\_ \_ \_ \_ \_ \_ \_ \_ \_ \_

HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE INQUIRY

- - - - - - - - -

being heard before:

SIR ANTHONY HART (Chairman)

MR DAVID LANE

MS GERALDINE DOHERTY

held at
Banbridge Court House
Banbridge

on Wednesday, 11th March 2015 commencing at 10.00 am (Day 101)

MS CHRISTINE SMITH, QC and MR JOSEPH AIKEN appeared as Counsel to the Inquiry.

Page 2 1 Wednesday, 11th March 2015 2 (10.00 am)WITNESS HIA368 (called) 3 4 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. Before we 5 start I, as always, remind everyone that their mobile phone must be either switched off or at least placed on 6 "Silent"/"Vibrate" and also that no photography and no 7 recording of any sort is allowed either in the Inquiry 8 9 chamber or anywhere within the premises. 10 Yes, Ms Smith. 11 MS SMITH: Good morning, Chairman, Panel Members, ladies and gentlemen. Our first witness today is HIA368. He is 12 HIA368. HIA368 wishes to take a religious oath and he 13 14 also wishes to maintain his anonymity as afforded by the 15 Inquiry. WITNESS HIA368 (sworn) 16 CHAIRMAN: Please sit down, HIA368. 17 18 Now just before Ms Smith starts to take this witness through his evidence, might I just point out to 19 everybody, if you haven't already had this explained to 20 21 you, there will occasions during the course of this morning no doubt when an individual may mention a name 22 23 or the name may be put to the individual, notwithstanding our anonymity policy. The reason for 24 25 that is that very often a designation number simply

1 won't convey anything to the witness concerned. 2 there are names that are mentioned from time to time during the course of the hearing. Those names must not 3 in any circumstances be repeated outside the chamber, 4 5 which means in practical terms you don't discuss them amongst yourselves, you don't discuss them with 6 7 colleagues and you don't mention them on social media. I am not singling you out in any way, but this is 8 9 something we say all the time just because many of you 10 are new to this today so that you understand that. Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY 11 12 MS SMITH: Thank you, Chairman. HIA368, just before I come to go through your 13 evidence I am going to outline to the Panel where 14 15 documents relevant to your time in the institutions can be found in our bundle of material. 16 HIA368's statement can be found at SNB-655 to 659. 17 18 The congregation's response is at 1981 to 1982. 19 Health & Social Care Board response is at SNB-6422 to 6505, which includes a number of exhibits, and you 20 21 will see that HIA368 was admitted into the care of Down County Welfare Authority. 22 23 Social work papers can be found at 43505 to 43969. There is police material, which is not relevant to 24 25 HIA368 directly, but it includes statements of complaint

- 1 made by his sister, who was in care with him, and also
- an interview with one of the nuns against whom she made
- a complaint. That can be found at 61460 to 61462 and
- 4 60311 to 60312, and the interview can be found at 60381
- 5 to 60390.
- Now if we could go to HIA368's statement, please, at
- 7 655, and you will see here, HIA368, that instead of your
- 8 name to protect your anonymity it says "The Witness
- 9 Statement of HIA369 -- 68". Apologies.
- 10 WITNESS SUPPORT: Excuse me. It is not coming up on
- 11 HIA368's screen.
- 12 MS SMITH: It's not coming up on the screen. Can we just
- check that the monitor is turned on? Is there a button
- 14 at the bottom there?
- 15 A. That's it.
- 16 Q. Is that it now? Good.
- 17 If we could go to the last page of that document,
- which is 659, please, and, HIA368, can I just ask you to
- 19 confirm this is the witness statement that you provided
- to the Inquiry and it was signed on 20th August 2014?
- 21 A. Yes, it is it.
- 22 Q. This is the statement of evidence that you wish the
- 23 Inquiry to consider together with anything else you tell
- 24 us this morning?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Thank you. Now if we go back to the first page, HIA368,
- at 655, your personal details are set out in
- 3 paragraphs 1 and 2. You then were put in Nazareth House
- from May 1969 until September 1971, between the ages of
- 5 7 and a half and 9. You are now aged 53. Is that
- 6 correct?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- 8 Q. We were discussing this just before you came into the
- 9 chamber this morning, that there are a number of social
- 10 work records in respect of you and your family. I am
- going to open some of those up to the Inquiry, but what
- they show is that in January 1963 you and your siblings
- were put into Glendhu Children's Hostel for a short
- period of time between 3rd and 30th January. You then
- 15 went back to your mother. Social Services again had
- been involved with the family but became involved in
- particular in September 1967, when you and your sister
- went to Marmion Children's Home from 5th September 1967
- to 22nd December 1967, when you again went back to your
- 20 mother.
- Now can I just ask: do you remember being in those
- two children's homes?
- 23 A. I can remember being in one of the homes, but, as I said
- earlier, I couldn't remember the name.
- 25 O. Yes. I think you remembered Marmion, which was the one

- in Holywood in County Down. Is that right?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Again you go back to your mother, and then in 1969 the
- 4 home conditions are not good, and I am going to look at
- 5 a couple of documents here. If we look at SNB-43960,
- and we can maybe enlarge that, you will see it is dated
- 7 30th April 1969, and it is a note from the Social
- 8 Services' file, which says that they:
- 9 "Phoned , who confirmed that HIA175",
- 10 who was your sister, "was removed from the care of her
- 11 mother yesterday and taken to Nazareth House.
- is sending up a full report. There is
- a court on Friday and an Interim Order will be sought.
- 14 There is a possibility that HIA368", and your date of
- birth is given, "might also have to be removed. Home
- 16 conditions very bad."
- We know that there was a Place of Safety Order
- sought in respect of your sister on 29th April 1969.
- 19 Then you and she were committed to care at
- Juvenile Court on 16th May 1969.
- 21 If we look at SNB-43955, and this is a memorandum
- 22 from 19th May, which records:
- "I wish to let you know that at Juvenile
- 24 Court on 16th May 1969 the above-named were committed to
- 25 the care of Down County Welfare Committee under

- section 80 of the Children and Young Person's Act. The
- children were conveyed to Nazareth House on Friday, 16th
- 3 May in accordance with instructions. No
- 4 maintenance contribution order was made.
- 5 I shall forward copies of the committal orders when
- I receive them from the Clerk of Petty Sessions together
- 7 with the forms C3, C19 and C2 in respect of HIA368."
- 8 That's signed by the Divisional Welfare Officer.
- 9 I think it is is the name recorded
- 10 there. So obviously you would not have been aware that
- this was going on in the background, given you age,
- 12 HIA368 --
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. -- but I am showing these documents to show the history
- of what happened.
- 16 If we look at 43690, this is the history of you
- being accepted into care under the 1950 Act, and you
- 18 will see that it records that you were brought to
- 19 Nazareth House on 16th May. The estimated period of
- care is until 18 years. So at this stage it is clear
- 21 that there is not any intention that you be returned to
- your mother. Your medical history is set out there. If
- we could just scroll down, it is noted that you were
- 24 wetting the bed and it is also noted under "Other" there
- 25 that you have a heart murmur. You have received various

- 1 vaccinations, but not one for TB. Your family doctor's
- 2 name is also given.
- Then if we look at 43957, you will see that on
- 4 14th May, just before the Order is sought, it is said:
- 5 "Place obtained in Nazareth Lodge if HIA368 is
- 6 committed. SR172 is prepared to move HIA175 from
- 7 Nazareth House if we feel this is better."
- 8 That's -- is informed. It's signed by
- 9 , who I presume is the social worker looking after the
- 10 case at the time.
- 11 So it would appear that when you are first taken
- into care, the plan is for you to go to Nazareth Lodge
- and for HIA175 to be moved to Nazareth Lodge if that was
- 14 felt to be better, but for some reason you actually end
- up in Nazareth House with HIA175. Maybe because she had
- been there for a few days and they didn't want to upset
- her, that they felt it was better to put you in there
- 18 with her.
- 19 But our understanding, the Inquiry's understanding,
- is that you were the first boy in Nazareth House. Do
- 21 you remember any other boys being there during your
- 22 time?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. There is some documentation -- I will come to look at
- 25 that in due course -- which suggests there may have been

- some younger boys in the house as well, but you don't
- 2 have any recollection of them?
- 3 A. No, I don't remember, no.
- 4 Q. Just for completeness, there are some medical
- 5 certificates. If we look at 43957 -- sorry. That is
- 6 43957. 43846, and you will see that the Down County
- Welfare Department provide a medical certificate, which
- 8 shows that on 16th May again the suggestion is that you
- 9 may be going to Nazareth Lodge. You were medically
- 10 examined and found to be free from infection and
- suitable for admission to the home. Now do you have any
- 12 recollection of seeing a doctor before you went in or
- 13 anything like that?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. Just if we look at 43690 -- sorry. I think that is the
- document that we have already looked at where it records
- 17 your medical history. Yes.
- 18 There is also just another document that we will
- 19 look at here, which is SNB-43835. Now this is a letter
- SR 152 , who I believe would have
- 21 been -- well, she is recorded there as the Superior of
- Nazareth House. It is dated there 10th November 1969.
- 23 It is addressed to the County Welfare Officer and it
- 24 says:
- 25 "Dear sir,

I am enclosing a report on the [name redacted] children, as requested in your letter of 31st October."

So by this stage you are in the home about six months and the County Welfare Officer is looking for a report from the home about you and your sister.

The Health & Social Care Board felt that they didn't have that report, but they have annexed what I think might be the report. If we look think at this, it is SNB-6450. I think we might need to rotate that, please, and if we can enlarge it. It is not terribly clear, but if we can enlarge it, we might be able to read it. You will see that it begins:

"HIA175 and HIA368.

These children are in good health and are visited by their mother weekly. They have a good attendance at school and are making fair progress. They seem to be quite happy and contented and to have settled down well."

Now I am speculating, but it may well be that this was actually the report that SR 152 sent with that letter, because there seems to be no other identifying details about it and it is about both you and your sister.

Do you -- it is recorded here that your mother was visiting. Have you any memory of her visiting you when

- 1 you were in Nazareth House?
- 2 A. Not in Nazareth House, but I can remember going down to
- 3 I think it was at the . She had
- 4 a house there, and I can remember visiting her there.
- 5 Q. There is a note certainly in May 1970 of a social worker
- 6 who took you to see her. We can look at that at 43949.
- 7 This is -- if we can just scroll on down just to the
- 8 handwritten note, please, and just highlight that, it
- 9 says:
- 10 "Took HIA175 and HIA368 out."
- 11 This is 11th May 1970.
- "They wished to see their mother, as she had visited
- them previously -- visited them the previous day and
- missed them. Miss [name redacted] was delighted to see
- 15 them both."
- 16 Then it goes on to record how they found her.
- 17 "HIA368 told his mummy that he is praying for a new
- 18 house. Miss [name redacted] will visit HIA175 and
- 19 HIA368 on 16th on HIA175's ..." --
- which was going to be your sister's 14th birthday
- 21 at that time.
- Now if we go back to your statement, HIA368, at
- page 656, and you have indeed recorded there at
- 24 paragraph 4 that the intention was that you were to be
- 25 put into Nazareth Lodge, but you thought that the reason

- that you went into Nazareth House was because you
- 2 refused to leave HIA175.
- 3 A. Uh-huh.
- 4 Q. So agreement was reached that you could stay with her,
- 5 but certainly the situation was that you were going to
- 6 be together in whichever home it was going to be --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. -- according to the note that we've just looked at.
- 9 You were in the same group as her and you say in
- 10 paragraph 5 here that you slept with the rest of the
- girls in the dormitory. You would have wet the bed
- 12 a lot.
- "Sometimes I would wake up with the nun hitting me
- because she knew I had wet the bed. I was made to stand
- out in the hallway with a wet sheet over my head, and if
- she could, HIA175 would try to hide the sheets and
- change them before the nuns found out that I had wet the
- 18 bed."
- 19 We have heard from the congregation that they don't
- 20 accept that children were made to stand with sheets over
- 21 their head, although they do accept that they wouldn't
- have dealt appropriately with children who wet the bed,
- and they do apologise to you for that. They are sorry
- that they didn't assist you in the appropriate manner.
- 25 Are you okay, HIA368?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. We appreciate that this is difficult.
- 3 A. Can I just take a minute?
- 4 Q. Yes, of course. Of course.
- 5 CHAIRMAN: Well, we will rise just for a couple of minutes.
- 6 (10.27 am)
- 7 (Short break)
- 8 (10.35 am)
- 9 MS SMITH: If we could go back to HIA368's statement,
- 10 please, at 656. HIA368, we were talking about the fact
- that you wet the bed when you were in Nazareth House.
- 12 In paragraph 6 there you go on to say that you were
- made to bath with the older girls, because there were no
- separate facilities for the boys.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. You were all put into the bath at the same time. You
- remember that the nuns used to put a bowl over your head
- 18 to cut your hair.
- 19 You go on then to say -- in paragraph 7 you talk
- about the food and you say that you never liked butter,
- 21 probably because you didn't have butter when you lived
- with your mother and you weren't used to it. So am I
- right in believing here that, in fact, the food that you
- were getting in the home was better than what you'd
- 25 experienced outside?

- 1 A. It probably would have been, yes.
- 2 Q. And you hated vegetables, because you were forced to eat
- 3 them.
- 4 "You weren't allowed to leave the table until we
- finished everything that was in front of us."
- 6 The congregation have said that they provided the
- 7 best food they could and they certainly encouraged
- 8 children to eat all that was put in front of them so
- 9 they didn't go hungry, but they didn't force children to
- 10 eat what was there. Were you -- I mean, was that your
- 11 recollection?
- 12 A. My recollection is that if you didn't -- you could not
- leave the table until you finished what was put in front
- of you.
- 15 O. You say:
- 16 "The nuns gave us hidings for nothing. There are
- a few good memories that I have -- there are very few
- good memories that I have of my time in Nazareth House."
- 19 You don't remember going to school --
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. -- although the document I pulled you showed you and
- 22 HIA175 seemed to be doing -- progressing well at school
- 23 at that time, but you have no recollection --
- 24 A. I have no -- no.
- 25 Q. -- of going to the school in the home? You say:

- The nuns gave us hidings for nothing."
- What kind of things might that have been over,
- 3 HIA368?
- 4 A. For wetting the bed, and generally if you didn't do what
- 5 you were told, or, you know, if you talked back, if you
- 6 talked back to them or whatever, or even looked at them
- 7 a funny way probably. You know, I just can remember
- given just getting -- I can remember one time not for wetting
- 9 the bed, waking up a nun because I think I was touching
- 10 myself when I was younger, you know, and she was calling
- me "disgusting" and everything else, all the names under
- 12 -- and, you know.
- 13 Q. You say -- what form did the hidings take, HIA368?
- 14 A. Usually with their hands. You know, I can't remember
- using anything else, but basically I remember getting
- beat by their hand.
- 17 Q. In paragraph 9 here you talk about how some of the older
- 18 girls used to sexually abuse you. That would have taken
- 19 place when you were aged between 8 and 11. Well, we
- 20 know that you actually left Nazareth House when you were
- 21 about 9.
- 22 A. Uh-huh.
- 23 Q. So would that mean that the years that you were there --
- you wouldn't have been with older girls when you were
- 25 11?

- 1 A. Well, I -- I was only surmising that when I was
- giving -- you know, when I first went up, because
- I didn't actually know what age I was when I went in and
- date I had actually left, but I can remember the girls
- 5 used to make me climb up their nightdresses.
- 6 Q. This would have happened in the dormitory.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. You say there would have been a few girls present at the
- 9 time.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. You also go on to talk about -- can I just say that the
- congregation have said in their response to you -- to
- this allegation that they are -- they say:
- 14 "Bullying a hazard in all educational environments,
- but that it was not accepted or tolerated by the
- 16 Sisters, and if HIA368 experienced bullying or peer
- abuse of any sort",
- they believe that to be wholly unacceptable and
- 19 apologise. They say the sexual abuse of children in
- their care has only come to light in recent years and
- 21 the Sisters are horrified, shocked and devastated that
- this abuse took place, and offer a sincere and profound
- apology to any child that suffered this horrendous act.
- 24 So one of the things that I wanted to ask you about
- is do you remember -- and again I am going to use a name

- 1 here, and as the Chairman has said earlier, the names
- 2 are not to be used outside this room -- do you remember
- a girl who was there with you in the home called HIA134?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. I gave you her surname when we were talking earlier, but
- I am just going to use her first name and you know who
- 7 we are talking about.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 O. She told the Inquiry about an incident that she said
- 10 happened between you and her in the bathroom in the
- 11 home. Now she was the same age as you, HIA368. What
- she described is something that we would today call peer
- experimentation, if I can put it that way.
- 14 A. Uh-huh.
- 15 Q. I mean, she said what happened between the two of you
- 16 was sort of consensual. She described what happened.
- 17 You know because you have been told what it was that she
- 18 said happened. You don't remember her. Do you ever
- 19 remember anything happening with anybody in the
- 20 bathroom?
- 21 A. I can remember being bathed with the other girls, but
- I can't remember anything like that happening in the
- 23 bathroom.
- 24 Q. When you were bathed with the older girls, was there
- 25 somebody supervising bath time?

- 1 A. I'm not 100% sure. I know, like, the baths were sort of
- like cubicles I think. You know, they were just big
- long baths. I don't know if there was somebody there or
- 4 not.
- 5 Q. Okay, but you certain don't remember this girl, HIA134?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. And you don't remember --
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. -- being in the bathroom on your own with any other
- 10 girl?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. You talk in paragraph 10 here about:
- 13 "Someone from Social Services would take us out to
- buy clothes and whatever else we needed, but as soon as
- we went back into the home, the stuff that we were
- bought was taken off us and was never seen again."
- 17 Your sister told you that:
- 18 "... she tried to tell the social workers what was
- 19 happening to us, but they still took us back to the
- home."
- 21 You say that your sister eventually went to another
- 22 convent where -- to work there.
- Now just if we could look at SNB-6446, please, these
- are just some examples from the social work records of
- 25 requests for a stock record slip it is called in

- 1 respect -- this is in July 1969. It is to Sinclair's in
- 2 Royal Avenue, which to those of us who are old enough to
- 3 remember was a large shop which did sell things like
- 4 school uniforms and children's clothes. It was opposite
- 5 the GPO in Belfast. It says there's a pair of shoes
- 6 there, a Burberry, a pair of shorts and a shirt being
- 7 bought for you. So this is an example of Down County
- 8 Welfare Committee raising an order for these clothes
- 9 from Sinclair shop in Belfast.
- 10 Another example at 46448, please -- 6448. Sorry.
- 11 It is 6448. Again this is in June of 1969 and it is to
- a shop in Mountpottinger. I think it is Prices Limited.
- 13 1 tee-shirt -- I think it is tee-shirt -- and one pair
- of grey trousers. Again this is the kind of clothing
- that the Social Services were providing for you and
- there are similar documents in respect of your sister in
- the records, but you say that this clothing was then
- taken off you when you came back to the home?
- 19 A. Uh-huh.
- 20 Q. The other thing I should say is that the Health & Social
- 21 Care Board have said to us that they have no record of
- any complaints by either yourself or by HIA175 about the
- treatment that you were receiving in the home.
- 24 A. Uh-huh.
- 25 Q. Certainly going through the social work records, there's

- nothing to suggest that that is incorrect in any way.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. There is nothing recorded in the documents of you or
- 4 HIA175 --
- 5 A. Uh-huh.
- 6 Q. -- complaining to the Social Services at that time -- at
- 7 the time that you were in these homes.
- 8 Going back to your statement, you talk about at
- 9 paragraph 11 you thought it was about the summer of 1972
- 10 that you were fostered out from Nazareth House and you
- 11 went to stay with a family in the area. You
- 12 couldn't remember their names. You describe them as
- "brutal". You say they had an outside toilet and
- an inside toilet, but you weren't allowed to use the
- 15 toilet inside.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. They would put a bowl under your bed at night or you had
- to go outside, and you say you got beatings from them.
- 19 They had their own children, who were allowed to treat
- 20 you badly as well, and you remember playing with a
- 21 family called the NHB 128 --
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. -- when you were in this. That's your memory of your
- time with this particular foster family.
- 25 A. Uh-huh.

- Q. Now again Social Services' records show that both you and HIA175 were boarded out to a family, and again I am going to use the name, and when I did use the name, that was the family you were talking about, and that was the NHB 134 family.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 You went there on a number of occasions, including the Ο. summer of 1970, but the first time that you went to them 8 was for Christmas 1969. You were taken to meet the 9 10 family before you actually went to spend Christmas with 11 them. If we look at SNB-43706, this is a note for the 12 file and it is dated November '69. Sorry. This is not the document that I was actually -- yes. It is 13 recording a number of things. It said: 14
- 15 " NHB 134 telephoned in reply to a advertisement in I visited her on 27th November 16 the '69 and saw someone else there. Both seemed to be very 17 18 keen to take the [name redacted] children even for a holiday period. We discussed various difficulties in 19 the situation, for example, mother visiting, jealousy 20 21 on", presumably one of the NHB 134 family's children's, "part, HIA368's difficulty in being the only boy, etc. 22 23 I formed quite a good impression of the family and arranged to take HIA175 and HIA368 to see them on 24 25 14th December 1969. HIA175 and HIA368 were quite

1 excited at the prospect of going to a foster home.

HIA175 is very quiet but seems to have almost a grown-up awareness. HIA368 is more child-like and more reserved at first. He is possibly withdrawn to some extent. It was interesting that his conversation during the journey consisted in a great measure of dangerous things, for example, lakes, Indians in the woods, etc. He also talked a great deal about God.

The family were very welcoming to the two children and were very impressed with their general behaviour. HIA368 and HIA175 in turn enjoyed the visit. HIA368 said it was the best day of his life. HIA175 stated that her mother would like to see them over the Christmas holiday and I assured her that arrangements would be made."

Then it goes on to say the children were transported, but the next page is missing.

Certainly it suggests the first time you went to this family you definitely enjoyed the visit there.

20 A. Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

Q. Then from the records it would appear that you went out to them over Christmas and then again after Easter 1970

-- you went to them at half-term in 1970 in February for a time. After Easter you appeared to be keen to live with the NHB 134 family and arrangements were, in fact,

Page 23

being made. If we look at SNB-6470, you will see here

that arrangements have gone so far as to actually enrol

you in schools. You were to go to the Boys' Primary

4 School in . This is in September 1970.

In around this time then if we look at 43812, this is dated -- it records the visits to you in during that summer, and it records that you are enjoying the summer break:

"... particularly HIA368, who is in his element with his makeshift bow and arrow."

Your mother turned up, which made -- without the Welfare's knowledge, and because of that NHB 134 was rather upset. If we just scroll on down, please.

There was another document, if we look at it at 6472. This is in October 1970:

"I wish to inform you the mother of these children has now changed her address. She has stated she is not happy about the children going to their foster mother and we have made arrangements for her to call at the office on Thursday, 22nd October."

If we then go down -- I think it is on the next page. Yes. If we can scroll on down, you see this is dated 27th October.

"Miss [name redacted] is still very much against the children going to . She says the children,

- 1 especially HIA175, are not happy about it at all and
- 2 also they will be too far from her."
- 3 She goes on to attack the Welfare Department for
- 4 taking the children.
- If we could scroll on down to the next page, it says
- there that on 30th October:
- 7 "Visited HIA368 and HIA175 at Nazareth House. Both
- 8 said they were not at all disappointed about not going
- 9 to . HIA175 stated that she wasn't happy
- 10 there. Both agreed that they were happier in Nazareth
- 11 House with the other children and also because they are
- 12 nearer their mother."
- So it would appear that Social Services had taken
- 14 you to this family in . HIA175 certainly in
- October of 1970 is saying that she wasn't happy there to
- Social Services and that you were both happier in
- 17 Nazareth House.
- 18 A. Yes. I can remember playing with the NHB 128. They
- were a family lived -- and I got on really well with
- them, and actually when I moved to , because
- they were so close, I actually found them again, but
- definitely we were in no doubt at the time. Probably at
- the start it was good, but, you know, as time went on,
- 24 it just ...
- 25 Q. You weren't happy with that foster placement --

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. -- in any case?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Certainly what happens in any event is there's
- 5 a document which shows that NHB 134 , who was to be
- 6 your foster mother, had a relapse of flu' and she
- 7 becomes unsure. The Social Services record that it is
- 8 appropriate to seek other foster parents --
- 9 A. Uh-huh.
- 10 Q. -- for you. If we look at 6463, you will see, if we can
- scroll down that to where it says "HIA368" -- this is in
- or around the same time where you are being with the
- 13 NHB 134.
- "HIA368 was at pains to let me know that he -- that
- the Nazareth House girls think he is a very tough boy.
- 16 He wondered if he shouldn't be at Nazareth Lodge along
- with the very tough boys there. Later SR31 said that
- she has been discussing with the housemother whether
- 19 HIA368 should attend school at Nazareth Lodge after
- 20 Easter. His present boy companions are only 6 years.
- 21 This would probably be a good thing."
- This is where I was asking you if you remembered any
- other boys being in Nazareth House, because this
- suggests there may have been younger boys than you in
- 25 the house.

- 1 A. No. I don't know any other ones.
- 2 Q. SR31 is certainly thinking that you might be better off
- 3 in Nazareth Lodge with the older boys at that point in
- 4 time. That is what she is saying to the social worker,
- 5 who is recording it. There must have been some talk of
- 6 you going to the Lodge, because you are trying to say to
- 7 the Social Services at this stage, you know, "I think
- I'd be better off there too with the other tough boys".
- 9 A. Uh-huh.
- 10 Q. You don't remember that discussion at all, HIA368?
- 11 A. I don't remember it, no.
- 12 Q. If we look -- certainly after HIA175, who was a good bit
- older than you -- she leaves Nazareth House and you do
- go to Nazareth Lodge in September 1971, but in the
- summer of 1971 you go to the foster family called the
- 16 NHB 132 -- again I am using a name not to be used -- for
- 17 the first time. You return from that summer placement
- and you go into Nazareth Lodge in September 1971. You
- are there until August 1972.
- In your statement in paragraphs 12 and 13 you talk
- about your time in the lodge. That's at 657. You say
- 22 that after your foster placement -- now you thought --
- I think when you were making this statement, you thought
- 24 you had gone from the NHB 134 to the -- to Nazareth Lodge
- 25 --

- 1 A. Uh-huh.
- 2 Q. -- but, in fact, you had actually been at the NHB 132
- 3 the summer before you went there.
- 4 "The woman in charge of us there was good. We
- 5 stayed in one big dormitory. There was a lot of
- fighting between the boys, so we had to be able to look
- 7 after ourselves. I remember us all playing outside in
- 8 a big field."
- 9 You say you remember trying to run away a couple of
- 10 times.
- "On one occasion I ran away with two other boys. We
- ended up at the family home of one of the boys and were
- returned to Nazareth Lodge. When we got back, the nuns
- removed the wire from a net curtain and beat us with
- 15 it."
- I was asking, HIA368, if you remembered the names of
- any of the boys that you ran away with at all.
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Or do you remember any of the names of the nuns who beat
- you? You don't?
- 21 A. I don't remember any names.
- 22 Q. You also -- when we were talking, you said there was
- a wigwam in the home.
- 24 A. Yes, we had a -- we took a wigwam with us, so we did,
- 25 thinking that that was what we were going to probably

1 live in.

- 2 Q. Certainly you were punished for running away when you
- 3 got back.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Now just -- if we look at just another couple of
- documents at SNB-43938, and this is a note in June of
- 7 1971.
- 8 "SR31, Nazareth House, phoned to enquire what action
- 9 we were taking with regard to HIA175, who is leaving
- 10 school at the end of the current term. She seemed
- anxious that HIA175 should leave Nazareth House as soon
- as possible after the end of term and is not prepared to
- include her in any holiday arrangements made by the
- home. She also feels that HIA368 should be transferred
- to Nazareth Lodge once HIA175 leaves Nazareth House."
- 16 Then it goes on to talk about HIA175 in the rest of
- that.
- 18 So it is clear that arrangements are being made for
- 19 you. They do not want to keep you in Nazareth House
- once your sister has left there, and SR31 feels that you
- should be transferred to the lodge not just because
- I presume your sister is leaving, but we have already
- seen the document where it has been suggested that you
- would be better off with boys of your own age.
- 25 Then if we look at SNB-43633, this is a memo which

confirms that the arrangements for you are that -- you are presently on holidays with the NHB 132 and:

"I have now confirmed with Nazareth Lodge that there will be a place for HIA368 with them and I should be grateful if you would bring him there on 31st August and not to Nazareth House."

So that is carried out. So we look then at 43921, as you recall, when you were in Nazareth House, Down Country Welfare were looking for a report about you and HIA175 from the nun in charge there. There seems to be another report here in November 1971 about you from Nazareth Lodge. It says:

"HIA368's health is very good. He is a very pleasant child to work with. from Down

Education Committee gave HIA368 a test on 19th October.

The result indicated that he is of average intelligence but extremely retarded in reading and arithmetic. He is having special tuition after school to help him. He visits his mother for a few hours each Sunday."

That's signed SR 34 , who would have been in Nazareth Lodge at that time. Now this is showing that you were at school --

23 A. Uh-huh.

Q. -- in the Lodge as well, but again you have no recollection of that at all, HIA368?

- 1 A. No, I have no, no, no ...
- 2 Q. As I said, you left Nazareth Lodge in August 1972 to
- live with the NHB 132 family from then on until you
- 4 reached of the end of your childhood. You describe your
- 5 time there in paragraphs 14 through to 17. You do talk
- about the difficulties that you had, but you would say
- 7 that, while this family was very strict, they gave you
- 8 a start in life for which you are grateful.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Isn't that right, HIA368?
- 11 A. Oh, yes, yes.
- 12 Q. Social Services record -- you also talk there about
- going briefly at paragraph 18 to Rubane House in
- 14 Kircubbin. On one occasion when your foster family went
- on holiday you were put into Rubane. This is at
- page 658. You say you were only there for a few weeks,
- but you remember on one occasion a boy tried to put his
- hand under your blankets and you stopped him and nothing
- 19 happened.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. That's the only incident you recall during your time
- there. There is some suggestion in Social Services that
- around the time you went to Kircubbin for this short
- period of time, and it was only a short period of time,
- 25 your foster family were having difficulties with your

- 1 behaviour at that time, and they felt that they were
- 2 going away and they couldn't leave you with anybody --
- 3 they couldn't make proper arrangements for you. That is
- 4 why you went into there.
- 5 A. Uh-huh.
- 6 Q. It is also recorded in the Social Services' document
- 7 that you were anxious to ensure that this was only
- 8 short-term and that you would get back to your foster
- 9 parents, and that you wanted to leave your belongings
- 10 there to make sure you got back.
- 11 The records chronicle your time with your foster
- parents. Now, as I have explained to you, what happened
- there is outside the terms of reference of this Inquiry,
- 14 because we are looking at what happened --
- 15 A. Uh-huh.
- 16 Q. -- in the institutions, but if I may just summarise,
- they disclose that there were some behavioural issues
- and some communication difficulties with you and your
- 19 foster parents, but Social Services stepped in and
- 20 helped to resolve that over the years. The family were
- 21 quite strict, and while you expressed a desire to stay
- on there as your home when you turned 18, that didn't
- 23 work out --
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. -- and you ended up leaving, but Social Services helped

- 1 to find you accommodation when you left and supported
- 2 you after you left. Isn't that correct?
- 3 A. That's correct, yes.
- Q. Your life after care you describe in paragraphs 19 to 22, HIA368. I am not going to go into the details, but it is clear that you have certain difficulties in life and you would express in paragraph 22 what you say the effects of your time -- your life in care have had on you and the fact that you have been trying to get answers about your life after having seen a counsellor.

Now the congregation in the final paragraph of their statement have said that they would like to express their hurt and sadness at the allegations that you have brought forward. They have always endeavoured to provide a safe and loving home for children and must offer you an unreserved and sincere apology for any abuse you received by any Sister.

Now I am reading that out to you, HIA368, because the next question I am going to ask you is one we ask everyone who comes to speak to us and tell us about their time in the institutions, and that is with regard to the recommendations that the Inquiry has to make at the end of its work --

24 A. Uh-huh.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25 Q. -- as to what should happen, whether there should be

- some sort of redress scheme, whether there should be
- 2 some sort of memorial, or whether there should be
- an apology, and, if so, from whom. So the Panel are
- 4 very keen to know what your own views are about that,
- 5 HIA368.
- 6 A. Basically I would like to have an apology and, as I say,
- you know, in my opinion I still maintain Social Services
- knew what was going on in these homes at the same time,
- and I would like them to admit at some stage that they
- were at fault as well, you know, because at some
- stage -- like, my sister HIA175 says she has told the
- social worker that took us out and obviously other
- children have told other social workers what was going
- on in the homes as well. So, you know, somewhere
- somebody has to know and, you know, didn't do anything.
- 16 Q. HIA368, thank you for that. I have no further questions
- for you, but if there's anything you feel that I haven't
- covered as we've gone through your statement about your
- 19 time in either of the two homes, Nazareth House and
- Nazareth Lodge, or if there's something that I have got
- wrong, please take this opportunity to correct that.
- 22 A. No. Everything -- everything's fine.
- 23 Q. Okay. Well, I have no further questions. The Panel may
- have some questions they want to ask you.
- 25 A. Okay.

- 1 Questions from THE PANEL
- 2 MS DOHERTY: HIA368, thanks very much. That is really
- 3 helpful. Can I just check? We have heard what the
- 4 congregation have said about the sheets, the wet sheets
- being put over children's heads.
- 6 A. Uh-huh.
- 7 Q. Can I just hear what you have to say about that? What's
- 8 your view?
- 9 A. Well, it's not very -- it wasn't very pleasant, you
- know, and it's not something I would think that nuns who
- are supposed to be looking after children -- it doesn't
- make any difference who, nuns, social workers, mothers,
- whatever -- anybody that in my opinion has done
- something like that there wasn't fit to look after
- anybody.
- 16 Q. You are adamant that it happened?
- 17 A. It did happen, yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. Thanks very much.
- 19 A. My own son wet the bed and I had all the sympathy with
- him and, you know, I wouldn't expect -- I wouldn't
- 21 expect it to be done on any children.
- 22 Q. Thanks very much.
- 23 MR LANE: It was obviously an unusual arrangement for you to
- 24 go to Nazareth House --
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. -- with you being the first boy there, and we have heard
- 2 from some of the other witnesses that the nuns were very
- 3 particular about girls covering themselves up in the
- 4 bath --
- 5 A. Uh-huh.
- 6 Q. -- and so on. They used to wear a shift. Was there any
- 7 arrangement made like that for you?
- 8 A. I'll be honest with you. I can't remember.
- 9 Q. Right. Okay. Thank you.
- 10 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA368, those are the only questions we
- 11 need to ask you today. Thank you very much indeed for
- 12 coming to speak to us --
- 13 A. Okay. Thank you.
- 14 Q. -- and sharing your experiences with us. Thank you.
- 15 A. Okay.
- 16 (Witness withdrew)
- 17 MS SMITH: Chairman, the next witness is to be taken by
- Mr Aiken, but if we take a short break, I'm sure he will
- 19 be ready shortly.
- 20 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We'll rise for a few minutes.
- 21 (11.00 pm)
- 22 (Short break)
- 23 (11.30 pm)
- 24 WITNESS HIA195 (called)
- 25 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Aiken?

- 1 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, good morning.
- 2 The next witness today is HIA195, who is HIA195, through
- 3 the material we have looked at sometimes known as HIA195
- 4 and sometimes as HIA195. I am going to call her HIA195
- for the purposes of today. She is aware, Chairman, you
- 6 are going to ask her to take the oath.
- 7 WITNESS HIA195 (sworn)
- 8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, HIA195. Please sit down.
- 9 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY
- 10 MR AIKEN: If we can bring up on the screen -- HIA195, you
- are going to see I hope the first page of your
- 12 statement, and if you can just check the hard copy that
- 13 you have with you and just make sure that it matches the
- one that's on the screen except for the black marks.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. If you look at the last page of the hard copy you have,
- and if we go to 179, please, and if you can just check
- that that matches the last page that you have, and can
- 19 you confirm that you have signed your witness statement?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And that you want to adopt the contents of your witness
- 22 statement as your evidence to the Inquiry?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. We were discussing earlier, HIA195, as you know, the
- 25 black marks are out of the outworking of the Inquiry's

anonymity policy, and you want to keep your anonymity?

- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Therefore we will use names to facilitate you giving
- 4 your evidence today, but none of the names that we use
- 5 will be reported and anyone who is here today listening
- 6 won't repeat any of those names or the information
- 7 relating to them beyond the room that we are sitting in.
- 8 Can you bear with me just for a few moments until
- 9 I give the Panel some references in the electronic
- 10 bundle to the material that relates to you?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. As you know, we have talked in detail about a lot of
- that material today. The Panel have that material.
- 14 A lot of it you know is very distressing and difficult.
- I am only going to summarise some parts of it for the
- Inquiry's work, but the Panel have had the opportunity
- 17 to read much of that material.
- In addition to HIA195's statement to the Inquiry
- 19 HIA195 herself wrote a handwritten record of her time as
- 20 a child, which covers not just her time in Nazareth
- 21 House, but her wider time in various locations and her
- 22 home life. That 52 pages runs from 30277 to 30328.
- In addition to those two statements HIA195 came
- forward at the age of 32 to speak to the police
- 25 after watching a news report about Father

- 1 Brendan Smyth.
- 2 The first police statement that she made was on 25th
- 3 January 1994. That runs from 62081 to 62084. The
- 4 second police statement is of 20th February 1994 and it
- 5 runs from 62085 to 62086. We will come back in brief
- 6 terms to the matters that those statements deal with
- 7 shortly, HIA195.
- 8 In addition, the Sisters of Nazareth have provided
- 9 a replying statement to the Inquiry, which is at 2032 to
- 10 2034. HIA195 is aware, although not necessarily finding
- it helpful, there is an apology to her specifically in
- paragraph 14 of that statement at 2034.
- 13 The Health & Social Care Board statement can be
- found at 6638 through to 6642 and with exhibits from
- 15 6643 to 6683.
- Then, as HIA195 knows from our discussion, there's
- substantial social work material, not just relating to
- 18 you, but to the Social Services' involvement generally
- with you and your siblings, and that runs from 46652 to
- 20 46693.
- 21 Having done all of that, HIA195, by way of
- 22 background, you were born on ?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And are now aged 52?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. You were one of seven siblings?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. The oldest, you believe died by cot death at
- a very young age, but the six siblings who came after,
- 5 you were essentially in the middle of them?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Your two older sisters, NHB8 and NHB9 or NH9, but NHB8
- and NHB9, feature in the social work material with you
- along with your younger brother, DL 59. The four of
- 10 you or sometimes three of you went into care together at
- 11 various times.
- 12 CHAIRMAN: HIA195, can I just ask you to pull the microphone
- a little bit closer to you and perhaps if you could turn
- it down slightly and then just speak up a little bit so
- we can hear you all right.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Thank you very much.
- 18 MR AIKEN: You have four children yourself?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. And now three grandchildren --
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. -- which keeps you busy. The picture of your time in
- care is complicated and I am going to try and summarise
- it, and if I go wrong at any location, you can stop me
- and correct me, but the main period of time that you

- lived in Nazareth House, which was at the placement of
- the Belfast Welfare Authority, was from January 1971,
- when you were aged 8, to May 1977, when you were aged
- 4 15. After your period in Nazareth in May 1977 you were
- 5 made subject of a Training School Order and went to live
- 6 in St. Joseph's in Middletown.
- 7 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 8 Q. We will come back to that very briefly at the end of
- 9 your evidence, but, as you say in your statement, you
- were in and out of Nazareth House a number of times.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. As I was discussing with you, I have been able to try
- and put that together. It appears that the earlier
- occasions when you were in Nazareth House were likely to
- have been a private arrangement between possibly your
- 16 mum and your dad and the nuns.
- 17 The example of that, if I can -- if we can bring up,
- please, 4210, this is a discharge record that is of 3rd
- 19 June 1963.

20

- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q.

It seems that you and your older sisters, NHB8 and NHB9, had been in Nazareth, and it is not clear and

- the congregation doesn't have a record of what date you
- entered, but this is a record of you leaving in June
- 3 '63.
- 4 Then there are similar -- if we go to 4207, there is
- 5 a similar record. I should have said just by the way
- 6 that's your mum signing to take you back out again, and
- 7 similarly this is your mum signing to take NHB8, NHB9,
- 8 HIA195 and DL 59 back out again, this time in September
- 9 '64. You know you were in and out, but you have no
- 10 specific reference as to times --
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. -- and what the circumstances were, and similarly there
- is another one in October '64 at 4208.
- 14 It seems that during that period or shortly after
- it, possibly 1965, although the records are not clear,
- 16 you -- your family becomes involved or to the notice of
- the Belfast Welfare Authority, and the reference to that
- 18 -- we are not going to bring it up -- is at 46654, but
- it appears, if we move down to 4209, that you were in
- again for a period of time in 1968, and this is
- a release for you, NHB8 and DL 59 and NHB9 in July of
- 22 1969. This time it is your dad signing for your release
- and you think maybe he took you out for the weekend at
- times.
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Then -- I am not going to bring up the detail of this,
- as you are aware of it and the Panel are aware of it,
- 3 but your mother took you and the children to live in

4

- 5 A. Right.
- 6 O. She died there in 1969.
- 7 The reference to that for the Members of the Panel is at
- 8 42998 and 46654. It appears that around that occasion,
- 9 if we go to 4204, you and NHB9 and DL 59 and now NHB11,
- 10 your youngest sister, went into Nazareth from this
- record we can see on 29th March 1969, but you were there
- to 4th April 1969. I think your recollection of that is
- 13 your granny then took you back out to live with her.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. The children lived with your granny for a period of
- 16 time. That was Mrs who looked after you then
- 17 until 1971. The Order does have a record that shows --
- if we look at 4212, please -- shows the circumstances of
- 19 you coming in to care of the Nazareth nuns again, this
- time admitted 8th January 1971:
- 21 "Application by Mr of the Belfast Welfare
- 22 Authority."
- 23 There is a recognition:
- 24 "These children have been in care previous to this.
- 25 Their maternal grandmother is no longer able to cope

- with the children due to ill health."
- 2 So you and NHB9, your older sister, and DL 59 go to
- live in Nazareth House and you are in the same group, as
- 4 I understand it?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And that group was SR31 or SR31 was in charge of?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And this was the nun who was also in charge of the
- 9 school?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And she was there until 1975 and then you remember her
- going to the Lodge?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 Q. While this record doesn't show it, your older sister --
- so there is you. Then above you is NHB9, then NHB8.
- 16 NHB8 also goes into Nazareth House, whether it is on
- a day -- you are not sure when, but for a period of time
- 18 in 1971 there was all --
- 19 A. Four of us.
- 20 Q. -- four of you were there together. We will see shortly
- 21 the circumstances that led to NHB8 and NHB9 leaving.
- The admission to care form that the Panel has come
- 23 to see over recent days with those who were admitted
- 24 through the Welfare Authority for the record -- I will
- not bring it up -- is at 46683 through to 46685. There

- is a better copy of the last page at 46653.
- 2 You don't have a specific recollection of social
- workers visiting you, HIA195, but I was showing you the
- 4 handwritten documents, and if we look, please, at 46656,
- 5 this is the -- a record of 27th January '70 -- no, it
- 6 isn't. Just take that down for me, please. 46665.
- 7 Yes. My apologies, HIA195, for the page reference.
- 8 This is the first occasion it seems:
- 9 "Visited Nazareth House with Mr and was
- introduced to the children -- introduced the children to
- 11 me. They have been in Nazareth three weeks and within
- this period became much more reserved and timid. All
- were anxious to hear about their grandmother and we
- 14 agreed ..."
- 15 MR LANE: "Asking her to visit."
- 16 CHAIRMAN: "Asking her to visit."
- 17 MR AIKEN: "... asking her to visit."
- 18 The records -- I am not going to go into the
- 19 specifics of them, but the records over the succeeding
- 20 months show the social worker, who changes over time,
- 21 taking you out to your granny and arranging for your
- granny to visit, and you remember going in and out to
- visit your granny both at weekends and in the summer.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. What I'm going to do is just look at some of the

1 relevant entries that you and I were looking at earlier

just so we follow the chronology of this, and then we

3 will apply some of these to the specific matters that

4 you talk about in your Inquiry statement. We might have

5 to look at them just more than once, but this hopefully

6 will maintain the integrity of the chronology.

In May 1971 if we look at 4... -- the next page,

46666, and at the bottom of the page -- so this is May

'71. So you have been in the home for a number of

months from January. You were 8 when you went in. You

have turned 9, and this record from Miss -- you

don't remember Miss as the social worker, but

13 what this records is she:

"Visited the children, who were pleased they would be allowed home for the weekend. Arranged for the following week. NHB9 and" -- this is short -- "HIA195", with a full stop, so HIA195, "were both disappointed they had missed their birthdays. So I wrote the date down so that they would not forget them in the future."

One of the things you talk about in your Inquiry statement, albeit you don't recollect her reminding you of your birthday and writing it down for you --

23 A. No.

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Q. -- was that birthdays were not the subject of celebration in Nazareth House.

- 1 A. No.
- 2 O. That is a record that relates to that issue. As I said
- 3 to you, there is a reference on 46667 -- if we move just
- 4 to the next page -- a reference to 30th June, which
- 5 shows the -- a record of the visits taking place with
- 6 your grandmother, but also, as I explained to you, this
- 7 is a record that says:
- 8 "Telephoned SR31 and arranged that the social worker
- 9 would collect the children to stay with their
- 10 grandmother. There was a complaint lodged about the
- dirty condition the children came back in following the
- 12 previous weekend."
- So you don't have any recollection of that being
- 14 an issue discussed with you --
- 15 A. No, never.
- 16 Q. -- about how you were being looked after when you
- 17 visited your grandmother?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. And, as I said to you, NHB8 seems to have, however it
- 20 has come about, been with you in Nazareth House, because
- 21 there's a record slightly further down the page that
- 22 shows in December '72 that she was there as well.
- 23 If we move on to the next page, on 23rd January 1973
- you are -- 4667. Sorry. 46677. If we just maximise
- 25 the top part of the page as much as we can. This is

Page 47 1 23rd January '73. So you are now 10 2 and NHB9 is almost 13. So you have been in the home for 3 slightly over two years, as has NHB9. It appears from this that the social worker had a joint conversation 4 with you and NHB9: 5 "... and the girls were in a ..." 6 7 That word is difficult to read. Maybe somebody can decipher it. 8 9 "... [something] mood and were pleased" --MR LANE: "Boisterous mood." 10 MR AIKEN: "Boisterous mood." That could be it: 11 12 "... were pleased that I had visited, possibly 13 because they have ..." MR LANE: "No other outside." 14 MR AIKEN: "... no other outside contact. 15 NHB9 and HIA195 also complained about the way SR31 16 had been treating them. They felt that she continually 17 18 picked on them in front of their group and they also 19 accused her of being violent towards them. Again it is difficult to know whether the children are exaggerating 20 21 or if they have developed a persecution complex that SR31 is against them. She has always ..." 22 MR LANE: "Talked to me." 23 MR AIKEN: "... talked to me about the [name redacted] girls 24 25 with affection, although she complains that they have to

- be controlled ..."
- 2 MS DOHERTY: "All the time."
- 3 MR AIKEN: "... all the time ..."
- 4 MS DOHERTY: "Strong willed."
- 5 MR AIKEN: "... as strong headed or strong stand to be in
- 6 group arguments" or "group arrangements, etc."
- 7 So what I wanted to ask you, HIA195, do you remember
- 8 you and your sister complaining about her being violent
- 9 to a social worker?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 O. You don't, but that's what the record shows. It is
- an issue that the Inquiry has raised with the Health &
- Social Care Board and what, if anything, was done about
- this will be looked into further.
- 15 It seems that, following that complaint, the next
- 16 month -- if we just scroll to the bottom of the page --
- on 26th February -- if we just move to the next -- yes
- 18 -- on 26th February the -- there's a:
- 19 "Phone call from SR31 to say that NHB8", so that's
- 20 your oldest -- older sister, "and NHB9 disappeared last
- 21 night. The police were informed, but as yet the girls
- 22 haven't been found -- traced."
- 23 Then the entry of the next day:
- "Girls found last night hiding in an attic in
- Nazareth Lodge. SR31 refused to take the girls back and

Page 49 1 so I contacted Sister", I think that's, " from 2 Good Shepherd Convent and she is prepared to accept the 3 girls. Visited Nazareth House this afternoon to speak to 4 SR31 and to see HIA195. HIA195 does not seem to be 5 particularly perturbed by the behaviour of her two 6 7 sisters and says she is very happy in Nazareth House. The girls asked her to go with them, but she refused, as 8 she said SR31 did not ..." 9 10 I am not sure if that is "did not know" or it maybe 11 some other word. 12 "She told you where NHB9 and NHB8 were and said that you could visit them." 13 Do you -- do you have any particular memory of that 14 15 incident where your two older siblings a month after you and NHB9 have complained or NHB9 has complained, 16 whichever of you -- the social work record says what it 17 18 says -- do you remember this incident where your older two sisters ran off and essentially were not allowed 19 back? 20 21 They just vanished. They weren't there. Do you Α. 22 know what I mean? 23 It appears -- I can't get to the bottom of when and how Q. from the records that are available, because I am not 24 25 necessarily sure they are complete, but it seems that

- 1 NHB9 does get to come back into the home for a period
- 2 possibly, but NHB8 certainly doesn't.
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. She is across the road. We can see, if we just scroll
- down a little bit, please, that:
- 6 "SR31 was quite upset by the whole affair and felt
- 7 that she had failed, but impressed that she felt that
- 8 she had no alternative but to refuse to take the girls
- back, as they were disrupting the other children in
- their group and also in the house. She also seems to be
- 11 quite reluctant to meet the girls and is unhappy that
- they are only just across the road. Thought that they
- should be sent to ... " -- that's either "Newry" or
- "Derry" -- "or Middletown. Disagreed with her on this
- point and said that I did not wish the girls to lose
- 16 contact with HIA195 and DL 59 ",
- because you two were still in Nazareth House.
- 18 CHAIRMAN: I think we can take it that's "Newry". It is
- 19 more like "Newry".
- 20 MR AIKEN: "SR31 appears to be fond of HIA195 and thinks
- 21 that she will settle quite well and will not miss her
- 22 sisters very much."
- 23 So the impression from the records as we put them
- together, while they cover various issues, is
- a suggestion of fondness towards you, and SR31 says that

- in her police interview, which we will come to, which
- 2 took place in 1996. Do you remember her displaying
- 3 fondness towards you?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. I will come back to the various incidents that have you
- form that view shortly, HIA195, but there is an incident
- 7 which we will look at from these notes which deals with
- 8 the hair cutting. I will come back to that. I was
- 9 asking you in these records it also shows an occasion
- 10 whenever the Welfare Authority appear to have paid for
- 11 your plane fare and your train fare to fly you to
- 12 and then take a train to . You didn't
- initially remember that when we were speaking --
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. -- but it was -- you went with an aunt to visit an aunt
- 16 who lived in
- 17 A. Yes. Right.
- 18 Q. That took place -- the reference, just so the Panel can
- 19 see the nature of the arrangements that were made, is at
- 20 46690 and 46692.
- 21 Unfortunately the social work records in this type
- of form don't continue through to your leaving. That's
- 23 maybe something that can be looked into further, but it
- appears that you leave in May 1977, aged 15. You
- explain in your own statement that your recollection of

- that is NHB9 ran away from where she was, picked up you,
- and you ran away together, and eventually the police
- 3 were involved and that resulted in ultimately you ending
- 4 up in Middletown.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. There is a report from that time. There's a psychiatric
- 7 report that can be found at 46658. I am not going to
- 8 bring that up, but -- and there is a report of how you
- 9 were getting on at the time at 46659 and 46660. I just
- 10 want -- I showed you this record earlier, HIA195, and if
- we can just bring up, please, 46655, you have a very
- 12 positive and warm recollection of SJM11 --
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. -- in St. Joseph's in Middletown.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. This is her it appears -- and we will clarify what
- exactly was going on in the third paragraph in a moment
- 18 -- but this is a report that seems to have been
- 19 formulated to determine -- it would have been made
- available to the court to decide whether a Training
- 21 School Order should be made or not.
- 22 What she says in it -- we talked about the reference
- to "dull girl" earlier and what that would mean in the
- context of it being written at the time, but describing
- 25 you as:

1 "... lively, extroverted, attractive, good manual

2 skills."

3 She then talks about the long history of residential

4 care. The third member of the family that they have had

5 in St. Joseph's and referring to:

6 "... the severe home deprivation and the scars of

7 this deprivation are adamant (sic) to a greater or

8 lesser extent in all the family."

9 She articulates the type of traits that she has

witnessed and says that she sees all the common signs of

11 severe institutionalisation. She says there are no

overt signs of maladjustment. That's the same as what

the psychiatrist says.

14 Then there's a particular incident that's referred

to there.

19 --

20 A. Yes.

21 0.

22 She says this:

23 "HIA195 is one of the tragedies of a broken family

and indeed to a degree of broken care. Very insecure

and needs love, care and security. The fact that HIA195

- is such an institutionalised child makes us loathe to
- 2 recommend another form of institutional care, but in the
- 3 circumstances there seems to be no alternative."
- If we just scroll down, this is what you and I were
- 5 discussing earlier, that:
- 6 "HIA195's family can offer no solution. Her father
- 7 is not interested and her sisters are incapable of
- 8 offering HIA195 the stability that she needs. There are
- 9 no hopes of fostering this girl.
- 10 HIA195 is settled, happy and contented here and so,
- 11 despite the danger of further institutionalisation, we
- 12 feel that there is little alternative but to make
- a Training School Order."
- 14 You explain in your statement that you weren't
- 15 always an angel when you were in Middletown --
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. -- but you settled down and found a warmth there that
- wasn't your experience in Nazareth House.
- 19 A. Yes. That's correct.
- 20 Q. I want to go back then to your statement. You stayed in
- 21 Middletown until '79, in fact, after your Training
- 22 School Order expired, and then ...
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. If we go back to your statement, please, at 171, you
- 25 talk at various locations in your statement about SR31

- and her behaviour towards you. You say in paragraph 5
- 2 that you were sure to get a slap every day from her.
- Was that a slap with the hand or what do you mean by
- 4 that when you say --
- 5 A. A bunch of keys on the top of the head.
- 6 Q. So it was hitting you with a bunch of keys. You say she
- 7 had her favourites, but you were her punch bag.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 O. What do you mean by "favourites"? What -- how did you
- 10 become a -- what characterised a favourite?
- 11 A. Different girls that she had, you know, that was always
- 12 with her and then other ones was hit.
- 13 Q. And you could see that distinction --
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. -- in the group that you were in. The group you were
- in, it was about forty girls. Is that -- or were there
- less? Can you remember? If you can't, just say.
- 18 A. I can't really remember.
- 19 Q. You can't remember the size of it, but there are
- a number of girls in the group?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. You describe yourself as "her punch bag". Is that just
- 23 how you characterise it, reflecting back on -- you know,
- were there good times with SR31 as well as the bad times
- 25 that you explained? Were there some times when she was

- 1 better to you?
- 2 A. I can't remember any good times with SR31.
- 3 Q. You felt you were -- you say in this paragraph you felt
- 4 you were getting picked on.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. We have looked at the record certainly from January '73,
- 7 where you and NHB9 raise that with the social worker.
- 8 In paragraph 6 then -- I should say, HIA195, that
- 9 that's the only -- that record we looked at seems to be
- the only occasion whenever SR31 was complained about to
- the social worker based on the material that the Inquiry
- has received. Do you remember complaining more often
- about SR31 to the social workers?
- 14 A. No, I was scared to in case she -- she used to beat me
- 15 all the time.
- 16 Q. So it wouldn't have been something you were complaining
- about?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. In paragraph 6 then you talk about DL 59 wetting the
- 20 bed and getting hit for wetting the bed.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. You remember that happening. In paragraph 8 -- did SR31
- also teach you in the classroom?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. You explain how you were beaten by her for being

- left-handed.
- 2 A. Yes. That's correct.
- 3 Q. What -- how would she -- was that -- did she use a ruler
- 4 or how -- what did she hit you with?
- 5 A. A bunch of keys.
- 6 Q. So it's the keys that you clearly remember were the
- 7 thing?
- 8 A. On the head.
- 9 O. You say here that she would hit you on the head in front
- of all the classes and tell everyone that you were
- 11 a dunce?
- 12 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 13 Q. Now I did say to you that there is a -- and we will come
- back to the record about education slightly later, where
- she seemed to be more positive in the social worker's
- record about your education, but we will come back to
- that. What you are saying is she hit you and you say in
- this paragraph she hit you for nothing.
- Then in paragraph 9 you recount how on a Friday you
- were involved in the cleaning of the floors in the
- 21 classroom.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. You explain you had a knife to take the --
- 24 A. Wax off.
- 25 O. -- wax off the floor and then you had to rewax it.

- 1 A. (Nods.)
- 2 Q. I was asking you can you remember others being involved
- 3 in that with you?
- 4 A. Nobody.
- 5 Q. You don't have a recollection of that. It was just the
- 6 classrooms that were done on the Friday?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Then am I right in saying the other parts of the
- 9 building then were worked on on the Saturday?
- 10 A. (Nods.)
- 11 Q. Does that mean that while there were some chores during
- the week in the mornings, the main chores were this work
- on the Friday evening and then on the Saturday?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. You mention this a number of times in your statement,
- 16 HIA195, that the punish... -- one of the punishments
- that she would give you was to kneel outside her cell.
- 18 A. And pray all night.
- 19 Q. The Order has said to the Inquiry that they accept there
- 20 may have been some kneeling. If we just bring up,
- please, 2033 and paragraph 9. Just scroll down, please.
- The Order said to the Inquiry:
- 23 "Many allegations have been made similar to those
- described by HIA195. Whilst we agree a child may have
- been made to kneel outside a Sister's door at night, we

- don't accept that HIA195 would have been left there all
- 2 night without food or sleep."
- 3 That's how it seemed to you. Whether it was all
- 4 night or not, that's how it appeared to you at the time.
- 5 A. It was all night.
- 6 Q. That's your recollection of it. You mention, if we go
- 7 back to paragraph 10 at 173, that you would be hit in
- 8 the class for falling asleep.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Was that with the keys or was that with some --
- 11 A. No, keys, bunch of keys.
- 12 Q. In paragraph 11 you talk about developing psoriasis on
- 13 your head.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. You describe how SR31 dealt with that, and that was
- having your hair cut off, and you describe the manner in
- which she tried to work on your head and the bleeding
- and then being hit with the brush that she was using.
- 19 Why did she hit you? Can you remember were you
- 20 struggling or --
- 21 A. No, I was squealing with the pain, because she was
- scrubbing my head that much with the Jeyes Fluid it was
- burning the head off me. I was squealing that much she
- just whacked me on top of the head with a scrubbing
- 25 brush.

- 1 Q. There is reference in the -- as I was showing you
- earlier, there is an entry in the social work records
- 3 that may relate to this incident. If we look at 46682,
- 4 please:
- 5 "Also visited HIA195 on 28th."
- This is in August '73. We can tell that from the
- 7 page before:
- 8 "She starts back at school hopefully on Monday, 3rd
- 9 September."
- 10 We will come back to that.
- 11 "While on holiday in Ballycastle HIA195 picked up
- some sort of head infection and this is still causing
- 13 her -- still troubling her some weeks later. SR31 is
- treating this twice daily and HIA195 has dealt with or
- taken the whole thing extremely well, especially given
- she has had to have her hair cut short on top.
- 17 SR31 is pleased with HIA195, although this is always
- 18 very -- although she is always very pessimistic about
- 19 how she may change when she is 12 or 13. I find HIA195
- an easy and cooperative child to work with and feel
- 21 SR31's pessimism is unfounded."
- 22 So if that's the same incident or the reference to
- it, what you are saying is the manner in which you were
- dealt with was harsh you feel?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Apparently you were taking it very well according to
- this record, but, as you reflect on it, you don't regard
- it as something that you should have had to take very
- 4 well?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. If we go back then, please, to 173, in paragraphs 14, 15
- 7 and 16 of your statement, HIA195, you describe in detail
- 8 the sexual abuse that you suffered at the hands of
- 9 Father Brendan Smyth. I am not going to go into the
- 10 detail of that abuse. You explain how it began with if
- I describe it as grooming, where you and your brother
- were brought to him, sweets, and then eventually you saw
- him on your own after your ballet classes, and you
- 14 describe what he did to you.
- 15 You have also described that in detail in your
- police statements, which the Panel have had the
- opportunity to read, and they also have -- I am not
- 18 going to open it -- the interview in which Father
- 19 Brendan Smyth admitted to the police abusing you and, as
- 20 you know, he was convicted of that abuse, having pleaded
- 21 quilty to it
- You explain in your statement and in the police
- 23 statement the -- you saw him on television and decided
- to come forward and explain what he had done.
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. What you do say in your statement, which I want to raise
- with you, is that -- you are saying in the statement
- 3 that -- two things, and I want to treat them separately,
- 4 if I can. First of all, SR31 took you to see Father
- 5 Brendan Smyth, who was in the visitors' room in Nazareth
- 6 House.
- 7 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 8 Q. You saw him over a period of occasions. I'm sure you
- 9 can't be precise as to how many times this was, but it
- 10 was over a number of occasions in Nazareth House.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. You recollect SR31 making you aware that he was there to
- see you and taking you to see him?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. I think you said to me earlier that you recall her
- 16 bringing tea in for him?
- 17 A. She brought him tea and sandwiches up.
- 18 Q. The second aspect that I want to raise with you then is
- 19 that after the first occasion that he sexually abused
- you you explain in your statement that you told SR31
- 21 about it.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Can you explain to the Panel why did you tell SR31 about
- it? What happened that led you to tell her about it?
- 25 A. Because there was blood running down my legs. Father

- 1 Brendan Smyth had been inserting his fingers.
- 2 Q. That's what led you to speak to her, because of the
- 3 shock of that for you?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. You came forward to speak to the police about these
- 6 issues in January and February 1994. I am not going to
- 7 bring up the police statements. The Panel has the
- 8 opportunity to read them. As I said, Smyth was
- 9 interviewed about them and pleaded guilty to the abuse,
- 10 but you were then one of -- and I appreciate you
- 11 wouldn't -- as I understand it, when you spoke to the
- police, you were just speaking to them about you. You
- had no involvement with other individuals who might have
- been speaking to the police about whatever they were
- 15 talking to them about.
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. You were living in at the time.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. SR31 -- just to be clear, this is the same SR31 that ran
- your group and who was in charge of the school and who
- left to go and work in the Lodge. Did you know her as
- 22 SR31?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. That's how she was known. So, to be clear, it is
- 25 that -- there wasn't another Sister [name redacted]?

- 1 A. No, SR31.
- 2 Q. In 1995 it appears that that SR31, whose real name was
- 3 SR31 or SR31, was the subject of a police investigation.
- 4 Just if I make the Panel aware that file, which was
- file 30 of 41 of Operation Overview, runs from 60289 to
- 6 60408.
- 7 Now you were one of seven individuals whose various
- 8 allegations were put to SR31 and amongst them was
- 9 a thread of the use of the keys, and what I am going to
- do -- I was discussing this with you earlier -- is just
- show the Panel some of the core references in the
- interview that relate to what she had to say.
- 13 If we look at -- the period -- the part that covers
- 14 your allegations being put to her are at 60324 through
- to 60342. If we just bring up 60324, please, there is
- a discussion here that -- she says well, she did carry
- 17 keys. She said:
- 18 "There were two keys."
- I presume they were for a large door. So they were
- 20 --
- 21 A. Two keys? There must have been about a hundred keys in
- the bunch.
- 23 Q. Sorry, HIA195. Can you just --
- 24 A. It wasn't two keys. It was about a hundred keys in one
- bunch.

- 1 Q. So it was a bunch of keys?
- 2 A. Uh-huh.
- 3 Q. She is saying to the police there were two keys that she
- 4 had. One was the classroom, one to her private room.
- 5 She would have carried those at night.
- 6 "A. Yes."
- 7 Just scroll down, please.
- 8 "Q. At all times basically when you were --
- 9 A. They were in my pocket, yes.
- 10 Q. Certainly you don't know anything about hitting
- 11 the child with the --
- 12 A. Certainly not.
- Q. -- bunch? Certainty not. Right. Okay."
- 14 Then she goes on to talk about you, and the same
- issue is raised. If we just look quickly, please, at
- 16 60333, she says very specifically:
- "No recollection of that at all now, you know. It
- 18 didn't happen. I didn't hit any..."
- 19 Well, I presume "hit" should be in there:
- "I didn't hit anybody with the keys."
- 21 So she is saying categorically while she had some
- keys, she never used them to hit anyone. What do you
- want to say to the Inquiry about that, HIA195?
- 24 A. She did hit me with the keys.
- 25 Q. She says in the police interview, if we look, please, at

- 1 60335, that you were considered, she seems to be
- 2 implying by others, to be her pet --
- 3 A. Never.
- 4 Q. -- and that other children in the group used to tease
- 5 her that HIA195 could not do any wrong. She says even
- to this day, which would have been 1996, she was
- 7 receiving letters from other girls stating that you were
- 8 her pet.
- 9 She said -- if we move through on to the next page,
- please, 60336, she says that you were -- she was very
- 11 kind to you and did -- on 60337 she says she did all she
- could to help you. On 60338 she says she was
- 13 particularly good to you.
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. Is that how you recall your time with SR31?
- 16 A. No. I hated her.
- 17 Q. Why did you hate her?
- 18 A. Because she was just cruel and rude and ignorant and
- 19 kept beating me all the time.
- 20 Q. What she says about -- the allegation then is put to her
- 21 that you told her what Brendan Smyth had done to you
- that first occasion, and if we go back, please, to
- 23 60328, so the -- what you say in your police statement
- about what happened and what you told her is explained
- 25 to her and she is asked then:

Page 67 1 "Q. Have you any recollection of that incident? 2 A. No, none, and as a matter of fact I don't know 3 that priest at all." The police officer then says: "You didn't know Father Brendan Smyth? 5 Never knew him. 6 Q. No contact with him? 7 8 A. No contact with him whatever." Then she is asked: 10 "Q. One thing I should establish is do you know who 11 he is now? 12 Α. I do. 13 Q. And who we're talking about? 14 A. Yes. 15 But you never met him before? Ο. A. No." 16 17 She refers to two constables 18 19 "Q. Yes. Was that is the first time you heard the 20 name --21 Α. Yes. -- Father Brendan Smyth? 22 Ο. 23 Yes, and as a matter of fact when they came and Α. 24 they told me about HIA195, they told me about [name 25 redacted] but they didn't give me any name. They told

Page 68 1 me about this child. They didn't give a name, and as a 2 matter of fact I thought they were referring to her 3 older sister, NHB8 --4 O. Yes. 5 -- who did give me quite a lot of trouble, you 6 know. 7 They didn't give you a name? Q. 8 Α. No. 9 Q. Right. 10 Well, they didn't. I don't know whether they Α. 11 were aware." 12 Then if we can go through, please, to 60339, after the discussion about the keys and the hitting it comes 13 back round to the discussion about Brendan Smyth. If we 14 15 just scroll down, please, and she says: 16 It is very much -- as a matter of fact I'm 17 shocked. 18 O. Uh-huh." Scroll down, please: 19 I was more than shocked when I heard it and 20 21 especially as I didn't even know Brendan, Brendan Smyth. When you heard she had made the allegation? 22 Ο. 23 A. Yes. 24 When was that? Q. 25 A. When did I hear it? Oh, some time ago now

1 I think.

11

19

20

21

22

23

24

- "Q. Just where you mention the ballet classes, that
  was one of the things actually she did say, that it was
  after the ballet classes that the priest came to visit
  her specifically.
  - A. That's another thing. They talk about Smyth coming to visit. Well, I was in the primary school, St. Michael's Primary School, and I was usually there until 5.00 or 6.00 in the evening, you know. I went home about 5.00 or so, but I did hear well after this ..."

    Then she says:
- 25 "... allegations. I had no recollection of this

- 1 Father Smyth, but I did hear that there was a mass --
- there used to be a mass there about 3 o'clock and that
- he used to come in. How she ever -- but how she ever
- 4 saw him then is beyond me, because the Sister who had
- 5 charge of the parlour was very strict and certainly
- 6 wouldn't allow the children in there."
- 7 So the implication of this seems to be, HIA195, that
- 8 not only did she not ever take you to Smyth, who she did
- 9 not know, but that she wouldn't have been there at the
- time Smyth would have been in the home, if he was in the
- 11 home.
- 12 A. Of course she was there.
- 13 O. She can't understand how he would have --
- 14 A. She was there, because I didn't finish ballet dancing to
- 15 6 o'clock. I used to go up there. She used to be
- waiting for me. She used to take me down to the room to
- 17 him by the arm and fire me into the room to him and then
- 18 bring him in tea.
- 19 Q. So you are clear about that?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. This is -- what's being said here is not --
- 22 A. She's telling lies.
- 23 Q. Now the one positive experience that did you have,
- 24 HIA195, that you explain in paragraph 13 of your
- 25 statement at 173 was ballet. We were talking about it.

- Obviously after ballet you were then abused.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. But you remember Miss , the ballet teacher --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. -- and being very positive about that. Where did the
- 6 ballet classes actually happen?
- 7 A. At the top of the Ormeau Road.
- 8 Q. So they didn't --
- 9 A. No, we went out to ballet. We didn't -- it wasn't in
- the home. We had to go out.
- 11 Q. Yes. What I understand you to be saying is when you
- come back to the home, then SR31 would have said to you
- that Father Smyth was there to see you.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. So the ballet wasn't happening in the -- in Nazareth
- 16 House?
- 17 A. No, because Miss used to bring me back and leave
- 18 me at the door.
- 19 Q. Now in paragraph 17 of your statement, HIA195, you talk
- about education, and I said to you we were going to
- 21 return to this briefly. If you look -- you say that
- 22 SR31 wouldn't let you do the 11 Plus, because she said
- you were a dunce, and you were sent to St. Monica's to
- do a test to see what class you would be put into. You
- 25 thought:

"I got top marks in the exam and was going to be put into the top class, but SR31 told me I wasn't going to that school, because it was too good for me. I was sent to another school" -- that was -- "for children with special needs."

You explain the difficulty there with your religion. You refer to how the headmaster said he didn't know what you were doing in that school.

I said to you there is a record in fairness, if we look at 46677, in the social work papers, and I think it's towards the bottom of this page. Can we just scroll down a little further? Yes.

"HIA195 ..."

This is the social worker has said:

"I discussed with SR31 her chances of her attending St. Monica's. SR31 feels that HIA195 is not material for a special school and is determined that she should be allowed to try St. Monica's to see how she progresses."

Then there's reference to -- and you seem to like school and -- in fact, that's about NHB9. My apologies. The next bit is about NHB9. So what that section is suggesting is that certainly at that point in time SR31 seemed to be wanting you to try St. Monica's.

25 A. Never.

- 1 Q. That's not your recollection --
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. -- of how you remember things developing?
- 4 A. She sent me straight to School down the Ravenhill
- 5 Road, the bottom of the Ravenhill Road.
- 6 Q. You don't -- you remember going to do a test in St.
- 7 Monica's?
- 8 A. I went to St. Monica's to do a test, for the test, but
- 9 after that I was sent down to Secondary School.
- 10 Q. You talk then in your statement about -- in
- paragraphs 19 and 20 about running away. We have seen
- the earlier version of running away, but then -- when
- you wouldn't go with your sisters, but you then
- subsequently did run away, and ultimately you were moved
- out of Nazareth House. It doesn't appear that the
- social work records relating to that period are
- available, the '76/'77 period. Maybe that's something
- that can be looked into, but ultimately the Training
- 19 School Order resulted in you being in Middletown then.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. There is -- I was asking you earlier -- there is
- a letter of 17th December 1984, which was written by
- 23 a Ms , if we look at 46657. Now this was you --
- 24 you would have been 22. You were living in as
- 25 I understand it, at the time. It -- the social worker

- explains the background to SR47 , who
- 2 presumably was in Nazareth House at the time. Her --
- 3 this social worker's intention, Ms , in the third
- 4 paragraph was to compile a life story book, as you had
- 5 very little information about yourself. So I presume
- 6 this is a social worker that came into your life and you
- weren't able to tell her a huge amount, because you
- 8 didn't know a huge amount about your background.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. She was going to create a life story book for you. She
- 11 had got a file from Social Services in effect and then
- was asking for some photographs or any other information
- that was had. In the files that have been provided to
- the Inquiry there doesn't appear to be a reply to that
- 15 letter. Do you remember the social worker ultimately
- doing that book for you?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. You don't. So if there was a reply, we don't have it,
- but you don't remember whether she in the end did it or
- 20 not?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. HIA195, there are two questions that we ask each witness
- at the end of their evidence. The first is about
- recommendations, that the Panel at the end of its work
- 25 has to consider what recommendations it might make to

- 1 the Northern Ireland Government in three areas. One is
- 2 some form of apology; the second is some form of
- memorial; or the third is some other means of redress.
- We ask each witness whether there is anything they want
- to say to the Panel to assist the Panel's thinking about
- 6 what recommendations they might make. Is there anything
- 7 that you want to say about that?
- 8 A. It's never going to give me my childhood back, is it, no
- 9 matter what I say?
- 10 Q. So the opportunity to come and speak and say what
- 11 happened to you --
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. -- that's what you wanted the opportunity to do?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. The last question that we ask each witness is whether
- there is anything else -- at the moment we are looking
- 17 at Nazareth House -- whether there's anything else about
- 18 your time in Nazareth House that maybe I didn't cover or
- didn't cover correctly that you want to say to the Panel
- 20 to assist with its work. Is there anything else that
- 21 you want to say about your time in Nazareth House?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. No. HIA195, I am not going to ask you any more
- questions. The Panel may want to ask you something.
- I just remind those present again that what they have

- 1 heard from you today is not something that should be
- discussed beyond here and the names won't be used in
- 3 accordance with the Inquiry's restriction orders. It
- 4 may be the Panel Members will want to ask you something.
- Just bear with me for a short while.
- 6 Questions from THE PANEL
- 7 MR LANE: The abuse by Father Brendan Smyth carried on over
- 8 a long time.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Did you ever talk to any of the other girls about this
- 11 at all?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. You just kept it totally to yourself?
- 14 A. (Nods.)
- 15 Q. Okay. Thank you very much.
- 16 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA195, I'm sure you will be relieved to
- hear that's the last question you are going to be asked
- 18 today. Thank you very much for coming to tell us about
- 19 your experiences. We very much appreciate it. Thank
- 20 you.
- 21 A. Thank you.
- 22 MR AIKEN: Chairman, I am going to deal with the evidence of
- another individual who has passed away.
- 24 CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 25 MR AIKEN: I am in a position to deal with that now if we

give HIA195 an opportunity to leave with .

2 CHAIRMAN: Yes. There is no need for you to stay. So if

3 you would like to go with now.

4 MR AIKEN: I'll come and see HIA195 shortly.

5 (Witness withdrew)

6 Reading of evidence of WITNESS HIA224

7 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, I am going to

8 open to you the evidence of HIA224, who was HIA224. She

9 was known I believe to her friends as HIA224, and

10 I believe some of her friends have attended today to

11 hear her story being opened. She was an applicant to

the Inquiry and was due to attend to give evidence.

I was going to take her through that evidence on 12th

14 February. She was unable to attend due to sickness.

15 Her friend who did give evidence that day explained that

16 to the Inquiry. Unfortunately she passed away on

17 at the age of 66 and therefore

didn't have the opportunity to come and share her

19 experience personally with the Inquiry.

20 If we can bring up, please, SNB-323, this is the

witness statement that was filed by HIA224. If we go

through, please, to 328, I'm happy to confirm and the

23 Panel will be aware that this statement was signed by

her and filed as the evidence that she intended to adopt

25 before the Inquiry.

Page 78

Equally, Members of the Panel, there is the response statement from the Sisters of Nazareth, which can be found at 2065 and 2066. If we just look at paragraph 10 of that, please, at 2066, paragraph 10 included this:

"The congregation have endeavoured to provide a safe and loving home for children and we offer HIA224 an unreserved and sincere apology for any treatment she received by any Sister which fell below the acceptable standard."

In addition, the Health & Social Care Board statement can be found at 6149 to 6150 and that explained to the Inquiry that HIA224 was a private placement in Nazareth House.

She was born on and was 66 at the time of her death. She was originally placed in St.

Joseph's Babies' Home and then was in Nazareth House from 6th July 1951 until 1st March 1966, aged 17. She was in the St. Anne's group overseen by SR116 during her period in the Nazareth House proper.

At paragraph 4, please, if we go back to 324, she said to the Inquiry that:

"After breakfast we all had chores to do. We had to wash and scrub the floors on our hands and knees. Big passage that we have to clean, and after breakfast we went to school."

Page 79

As the Panel is aware, the Order have said there would have been some tidying up each day, but that the main chores wouldn't have been done every day.

In paragraph 5 she describes going to primary school and being taught there, and on one occasion being made to read out loud and couldn't pronounce a word, and the nun was so cross at her. That had a big impact on her. She explains that she always felt inferior then when she was made to read out loud. She felt she was terrible at maths and would have liked to have learned more.

In paragraph 7 of her statement to the Inquiry she explained this process that the Panel has heard a number of times about -- of showing underwear.

"We were expected to keep ourselves clean and tidy and we had to show our knickers to the nuns. We were all lined up. If you had an accident, then we were humiliated."

She refers to being bathed once a week or twice a week and the nuns using Jeyes Fluid.

"We always said it was very smarty because it would make our skins sting."

They had to wait for their turn to get washed.

In paragraph 9 of HIA224's statement at 325 she says that:

"We dreaded being punished and I hated witnessing

punishments. The girls who were punished most seemed to be the ones who were quite brave and outspoken."

She explains how a nun:

"... liked to hit us on the knuckles with a ruler, but she wouldn't stop -- but she would stop if we cried straightaway."

That's SR116 that she is referring to, SR116. She says that:

"Some girls definitely had it worse than others."

She gives an example in paragraph 11 of a particular girl, who she describes as:

"... generally a very nice girl, but she was having a bad day, and the nun picked on her to say the decade of the rosary. She refused and we all witnessed her being slapped on the hands with a ruler."

In paragraph 10 she describes an occasion whenever she was getting slapped on the wrist by an older nun and SR134 came to her rescue and pulled the -- pulled her away from the older nun. She said:

"I always liked SR134 after that incident. She was my favourite nun. She was quite strict with other children, but she was kind to me. The nuns had their favourites for some reason. If the nuns were cruel to me, I sometimes wondered if they knew something about my background that I didn't, because they always made me

Page 81 1 feel inferior." 2 She talks about how SR31 in particular picked on her 3 for small things. "Just sitting down, she would tell me to straighten 4 5 up." In paragraph 9 and paragraph 22 of her statement she 6 7 brings together two themes that the Inquiry has heard The first in paragraph 9 is that of fear. 8 She talks about dreading being punished and then: 9 10 "There was an atmosphere of fear in the home. We 11 would just see children crying as if something had 12 happened to them." Then if we look at paragraph 22, please, on 328, she 13 says that her time in the home has affected her in later 14 life. Ouite a lot that she had blocked out. 15 "There wasn't much love in the home. We only had 16 each other. It has made it difficult for me to show 17 18 affection and get close to people." Then she explains that she felt too frightened to 19 have children, because she didn't want history to repeat 20 21 itself and says she would have loved to have had a better education. 22 23 In paragraph 13 at 326, please, she explains to the Inquiry that -- what I am going to characterise as 24 25 a lack of information, and she says that she really only

Page 82 1 found out her real name through the doctor: 2 "... when he called me by my full name on one occasion." 3 In paragraph 15 she describes how: 4 5 "One of the girls asked when her birthday was. The nun replied 'February'. So this girl thought her 6 7 birthday was the entire month of February." She says: 8 9 "I don't recall ever having a birthday party or 10 celebrating anyone's birthday in any way, even singing to them." 11 12 She refers to in paragraph 17 then that when she reached a certain age, they got together: 13 "... and used to wonder about ourselves." 14 15 She went to get her birth certificate and that was the first time that she found out her mother's name, and 16 17 it turned out that the nuns had the wrong birth date for 18 her. The nuns apologised for that in their replying 19 statement. She does describe in paragraph 12 of her statement 20 21 at 326 some what appear to be more positive times in the 22 garden making their own entertainment, swings and 23 climbing frames and games that they played, Cowboys and

In paragraph 14 of her statement she refers to what

Indians.

24

25

Page 83 1 she called the taxi party. They were picked up in 2 a taxi at Christmas and they'd get wee gifts, as she described them, like a pen set or bath cubes, but then 3 she said: 4 5 "We only had them a short time and we wouldn't see them again." 6 7 She explains in paragraph 18 at 327 that she left St. Monica's at the age of 15, but stayed on in Nazareth 8 9 House for another year, and then had a live-in job, but then she describes: 10 11 "I went back to St. Joseph's Baby Home to work and was training to be a child's nurse." 12 That didn't work out: 13 14 "... because I couldn't survive ..." 15 on the money she received. So for a period of time she had to go back and work in St. Joseph's. 16 Obviously the Inquiry Panel have had the opportunity 17 18 to have regard to the other material that relates to 19 HIA224. Unless I can assist any further, those are the matters that I was going to raise with the Inquiry in 20 21 respect of her evidence. 22 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Perhaps one matter that we might just 23 highlight for the benefit of those present, in paragraph 20 of her statement she describes how in later 24 25 life she learnt that she had a relative in Nazareth

Page 84 Lodge, and that turned out not to be her brother, as had 1 2 at first been thought, but a cousin, and that cousin was one of those who was sent to Australia under the Child 3 4 Migrant Scheme, and she was able to establish contact with him in later life. 5 Well, ladies and gentlemen, that completes our 6 7 programme for today, rather earlier than usual, because 8 we only had two witnesses who were able to come to speak 9 to us in person. We will adjourn now and we will resume tomorrow morning at the usual time. 10 11 (12.45 pm)(Hearing adjourned until 10 o'clock tomorrow morning) 12 13 --00000--14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25