this SR 76 , and that the
11 matter be considered again next year, when SJM 248
 is due to retire. I would not reduce
13 it by more than one at present, as I think SJM 248
14 is really finding the work very exacting at her age and
15 yet I would very much deprecate her going before that
16 year. She still has the authority and is in the
17 position everyone ..."

18 CHAIRMAN: "... is the person ..."

19 MS SMITH: "... and is the person everyone looks to as the
20 boss."

21 Miss Forrest signed that on 13th February 1956.

22 Admission to St. Joseph's and what that entailed is
23 set out in the policy document from SJM3522 to 3529,
24 which deals with assessments and long-term admissions,
25 and also at SJM3537. Referrals were made by Social

1 Services either for assessment or for long-term
2 accommodation. Occasionally girls were admitted
3 directly by the Juvenile Court for offending, but as
4 SR234 points out in the statement she has provided to
5 the Inquiry at SJM162, most girls were admitted on Place
6 of Safety Orders. The five-week assessment period could
7 be extended twice before a girl was either discharged or
8 a formal Training School Order was obtained.

9 The daily schedule is seen in policy document at
10 SJM3548. Again this would have been in the latter years
11 of operation of the facility in the 1990s.

12 I am turning now to consider the question of the
13 complaints that the Inquiry has heard about
14 St. Joseph's. According to the statement of Sister
15 Canice Durkan, during the period of the Inquiry's terms
16 of reference approximately 1500 girls spent time in
17 St. Joseph's. The Inquiry has been spoken to by
18 thirteen of them. Eight complain about their time in
19 the school while five others make no complaints. Four
20 others have spoken to police or made a civil claim
21 against the Order. As Sister Canice points out, this
22 equates to 0.8% of former residents. All but one of
23 those from whom the Inquiry will hear this week were
24 resident after 1952. One person, as I said earlier, was
25 resident in the orphanage from she was a baby until the

1 age of 16. The Inquiry has also seen statements from
2 former residents that are appreciative of their time in
3 St. Joseph's.

4 The nature of the complaints made are similar to
5 those that the Inquiry has heard about in other modules.
6 The Inquiry will hear complaints of physical abuse by
7 nuns and other staff, humiliation by nuns and other
8 staff and bullying by other girls. In addition, three
9 women who spoke to police, but not to the Inquiry,
10 complained of sexual abuse by staff members.

11 In light of the complaints made to the Inquiry the
12 matters that will be of particular interest to the
13 Inquiry in this module are:

14 Whether discipline was maintained by striking girls
15 with any object;

16 Whether bullying by lay or religious staff was
17 permitted;

18 Whether there was a policy of separating sisters;

19 Whether children were expected to spend excessive
20 amounts of time scrubbing and cleaning;

21 Were children provided with and allowed to buy
22 cigarettes;

23 What preparation, if any, was made to prepare girls
24 for the onset of puberty: and

25 Was any child deprived of food as punishment for any

1 reason?

2 Sister Canice has answered some of those questions
3 in her rule 9 statement to the Inquiry and I am not
4 going to go over what she says in that statement, but
5 she will be coming to give evidence to the Inquiry in
6 the second week of this module. She also addresses
7 those complaints of which the congregation had knowledge
8 in her statement at SJM22725. I am not going to go
9 through this, but you will see that she talks about
10 which complaints they had -- they are now aware of and
11 sets out the details of those there.

12 The material obtained from police by the Inquiry
13 shows there were few complaints made to police by former
14 residents of St. Joseph's. I don't intend to open the
15 police material relating to a witness from whom we will
16 hear later this week, but will outline the other cases
17 of complaint from those who spoke to the police but have
18 not come forward to the Inquiry.

19 In 1998 one former resident, SJM58, contacted police
20 and complained that in the mid-1970s a female member of
21 staff, a houseparent, SJM4, had sexually abused her.
22 Her statement of complaint is at SJM4034 through to
23 4040. It details sexual abuse from when the girl was 14
24 until she left two years later. That involved digital
25 penetration and oral sex. She states that the abuse

1 took place in House 1 while the girl was there and
2 continued after she moved to House 4. The police
3 summary is at SJM4026 to 4027. The staff member, when
4 interviewed, admitted buying gifts for the girl and said
5 that each houseparent was known to have favourites. She
6 denied the allegations. Police investigations found
7 nothing to support the allegations from another resident
8 whom the girl believed might also have been abused. The
9 girl who complained was considered by police to be
10 unreliable due to a history of alcoholism and depression
11 and the police recommended no prosecution. The DPP so
12 directed on 28th January 1999 and that direction is at
13 SJM4013.

14 Another complaint that is in the police papers is
15 that of another former resident, SJM60, who alleged that
16 a male staff member who looked after the swimming pool
17 sexually abused her. The complaint was brought to
18 police attention in 2013 by the congregation when they
19 became aware of it. The letter is at SJM4079. If we
20 look at that, please, you will see that it is written
21 from the Regional House of the Congregation of St. Louis
22 and it is drawing to the attention the allegation by the
23 former resident to the attention of the PSNI. I am not
24 going to read through the letter, but they give -- the
25 details of the person making the complaint are given and

1 the contact details for the Order's solicitors are given
2 in that letter so that the police can make contact with
3 them.

4 The matter was not investigated as once the person
5 who made the complaint learned that the man in question
6 was dead, she did not wish to make a statement of
7 complaint to police.

8 Another former resident, SJM59, spoke to police in
9 2004 about her time in St. Joseph's from 1954, when she
10 was aged 9, until she left in 1961. Her statement is at
11 SJM4087. She alleged at age 9 she was force fed by --
12 I~am going to use names to make it clear -- it is SR237,
13 that's SR237, that she was physically abused by her and
14 by SR239, SR239, and she was sexually abused by a nun
15 SR238, SR238. Police inquiries suggested that SR239
16 left the Order, SR237 was by then dead and SR238 had
17 suffered -- was suffering from senile dementia and was
18 unfit to be interviewed. So that investigation ended.

19 The congregation has received only three civil
20 claims, none of which have been, as I understand,
21 resolved or in some cases pursued.

22 I am now going to say a little about what material
23 we have received in respect of inspections and
24 governance of St. Joseph's. Prior to legislation as
25 a training school in 1952 St. Joseph's was inspected as

1 an industrial school annually in accordance with the
2 inspection regime which operated pursuant to the
3 Children Act 1908.

4 The Inquiry has obtained a file of inspection
5 reports covering the period 1922 to 1954 from the Public
6 Records Office of Northern Ireland, which is in the
7 bundle at SJM1263 to 1491. If we look at an example of
8 such a report at SJM1264, this appears to be a report of
9 Dr Simpson, and Mr Jackson's initials are recognisable
10 there in the margins. You will see that the reason
11 I say it is Dr Simpson is it says:

12 "Amendments made after discussion with Dr Simpson
13 and EJ."

14 That's 13th December '49. I am not going to go
15 through the report, but if we can just scroll down it,
16 it gives an account of the general health of the pupils,
17 the medical arrangements, the buildings and equipment
18 and so forth.

19 Just pause there for a moment, because we can look
20 at a few other years. 1488 is an example from 1926.
21 You will see that it is quite a short inspection report:

22 "The health of the children has been very good, only
23 a few trivial illnesses. The medical officer made
24 fifteen visits during the year. The children appear to
25 be well-nourished, are comfortably and neatly clothed

1 and are apparently contented and diligent.

2 The premises in good condition, conduct of children
3 good, breaches of discipline have been few and the
4 punishments mild.

5 Prescribed books were well kept."

6 Now 1487 shows that this report was, in fact, sent
7 to the nuns:

8 "I am directed by the Minister of Home Affairs for
9 Northern Ireland to transmit to you to be laid before
10 the Committee of Management of St. Joseph's Industrial
11 School, Middletown the accompanying copy of the report
12 of one of the medical inspectors of the Ministry on his
13 annual inspection of the school on 13th instant.

14 Favour of an early acknowledgment of its receipt is
15 requested."

16 That acknowledgment was then sent at 1486:

17 "Dear sir,

18 I beg to acknowledge with thanks the receipt of copy
19 of report of medical inspector of the Ministry in his
20 annual inspection of this school on 13th inst.

21 I am, dear sir, yours sincerely ..."

22 That's SR 267 .

23 That's 1926. Again there are examples in 1931.

24 I don't know if we need to call these up necessarily,
25 but the report is at 1444, 1 and three 4s. It was sent

1 on -- we see that at 1443 -- and acknowledged at 1442.
2 The report from 1945 is at SJM1359. The 1948 report is
3 at SJM1327 to 1329.

4 Now the Ministry of Home Affairs and the trustees of
5 St. Joseph's entered into a deed of trust in order to
6 allow for the registration as a training school.
7 Trustees included members of the congregation and the
8 Archbishop of Armagh. After it was registered as
9 a training school, inspections were carried out by the
10 Children's Inspectors and medical officers of the
11 Ministry and then the Department, and extracts appear to
12 have been provided to the training school. If we could
13 look, for example, at SJM1294:

14 "I am directed by the Minister of Home Affairs to
15 enclose for your information a copy of a joint report
16 which the Ministry has received from Ms Forrest and
17 Dr Simpson following their inspection of St. Joseph's
18 Training School on 20th December."

19 Then if we look at the next page, which is 1297, you
20 will see that the report is here. It says:

21 "This report reflects credit on the management and
22 staff.

23 Matters to which specific attention has been drawn
24 by the inspectors are dealt with hereunder."

25 One of these names of children is someone who we

1 will hear from tomorrow. The issue is a medical one.

2 "In view of the statement that repairs have not been
3 effected Mr McRandall, the architect, might be asked for
4 his observations, having regard to our letter of ...
5 addressed to the Ministry of Education."

6 The entrance drive is discussed. We can scroll on
7 down through this, please, just. Electrical
8 installation. It is signed 31st January 1951.

9 At SJM1286 we can actually see the report for 1952:

10 "We inspected this school on 20th December 1952. On
11 that date there were thirty girls in the training
12 school, twenty-two junior and eight senior. Five
13 juniors and two seniors were admitted during the year
14 and six juniors and four seniors discharged. There was
15 no instance of absconding."

16 General health described, buildings, equipment,
17 activities, after care:

18 "The new system of after care by SJM22 appears to be
19 working well and the staff are well satisfied with the
20 results. SJM22 is able to visit the girls regularly and
21 also to visit the school so as to get to know her future
22 charges.

23 The standards of care and training in this school
24 remain excellent. It is evident that all the Sisters
25 have the children's interests very much at heart. We

1 inspected and signed the statutory books, which were up
2 to date. The punishment book shows a very occasional
3 record of two slaps or four slaps, but mainly punishment
4 is by deprivation of privileges. In general the
5 impression is one of firmness and kindness in the right
6 proportions."

7 Again it is signed by Dr Simpson and Ms Forrest.

8 1289 shows the following year. I think what I am
9 actually trying to show is that this -- the report is
10 compiled and then an extract from the report is sent to
11 St. Joseph's at this point in time in the 1950s,
12 although if we look at 1280 I think was the actual
13 report from 1953 again from Ms Forrest and Dr Simpson,
14 and again I am not going to go through that, but if we
15 look at the extracts that are sent, that's at 1274, and
16 if you can compare it, essentially the report is -- the
17 main body of the report is extracted from the
18 inspectors' report and sent on to the training school
19 without the actual introductory paragraph as to when the
20 inspection took place.

21 The 1954 report is at SJM1272 and the extracts that
22 were sent to the training school are at 1271. I have
23 taken a little time to show these as essentially they
24 are indicating how inspections were changing through the
25 period, and St. Joseph's is the first institution that

1 the Inquiry has looked at where we have managed to see
2 inspection reports right from the early period of time
3 of our terms of reference right through to the latter
4 stages.

5 After 1972 the Social Work Advisory Group, and
6 subsequently the Social Services Inspectorate, carried
7 out inspections on foot of an arrangement reached
8 between the Northern Ireland Office and the DHSS. What
9 was described as a first major inspection of
10 St. Joseph's, Middletown took place in 1987 and the
11 report can be found at SJM1493 through to 1559. Now
12 I don't intend to go through the report in detail, but
13 would wish to highlight a few of the paragraphs.

14 If we look at 1501, there are vignettes of the girls
15 resident at the time of the inspection here on this
16 page. What they show is that many of the girls were
17 presenting with very complex needs in the 1980s. If we
18 can scroll down to page 1503, at paragraph 2.7 the views
19 of the children were canvassed by the inspectors. It
20 says:

21 "The inspectors met most of the girls at some time
22 during their stay in St. Joseph's. Some of these
23 contacts happened informally, but others were initiated
24 by the young people, who invited the inspectors to come
25 to their house for a meal or an evening's entertainment.

1 Some of the girls were poor communicators, but others
2 freely gave their perceptions of life in St. Joseph's
3 and compared it with previous placements. Their views
4 were wide-ranging, but a consistent theme emerging was
5 their high regard for the St. Joseph's staff. Generally
6 they were content with the treatment they received in
7 the school and had no complaints."

8 The staffing complement is discussed at 1505
9 onwards. We'll look at paragraph 3.13. That's at page
10 1508, please. It says:

11 "There is a very low turnover of staff, which may
12 indicate a happy, cohesive and committed group. All of
13 the staff have an open and easy relationship with SR240
14 and other members of the senior management group. There
15 is a total acceptance of the children in the school.
16 The level of discussion and exchange that takes place
17 between staff, their availability to the girls and
18 concerns about sharing information indicate clearly that
19 the care of the child is central to all activities in
20 the school.

21 From the profile of the girls and their problems,
22 the level of emotional disturbance, the pain and
23 suffering that they have experienced through rejection,
24 sexual abuse and incest, and the fact that some other
25 residential settings had failed them, clearly show that

1 staff have to cope with a wide range of need. The girls
2 can be volatile with emotional outbursts, which
3 occasionally result in physical confrontations between
4 themselves. Throughout the staff manage to keep cool
5 heads, engender a sense of calm and never lose sight of
6 the basic concept that no child, no matter how
7 difficult, will ever be rejected or transferred to
8 another unit or elsewhere."

9 At SJM26596 we can see the conditions of appointment
10 of child care resident staff, which dates from some time
11 in the late 1980s. I am not going to go through it, but
12 it is clear here that the appointments, salary,
13 emoluments and duties of the residential staff in
14 St. Joseph's is set out.

15 If we can return to the training school report --
16 sorry -- yes, the training school inspection report at
17 paragraph 6.17. Unfortunately I don't have the actual
18 page reference for that, but if we go back to 15... --
19 it is probably in around 1512. Further on than that.
20 If we can get to paragraph 16.17. So maybe -- you will
21 see here as we scroll through it that it was a detailed
22 inspection report, going into the routine of the girls,
23 and then care of the individual is the theme in chapter
24 6 of the report. It goes through the individual details
25 of that, visiting social workers' reviews. If we just

1 pause there, please, at 16.7 there on 1522 -- 6.17 -- it
2 talks about behaviour and discipline. It says:

3 "Many of the girls come to the training school from
4 situations where their behaviour was regarded as
5 uncontrollable and where they were not made amenable for
6 breaches of discipline. Within St. Joseph's the
7 importance of maintaining a relaxed informal milieu is
8 emphasised and the development of appropriate
9 relationships is given priority. When good
10 communication with the girls has been established, then
11 it is easier for staff to influence them. Discipline
12 and order is maintained by:

13 (i) A framework in each unit which both girls and
14 staff clearly understand.

15 (ii) The care, supervision and vigilance of staff.

16 (iii) A unity between staff and girls and a mutual
17 support in implementing policy.

18 (iv) Contractual arrangements with individual
19 girls.

20 (v) A weekly meeting with the girls to assess
21 individual and group process.

22 (vi) Loss of privileges in terms of pocket money,
23 which is related to a mark system."

24 A simple contract is attached to the report. Then
25 it goes on to describe the marks system in the following

1 paragraphs.

2 Smoking is dealt with at paragraph 6.25, where it
3 says:

4 "Many of the girls in St. Joseph's are regular
5 smokers. The number of cigarettes they can purchase is
6 restricted only by the amount of pocket money they
7 receive. However, smoking is strictly controlled by the
8 staff and limited to five cigarettes each day. These
9 are issued at set times and it was apparent in some
10 houses the girls only received their cigarettes upon
11 satisfactory completion of their services",

12 which is the word that was used for chores in
13 St. Joseph's.

14 "The inspectors recognise that many of the girls
15 have acquired the smoking habit before coming to the
16 training school and that restricted smoking is perhaps
17 better than free smoking. Nevertheless it is
18 recommended that management should review the current
19 policy and practice in this area and give some
20 consideration to introducing incentives for
21 non-smoking."

22 The Inquiry has previously looked at the overview
23 SSI report from 1989, which is in the bundle at SJM2158
24 to 2243, and there are also other inspection reports in
25 the bundle at SJM2148 to 2157. We can see the 1992

1 regulatory inspection report. This is a report of
2 Wesley Donnell, and at SJM2152, if we look at that,
3 please, he notes that between June 1991 and January 1992
4 there were no formal visits from a member of the Board
5 of Management, which was a breach of rule 10 of the 1952
6 Training School Orders, and he also stated that
7 a separate fire drill record should be maintained. His
8 conclusions are at SJM2156, please, if we could look at
9 that, please, paragraph 22. He says:

10 "During the course of" -- just scroll down,
11 please -- "the twelve-hour visit to St. Joseph's the
12 inspector had the opportunity to meet with all grades of
13 staff, mingle freely with the young people and visited
14 most parts of the complex. He attended the daily
15 assembly, visited the young people in class, saw them at
16 lunchtime and spent three hours visiting them in their
17 house units in the evening. Much informal discussion
18 took place between the inspector and the young people.
19 It was evident that the young people had been prepared
20 for the visit. They knew who the inspector was, why he
21 was visiting and their right to see him privately to
22 raise any issues or concerns that they had. The young
23 people are at ease with adults and this much in evidence
24 during the visit. There was a desire to talk about the
25 house unit and show off their rooms. A relaxed

1 atmosphere prevailed in all houses, with the young
2 people engaged in a variety of activities. No matters
3 or complaints were brought to the attention of the
4 inspector.

5 It is concluded on the basis of the visit that the
6 usual high standards of care observed in previous
7 inspections and regular visits to the school continues.
8 There were no indications that any untoward practices
9 were taking place. The young people looked relaxed and
10 contented, related well to staff and appear to function
11 well as a group in the units. It is possible life in
12 St. Joseph's is not always so settled, but at least on
13 this occasion calmness and good humour prevailed."

14 We can see the 1993 general inspection report and
15 appendices at SJM2259 to 2292. This report is in a more
16 modern format that we saw in some other modules that had
17 come to be used by the SSI at the end of the term --
18 sorry -- at the end of the period of the Inquiry's terms
19 of reference. It sets out its conclusions
20 and recommendations at the start. If we look, please,
21 at 2262, it says:

22 "The first major inspection of St. Joseph's took
23 place in May 1987. At that time the Inspectorate was
24 impressed with the standard of care provided for the
25 young people. Since that inspection a number of changes

1 have taken place. In physical terms a new intensive
2 care unit has been provided and the educational
3 provision has been substantially refurbished. There
4 have been changes in staff, in physical provision and
5 the community of St. Louis has suffered in the loss of
6 SR 243

7 Despite the changes and the trauma,
8 St. Joseph's has continued to provide child care of
9 a very high quality and the inspectors are pleased to
10 note the maintenance of such standards.

11 The credit for much of the success of the school and
12 the standard of care provided rest with the staff. From
13 the Director and the senior management team to the unit
14 care staff a feeling of commitment to the children and
15 loyalty to the organisation is very evident. There are
16 a number of features that contribute to the effective
17 provision of care. Operational policies in the school
18 are straightforward, unambiguous and understood by all.
19 The members of staff at all levels have a sound
20 knowledge of the young people and a consistent approach
21 underpins the approach to care. The staff are
22 encouraged to take initiative and to accept
23 responsibility for their actions. A management
24 structure exists which directs practice and brings
25 maximum support to the care staff and to each other.

1 A major feature in the smooth and effective running
2 of St. Joseph's is the style of leadership, which
3 stimulates, gives confidence and brings together
4 collective effort. Good practice in the school depends
5 to a large extent on the unswerving commitment and
6 support of the senior management team. The inspectors
7 cannot stress too strongly the importance of this group.
8 The team of four staff provide an all-day, all-year
9 round cover to the staff and young people alike. The
10 inspectors had some minor concerns about the ability of
11 the senior staff group to continue with this burden of
12 management. Although some relief has been gained by
13 including the teacher leader on the senior staff roster,
14 the inspectors feel that additional ways may be needed
15 to be explored to spread the burden of pressure on the
16 senior team."

17 So it goes on. Just scroll on down. Then it gives
18 a summary of the recommendations, but it does say at
19 paragraph 2.6:

20 "The Social Services Inspectorate wishes to offer
21 their warmest congratulations to SR240, the Director of
22 St. Joseph's, upon being awarded the Order of the
23 British Empire for services to children."

24 I think the Inquiry might think that to say that the
25 report is glowing would not be to overstate matters.

1 In December 1994 a further regulatory inspection
2 took place and this time the inspector was Mr Walker.
3 That report is at SJM2293 to 2311, although there appear
4 to be two pages missing from the report. He also makes
5 mention at 2309 about there still being some difficulty
6 with the Board of Management members visiting each
7 month. The report also deals with matters for which the
8 training school rules make no provision. If we look at
9 that, please, at 2306, paragraph 7.3, he deals with the
10 use of the secure unit. He said:

11 "Every time the unit is used, even though the girl
12 may not be locked in, full reports are prepared, giving
13 details of the situation, who was involved and the
14 decisions that were taken. These reports were made
15 available to the inspector. This material is also
16 collated to give a picture of the use of the unit of
17 a year. In 1993 there were 29 admissions, of whom 14
18 simply slept in the unit without it being locked. Only
19 five of the admissions were for 24 hours or more. Two
20 of the five were for one day, one for two days, one for
21 three days and one for a week. The latter was at the
22 request of the court and Social Services. Since then
23 use of the unit has declined and there have only been
24 eight admissions in 1994. There had been none between
25 15th June and the time of the inspection."

1 He also deals with the issue of absconding, which
2 again would not have been something that would have been
3 dealt with in the training school rules from 1952.

4 I should say that having seen a staff report
5 discussing this particular report, great merriment was
6 caused by the fact that the training school in the 1990s
7 was still governed by rules that dated back to 1952.

8 If we go to his conclusions, please, at 2308, he
9 says:

10 "Although the inspector has known St. Joseph's for
11 about fifteen years and has been aware of the reputation
12 it has developed for work with difficult and disturbed
13 teenage girls, this comparatively brief visit was his
14 first formal inspection of the school. It was pleasing
15 to able to note that at least many of the positive
16 things he had heard were confirmed. The school has many
17 assets: a staff of both practitioners and managers, who
18 are dedicated to their task; a range of living
19 accommodation that is pleasantly domestic in style,
20 well-maintained and comfortable; school facilities that
21 would be the envy of many teachers in mainstream
22 education; and, perhaps most importantly, an atmosphere
23 that can best be described as peaceful.

24 This report makes a number of recommendations, most
25 of which are of a minor nature and largely made

1 necessary by trying to make the requirements of the
2 Training School Rules more relevant to the changed
3 circumstances today -- of today. It is hoped that they
4 will be helpful."

5 In addition to the governmental inspections --
6 sorry. I should say the Board of Management minutes
7 record an unannounced visit by SSI in 1994 by Mr Wesley
8 Donnell. That can be seen at 1262.

9 In addition to the governmental inspections there
10 was a Board of Management set up after 1950, which was
11 answerable to the trustees. There were between twelve
12 and twenty members of the Board, including trustees,
13 members of the congregation and local clergy, who were
14 appointed by the archbishop in his capacity as
15 a trustee. There were also lay professionals appointed
16 to the Board and nominees of the Ministry of Home
17 Affairs or its successor, the NIO. All appointees had
18 to be approved by the Ministry. The Board met quarterly
19 and there were various subcommittees that met more
20 frequently.

21 From records the Inquiry has seen it would appear
22 that the requirement of a member of the Board to visit
23 the school under Rule 10 of the Training Schools
24 Regulations was generally met apart from the instances
25 outlined in the regulatory reports that I referred to.

1 The inspection in 1987 recommended that records of such
2 visits be made and maintained, and it would appear that
3 recommendation was followed.

4 That leads me on to the issue of what records were
5 kept in respect of St. Joseph's. You will recall that
6 the 1950 Act and the 1952 Rules made thereunder required
7 that certain records be maintained. If we look at
8 SJM22720, which is the statement of Sister Canice
9 Durkan, she answers the question about what records were
10 kept by St. Joseph's. She says that:

11 "Records kept would have changed over time. The
12 school complied with contemporaneous statutory
13 requirements for record-keeping. Our records from 1972
14 onwards are certainly much more detailed than the period
15 prior to this. Prior to 1972 we maintained files on
16 each child with details of their admission and
17 discharge. Records of information St. Joseph's received
18 from the local authority prior to their admission and in
19 some cases medical reports, which would have been more
20 common where a child had a medical condition. We also
21 retained an admission book, a punishment book and from
22 1961 daily log book. We also have a book recording
23 Board of Management meetings from 1951.

24 From 1970 there was a daily log book retained and
25 completed by the staff each day. This records important

1 events, positive and negative, such as trip out and
2 where a girl might have absconded. A personal file for
3 each girl was maintained and was much more detailed from
4 this period onwards. These individual files would have
5 contained material such as pre-admission reports, copies
6 of Place of Safety and Training School Orders, birth
7 certificates, medical certificates, internal assessment
8 reports, care plans and ongoing recordings made by the
9 school's staff.

10 From around '77 to '95 comprehensive daily diaries
11 for each house were maintained. These were completed by
12 staff in the evening and would have recorded much more
13 information in relation to each girl. They were
14 an open, honest log of the events of the day, including
15 significant occurrences and changes in a girl's mood.

16 An admissions and discharge register was retained.
17 A major incident book was also maintained by the
18 Director. A daily register book was kept, indicating
19 the presence or absence of each girl in the school.
20 Licensing certificate books, relating to children
21 leaving St. Joseph's on licence, were maintained and
22 records of fire drills were also kept. The Director
23 also maintained records of correspondence with the
24 Ministry of Home Affairs in relation to all aspects
25 relevant to its oversight role."

1 The Inquiry has received diaries for each house,
2 some of which are essentially a note of appointments and
3 meetings relating to each child. Others are effectively
4 a daily account of behaviours and events within the
5 house, and the Inquiry will see examples of these when
6 we call witnesses later this week. The use of diaries
7 is discussed in the policy document at SJM3538 to 3539.

8 Now Sister Canice refers to the punishment book that
9 was kept on page 22721. The punishment book pages from
10 December 1922 through to May 1968 can be seen in the
11 bundle at SJM26852 to 26997.

12 If we could just look, please, at 26852, first of
13 all, you can see this is the cover of the book, which is
14 a large, bound document. If we can scroll down, please,
15 just to the next page, you will see that this dates
16 right back to 1922. The name of the child, the offence
17 that was alleged to have been committed. I think we
18 probably have to go then on to the next page to see by
19 whom was reported. The punishment that was given. We
20 will see here there is "dress of disgrace" as
21 a punishment. Now no doubt the Inquiry will obtain more
22 information on what that actually entailed when we hear
23 from members of the congregation. Sister Canice Durkan
24 doesn't explain this method of punishment in her
25 statement at SJM22722 when she describes how girls were

1 punishment (sic) and discipline was maintained in
2 St. Joseph's. If we could go there, please, at 22722.
3 I will return to look at the punishment book when
4 I refer to entries relating to one of our witnesses
5 later in the week.

6 At paragraph 23, if we can just scroll up, please,
7 to the preceding page there, it says:

8 "Between 1922 and 1952, which was prior to
9 St. Joseph's becoming a training school, the extent to
10 which St. Joseph's was permitted to administer physical
11 punishment was regulated by the Children Act 1908.
12 During this period physical punishment was administered
13 to children in St. Joseph's and recorded in a punishment
14 book."

15 The copy we have just been looking at.

16 "It would appear from the records that physical
17 chastisement took the form of slaps to the hand or in
18 rarer cases the posterior of the child or young person
19 using a cane.

20 From an inspection of the punishment book for this
21 period it would appear that the punishment administered
22 depended on the seriousness of the offence and whether
23 it was a first or recurrent offence.

24 The punishment was administered by the manager of
25 St. Joseph's, who was the most senior person in charge.

1 It was recorded in a punishment book.

2 It is my understanding that there was no statutory
3 requirement to provide reports of punishments
4 administered during this period to the Ministry of Home
5 Affairs. However, we have noted at various points
6 within the punishment book that the records appear to
7 have been inspected and signed by various individuals
8 whom I believe were members of the Board of Management
9 or Board of Visitors at the time.

10 When St. Joseph's was established as a training
11 school, physical punishment was regulated by the
12 Training School Rules (Northern Ireland) 1952 and in
13 particular rules 38-45.

14 In respect of this period St. Joseph's was required
15 to submit quarterly returns to the Ministry of Home
16 Affairs giving particulars of the corporal punishment
17 imposed.

18 Whilst physical punishment was permitted for part of
19 the period from '69 to '95, it is my understanding that
20 as early as '69, but certainly by '72, the management at
21 St. Joseph's decided it did not need to use physical
22 punishment as a means of discipline and a punishment
23 book was no longer used."

24 As stated here, use of corporal punishment ceased by
25 1969 and thereafter punishment was effected by reducing

1 marks, which led to loss of privileges. That again is
2 set out in the policy document at page 3535. The use of
3 physical restraint is outlined in the policy document
4 again at 3534.

5 Statistical reports submitted to the Ministry of
6 Home Affairs can be seen in the bundle from SJM1001 to
7 1207, covering the years 1950 to 1965, and they include
8 the lists of the girls resident, for example, if we look
9 at SJM1157, which is a list of the girls who were
10 present on 31st December 1953. 1160 is a return showing
11 from where admissions had come during the year. You
12 will see here that there were three admissions in that
13 year, two from Belfast and one from Derry. The girls'
14 register numbers are given at the side. The medical
15 officer's report can be seen on the next page, 1161. It
16 said:

17 "No deaths, no infectious diseases. Some children
18 had", something, "cold ..."

19 CHAIRMAN: "... slight ..."

20 MS SMITH: "... slight cold and ..."

21 MR LANE: "... influenza."

22 MS SMITH: "... influenza."

23 Thank you very much.

24 Something "... had crushed her arm. X-ray report.

25 Sprain of", something, "on shoulder -- of joints of

1 shoulder.

2 All other children enjoyed good health during the
3 year."

4 There were returns about deaths and discharges
5 I should say at 1163 and 1169 and again also about who
6 had been sent to employment. These were the kind of --
7 I am just scrolling through these quite quickly to show
8 this is the kind of documentation that the training
9 school was required to complete and return during the
10 year to the Ministry of Home Affairs.

11 Other documentation the Inquiry has received
12 includes minutes of residential and school staff
13 meetings between 1985 and 1988, and they are at SJM26525
14 to 26851. I don't propose to open these, but it is
15 clear that the 1987 SSI recommendations were made known
16 at a general staff meeting at SJM26533, which indicates
17 the level of communication that there was between senior
18 management and the staff in the home.

19 There are minutes that record meetings of the heads
20 of units, for example, at SJM26753 from September 1992.
21 There were individual house staff meetings. We will see
22 here that:

23 "Further to a general meeting SR240 pointed out that
24 the main emphasis in the year would be on:

25 An in-depth look at how units run.

1 Self-monitoring and external monitors of all aspects
2 of care.

3 Preparation for contracting",
4 and so forth. For example, there is an individual
5 house staff meeting for House 3 on 24th February 1993 at
6 26761. You will see that:

7 "We discussed at length the dynamic of the group of
8 girls. One girl found the group to be quite
9 unintegrated. The group had changed dramatically since
10 two girls left. They had had a normalising influence."

11 Then each individual girls are discussed there.
12 Again House 2 we can see at 26816 dating back to 30th
13 September 1992. This is handwritten. Indicates who was
14 present, the agenda.

15 "Looked at the house and its needs.
16 Talked about each girl individually.
17 The girls will possibly have a weekend."
18 Hallowe'en break is coming up.

19 "As part of a team we looked and talked through the
20 aims and objectives of House 2. In some areas we added
21 extra. Anyone with other ideas can add to these".

22 and so it goes on. Clearly the record-keeping
23 developed over the years and that is clear from the
24 documents that the Inquiry has seen and that are in the
25 bundle.

1 There was a visitors' book was kept from 1953
2 through to 1969. That's at SJM25254 to 25291. There
3 are comments about the fabric of the buildings and the
4 atmosphere being generally good. Some of the comments
5 in the visitors' book again are quite glowing, for
6 example, 25275. You will see here if we can just scroll
7 on down:

8 "Paid my first visit to Middletown Convent today.
9 The happy relationship which exists between the Sisters
10 and children struck me as being something very
11 wonderful. The welfare of the children, spiritual and
12 physical, is very obviously the primary objective of the
13 Sisters."

14 Then in June 1960:

15 "Many improvements have taken place since my last
16 visit. I understand that many more are planned. No
17 wonder that so many past pupils of this school whom
18 I have met from time to time regard it as their real
19 home where they found security, happiness and the love
20 which was denied them in their natural home."

21 That's signed M. McNeil.

22 There are some records of visits by Board members
23 from the 1990s, SJM24293 to 24326. At SJM25370 to 25410
24 we can see the Board of Management minutes for 1961
25 through to 1970. In the minute for January 8th, 1970,

1 for example, we can see a discussion of the setting up
2 of a Licensing Review Committee and the question of
3 a social worker for St. Joseph's. If we just look at
4 that, please, at 25399, you will see that it records in
5 the minutes who were present, which apologies there
6 were, minutes of the previous minutes being adopted,
7 tributes being paid to BR 39 by Father
8 Crilly and Father Savage.

9 BR 39 name had been synonymous with
10 training school techniques and development in Northern
11 Ireland. Not only had the De La Salle Order and the
12 whole field of social work suffered great loss in his
13 passing, but also St. Joseph's, who had the privilege of
14 having BR 39 on the governing body. His vast
15 experience and advice were always at our disposal. The
16 governing body extend its condolences to the De La Salle
17 Order and it was proposed by SR234 that another member
18 of the De La Salle Order be asked to replace Brother
19 Stephen. BR 6 name was suggested and the
20 secretary undertook to approach him on the matter. The
21 appointment of a member to replace Mrs Haye was deferred
22 until the April meeting. On the matter of the ..."

23 CHAIRMAN: "... new units ..."

24 MS SMITH: "... new units" -- yes -- thank you -- "it was
25 proposed that Messrs McLean and Forty be asked to speed

1 up negotiations and the gardening (sic) requested that
2 the tenders be available to them at the April meeting.

3 The purpose of a pre-release hostel together with
4 requirements and future possibilities was discussed. It
5 was suggested that negotiations be reopened with the
6 Ministry.

7 The composition of a Licensing Committee was
8 recalled by Father Savage and the purpose of such a body
9 discussed. It was decided that there should be
10 an inaugural meeting in the near future.

11 Reverend Savage raised the question of a social
12 worker for St. Joseph's. A lively discussion followed
13 on the introduction of a social worker to the staff, in
14 either full-time or part-time capacity. Father Savage
15 suggested that as the Orphan Society of the diocese
16 required a part-time social worker, this person could
17 also work in St. Joseph's. The Ministry agreed to this
18 in principle. Number of hours, salary to be worked out
19 by mutual agreement. Tentative suggestions were made
20 about advertising, interviewing applicants, etc.

21 There being no other business, the meeting
22 concluded."

23 That's an example from 1970, January 1970. There
24 are also minutes of the Board of Management from 1982 to
25 1988 at SJM24327 to 24532. It would seem that the only

1 serious matters -- it would seem that only serious
2 matters involving the girls were brought to the Board's
3 attention, for example, if we look at SJM24358, when
4 there is what is referred to as a drug incident being
5 brought to the attention of the Board in 1983. It says:

6 "In September whilst the girls were at Runkerry,
7 there were suspicions that one of the girls may have had
8 cannabis there. The girl was immediately brought back
9 to Middletown and an investigation started. A substance
10 found in her possession was sent to the Drugs Squad for
11 analysis. Results of this was being awaited.

12 Preliminary inquiries revealed that the girl had brought
13 with her a quantity of drugs in May. SR240 assured the
14 Board that a full investigation would be undertaken into
15 the source and channels of the drugs and any breach of
16 supervision here which resulted in the smoking of the
17 drug going undetected. If the substance being analysed
18 was found to be cannabis, the police would most likely
19 prosecute. The alternatives included the Board
20 prosecuting the girl or seeking permission to remove the
21 girl under section 140 of the Children & Young Persons
22 Act. Since the investigations were at a preliminarily
23 stage, no decision could be reached. SR240 would
24 consult with the Board if a section 140 became
25 necessary. A full report would be made to the next

1 Board meeting. Board advised SR240 to seek help with
2 Drugs Squad.

3 Next board meeting settled for January 26th."

4 I am not going to go through it, but it turns out
5 that the substance in question was not, in fact,
6 cannabis and the police were unable to prosecute in any
7 way, but there had been some other evidence of drug use
8 by this particular girl.

9 Later in 1988, for example, there is reference to
10 the Licensing Committee reporting to the Board and the
11 Board approving details about girls. If we look at
12 24524, you see there the Licensing Committee report:

13 "SR 268 reported on the meeting held in
14 March 1988. The Committee interviewed the following
15 girls."

16 As I say, there are Licensing Committee papers from
17 1989 onwards. They are in the bundle at 25098 to 252247
18 (sic). We can see an example of those at 25202. You
19 will see that there were two subcommittees of the
20 Licensing Review Committee. This is a Subcommittee I.
21 You will see that they spoke to each of the girls
22 individually. One girl there is recorded as:

23 "Gentle interview. Child answered well and invoked
24 a lot of sympathy. Review Committee recommended that
25 her involvement with the high school would soon end but

1 her formal education should continue in some shape. She
2 expressed great interest in returning home and her
3 reasons were very obvious."

4 So those girls were all interviewed by the Licensing
5 Review Committee and then that committee reported back
6 to the Board of Management.

7 There are further Board of Management minutes for
8 1988 through to 1995. They are in the bundle at 25547
9 to 25710. As one might expect, the minutes from these
10 later years are more detailed. For example, if we look
11 at 25682, you will see this is a minute from the minutes
12 of 29th June 1989. I am not going to go through it, but
13 you will see that they have become, first of all, typed
14 and more detailed, and then if we look at the minute for
15 1993 at 25613, again we are seeing this more detailed
16 type of or perhaps just a more formal type of minute
17 being developed.

18 There is a file of correspondence between
19 St. Joseph's and the Ministry of Home Affairs or the
20 Northern Ireland Office and that's at SJM26322 to 26523.
21 I am not going to go through this in any detail, but it
22 includes some material that the Inquiry has not seen
23 when it looked at other training schools in Module 7.

24 For example, if we look at 26323, this is a circular
25 from the Ministry of Home Affairs of 1964. It indicates

1 that parents of children who were on national assistance
2 could apply for a grant to see them each quarter, to
3 allow them to travel to see their children. In
4 exceptional circumstances that could be extended to
5 other impoverished parents. There are in this bundle of
6 paper circulars dealing with after care allowance
7 payments. One such example is that of 1962, which is at
8 26326. You see there the allowances that were being
9 paid at that time.

10 The bundle also contains quarterly returns regarding
11 corporal punishment. That's from page 2040 onwards.
12 I will just look at one example, please. I will be
13 looking at some of these with one of our witnesses this
14 week. Again this is the return of the corporal
15 punishment for 30th September 1958. You will see there
16 the names of the girls, the dates of the punishment, why
17 they were punished and what punishment was imposed.

18 From SJM2061 to 2091 we can see the quarterly
19 self-injury returns. In 1989 it is clear that
20 St. Joseph's was dealing with a girl who was a very high
21 risk of suicide, if we look, please, at SJM2092, and
22 I am not going to name this girl, but this letter to the
23 Training Schools Branch indicates the level of care that
24 St. Joseph's was providing to her. I will use her first
25 name:

1 "I confirm the situation regarding the re-admission
2 SJM 65 who was a patient at the ETU, Craigavon Area
3 Hospital and Ward 3 at St. Luke's Psychiatric Hospital
4 since February. She was admitted to the ETU because of
5 serious suicide attempt. She continued the pattern of
6 self-injury, making several attempts whilst at the ETU
7 until she was finally admitted to the adult psychiatric
8 hospital. We have continued to work closely with the
9 doctors and psychiatrists. There has been no
10 appreciable change in her condition, but in a final
11 effort we have been asked to take her back and work on
12 an intensive programme with her. She is still
13 considered a high suicide risk. Because our intensive
14 care unit is not complete, we have placed her in the
15 hostel, where she will receive 24 hours' supervision on
16 a one-to-one basis.

17 The Board of St. Joseph's has accepted her back in
18 the knowledge that she is a very high risk case, and
19 whilst in the final analysis we may not prevent her
20 committing suicide, at this point in time the Board
21 accepts the responsibility, providing we take all
22 reasonable and possible steps to prevent self-injury.

23 Supervising a girl on her own places heavy demands
24 on our staffing resources. I indicated to Mr Ireland
25 that we would have to get some extra help between now

1 and the end of August, but would do so with minimum
2 financial expenditure.

3 I enclose a list of our proposals."

4 That is signed on behalf of SR240.

5 You will hear about certain members of the
6 congregation from the witnesses who are coming to speak
7 to the Inquiry this week. Some of them are now
8 deceased. Some are too ill to attend in person to speak
9 to the Inquiry or indeed to provide a witness statement
10 answering the allegations. Some others will come to
11 give oral evidence. Both Mr Aiken and I will tell you
12 what is known about the nuns in terms of when they
13 worked in St. Joseph's and in what capacity as we cover
14 the evidence given by witnesses.

15 Chairman and Panel Members, that concludes my
16 opening remarks for this module, and although the
17 modules we are dealing with in 2016 may take less time
18 in terms of public hearings, they involve almost as much
19 work for the teams in preparation. There is enormous
20 amount of work involved, and I wish to pay particular
21 thanks to Maria Dougan, Orla Hunt, Jane McManus and
22 Judith Gibson on the legal team, and to those members of
23 the admin team who worked on a Saturday to ensure that
24 material could be processed. To those I have named and
25 the others I have not but who have helped out when

1 needed I am very grateful.

2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Well, ladies and gentlemen, we will
3 adjourn now and we will resume tomorrow morning, when
4 I anticipate we will hear the first of a number of
5 witnesses in the course of this week. So 10 o'clock
6 tomorrow morning.

7 (11.40 am)

8 (Inquiry adjourned until 10 o'clock tomorrow morning)

9 --ooOoo--

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I N D E X

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

Opening remarks by CHAIRMAN2

Opening statement by COUNSEL TO THE3

INQUIRY