

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HISTORICAL INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE INQUIRY

being heard before:

SIR ANTHONY HART (Chairman)

MR DAVID LANE

MS GERALDINE DOHERTY

held at

Banbridge Court House

Banbridge

on Thursday, 8th January 2015

commencing at 10.00 am

(Day 84)

MS CHRISTINE SMITH, QC and MR JOSEPH AIKEN appeared as
Counsel to the Inquiry.

1 Thursday, 8th January 2015

2 (10.00 am)

3 WITNESS HIA307 (called - by videolink)

4 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. Before we
5 start this morning can I just, as always, remind
6 everyone that mobile phones must be switched off or
7 placed on "Silent"/"Vibrate" and that no photography or
8 recording is permitted within the chamber or anywhere on
9 the premises.

10 MS SMITH: Good morning, Chairman, Panel Members, ladies and
11 gentlemen. Our first witness today is HIA307. He is
12 "HIA307". HIA307 wishes to maintain the anonymity that
13 the Inquiry has afforded him and he is content to take
14 the oath.

15 Good evening to you, HIA307. Can I just check that
16 since we last spoke today you have managed to obtain
17 a copy of a bible there?

18 **A. Yes, we have.**

19 Q. That's great. Thank you. The Chairman will then just
20 swear you in.

21 CHAIRMAN: HIA307, can you hear me?

22 **A. Yes, I can.**

23 WITNESS HIA307 (sworn)

24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, HIA307. If at any stage you
25 find it difficult to hear what we're saying, please

1 don't hesitate to tell us.

2 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

3 MS SMITH: Thank you. Chairman, Panel Members, the relevant
4 documents are to be found in the bundle at SNB-096 to
5 107, which is HIA307's statement.

6 The congregation's response is at 1620 to 1621.

7 The Health & Social Care Board response is at 5665
8 to 5666 and essentially indicates that this was
9 a private placement and they hold no records.

10 There is also material which HIA307 brought to the
11 Inquiry, which can be found at SNB-32099 to 32110 and
12 32137 to 32151.

13 Now if we could just put HIA307's statement up,
14 please, at 096, HIA307, you will see -- you can't see
15 the statement that we have, but I know you have a copy
16 of the witness statement you provided to the Inquiry
17 with you there.

18 **A. Yes, I have.**

19 Q. Okay. I am just going to ask if we could look at the
20 last page of your statement, and can I ask you to
21 confirm that you signed your witness statement -- that's
22 107, please -- can I ask you just to confirm that you
23 signed your witness statement on 5th June 2014?

24 **A. Yes, I did.**

25 Q. Would you also confirm, please, HIA307, that you wish

1 the Inquiry to take this statement into account as your
2 evidence together with anything else that you tell us
3 today?

4 **A. Yes, I do.**

5 Q. Thank you. Now if we go back to the first page at
6 paragraph 1, your personal details are set out on that
7 page and I am not going to go into those personal
8 details, HIA307, but can I just ask you to confirm that
9 you are now aged 69, almost 70?

10 **A. That's correct.**

11 Q. We know that you were placed in Nazareth Lodge from
12 February 1948 until December 1956.

13 In paragraph 2 of your statement you say this and
14 you describe your time there as "bleak, harsh and
15 cruel". You say:

16 "The nuns were at best indifferent but more often
17 were sadistic bullies, who spoke with harsh, loud voices
18 in scornful, dismissive tones. They were quick to
19 strike out and provided no reassurance or comfort to
20 a small, frightened child."

21 You go on then to speak about -- I am going to ask
22 you a little bit about life in the home in general,
23 HIA307, first of all. You describe the dormitories in
24 paragraph 3 there. You say:

25 "We slept in a large dormitory, which had beds down

1 the sides of the room and a row in the middle. There
2 was a cubicle in the corner where the nun who was in
3 charge of that dormitory slept."

4 Can I just ask about this, HIA307? Did -- did you
5 ever see a nun at night-time? Did you ever see a nun
6 come into the dormitory at night-time?

7 **A. I guess, yes, sometimes there'd be a child crying and**
8 **then they come out to find out what was going on, and**
9 **the nuns, they walked to and fro through the -- through**
10 **the bedroom, and to make sure children were asleep and**
11 **all that sort of thing.**

12 Q. Thank you. In paragraph 5 -- and I'll come on to why
13 you were crying -- you say you cried yourself to sleep
14 so often:

15 "... in beds that were never warm enough, with
16 inadequate blankets, leaving me with freezing feet",
17 and you never had any sense of comfort or security.
18 I will come on to why you were crying. When you were
19 crying, did any of the nuns come to you to see what was
20 wrong?

21 **A. No, not me personally, but I believe they did for some**
22 **of the children, maybe the smaller ones, but I'm not**
23 **sure about that.**

24 Q. At paragraph 11 of your statement you talk you about
25 bathtime in the home and you say that:

1 "The bathroom in Nazareth Lodge was a massive room
2 with claw-foot baths. The nuns were keen on cleanliness
3 and they poured Jeyes fluid into the bath of the water
4 (sic) which was used to wash many boys. I recall the
5 stinging of the water with the Jeyes fluid on my body.
6 It stung like hell."

7 That's your recollection of bathtime at this period
8 in the home.

9 **A. Yes, yes. That's correct. I think -- I think the Jeyes**
10 **Fluid was supposed to remove any lice or -- I think that**
11 **was what it was for, but it was like a very strong**
12 **detergent, and I think they used the same detergent to**
13 **do the floors, to mop up the floors and clean the**
14 **different tiled areas in the orphanage.**

15 Q. Well, can I just move back to paragraph 4 of your
16 statement? In this paragraph you describe how you:

17 "... endured countless acts of physical violence
18 and, equally as traumatic, witnessed daily assaults as
19 children were literally picked up by their ears and
20 thrown to the ground, belted and kicked around. As
21 a very small boy the terror of their shouting and name
22 calling was terrifying",

23 and I take when you are talking about "their
24 shouting", you are talking about the nuns here, HIA307.
25 Is that correct?

1 **A. Yes, the nuns, yes. Yes, I'm talking about the nuns.**
2 **They were quite frightening at times.**

3 Q. You say:

4 "We were all called 'sons of whores', a term I never
5 understood except that it was obviously bad and meant we
6 were all very bad children. The verbal abuse from the
7 nuns has stayed with me and I have never been able to
8 forget how it made me feel as a young child."

9 You go on in paragraph 6, HIA307, to describe how as
10 an adult you suffer from profound hearing loss. You are
11 totally deaf in one ear and have slight hearing in the
12 other, assisted by a hearing aid that costs you money to
13 replace every five years.

14 You say that your audiologist is clear that is the
15 result of trauma from constant beatings to your head and
16 ears as a child. You say:

17 "Particularly when the nuns would box my ears,
18 slapping me hard with open palms across both ears, it
19 forced air and pressure into my ears, leading to
20 permanent damage."

21 You say the pain was excruciating. You would be
22 nauseous and lose balance when they did that, and you
23 say they did it often. It happened -- you say:

24 "They crept up behind me if I was talking or
25 something and they would say, 'Take that, HIA307'. By

1 the time I left Nazareth Lodge in 1956 my hearing was
2 severely impaired and it has caused me enormous grief as
3 well as communication and employment problems, resulting
4 in financial hardship in my entire life."

5 Now I know, HIA307 --

6 **A. Yes, that's correct.**

7 Q. -- you can, however, hear what I'm saying, because of
8 the assistance that you have from your hearing aid. Is
9 that correct?

10 **A. Yes, that's right, yes. Yes. I can hear you, but with
11 great effort.**

12 Q. And I know we have had to have the volume turned up at
13 your end so that you could hear me properly.

14 **A. That's correct.**

15 Q. Can I just -- can I just move on to paragraph 7 here?
16 You describe what you say was a particularly bleak and
17 miserable experience in Nazareth Lodge, which occurred
18 when you were about 7 or 8 years of age. You think you
19 had either measles, mumps or chicken pox, but certainly
20 an illness, and you were left alone in isolation for
21 days.

22 "I never saw a doctor and, apart from food being
23 brought in and left for me, nobody spoke to me or gave
24 me any care or comfort. I felt profound despair, fear
25 and loneliness",

1 and you still feel haunted by that period. You
2 describe another occasion --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. Sorry. I am just reading through your statement,
5 HIA307.

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. -- when you were playing on the merry-go-round at
8 Nazareth Lodge and when one of the wood swings which was
9 broken swung into your face and cut you just below your
10 right eye. You say you still have the scar there to
11 this day and you never saw a doctor or nurse whilst in
12 the Lodge. Can I --

13 **A. That's correct.**

14 Q. Can I ask whenever this injury occurred to your eye, who
15 would have treated it?

16 **A. Sorry?**

17 Q. Did anyone give you any treatment for the injury to
18 below your eye?

19 **A. No. I didn't get a bandage. I think it was probably
20 cleaned when we had baths or washed or something, but
21 I never saw anybody. I never got any medical care.**

22 Q. At paragraph 8 here you describe a different type of
23 beating. You've described the ear boxing and pulling
24 children up by the ears, but at paragraph 8 you've said
25 that:

1 "One of the most painful punishments dished out by
2 the nuns was the beating of my fingertips with a wooden
3 ruler."

4 When we spoke earlier, I clarified with you this
5 happened mostly in the classrooms in the school
6 section of Nazareth Lodge.

7 **A. That's correct.**

8 Q. You say:

9 "The nuns would grab my hand and squeeze the fingers
10 all bunched up together until they went red and then
11 strike them across the fingertips with a ruler. The
12 pain was terrible and it was done with viciousness,
13 especially in winter, when our hands were so cold, so
14 they could inflict the greatest pain and generate fear."

15 **A. That's correct, yes.**

16 Q. Can I just ask why you might have been punished in
17 school in this way, HIA307?

18 **A. Ah, well, I mean, boys will be boys I suppose.**

19 I suppose I spoke out of turn at times, and you were not
20 paying attention or -- and it may have been because
21 I didn't hear what was going on and I was probably
22 accused of ignoring the questions that were put to me.
23 I don't know. I can't remember. I can only remember
24 the punishment, but it was dealt out not only to me but
25 to numerous children.

1 Q. You go on in paragraph 9 here to describe a particular
2 nun, and we have given her the designation "SR34". I am
3 going to use the name, but I am just going remind
4 everybody at our end that the name is not to be used
5 outside of this chamber. That was SR34. You describe
6 her as "the most terrifying nun at Nazareth Lodge". You
7 say:

8 "She was an aggressive bully and she was the biggest
9 nun. She was always yelling at the children and
10 punching us with closed fists. She also boxed our ears.
11 She had a nasty angry face, and seeing her coming up the
12 corridor made you shrink back against the wall to try
13 not to be noticed."

14 You go on to describe a different nun, who is
15 "SR152", and that is SR152. You say:

16 "She seemed much -- she seemed kinder, but she was
17 upstairs with the big boys and I didn't see her very
18 much. She was more of a friend to us and taught us how
19 to play rounders. She appeared to be more modern than
20 the other nuns and maybe she knew that the way we were
21 being treated was not right."

22 Can I just pause there and ask was there an age
23 differential between these two nuns? Was one much older
24 than the other or what was the position?

25 **A. SR152 was younger and I think from recollection --**

1 I don't know whether she was that popular with the other
2 nuns, because of her -- the way she got on with the
3 children. She seemed to get on better with the children
4 than the other nuns, and I think she found it hard to
5 fit in to start off with. I think things mellowed after
6 a while, but she seemed to be a kinder person, and you
7 noticed the difference between her and the other nuns.

8 Q. You then go on in paragraph 10 here to talk about
9 a third nun, "SR71", who is SR71. You say:

10 "During one particular incident this nun belted me
11 with her fists and for weeks afterwards slapped me about
12 and shouted at me every time she saw me."

13 The catalyst for that was in the Lodge you were all
14 watching a Paul Robeson film about slavery. One day
15 some visitors came into Nazareth Lodge while you and two
16 others were on your hands and knees waxing the endless
17 wooden floors.

18 "One of the visitors asked me how I liked living
19 there. I told her we were treated like slaves."

20 Now can I just ask do you remember who these
21 visitors were or where they had come from?

22 A. Well, they may have been -- they may have been people
23 from -- they were civilians. They weren't religious
24 people. They weren't wearing a priest's cloth and they
25 were all -- I think they were all male and they were

1 wearing suits, and they were -- they may have been child
2 welfare people or some officials. They were some
3 official people anyway and they had come to visit the
4 orphanage, and I opened my mouth too much, and
5 I received punishment for my efforts for a few days and
6 weeks after that.

7 Q. You say, as you say here in your statement, that
8 resulted in you getting the wrath of the nuns,
9 especially SR71. Was she present when you made the
10 comment?

11 A. I think she was. There was one -- there was a nun
12 present, because when we were doing these jobs, there
13 was always a supervisory nun in the background making
14 sure things were done properly.

15 One of the things that I could add to that is that
16 my name wasn't HIA307 at the time. My name used to be
17 "HIA307" when I was at the orphanage. My name changed
18 when I came to Australia to HIA307 or HIA307. This
19 Sister used to say things like, "So we're not good for
20 you -- we are not good enough for you, HIA307", and that
21 would, you know, end up -- the statement would be
22 finished with a whack around the earhole or something
23 like that just to let me know that they weren't happy
24 with what happened.

25 Q. You say that they were always worried about putting up

1 a good front when any officials were around and you were
2 dressed nicely for church and then back into rags to do
3 the polishing and dirty work.

4 **A. That is correct, yes.**

5 Q. HIA307, just so you know that we -- and we discussed
6 this earlier, that the congregation have given us a
7 response statement for -- in response to the statement
8 you have given to the Inquiry, and they have in that
9 statement said that they offer you an unreserved and
10 sincere apology for any treatment you received by any
11 Sister which fell below the acceptable standard.

12 I know that's the first -- when I told you this
13 morning, that is the first you have been aware of that
14 apology from them. I will go on -- I will leave what
15 you want to say about that until later.

16 But if we can just go back to your statement here at
17 paragraph 13 -- sorry -- paragraph 12, you describe the
18 baths as:

19 "... dangerous places, because that is where the
20 older boys would sexually molest the younger ones.
21 I was abused many times in the bathroom by older boys.
22 Disgusting things were done to me that I don't want to
23 talk about. The abuse was more fondling in nature and
24 there was no penetration."

25 I just wanted to pause there and ask you how did the

1 older boys come to be in the bathroom with the younger
2 boys? What were the circumstances of that?

3 A. Well, the older boys were -- they were the helpers.
4 They helped the boys into the baths and out of the
5 baths. The bathrooms were fairly big rooms and the
6 children -- we all lined up in a line to get into the
7 bath, and the same water was used for all the children.
8 When you got in and when you got out, another child
9 would go in and then get out. This is where the boys
10 would abuse you, you know. The older boys would grab
11 you by the penis or stick their finger into your
12 backside or something like that, and this was -- this
13 was commonplace, but it wasn't done in a way that could
14 be seen. It was done in a way that -- it was like
15 a jocular thing, you know, but it was -- it was still
16 abuse, but there was a nun -- there was technically
17 a nun in a supervisory position in the bathroom, maybe
18 not all the time, but there was a supervisory Sister
19 involved. So they must have known these things were
20 going on, and they really didn't do anything about it.
21 They were frightened of the older boys I thought.

22 Q. Yes. You go on to say this in paragraph 13. You say
23 that you were intimidated, belted and bullied by the
24 older boys.

25 "I was made to do sexual things to them and the nuns

1 never protected any of us. They couldn't have been
2 blind to what was going on, as they were always spying
3 on us. I have believe that the nuns were frightened of
4 the older boys, as some of them were bigger than them.
5 I do not recall telling the nuns about the abuse.
6 However, other boys told the nuns about what the older
7 boys were doing to them, but the nuns just said
8 something like, 'That didn't happen, and if you say that
9 again, I will box your ears'."

10 Did you overhear other children tell the nuns or how
11 do you know that they did tell them about what was
12 happening?

13 **A. No. Well, other children would say that they told**
14 **Sister so-and-so about what happened by somebody and**
15 **that's -- that was hearsay more than anything. They'd**
16 **come and tell you, "Did you see somebody told Sister**
17 **so-and-so about what happened in the bathroom?" and then**
18 **they'd say, "She didn't take any notice. She just gave**
19 **me a clout on the ear and told me to, 'Keep going. Out**
20 **of the way'".**

21 **Q.** One of the -- the congregation in response to the issue
22 of bullying by boys have said:

23 "Where there were so many children of different ages
24 together, it is hard to see that disputes would not
25 arise. Bullying is a hazard in all educational

1 environments, but this was not accepted or tolerated by
2 the Sisters. If HIA307 suffered bullying or peer abuse
3 of any sort, we do believe this to be unacceptable."

4 They go on to say:

5 "The sexual abuse of children that were in our care
6 has only come to light in recent years. The Sisters are
7 horrified, shocked and devastated that this abuse took
8 place and offer sincere and profound apology to any
9 child that suffered this horrendous act."

10 So you thought the supervising Sister in the
11 bathroom must have been aware of what the older boys
12 were doing. The nuns would say they were unaware that
13 there was ever such sexual abuse going on in their
14 homes, HIA307.

15 **A. Well, when I say -- when I say there was a supervisory**
16 **nun there, I mean, you know, there was supposed to be**
17 **a supervisory nun there. Now they may not have been**
18 **there every time. They may have been doing other**
19 **things. At the times they were there they must have**
20 **seen something or must have known something was going**
21 **on. So in my opinion they were negligent in not doing**
22 **something about it.**

23 **Q. Well, at paragraph 6 -- sorry -- 14 in your statement**
24 **you talk about one of the cruelest things that was done**
25 **to you at Nazareth Lodge was to devise -- I beg your**

1 pardon -- deprive you of visits from a lady, whose name
2 is given here, whom you describe as your foster mother,
3 who had looked after you until you were 3. Now I know
4 you didn't know this until later you were contacted by
5 someone who had also been fostered by that lady. Isn't
6 that the position, HIA307, that --

7 **A. Yes.** **was the boy. He was older than me by**
8 **four years, and he -- he told the story when he came**
9 **home from school one day, I was gone, and**
10 **told him that my mother had put me -- placed me into**
11 **an orphanage.**

12 **Now** **came to visit me on numerous**
13 **occasions evidently, and on one particular occasion she**
14 **came and I wasn't very well. I was suffering from what**
15 **was supposedly impetigo or something of that sort.**

16 **said that** **had actually -- I don't know**
17 **whether she actually told the Reverend Mother off, but**
18 **she told one of the nuns off or the Reverend Mother, and**
19 **the Reverend -- she wasn't very happy about the way**
20 **I was being treated and I wasn't being looked after**
21 **properly. Anyway the next time** **came,**
22 **according to** **, she -- she was told that I had gone**
23 **to a good home and, "You needn't bother coming to see**
24 **him again, because he is not here now".**

25 **Q.** You -- while you obviously have heard this subsequently,

1 this account of why she stopped coming, but you remember
2 her coming to visit you in the home and you remember
3 those visits as something positive in your life.

4 **A. Yes. I can remember her vaguely, a lady in my life when**
5 **I was very, very young. Now it could have been**
6 **or it could have been my mother, but I can**
7 **remember being nurtured and being looked after by that**
8 **particular person. I may have been very young, but I do**
9 **remember that person. So I think I remember the**
10 **kindness more than anything than the -- I couldn't tell**
11 **you what she looked like. I can remember the eyes and**
12 **that's all I can remember, but those accounts are from**
13 **, and he stayed with until he was 21**
14 **and got married. So my life would have been completely**
15 **different had I stayed with . I don't know.**

16 **Q.** But certainly you now believe that the nuns took from
17 you the one important emotional attachment you ever had
18 and you felt that they did that in order to protect
19 themselves from criticism.

20 The Order in response to that say that they have no
21 record of this lady visiting you in the home, but that
22 at paragraph 6 of their statement they say if the
23 relationship broke down due to any issue on the
24 congregation's part, then they offer you a profound
25 apology for that.

1 Now in paragraph 15 you complain about the poor
2 record-keeping of the congregation and the difficulties
3 that that has caused you through life. You say it has
4 deprived you of vital information which you needed to
5 trace your family. At the time of drafting this
6 statement, when you were 68, you had never seen your
7 mother's photo and:

8 "... no idea whether I have any living family
9 anywhere in the world. I have been searching for my
10 mother for more than thirty years and all the Sisters of
11 Nazareth can give me is sacramental information about my
12 first Holy Communion and Confirmation. They have given
13 me no information about who I really am and what
14 happened to my mother."

15 You say you have:

16 "... little confidence in those lying women. To
17 this day I don't know whether they are simply refusing
18 to give me my records or whether they actually exist."

19 You are aware from what I have told you that we have
20 been unable to obtain anything further than what you
21 have already received from the congregation in terms of
22 records, HIA307. So I can't assist you with whether or
23 not there were other records and simply -- that simply
24 no longer exist or whether the records were kept at the
25 time in the manner you believe they ought to have been.

1 You do have a good memory of one thing about
2 Nazareth Lodge and what was your time in the choir.
3 Isn't that correct?

4 **A. Yes, I do, yes, yes. That was a good time.**

5 Q. You say you had a good voice and the nuns encouraged
6 your talent. You were always the lead in plays and you
7 remember reciting poetry in City Hall. You say the
8 Sisters nurtured that ability, and you enjoyed that, and
9 singing in the group gave you a sense of belonging, and
10 it was one of the few good things about your time in the
11 Lodge. You say you now know the Sisters had many
12 fundraising events and you and others like you were
13 being used, as you say, for their own ends, as simply
14 these concerts were being put on to raise funds for the
15 home.

16 **A. Yes, that's correct, yes. It was a good time, you know.**
17 **We did a lot of practice and we made sure we did it**
18 **right, and I was -- I was what you'd probably call the**
19 **main actor. I did all the main singing and I was the**
20 **main actor in most of the plays and -- because I had the**
21 **voice and must have had the ability, and the nuns**
22 **encouraged that, you know, and I quite -- you know,**
23 **I can't be harsh and say they were completely bad in**
24 **that respect. They encouraged me to do the singing, and**
25 **we all enjoyed it, because we were all doing it together**

1 think it might have been him, and you subsequently
2 actually lived in his parish, although you didn't know
3 when you lived in his parish that he had been involved
4 in the Child Migrant Scheme.

5 Now --

6 **A. No, I had no idea.**

7 **Q.** So all of the boys put up their hands, but I take it all
8 of the boys who put their hands up, they didn't all go
9 to Australia. Is that correct?

10 **A.** Oh, no, no. I mean, we were in a -- as far as I can
11 remember we were in a complete gathering of the whole --
12 I think the whole orphanage. Oh, hang on. It may have
13 been a situation of certain age children. I am not sure
14 now, but there was a lot of boys in the particular room
15 that this priest was in giving us the information about
16 Australia, and he really made it sound like a real
17 adventure and -- well, naturally we all thought, "This
18 is going to be good" and we all put our hands up, and
19 I think there was a (inaudible) from there -- there was
20 another official with him I think and then the Reverend
21 Mother and a few of the supervisory nuns that were in
22 the same room, but it was quite a revelation, and we
23 were all, you know, excited about it, and it was just
24 one of those things where we all put our hands up,
25 because we just wanted to go. We didn't want to stay

1 where we were, because we weren't very happy where we
2 were. So naturally you put your hand up if you were
3 going to go somewhere that's going to be better.

4 Q. Well, can I ask you do you remember ever having
5 a medical examination before you left?

6 A. No, not really. I probably did, but I can't remember
7 it.

8 Q. Or did you ever undergo an IQ test?

9 A. Definitely not an IQ test. I have never had an IQ test,
10 because if I had an IQ test, I think I would have passed
11 it with flying colours, because I had a reasonable
12 amount of intelligence when I was at school in Ireland.
13 I had to admit the education was good, and I think even
14 though my education suffered when I came to Australia,
15 I think some of the remnants of the good education that
16 I had in Ireland stood in -- stood in stead. You know,
17 I feel as though I kept some of that, even though
18 I couldn't progress like I could have done
19 education-wise. I think my education -- it was strict,
20 it was hard, but I think the education, to be fair, was
21 quite good.

22 Q. Just to be clear that you are -- you have never managed
23 to locate your mother to be ever in a position to ask
24 her whether or not she gave her consent to your
25 migration. Isn't that the position?

1 A. No, I haven't got any idea of that at all, no, and
2 that's one of the things that really hurts me deeply,
3 the fact that I may never know that. Well, I may never
4 ever know my mother, but that's -- that's something that
5 we are still looking at and still trying to -- I have
6 found relations and the relations that I have found
7 I have been able to see them. They have made me very
8 welcome, and at the time when I did go to see them, it
9 was a traumatic situation in the family, where , my
10 cousin, whom I was identified with to start off with
11 through a DNA process, he ended up having a brain
12 tumour, lung cancer and prostate cancer. So he got the
13 trifecta. I went to see him and ... Sorry.

14 Q. Sorry, HIA307. While you -- take your time, HIA307. Do
15 you -- do you need to take a break at all, HIA307,
16 because we are quite happy to take break if you need to
17 take one? Would you like to take a short break?

18 A. I'm okay. I'm okay.

19 Q. Let me -- while you just take a moment and while you are
20 doing that I am going to ask that your child migrant
21 form is pulled up on our screens here. All right? So
22 if we could look, please, at SNB-32102, this is your
23 child migrant form, HIA307, and you kindly gave this to
24 the Inquiry.

25 Your date of birth is recorded there, your place of

1 birth, your nationality and your religion. Your
2 mother's name and an address in Belfast is recorded
3 there. The name and address of your guardian is
4 recorded as "Mother Superior of Nazareth Lodge". Your
5 educational standard is given and there is
6 an intelligence -- an IQ standard stated on it also. It
7 states which institution you are living in and when you
8 were admitted there. If we could scroll on down through
9 it, please, it says -- the section to be completed by
10 the parent or guardian giving consent to your migration
11 is completed by the then Mother Superior, SR104. It is
12 dated on 6th December 1955. She has signed it. It is
13 witnessed by a solicitor in Belfast, and then the
14 section to be completed by the sponsoring organisation
15 is completed by the -- it is recorded there that the
16 sponsoring organisation was the Federal Catholic
17 Immigration Committee. Signed on behalf of that
18 organisation by a Charles Flood on 14th December 1955.

19 Just one other -- I going to call up a photograph
20 here of -- sorry. If we can just scroll on down to the
21 next page, I think we can see that there were --
22 a medical history is recorded there. It said what
23 illnesses you had. It is recorded "measles". So that
24 period of isolation that you talked about, it may well
25 have been the measles that you had at that time. It

1 asks if you have been vaccinated. It gives the name of
2 the usual medical attendant, who would have been the GP
3 for the home at that time. It records you as being
4 short-sighted and it does -- makes absolutely no mention
5 in this of your hearing difficulties. It is signed by
6 again SR104.

7 If we could just scroll down, please, to the next
8 page, yes, the next page, this is a photograph that you
9 brought to the Inquiry. If that could be turned round
10 so that we can see it. I know you don't have this
11 photograph with you, HIA307, but you know the photograph
12 I am speaking about --

13 **A. I know.**

14 Q. -- which is the group of four nuns --

15 **A. I know.**

16 Q. -- with the boys behind. Can we rotate that, please,
17 photograph? We are looking at it on a side view here.
18 So I am trying to get them to turn it round so we can
19 look at it properly. I think we are having a little
20 difficulty with the technology, but in any event you are
21 recorded and I think if any -- if we look at it to our
22 sides, you are the second boy in from the right-hand
23 side. Just behind your name is recorded there on it.
24 You have identified two of the nuns whom you have named
25 to the Inquiry on the front of that photograph, SR34 and

1 SR152. Do you -- if we just -- I think SR71 is at the
2 end, and I can't -- I think there's a nun in the middle
3 whom you have not identified. Is that correct? Can you
4 recall from your memory?

5 **A. I don't -- I can't remember the name of that extra nun.**

6 Q. But you are certainly in that photograph and one of the
7 things you said to me, HIA307, was that that was one of
8 the -- we have managed at last to get it turned round so
9 that we can see. There are a number of boys who are
10 named in there and you are in the back row of the boys
11 and you are second in from the left-hand side. You have
12 said to me that this is one of the very few photographs
13 that you have from your childhood.

14 **A. Yes, that's correct, yes. It's the only photograph**
15 **I have other than the photograph of and myself**
16 **when we were at . I haven't got that here**
17 **either.**

18 Q. No, but that was something that was given --

19 **A. being --**

20 Q. That was something given to you later by .

21 **A. Yes, yes. Sorry?**

22 Q. The photograph --

23 **A. Ah, yes. gave me that photograph. Yes, yes.**
24 **That's correct, yes.**

25 Q. Going back to your statement, HIA307, at page 01... --

1 sorry -- 0101, I am not quite sure which paragraph this
2 is, but one of the complaints you make is that you were
3 born in Dublin and you believe that you ought not to
4 have been deported under the UK Child Migrant Scheme,
5 although your family -- your mother came from Northern
6 Ireland, and you have provided the Inquiry with your
7 birth certificate and a baptismal certificate, which
8 show you were born and baptised in Dublin. Sorry. You
9 wanted to say something.

10 **A. I was waiting for you to finish. Well, I don't know**
11 **that about my mother, because my family all came from**
12 **Fermanagh. You are probably familiar with Fermanagh.**
13 **That is pretty close to the border, and the HIA 307 and**
14 **the lived in the area, but it didn't necessarily**
15 **mean that they were Northern Irish. They could have**
16 **been Southern Irish. So I don't know that yet, whether**
17 **my mother was from Southern Ireland or Northern Ireland.**
18 **We are assuming that she was Northern Ireland. So --**

19 Q. I think we have made that --

20 **A. -- that I don't know.**

21 Q. I think we have made that assumption from something that
22 you said to us in your Inquiry statement, and also the
23 Child Migrant Scheme records her as certainly being
24 resident in Belfast, according to the form we have just
25 looked at.

1 **A. Ah, yes.**

2 Q. But I appreciate that because of the lack of information
3 that you have about her background, you can't be certain
4 as to where she originally came from, whether the North
5 or South.

6 **A. That's correct.**

7 Q. But certainly you were baptised in Dublin and born there
8 and those documents -- I am not going to call them up,
9 but they are in the bundle in the papers I have
10 indicated.

11 Now at paragraph 18 of your statement, if we can
12 just scroll back up a little bit, you say that you:

13 "... left Nazareth Lodge on 21st December 1956 when
14 I was 11 years old. Thirteen of us were being sent to
15 Australia. One boy whose brothers were in the Lodge
16 came from Rubane. So there were fourteen in total.
17 I remember the day we left. We got taxis to the docks
18 and we were crying our hearts out. We didn't want to
19 leave. I sailed to Australia on 24th December 1956 on
20 the SS Strathnaver. We were the only child migrants on
21 the ship and we ran riot. It was the first time we were
22 free. We ran all over the ship and got to eat what we
23 wanted. It was a fantastic four weeks. I learned to
24 swim on the ship. We were looked after by two young
25 civilian women. I am sure they regretted volunteering

1 for the job as we were quite a handful."

2 But you certainly remember the passage?

3 **A. That's for sure. I'm sure, yes, that it was a fantastic**
4 **time. We had never been free and it was -- yes, I am**
5 **sure the two ladies who were looking after us, they**
6 **regretted the decision of coming to do it, because we**
7 **did run amok, and I have to be honest about that. We**
8 **weren't -- we weren't what you would call the best**
9 **behaved, I am sure, but we had nobody to answer to. So**
10 **we just did what we wanted and got away with it, no**
11 **problem at all. It was great, absolutely fantastic.**

12 **Q.** You arrived in Australia in Fremantle on
13 22nd January 1957. You were taken then to Bindoon in
14 Boys Town. You were there from 1957 to 1961. You are
15 aware that the -- what happened to you in Australia is
16 outside the terms of reference of this Inquiry, but if
17 I can summarise what happened to you in that home, while
18 you were there, you suffered sexual abuse by both
19 Brothers and an ex-resident. You were physically abused
20 by the Brothers. You were denigrated and you were
21 bullied because of your Irish accent, and you were made
22 to engage in excessive physical labour.

23 Can I ask, HIA307, while you were in Bindoon, did
24 you ever see anyone from the UK or from Northern Ireland
25 come and visit you there?

1 **A. Never. In fact, I am very -- we very rarely saw anybody**
2 **from the Child Welfare Department here in Australia.**
3 **I can't remember -- there may have been the odd visit**
4 **that I don't know, but I can't remember it.**

5 **Q. Uh-huh. In paragraph -- you talked about your time in**
6 **Bindoon from paragraph 20 to 35, and then from**
7 **paragraph 36 onwards you talk about your life after**
8 **care.**

9 At paragraph 38 you talk about your attempts to
10 locate your family. You say you:

11 "... had no birth certificate until I applied to
12 Dublin for it", in your 20s. "I first made enquiries
13 about my mother back in 1961/'62", which is when you
14 would have left Bindoon, "and I went to the Catholic
15 Welfare Ecumenical Society in Perth."

16 You met with a lady. They were of no assistance in
17 helping you trace your family. There was no proper
18 system in place to ensure that former child migrants
19 receive important documents, such as birth certificates,
20 at the appropriate time. You had left institutional
21 life and were left to your own devices. You say you had
22 no knowledge of normal everyday life and you weren't
23 informed of your rights by the authorities in Australia.
24 You were offered no help or advice to reunite with your
25 families until the Child Migrants Trust began working

1 for child migrants.

2 You say that -- you go on to talk about the
3 contribution that former child migrants and their
4 families have made to the Australian economic and social
5 development of that country, but you say that many of
6 them have been disadvantaged because of lack of
7 identity, lack of education and other deprivation
8 resulting from the effects of unsupervised institutional
9 life.

10 Now one of the things that I also talked to you
11 about, HIA307, was the fact that this Inquiry has to
12 make recommendations about what should happen in terms
13 of what has happened to the children who spent time in
14 institutions here. You have had experience through your
15 time in Australia of the redress scheme that operated in
16 Western Australia --

17 **A. Uh-huh.**

18 Q. -- and you have also been in London to hear the former
19 Prime Minister, Gordon Brown, deliver his apology to
20 child migrants. The Inquiry will be very interested to
21 know what your views are, having had those experiences
22 of two different types of things, that this Inquiry
23 might recommend and what you feel is beneficial and what
24 is really not of much value, and I want to ask you about
25 that now, and I also want to ask about the fact that as

1 of today and the response statement that the
2 congregation have given to the Inquiry. You are aware
3 that they are making personal apology to you, and I want
4 to know what you feel about all of those things, if
5 I may.

6 **A.** Uh-huh. Yes. Well, about the personal apology --
7 I think -- I have jotted down a couple of things here --
8 but about the personal apology, I am not really -- I am
9 not really worried about that, but I think that's all
10 way, way, way too late. I have been through a few of
11 these inquiries now and given statements over the years,
12 and I find that, you know, at the end of the day
13 apologies don't mean that much to me and they don't mean
14 much to a lot of the child migrants. We are glad to get
15 them, but I don't hold much faith in them really,
16 because it's all too late.

17 The recommendations that I put forward in
18 paragraph 30 -- 46 in the --

19 **Q.** In your statement.

20 **A.** Is it 46?

21 **Q.** Yes, it is 46.

22 **A.** In the statement, yes. That's the recommendation --
23 that's the recommendation that I would like to put
24 forward to emphasise that as a -- as my statement of
25 recommendation.

1 Q. And just to be clear, I will read that out. You
2 recommend -- you would like to see that perpetrators are
3 held to account, regardless of their age; that there are
4 steps to be taken by Government to ensure the release of
5 all relevant records; and that compensation be made
6 available for all the harm that was caused. You believe
7 that the Government should be reimbursed by the Catholic
8 Church for compensation paid out to victims, and you
9 yourself will never negotiate with the church directly
10 as a victim of their crime, but they must be held
11 accountable and made to pay for their actions.

12 Now, HIA307, just before we conclude here, I just
13 want to draw attention to paragraph 42 of your witness
14 statement, where you describe the effect that -- what
15 you say -- all the abuse and trauma that happened to you
16 in both jurisdictions you say goes back to the actions
17 of the Sisters of Nazareth and their cruel, brutal
18 regime. You say that their failure to keep even basic
19 records has condemned you to a lonely life without any
20 sense of belonging or a home. You feel cut off from
21 your country and feel like an alien in Australia even
22 after more than fifty years.

23 In 1998, when you returned to visit Ireland, you
24 felt unable to go to visit Nazareth Lodge, because you
25 felt that would have been too difficult for you to do.

1 A. That's correct. Yes, yes, yes.

2 Q. Now, HIA307, I am not going to ask you anything further,
3 but I want to check with you that you are happy that we
4 have covered everything that you want to say about your
5 time in Nazareth Lodge and about your experience as
6 a child migrant, and if there is anything else that you
7 want to say to the Inquiry, I want to offer you now the
8 opportunity to do that.

9 A. Okay. First of all, I am glad you have emphasised the
10 fact that the record-keeping, because that has been the
11 biggest problem. I find that I was -- I didn't have any
12 basic right there to -- my rights were violated, because
13 I didn't have the basic knowledge of where my mother
14 was, what happened, what permission she gave and all
15 these sorts of things. So that's one thing. I am glad
16 that has been over-emphasised.

17 Now about , my family -- about , passed
18 away not long after I visited him, and I was fortunate
19 enough to go and stay with him for a couple of weeks --
20 four or five weeks, and the family were so welcoming and
21 everything like that, and I went and met family in
22 Fermanagh, the and the , because I am
23 related both ways, and the fact that he passed away was
24 a terrible thing for me, but at least I did get the
25 chance to see him, but it gets back to the

1 record-keeping again. They -- the whole shemozzle about
2 all of this is because the record-keeping wasn't done
3 properly; and the apologies -- like I said, it is too
4 late for that; and the abuse, somebody must have known.
5 Bindoon, I know we are not covering that here, but
6 Ireland, the abuse, people must have known about it.
7 Authorities must have known about it. Somebody must
8 have known about it. The nuns -- the head -- the
9 Reverend Mother must have known about it, but, you know,
10 these things weren't -- weren't done properly in my
11 opinion and they need to be addressed.

12 The hearing aid -- I have got hearing aids. I was
13 able to hear you, because you have got a beautiful
14 Belfast accent or Irish accent. If it is a Belfast
15 accent, I am sorry if I confused you --

16 Q. It is Belfast.

17 A. -- but anyway -- anyway, but I had an accent like that
18 once and, you know, I was happy to keep it, but being
19 here -- I have been in Australia too long. So I just
20 have to bear with the accent I have got now, because
21 even though -- even if I lived in Belfast for another
22 fifty years I don't think I'd ever pick the accent up.
23 So I'm sorry that I still haven't got that.

24 So -- but the hearing aid business, you know, like
25 I really feel that I have lost so much because of my

1 hearing. My family suffered, because I wasn't able to
2 express things in the way that I could have done if
3 I could hear properly.

4 Emotionally when I left Ireland and when I left
5 Bindoon, I was emotionally disgruntled. I didn't know
6 how to react to normal family life. When I first lived
7 in a small house after living in an institution for all
8 of my life, I was so -- I felt so claustrophobic. You
9 know, I just had -- the people that I stayed with --
10 I met the , the people that looked after me when
11 I -- on the recommendation of Fr Cyril Stinson by the way, the
12 people that looked after me. They knew -- they knew
13 something was wrong with me, but they were too
14 frightened to say anything about it, because they
15 thought I would run away, because they thought I would
16 be treating them -- they would be treating me like
17 they -- I found this out later on -- they would be
18 treating me like I had been treated all my life. So
19 they were sensitive to that.

20 The three things in my life that I can remember that
21 made any difference to me in a nice way was
22 -- here we go again.

23 Q. It's okay, HIA307. Just take your time.

24 A. -- and -- and that looked
25 after me when I first left -- they were a good influence

1 on me -- and my wife, because she has had so much to put
2 up with with me, the way I have been, and, you know, my
3 emotional -- the way I was emotionally. As far as I'm
4 concerned if I didn't have -- if I hadn't had those
5 people in my life, I don't know what I would have been
6 like. I would have been like some of the other child
7 migrants that I know. They are living a lonely
8 existence. They will never come forward in an Inquiry
9 like this. They don't want to.

10 So, you know, the recommendations that I make,
11 I believe that they should be attended to.

12 Q. Thank you very much for that, HIA307. I have -- sorry.

13 A. Before -- before I -- yes. Before I go I'd like to --
14 before you go -- sorry -- I'd like to thank you for
15 being able to make this possible for me to come forward
16 and state my case, and I think the videolink has been
17 great, because, you know, we have had a couple of
18 technical hitches, but I think it's gone very well, and
19 credit to you and thank you for listening to me.

20 Q. Thank you very much, HIA307. I have nothing further
21 that I want to ask you. The Inquiry Panel Members may
22 have a few questions for you and I will hand you over to
23 them.

24 A. Okay.

25

1 Questions from THE PANEL

2 CHAIRMAN: HIA307, can I ask you some more questions about
3 your experience before you went on the boat to
4 Australia?

5 **A. Yes, you can, yes.**

6 Q. Some, but not very many, of the children who went
7 remember them having a face-to-face meeting with
8 an Australia immigration official, or there are some
9 records to suggest that that happened for some children.
10 Do you remember anything of that sort?

11 **A. No, not at all. No, not at all.**

12 Q. I think you said that when a priest whom you think may
13 have been ^{Fr Cyril} Stinson came to the home, that there was
14 an official or officials with him. Have you any idea
15 who those people were?

16 **A. Well, I am saying they were officials, because the only**
17 **people -- the only people I ever saw -- oh, sorry.**
18 **I can hear your echo. The only people that I saw most**
19 **occasions in my life were the nuns. So when I saw male**
20 **people in suite, I took them to be officials. So**
21 **I don't know. I don't know.**

22 Q. I see. Just one other matter I want to ask you about.
23 We don't have it this morning, but we do have a record
24 that shows that nine children who went as part of your
25 group at the end of 1956 underwent IQ tests from

1 a professor at Queen's University, but you from what you
2 have said have no recollection of that happening to you?

3 A. No. I don't -- I don't recollect ever being examined in
4 an IQ test.

5 I will say -- I am just jogging my memory on that
6 particular point -- I have had a vaccination before
7 I came to Australia. A smallpox vaccination I think it
8 is. So I must have seen somebody medical at one time.
9 I don't think the nuns gave me the needle. So that's --
10 that's the only thing I can recollect. That may have
11 happened, but I don't remember it.

12 Q. Well, we do know from the records that some children
13 were definitely examined by doctors before they were
14 accepted. So that may have happened to you for all we
15 know, but thank you for that.

16 A. Yes, yes. It could have.

17 Q. Just one moment.

18 MR LANE: Thank you for your evidence. There. You can see
19 me now. Could you tell me who the nuns were who were
20 involved in the singing and the acting that you did?
21 What were their names? Do you recall?

22 A. I can't remember, but I do remember it was -- well, it
23 was good and bad, because if you did anything wrong and
24 you didn't sing the right note, you got chastised and
25 you were verbally shouted at, but no, I can't remember

1 the actual -- there must have been a musical supervisor
2 among the nuns, but I just can't remember her name, no.

3 Q. Were there any outsiders came to teach as well, lay
4 people from the community?

5 A. Sorry?

6 Q. Were there any teachers from the community who came in
7 to teach singing or music?

8 A. Oh, I don't recall that, but there was a teacher, a male
9 teacher that did come into the school in the latter
10 years when I was -- when I was at Belfast, at Nazareth
11 Lodge, a fellow by the name -- if I remember right, his
12 name was NL85, and he used to ride his bike to school,
13 but he seemed like -- he must have been quite a nice
14 fellow, because I don't remember him being harsh or
15 strict or anything like that. I think he was completely
16 different to the nuns, but having said that, I don't
17 think I was ever in his class. We'd see him in passing
18 down the corridors or something like that, but I think
19 he was teaching the older boys, and I'm not sure what
20 subject he would have been teaching.

21 Q. Okay. Thank you very much.

22 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA307 --

23 A. Okay. Thank you.

24 Q. -- I'm sure you will be relieved to hear that's the last
25 question we have to ask you. Thank you very much indeed

1 for taking the time to speak to us today from Australia.
2 I can appreciate it is getting on in the evening now
3 where you were, but we are very grateful to you for
4 taking the trouble to speak to us. Thank you very much.

5 **A. Okay. Thank you very much for having me here.**

6 MS SMITH: Thank you, HIA307. Goodbye.

7 **A. Goodbye.**

8 **(Videolink terminated)**

9 CHAIRMAN: Well, we will rise for a few minutes to allow the
10 video equipment to be removed before we take the next
11 witness.

12 (11.03 am)

13 (Short break)

14 (11.10 am)

15 WITNESS HIA183 (called)

16 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

17 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

18 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, good morning.

19 The next witness this morning is HIA183, who is
20 "HIA183". HIA183 gave evidence relating to Rubane on
21 Day 56 of the Inquiry, which was 7th October. It seems
22 a long time ago now, HIA183, but just a couple of months
23 ago, and he took the oath on that occasion, Chairman.
24 He also confirmed, as he does today, that he wishes to
25 preserve his anonymity.

1 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA183, since you were sworn on the
2 previous occasion, that still has effect. So there is
3 no need for you to take the oath again.

4 **A. Thank you very much, sir.**

5 MR AIKEN: On the last occasion HIA183 proved and adopted
6 his witness statement. It had an RUB number, but I am
7 just going to confirm it again, HIA183 --

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. -- because it now has a Sisters of Nazareth number.

10 CHAIRMAN: Just a moment. Just a moment, please. Those who
11 wish to carry on a conversation, do it outside, please.
12 It is extremely distracting to everyone for people to
13 carry on these conversations at the back of the chamber.
14 If you want to have a conversation, do it outside.
15 I don't want to have to say this again. Very well.

16 MR AIKEN: So I'm just going to go through the process,
17 HIA183, of making sure we have got the right statement.
18 If we can bring up, please, SNB-521 and, HIA183,
19 hopefully you will confirm that's the first page of your
20 statement that's appearing on the screen.

21 **A. That's correct.**

22 Q. And the last page, if we go to 528, if you look at the
23 last page of the hard copy you have, HIA183, and you
24 confirmed on the last occasion that you had signed your
25 statement.

1 **A. That's correct.**

2 Q. Can I just confirm you have signed this statement and
3 you adopt it as your evidence before the Inquiry?

4 **A. Uh-huh.**

5 Q. In addition, HIA183, if you bear with me for a moment
6 just till I give some references to the Panel, the
7 Sisters of Nazareth have provided a response statement
8 and that can be found at SNB-1934 to 1935. I have made
9 HIA183 aware that that statement in paragraph 7 contains
10 an unreserved and sincere apology to him, which he found
11 helpful when we were discussing the matter this morning.

12 In addition, there is a Health & Social Care Board
13 statement. That can be found at SNB-5663 to 5664, and
14 essentially the Health & Social Care Board confirm that
15 HIA183's time in care was a private arrangement, that
16 the Welfare Authority was not involved with.

17 HIA183, as we did on the last occasion, I am going
18 to just summarise some background information and then
19 take you to some of the main issues that you address in
20 your statement --

21 **A. Okay.**

22 Q. -- relating to Nazareth Lodge --

23 **A. Uh-huh.**

24 Q. -- and summarise what that material has to say and ask
25 you some questions about it.

1 You were born on

2 **A. That's correct.**

3 Q. -- and are now aged 69?

4 **A. That's correct.**

5 Q. You have been married to since 1980?

6 **A. That's right.**

7 Q. You have three daughters?

8 **A. Correct.**

9 Q. And one of those daughters has produced for you two
10 granddaughters?

11 **A. That's correct.**

12 Q. And eventually after a series of jobs that we looked at
13 as part of looking at Rubane, and we will touch on it
14 today, you got into and you ran your own
15 business for thirty years --

16 **A. That's correct.**

17 Q. -- before retiring. You went into what was then Fox
18 Lodge, the babies' part of the Nazareth operation, as it
19 were, on the Ormeau Road and Ravenhill Road, the then
20 babies' home, on 8th January 1946 at six months old.

21 **A. That's correct, yes.**

22 Q. You eventually moved then into the Nazareth Lodge part
23 for the younger boys on 1st September 1951, just after
24 you turned 6 years of age.

25 **A. That's correct.**

1 Q. Just if I can give the Panel the register reference can
2 be found at SNB-4454.

3 You remained in Nazareth Lodge for six years until
4 12th August 1957 -- the register confirming that can be
5 found at SNB-4456 -- when you moved to Rubane as part of
6 the annual transfer of Nazareth Lodge boys to Kircubbin.

7 **A. That's correct.**

8 Q. We will touch on that just a little at the end, because
9 in those documents I was showing you

10

11

12 **A. That's correct.**

13 Q. What I want to do is talk to you a little bit about your
14 time when you were in Nazareth Lodge between 1951 and
15 1957. Your recollection is there would have been maybe
16 150 or more boys living in Nazareth Lodge at the time.

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. You explain, if we look at the -- go back to the first
19 page of your statement, please, at SNB-521. You explain
20 that initially whenever you moved into Nazareth Lodge,
21 there was no groups as such. You were in different
22 dormitories making up the 150 or 170 boys.

23 **A. That's correct.**

24 Q. You explain that SR118, who is "SR118", was essentially
25 in charge of all of the boys --

1 **A. Uh-huh.**

2 Q. -- and you ate together, everybody, in the refectory and
3 there were no delineated groups as such.

4 **A. At that particular time, yes.**

5 Q. But once SR118 left and SR34 arrived, then a more formal
6 group structure was created, and, as I said to you
7 earlier, we have established SR118 appears to leave
8 about 1954 and SR34 comes -- SR34 is "SR34" -- she comes
9 at that point in time. You would have been about 9 -- 8
10 or 9 years of age, HIA183, whenever SR34 comes along.

11 **A. That's right.**

12 Q. At that stage the 150 or 160 boys are broken into groups
13 and you were in St. Joseph's group --

14 **A. That's correct, yes.**

15 Q. -- and headed up by SR34 and a lay worker, NL 5

16 **A. That's correct, yes.**

17 Q. There were other groups given other names, and you
18 remember SR71 being in charge of a group, SR152. I am
19 not sure if you remember --

20 **A. SR47.**

21 Q. SR47, and they each had a group that they were
22 responsible for.

23 **A. That's correct.**

24 Q. And that change meant that when you would have gone to
25 the refectory, for instance, you would have ate as

1 a group together.

2 **A. That's correct.**

3 Q. The other groups would have been there as well at meal
4 times, but your group was kept more together.

5 **A. That's correct, yes.**

6 Q. I was asking you after the change to this group
7 structure with SR34 how many boys were in your group.
8 You can't be sure about that --

9 **A. No.**

10 Q. -- but you think 20 to 30 perhaps.

11 **A. Yes, probably.**

12 Q. But the arrangements in terms of sleeping and so on,
13 they remained essentially the same. Your group slept in
14 one of the large dorms and other groups slept in their
15 various dorms.

16 **A. Yes, that's correct.**

17 Q. What I want to then ask you about is your period before
18 SR34 comes, so the period when SR118 is in charge and it
19 is not the St. Joseph's group. It is just the boys
20 living in the dorms.

21 **A. That's correct, yes.**

22 Q. You explain in paragraph 5, if we scroll on to the next
23 page, please, that you remember being punished when you
24 were 5 or 6 years of age and generally -- for something
25 trivial. What you remember SR118 doing is putting you

1 in a freezing cold bath and then pouring cold water over
2 your head.

3 **A. That's correct.**

4 Q. Can you remember what you did that resulted in you being
5 punished in that way?

6 **A. I can't recollect, but I think it was something very**
7 **trivial. I probably might have been talking in the**
8 **church during probably devotions or probably saying the**
9 **rosary. That's all I can remember, but I can't**
10 **specifically remember what it was for, you know.**

11 Q. And you were taken to the bathroom.

12 **A. I was taken up to the bathroom with another boy.**

13 Q. Who was the other boy -- in the incident that you
14 remember who was the other boy?

15 **A. Am I allowed to mention a name?**

16 Q. Yes. His name won't be used beyond this chamber.

17 **A. HIA427. HIA427. HIA427 had special needs, and the two**
18 **of us were brought up. This was after the -- I think it**
19 **was after -- we went -- I think the rosary was said**
20 **first and then we had our tea and then we were getting**
21 **ready for bed, and then SR118 marched us up to the -- to**
22 **get a cold bath. So it was about six buckets of cold**
23 **water poured over my head. So that was all right.**
24 **After that I was asked to get out of the bath. I dried**
25 **myself off, and I remember now HIA427 -- HIA427 was**

1 roughly about the same age as myself. He had special
2 needs, HIA427, and HIA427 had problems with his bowels,
3 you know, and he would have soiled his pants. At that
4 particular time I remember SR118 asking HIA427 to
5 undress himself and I could just smell the whiff. She
6 got his pants and rubbed the whole excrement over his
7 face. To me that -- I was -- as I say, I must have been
8 about 8 or 9 at that particular time, and that has
9 stayed with me for all those years, and at that
10 particular time it had a profound effect on me.

11 Q. After that was done to him he was then put in the bath?

12 A. He was put into the bath. That's probably how he was
13 able to get rid of all the soil.

14 Q. Did you see others being punished -- not the rubbing of
15 the pants --

16 A. No, no.

17 Q. -- but were others punished by this method of the cold
18 bath? Was that a known thing or just new to you?

19 A. Well, in my -- sorry, Joe. In my particular time it was
20 a common practice that any of the boys who wet the bed
21 were -- were brought upstairs immediately after tea and
22 had to get -- had a cold bath or a cold shower or
23 whatever it was. That was a common practice, but thank
24 God I hadn't got that problem, you know. So I always
25 remember it.

1 Q. In your statement you mention you would have been about
2 7 at the time of this incident with HIA427, which would
3 have been around 1953. So that's the year before SR118
4 moves on --

5 A. That's correct.

6 Q. -- to -- she goes to Aberdeen. When you say it had
7 a profound effect on you, what do you mean by that?
8 What -- how did it come against you?

9 A. Well --

10 Q. What did it feel like or what do you remember about it?

11 A. Well, at that particular time, you know, it just never
12 left my mind. I just -- to me I just find it very
13 inhumane that a human person, never mind a nun, or
14 anybody could do that to a child of 7 years of age.
15 I used to wake up in the morning time even when I was in
16 the home and just it was the first thing you thought
17 about, you know. So you just kept your head down and
18 tried to be -- I was a placid child, you know. I wasn't
19 a difficult child, you know, but it still is very much
20 in my mind still.

21 Q. You did continue a relationship with HIA427 and you
22 refer to that, that you visited him before he passed
23 away.

24 A. Well, I must admit now I was a wee bit lackadaisical,
25 but I was speaking to Joe Napier and he told me that

1 HIA427 hadn't been well. Can I mention HIA21, can I?

2 Q. Yes.

3 A. HIA21 and I -- HIA21 and I went down to visit him.

4 HIA427 -- HIA427 told me -- we talked. We caught up
5 about the news and how happy he was, and we asked him
6 was he happy in the home, and HIA427 says he hadn't got
7 happy memories at all in the home. The next minute we
8 knew -- we went down quite a few times before he passed
9 away. To me HIA427 -- I remember him in Kircubbin. He
10 had a miserable old existence, you know.

11 Q. You talk about SR34 then, who is "SR34", HIA183, in
12 paragraph 6. Just to be fair to her, you would put her
13 in a different bracket. The words you used to me
14 earlier: she was cold as far as you were concerned, but
15 she wasn't like SR118.

16 A. No. I think SR34, I mean, she had a big responsibility,
17 you know, looking after the children. I think she had
18 a lot on her mind, you know. You didn't get the
19 individual attention, you know. Personally I think she
20 was under a lot of pressure at that particular time.

21 Q. But you draw a contrast between her and SR118.

22 A. Oh, a big contrast.

23 Q. What was different between the two of them?

24 A. Well, I think SR34 was a wee bit more compassionate at
25 times, you know. She would have been compassionate at

1 **times, you know.**

2 Q. You describe in paragraph 6 then a particular incident
3 where everyone is made get out of bed in the dormitory
4 --

5 **A. That's correct.**

6 Q. -- and kneel in the corridor --

7 **A. That's right.**

8 Q. -- for what felt like an hour. I am not sure whether it
9 was an hour or not, but --

10 **A. I don't know.**

11 Q. -- it felt like an hour to you.

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. You said to me earlier you think you were probably 9 or
14 10 at the time of this.

15 **A. That's correct.**

16 Q. Can you remember what had happened that everybody got
17 punished in this way?

18 **A. No. As I said to you, I don't remember actually really**
19 **what it was about. Nobody knew what it was about, but**
20 **we must have been half an hour, ten or fifteen minutes**
21 **standing -- there was a big passage and a sort of**
22 **terrazzo floor and we were kneeling -- we were asked to**
23 **get out of bed and kneel down. Somebody must have done**
24 **something and it annoyed SR34. We were kneeling there**
25 **for about half an hour I'd say was probably the least.**

1 Q. Was this -- if I can ask you, HIA183, was this type of
2 group punishment a normal thing or was this an unusual
3 thing?

4 **A. This was an unusual thing actually. That was the only**
5 **thing I can recollect. It wasn't an occurrence, you**
6 **know.**

7 Q. Afterwards you make the point that you feel she must
8 have regretted -- whatever the reason for it, the doing
9 of it she must have regretted, because she gave
10 everybody a sweet afterwards.

11 **A. Well, she had a box of sweets and she told us to help**
12 **ourselves. So we all took a big box -- you know,**
13 **handful of. I think she realised she probably was in**
14 **the wrong. That was my only conclusion.**

15 Q. She, like whoever was in your dorm before SR34 came
16 along, was in a cubicle or had a cubicle in the corner
17 --

18 **A. That's correct.**

19 Q. -- with a window and a curtain.

20 **A. That's correct.**

21 Q. Would she have checked on you from time to time? Can
22 you remember her checking?

23 **A. No.**

24 Q. You don't?

25 **A. No.**

1 Q. I was asking you whether in her time older boys were in
2 charge of you in the dorm in addition to helping SR34.
3 You had said to me you don't remember there being older
4 boys.

5 **A. I don't recollect that no, Joe.**

6 Q. You then talk about another individual, who was a lay
7 civilian worker who came into the home, which was NL4.
8 She is "NL4". Again all the names we use are not to be
9 repeated outside the chamber. In paragraph 7, SNB-522,
10 you describe an occasion whenever she was involved with
11 you. Now she was not involved with your group --

12 **A. No.**

13 Q. -- and was not someone that you met a lot in the home.
14 Is that fair?

15 **A. That's correct, yes.**

16 Q. But on this particular occasion there was a lining up
17 going on to go into the refectory.

18 **A. That's right.**

19 Q. And can you just explain to the Panel what happened on
20 that occasion that led you to be involved with NL4?

21 **A. Well, I do remember now we were -- I think it was after**
22 **school we were going for our tea break, sandwiches, and**
23 **at that particular time I remember there was -- there**
24 **was a kitchen being built at that particular time and**
25 **the kitchen had been completed, and I remember looking**

1 at this -- it was a half moon door, and I remember
2 looking through. I was mesmerised by the building, you
3 know. I was about 9 or 10 at that particular time.
4 They spent quite a few years building it. I remember
5 sitting looking it with awe, you know. "This is great",
6 you know. The next minute this person behind me asked
7 me to move on and I looked around again and the
8 next minute she just give me one big smack and I was off
9 balance.

10 Q. Where was the smack, HIA183?

11 A. It was right on the face, on the cheek and it stung. It
12 really, really, stung and it just knocked me off
13 balance. At that particular time the baby home was
14 being built and I used to hear the men using the foul
15 language. So I just told her the f*** word. I told her
16 -- she asked me what did I say. I says, "I told you to
17 fuck off". So she asked me quite a few times and
18 I denied it. She says to me, "If you tell me what you
19 said, I'll give you sweets". So naturally I went -- my
20 eyes were bigger than my mouth, you know. So I told her
21 what I told her -- what I said.

22 I was to go out to that week-end, and she
23 reported --

24 Q. This is your involvement with that I will come
25 back to.

1 **A. Yes, yes.**

2 Q. That was something you looked forward to and it was in
3 front of you that week-end.

4 **A. That was something -- I had to go -- I had to go the**
5 **next day. I was going to . It is down in**
6 **in County Down. That was knocked on the head**
7 **because of what I said to NL4.**

8 Q. Who were you taken to? Did she impose that punishment
9 or was it imposed by someone else?

10 **A. SR34 imposed that punishment on me.**

11 Q. So what you said to NL4 was reported to SR34.

12 **A. To SR34.**

13 Q. You were punished as a result of that.

14 **A. For that.**

15 Q. Did you tell SR34 what had caused you to use that
16 language?

17 **A. No, I didn't, because I wasn't asked and I didn't defend**
18 **myself. As I say, I was an easy-going child. I would**
19 **imagine I was a placid child. So -- but it took a lot**
20 **out of me when I was told I wasn't going to**
21 **that next day, because I was really looking forward to**
22 **it, because I was told about three months in advance**
23 **that we were going down to I really, really**
24 **looked forward to that. When I was told that day -- it**
25 **was in church whenever I was saying the rosary --**

1 time in 1956. So she wouldn't have been supervising
2 you. Of course, you are not saying she was supervising
3 you.

4 **A. No.**

5 Q. You are saying she just happened to come across you in
6 the line that day.

7 **A. Yes.**

8 Q. But she says that -- she denies striking you in the face
9 or indeed any child in the face for any reason. So she
10 is simply saying, "That didn't happen. I didn't hit
11 you, HIA183". She said the allegation is false that's
12 made against her.

13 Now what do you say about the suggestion you weren't
14 hit -- if you were hit by somebody, it wasn't NL4 who
15 hit you?

16 **A. It certainly was NL4. I have a good memory. I remember
17 it. She had blond hair, fair hair at that particular
18 time, but I would have seen her the odd time manhandling
19 children, you know, but she wasn't suitable for the job.
20 That's my own honest opinion.**

21 Q. But you are clear --

22 **A. Oh, it was definitely NL4.**

23 Q. Obviously she takes a different view. The Inquiry will
24 hear from her in due course.

25 **A. Believe you me, it was NL4.**

1 Q. Another matter that you mention, HIA183, that I am just
2 going to cover in brief detail, in paragraph 9, if we
3 move down, paragraphs 9 and 10, you make the point about
4 the food not being great and being hungry, and you
5 remember going -- stealing bread from the kitchen and
6 pointing out that you were lucky you didn't get caught
7 --

8 **A. Yes, I am.**

9 Q. -- for having done that, but you describe in
10 paragraph 10 how the regime was very regimental, and how
11 religion played a large part in the life of a child in
12 Nazareth Lodge, and the chores like polishing the floor,
13 and some others described that as you got down on your
14 knees to scrub the floor. Is that the type of polishing
15 you are talking about or how did you do it?

16 **A. I think I did it the odd -- it wasn't -- it wasn't**
17 **a regular occurrence with me. I can't recollect, but**
18 **we did it the odd time now. It wasn't we did it every**
19 **day, but we did it the odd time. Probably -- I don't**
20 **know. It might have been through punishment now. My**
21 **mind -- memory would be very vague on that, but I do**
22 **remember sitting down and, you know, polishing the floor**
23 **on my hunkers, you know.**

24 Q. So the position is there were chores to be done and you
25 took your turn at doing them --

1 **A. Yes, that's correct.**

2 Q. -- and that on occasion included --

3 **A. That's correct.**

4 Q. -- the polishing of the floors.

5 You do say in one sentence just, and I want to pick
6 it up, because you raised it with me, that the education
7 was poor.

8 **A. Very poor.**

9 Q. And you by the time you left as it turned out to go to
10 Rubane in Kircubbin, you couldn't write. Is that --

11 **A. I couldn't write my -- I couldn't even write my own
12 name.**

13 Q. That's a regret that you have.

14 **A. It's the biggest regret of my life. That's the only
15 thing I find it very hard to come to terms with is my
16 lack of education.**

17 Q. But at the same time, HIA183, you do point out in
18 paragraph 11 some positive reflections of your time in
19 Nazareth Lodge --

20 **A. That's right, yes.**

21 Q. -- or perhaps as a result of not being in Nazareth Lodge
22 as a result of them, which is the point you make, that
23 you were visited once a month by a lady called

24 **A. . That's correct.**

25 Q. How did you come to be involved with Can you

1 remember?

2 **A. I think** came up -- she came up -- there used to
3 be people would come up and visit Nazareth Lodge and
4 visit the boys, and so got to know me and I got
5 to know her and we just struck up a friendship, and
6 there was three other -- I think it was three other
7 girls. The three of them worked in the .

8 asked me would I like to go out with -- for --
9 you know, to her home for the week-end. It was a day
10 actually. It wasn't a week-end. It was a day. So
11 I would have went out on the odd Sunday for the day.
12 I looked forward to that. It was usually about once
13 every six or seven or eight weeks she would have called
14 up and brought us out.

15 **Q.** The other positive experience you reflect on are the
16 summer breaks where you went to spend two to three weeks
17 with a family. For you that was the --

18 **A. The** in .

19 **Q.** -- outside of

20 **A. Outside of**

21 **Q.** You still keep in contact with them.

22 **A. I still keep in contact with them, yes.**

23 **Q.** Again this is an arrangement which worked well for you.
24 It may not have been the experience of others, but your
25 experience of it was a very positive one where --

1 **A. Uh-huh.**

2 Q. And these were families that -- can you remember how it
3 came about that they were getting involved in the lives
4 of the boys in Nazareth Lodge?

5 **A. Well, the** **-- now there was one of the**
6 **was related to** **.** **sister**
7 **worked up in Nazareth Lodge, and I got to know**
8 **sister. She worked up in the baby -- she worked in St.**
9 **Joseph's. She brought me out for the week-end to the**
10 **-- to** **mother. They called them the**
11 **, but** **was going with** **at that**
12 **particular time, and she was called** **So we**
13 **were related with the -- it was more or less to do with**
14 **the** **family. So they lived in** **So**
15 **struck up a good friendship. I used to look forward**
16 **going on a holiday every summer, and it lasted for about**
17 **a fortnight, and I really, really looked forward to**
18 **that, you know.**

19 Q. So that was an arrangement that arose from interaction
20 in the home and the people you met --

21 **A. That's correct.**

22 Q. -- and you have that positive memory, and you say in
23 your statement in fairness to you those are the only
24 happy memories that you have from the time in Nazareth
25 Lodge. It is not a time you look back on with fondness.

1 **A. That's correct.**

2 Q. You do make the point that when you returned, that the
3 sweets and money that had been given to you by
4 presumably or the were taken off you
5 by the nuns, and I was asking can you remember who did
6 that, but you don't remember who.

7 **A. I don't remember who did that, but that's correct, yes.**

8 I always thought that the money was being -- you know,
9 you didn't mind giving the money, because you knew at
10 that particular time the nuns had to go out and, you
11 know, try and support the home, and it was difficult for
12 the nuns too, you know. So it was no qualm with me to
13 have to give the money in, because, I mean, to me at
14 that particular time where I was in the home there was
15 no tuck shop. So it was irrelevant. I wasn't going to
16 be able to spend the money. So the money was just
17 handed in and the sweets.

18 Q. You mention in paragraph 12 then a visit, and you -- we
19 were discussing this earlier -- you speculate now as to
20 that you think that might have been your mum coming to
21 visit you, but who they were wasn't revealed to you and
22 that was the only occasion that they came. Other than
23 --

24 **A. The**

25 Q. -- and the , apart from this visit, there

1 weren't any other visits that you had during your time

2 --

3 **A. That's correct.**

4 Q. -- in the Lodge.

5 **A. That's correct.**

6 Q. Now, as I mentioned to you, you left Rubane -- you went

7 off to Rubane at 12 and you stayed there until

8 July 1960. We discussed on the last occasion you worked

9 in the -- perhaps Siobhan, if she would, could get the

10 RUB bundle ready for me for a moment -- you worked in

11 the cafe originally --

12 **A. That's correct.**

13 Q. -- as a result of the Nazareth Lodge Aftercare Committee

14 arranging --

15 **A. That's right.**

16 Q. -- your placement --

17 **A. That's correct.**

18 Q. -- but I was showing you earlier that it seems that the

19 aftercare worker, if that was Mr Murphy perhaps --

20 **A. That's right. That's correct.**

21 Q. -- kept tight note of his interaction with the boys --

22 **A. That's right.**

23 Q. -- and one of those notes, if we can bring up RUB20017,

24 we can see, HIA183, that you didn't -- it didn't work

25 out in the cafe for you.

1 **A. That's correct.**

2 Q. Then in September of 1960

5

We can see there is
7 an entry relating to you then on 11th October of '60.

8 If we move through to the next page, 20018,

10 , and then you moved to work for
11 another firm in Belfast, sack merchants. Can you
12 remember what you did

15 **A. Do you know, I can hardly -- I can vaguely -- it**
16 **definitely did happen, but I can vaguely recollect what**
17 **I actually was doing,**

20 Q.

21 **A. Yes, yes.**

22 Q.

-- if you can't remember, just say so --

24 **A.**

1

3 Q. And you can't remember if it was Mr Murphy sorted that
4 out, but it may well have been.

5 A. No, Mr Murphy didn't sort that out, no. That wasn't
6 sorted out.

8 Q.

9 A.

11 Q. You have mentioned then your business that
12 you began.

14 A. That's correct, yes.

15 Q. --

17 A. I think actually that was before -- that was actually
18 before I started up on my own, my own business. That is
19 the time when I --

20 Q. You were working for another

21 A. Yes, at that particular time, yes.

22 Q. . In paragraph 31 of your
23 statement, if we go back to 527, please, SNB-527, you
24 make the point in paragraph 31 that you came forward to
25 the Inquiry because you feel there should be

1 accountability, and the matters that you point out are
2 no love, no stability, no education.

3 "All I wanted was love and I didn't receive it in
4 either home and it took me a long time after I left care
5 to learn how to love. I always mistrusted people."

6 That's essentially the core. There are particular
7 incidents that you remember, but it is the lack of
8 warmth --

9 **A. That's correct.**

10 Q. -- or lack of love, as you describe it, that
11 characterised your time in Nazareth Lodge.

12 **A. That's correct, and the lack of education.**

13 Q. And the lack of education. As you know, HIA183, from
14 having gone through this with me before, we always ask
15 two questions at the end of someone's evidence.

16 The first question is about recommendations that the
17 Panel have to consider making to the Northern Ireland
18 Executive at the end of the Panel's work.

19 **A. Uh-huh.**

20 Q. I raised that with you earlier and you had a particular
21 idea that I asked you to share then with the Panel about
22 -- you have a concern in the area of compensation. If
23 money was just given --

24 **A. Uh-huh.**

25 Q. -- as a lump sum to people, that's --

1 A. I personally think that would be irresponsible really,
2 because if you give a lump sum to a person -- I don't
3 know what that sum would come to. It might be --
4 I honestly think it would be irresponsible, because most
5 of those boys, they wouldn't be able to hold on to that
6 money. They would flaunt it, you know. I think it
7 would be more sensible is to put it into a small pension
8 for them, because half of these boys, they are living --
9 they are struggling, you know, financially, you know,
10 because half of them are not -- they have no -- they
11 have no -- what do you call it -- they have no substance
12 in their life. Do you know what I mean? They are
13 trying to make ends meet, you know, and I think it would
14 be more sensible if they put it into a pension fund for
15 them, you know. To give them a lump sum I think would
16 be irresponsible.

17 Q. So your view is that they are likely to get more benefit
18 or individuals who have suffered are likely to get more
19 benefit from some form of ongoing pension type
20 arrangement than --

21 A. Yes, I think that would be more sensible, because
22 I think it would be irresponsible. If you give them
23 about -- I don't know. I am not going to put a sum to
24 it, but they would have it spent in no length of time.
25 They wouldn't have the wit to put it by into a pension

1 fund or anything like that. I think if the State or
2 whoever is putting it up, it would be more responsible.
3 That's my personal own opinion, you know.

4 Q. That's your own view. Is there anything else you want
5 to say about recommendations or does that --

6 A. The only thing I would -- the only thing I would suggest
7 is -- I have emphasised it the last time -- I think
8 institutions are a very unnatural environment to bring
9 up a child, and, as I say, I can't emphasise enough that
10 my education has suffered a lot, you know, over that.

11 However, saying all that, I have been very, very
12 lucky and blessed. I have a good wife and family, and
13 I'd just like to take this opportunity to thank Judge
14 Hart and yourself and your co-workers for the
15 sensitivity you have given me, and you have made it
16 a lot easier for me to work along with. That's all
17 I have to say. It has been all said and thank you very
18 much, Joe.

19 Q. HIA183, I am grateful for that. If you remain -- I was
20 going to ask you this last question, which is whether
21 there is anything else, but I think you have covered
22 that.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. I am not going to ask you anything else unless I have
25 left something out or I have not covered it in enough

1 detail. If there's anything --

2 **A. No. I can't emphasise that enough. I must say you**
3 **have done a great job, and I think the Panel has to**
4 **be -- the whole Panel has to be praised for the way they**
5 **have handled the whole thing, and especially yourself,**
6 **dealing with yourself, Joe, and Christina for your**
7 **sensitivity.**

8 Q. That is very kind of you. If you just remain where you
9 are, HIA183 --

10 **A. Oh, sorry.**

11 Q. -- the Panel Members may want to ask you something, but
12 I am not going to ask you any more.

13 Questions from THE PANEL

14 CHAIRMAN: HIA183, can I just ask you about the lady you
15 call who would take you out from time to time?
16 As I understood what you were describing, she and some
17 friends of hers came to the --

18 **A. Home.**

19 Q. -- home and you struck up a relationship with her and
20 then she would take you out. Were there other people
21 who came to the home and took out children in the same
22 sort of way or were you unusual in that respect?

23 **A. Oh, I think there was -- I think there was a few people**
24 **would have been brought out at weekends, you know.**
25 **I know these -- there was four of them. They worked in**

1 the and took me out at weekends. Four
2 of them would have come out together. There was two of
3 the boys went to Australia, HIA 318 and -- HIA 318
4 HIA 318 -- I am trying to think -- John -- HIA 318
5 and . No, it wasn't , but
6 HIA 318 went to Australia, you know. I looked forward to
7 those weekends. and I still keep -- is in
8 her 80s now. I still keep in contact with her, and
9 I take her out the odd time for her tea, you know. So
10 I still kept up a -- keep up a -- would be about
11 85 now.

12 Q. But -- it may not be a question you can answer --
13 looking at your group of about 20 or 30 children, how
14 many of you might have gone out in that way? Are we
15 talking about just a handful, two or three, or would
16 many children have gone out?

17 A. I couldn't tell you. I would say there would probably
18 have been quite a few would have went out, you know. It
19 would have been around about Christmas time, holiday
20 time, you know.

21 Q. I suppose you were more concerned about yourself rather
22 than what the other people were doing.

23 A. Exactly, you know.

24 Q. Thank you very much.

25 MS DOHERTY: Thanks very much, HIA183. Can I just ask --

1 some of the other witnesses have talked about boys being
2 brought into observe other boys being chastised, boys
3 that had run away or boys that were being punished
4 through the cold baths. Do you remember that? Do you
5 have any ...?

6 **A. I wouldn't have remembered that in Nazareth Lodge now.
7 There was none of that happening in Nazareth Lodge now,
8 but it did happen in Kircubbin, but I never -- I have
9 heard it had happened in Kircubbin, but I never
10 witnessed it, you know. I think I witnessed it once
11 actually, but ...**

12 Q. But not in Nazareth Lodge?

13 **A. Not in Nazareth Lodge, no, no way.**

14 Q. And older boys bullying, was that an issue for you?

15 **A. Well, I am talking about -- I was never bullied, thank
16 God, now, but I do remember it was very intimidating
17 when I was a young boy. There was boys a lot older than
18 me. So you just kept your head down. You just kept
19 your distance, you know.**

20 Q. Thanks very much.

21 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA183, that's all we need to ask you on
22 this occasion. Thank you very much for coming back to
23 speak to us again, because, as we explained before, it's
24 difficult to deal with different institutions in the
25 course of one day. So we have to keep them separate,

1 but we are very grateful to you for coming back to speak
2 to us and what you had to say today. Thank you.

3 **A. Thank you very much, judge.**

4 MR AIKEN: Chairman, can I correct one oversight on my part?
5 I got used to Mr Harvey's presence during the last
6 module and not inviting his appearance on each occasion,
7 but he appears for NL4, who has assisted me with a draft
8 statement and we will by the week-end have a finalised
9 statement. So if his appearance together with
10 Mr Collins, his solicitor, could be noted.

11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

12 MR AIKEN: I know that Ms Smith is taking the next witness.
13 It may be she is in a position to begin that process
14 shortly, but if we could take a short break to ascertain
15 the position.

16 CHAIRMAN: We will rise now for a few minutes. If it is
17 possible to continue before lunch, we will let you know
18 in a few minutes, ladies and gentlemen.

19 (12.15 pm)

20 (Witness withdrew)

21 (Lunch break)

22 (2.00 pm)

23 WITNESS HIA21 (called)

24 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

25 MS SMITH: Good afternoon, Chairman and Panel Members.

1 Before we commence with the next witness there is an
2 appearance to be announced.

3 MS SAVAGE: Chairman, Members of the Panel, Michelle Savage.

4 I appear on behalf of NL5.

5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms Savage.

6 MS SMITH: Chairman, the next witness this morning is

7 "HIA21", HIA21.

8 **A. It is the afternoon.**

9 Q. Oh, it's the afternoon. Did I say "this morning"? It
10 has been a longer day than I thought -- or a shorter day
11 maybe.

12 HIA21 is already sworn, as he has given evidence in
13 the last module, Chairman, and he does wish to maintain
14 the anonymity the Inquiry has afforded him.

15 The statement that HIA21 has provided to the Inquiry
16 can be found at SNB-631 to 647.

17 The congregation's response is at SNB-2000 to 2001.

18 The Health & Social Care Board provided two
19 statements for the Inquiry. The previous one stated
20 that HIA21 had been a private placement and they had no
21 child care records in respect of him. A more recent one
22 at 5... -- sorry -- yes, 50... -- 567... I am getting
23 the numbers wrong. The two statements are at 5676 to
24 5677 and 5005 to 5012. The latter relates to
25 the decision to admit a group of boys who were in Rubane

1 into the care of the Welfare Authority for maintenance
2 purposes, and the papers regarding same can be found in
3 the bundle at 42993 to 42994.

4 I should say that HIA21 makes allegations against
5 two people: NL4, whom we have a received a draft witness
6 statement this morning, an unsigned draft witness
7 statement, but I am advised what she says about the
8 allegations he makes can be put to him, and her
9 representatives are here; and I have spoken to Miss
10 Savage, who appears for NL5, and she has advised me as
11 to what her client says about what HIA21 says about her.

12 Now, HIA21, you are now 58.

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. You were in Nazareth Lodge in Belfast from you were born
15 effectively, from you were a baby until you were 11.
16 You were then transferred in 1968 to Rubane, and you
17 have spoken about your time in Rubane on the last
18 occasion you spoke to the Inquiry.

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. Now I just wanted to confirm at the time that -- all of
21 the years you spent in Nazareth Lodge at that stage
22 there were no older boys. There were no teenage boys in
23 the home --

24 **A. No.**

25 Q. -- because they had been transferred from 1951 onwards

1 to Rubane.

2 **A. Yes. The boys up to my time stayed to age 11 and then**
3 **we moved to Kircubbin, but nobody over the age of 11**
4 **stayed there.**

5 Q. Maybe 12, but that would have been about the max.

6 **A. Maybe, but not that I recall.**

7 Q. You speak generally about your time in Nazareth Lodge in
8 paragraphs 11 through to 15. If we could just go to
9 that, first of all, please. You -- at paragraph 11
10 there you say:

11 "The backdrop to Nazareth Lodge, the food, clothes
12 and recreation were of a reasonable standard. Most
13 certainly you were not starved or deprived. There was
14 always a warm bed. We had everything that could be
15 provided and it wasn't easy for the nuns. From a point
16 of view looking back as a child, Christmas time was
17 always an exciting time. The negative aspect, however,
18 is when you received your Christmas present, you had to
19 return it the following day. The presents were kept and
20 redistributed the following Christmas. From a child's
21 perspective this made no sense, but only to cause much
22 resentment."

23 You say it would be -- later years you understood
24 the reason behind this policy. The nuns depended on
25 voluntary subscription. There were no State support or

1 funding back then. Nevertheless you felt it was rather
2 cruel, and you cite a particular year when you got a toy
3 milk float with churns, and it broke your heart having
4 to give that back.

5 **A. Indeed.**

6 Q. Now we have discussed this earlier. You know that the
7 congregation have provided a response statement with
8 regard to what you have said about your time in care --
9 in their care in the home in Nazareth Lodge. They say
10 that they don't accept that toys were removed from
11 children.

12 **A. Well, I mean, as far as I am concerned as a child,**
13 **I mean, Christmas time you recognise as a very important**
14 **period of the year, and obviously getting Christmas**
15 **presents, albeit very few, was the only one we ever got.**
16 **So on that basis I would refute that. The presents were**
17 **given on Christmas Day and taken away the day after, and**
18 **that's for sure.**

19 Q. Can I just ask, HIA21, if you remember going to
20 Christmas parties outside the home? Did you do that?

21 **A. Yes. We were very blessed that the nuns provided**
22 **Christmas parties throughout Belfast by mainly large**
23 **businesses like Mackies and Kenzies Bakery, where we**
24 **would go with -- also the Nazareth House girls and**
25 **ourselves would go to these various parties. So there**

1 **would be five or six Christmas parties per year at**
2 **Christmas times, and very excitable. The journey itself**
3 **just going out was very good.**

4 Q. You say that was the only time you saw the girls from
5 Nazareth House, when you went to these parties.

6 A. **Yes. Uh-huh.**

7 Q. You also talk about going to the cinema on the Ormeau
8 Road maybe once or twice a year --

9 A. **Yes.**

10 Q. -- although through school time you also went swimming
11 in the Ormeau Baths. That was extended to going for
12 walks along the Ravenhill Road and going into a little
13 sweet shop.

14 A. **Yes.**

15 Q. Did you get pocket money when you were in Nazareth Lodge
16 to spend in the sweet shop or what happened?

17 A. **No, I think the money was provided by the lay carer who**
18 **would take us out. We would go to the local shop, sweet**
19 **shop, and buy sweets or she would buy sweets for us. It**
20 **was an adventure itself just to get out for a walk and**
21 **see different areas of Belfast we never saw before.**

22 Q. You went to school in Nazareth Lodge. So you not only
23 lived there, but you went to school on site.

24 A. **Yes, I did. That's correct.**

25 Q. You say some of the boys would also go out to foster

1 homes at weekends. You say ironically in most cases the
2 boys couldn't wait to get back to the Lodge, because it
3 was home. Did you yourself go out to a foster family?

4 **A. Yes. I went out with my couple in ,**
5 **, the , for a number of years at**
6 **weekends, but to be honest, I couldn't wait to get back**
7 **to the home, because it was my home.**

8 Q. Can I just ask -- I am going to come on to a couple of
9 things, but I have already said that Nazareth Lodge
10 primary school was within the grounds of the Lodge there
11 at paragraph 14. If we could just scroll down to it.
12 You say the school had four classrooms, four teachers
13 and you name some nuns there who were teachers in the
14 school. Although we have given them designations SR34,
15 47, 156 and you also name lay teachers who taught in the
16 school there, but you -- I am just going to use the
17 names of the nuns and ask you if you remember any other
18 nuns. There was SR34, SR47, SR 156 --

19 **A. Yes.**

20 Q. -- and the lay teacher was NL 63 .

21 **A. Yes, that's right.**

22 Q. You say they were all good teachers.

23 **A. They were all good teachers in their own right. NL 63**
24 **obviously -- NL 63 was quite strict in the sense that**
25 **he would use a strap. SR47 to me was a very, very**

1 gentle person and SR 156 very much similar. SR34 was,
2 let's say, a wee bit robust, a very dominant person and
3 very strict. So, I mean, you curtailed the line and
4 stayed within your parameters, you know.

5 Q. You describe her as having a short fuse.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You say that:

8 " NL 63 was strict and would have used
9 a leather strap and SR34 was much the same, that she had
10 a short fuse."

11 Are you suggesting she would also have used
12 a leather strap in the school?

13 A. Not in my time. I think the way SR34 would have handed
14 out punishment was probably a smack on the face or
15 something like that there, or slap on the legs, or
16 occasionally pulling your cheeks, that one.

17 Q. You say that -- I think the words you used to describe
18 her when we were talking earlier was she was probably
19 over-zealous.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Now you didn't -- certainly you say you don't ever
22 remember any school inspectors coming to visit the
23 school. You do talk about you remember Cardinal
24 Conway's visit to the home some time in the 1960s.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Did you ever remember anybody else coming to inspect the
2 home, never mind the school, but coming to look at the
3 home to see what was going on in it?

4 A. I don't recall any visitation from anybody or any
5 particular bodies that I would recall. Obviously being
6 quite young and small, I wouldn't really comprehend who
7 was coming or going. I might have seen in school
8 occasionally men in -- what I would call in suits, but
9 whether they were actually school inspectors or not I'd
10 only be speculating.

11 Q. You talked when we were speaking earlier about the fact
12 that there was an annual open Sunday in the home. Can
13 you tell us a little bit about that, HIA21?

14 A. Yes. It was an opening once a year on a Sunday --
15 I think it is usually before Easter or after Easter --
16 where Joe Public and particularly married families or
17 husband and wife would come, and there'd be dozens and
18 dozens of visitors coming just to visit the children,
19 give them sweets, talk to them, spend a few hours with
20 us. That was an enjoyable day, because we knew that
21 people would come up and give us sweets more than
22 anything else.

23 Q. You also -- do you remember the doctor visiting the home
24 or the dentist, or what were the arrangements with
25 regard to medical care?

1 A. Well, there was a doctor that I recall -- I mean, I have
2 a particular problem with my kidney -- Dr McSorley, who
3 was attached to Donegall Pass Health Clinic. He would
4 come occasionally to visit me. So I presume he would
5 have been the standard doctor for the home itself. That
6 man is now deceased.

7 As for the dentist, I think we had to go to
8 somewhere on the Ravenhill Road. There was a local
9 school of dentistry or something like that there that we
10 would go.

11 Q. Barbers, getting your hair cut.

12 A. We had two men basically I think from the Falls Road
13 area who would come every five or six weeks to cut our
14 hair. We were very much awarded. We got a penny chew
15 every time we got a haircut providing we were good.
16 More times than not we were.

17 Q. If I can then move on to talk about the person against
18 whom you make complaints about your time in Nazareth
19 Lodge. If we could go back to paragraph 3, HIA21, of
20 your statement, and you describe that:

21 "From the age of 6 years old I suffered systematic
22 physical and psychological abuse by a lay member of
23 staff",

24 who is given the designation there "NL4". Again
25 I don't think I need to give you the name of the person

1 that we are talking about.

2 **A. No. Yes.**

3 Q. So I'm not even going to use her name in the chamber,
4 but you say:

5 "These abuses continued for the next five years.
6 I lived in total fear of her. She dominated my
7 existence. In later years I would find out she was
8 of the Nazareth Order."

9 Now just before we go on to discuss a little bit
10 more about what you say she did to you, can I -- this
11 started about the age of 6. What was the position with
12 regard to moving -- you had been in the home from you
13 were a baby.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. What were your movements through the home? Where did
16 you go?

17 **A. Initially I was attached to St. Joseph's baby home on
18 6th February 1957, and at the age of 4 I went to a place
19 called Bethlehem, which is attached to Nazareth House --
20 Nazareth Lodge itself. It is in the same grounds, and
21 then to the main house at 5.**

22 Q. So from the baby home after -- the babies and toddlers
23 would have stayed in the baby home and moved over to --

24 **A. To about 3.**

25 Q. What -- would Bethlehem be described as the nursery?

1 **A. A nursery, yes.**

2 Q. Then from the nursery you moved into the Lodge, the main
3 building.

4 **A. To the main block, Nazareth Lodge itself, yes.**

5 Q. That would have been around the time you reached school
6 age. Would that be right?

7 **A. Most likely.**

8 Q. Now in paragraph 4 -- I will come back and discuss with
9 you what NL4 has said about the allegations that you
10 make against her, but we will go through those
11 allegations, first of all.

12 Paragraph 4 you say that:

13 "The physical abuse consisted of her punching and
14 kicking me in addition to being physically force fed.
15 She degraded and humiliated me in front of other
16 children. The home had a communal dining area, which
17 was divided into four eating units, which reflected your
18 group. In most cases stew was the main diet, which
19 I had a huge dislike for. I used to hide the stew in my
20 trouser pockets and NL4 spotted the stain on my trousers
21 and she asked me what I was doing. I told her I didn't
22 like stew. Her response was to take the stew from my
23 pockets and got me into the middle of the dining room,
24 where she held me down on my knees and pulled my hair so
25 that my mouth would open, and she forced the food into

1 my mouth. I was crying and terrified as the food went
2 down my throat. She kicked and punched me and hence
3 I swallowed the food. All the children in the room
4 would have witnessed this. There were no Sisters
5 present during this episode, as was the same on many
6 occasions she abused children. The impact of force
7 feeding would limit my intake that I became fussy about
8 food ever since."

9 Now I am going to pause there. Just to confirm that
10 this woman, NL4, has said in her statement that you are
11 correct when you said -- you described her as
12 an .

13 . She said
14
15 she was homesick and wanted to return to Belfast.

16 From that period she worked in Nazareth Lodge off
17 and on over a number of years. One thing she says. She
18 has worked out that from testimonials and references and
19 her medical records where she might have been at any
20 given year. She says certainly she would have been in
21 Nazareth Lodge between 1966 and 1968, because she has
22 a reference from SR172, who was the Mother Superior at
23 that time, referring to her work as a housemother for
24 the past two years, and that's dated August 1968. Can.
25

1 I just ask, HIA21, you talk about a period of five
2 years in your life.

3 A. Yes. Well, maybe I can explain that, Christina. First
4 of all, when Nazareth House was being renovated as such
5 or Bethlehem, we lived actually in what we called the
6 concert hall. That would have been in the early 1960s,
7 early 1960s. I can't be precise, but certainly I would
8 say from '62 anyway, and NL4 was there working in that
9 environment in that hall, and I was one of those
10 children who was in that hall.

11 So, I mean, for her to suggest that she only worked
12 from '66 to '68, I mean, that may be the case, but the
13 fact she left on numerous occasions during the course of
14 my time that I grouped something like five years as what
15 I endured from her, it doesn't cause -- mean to say from
16 1964 to '68 that she abused me continuously. It is
17 during a period of five years while she was there that
18 I suffered under her.

19 Q. Just to be clear, HIA21, I don't think -- she is not --
20 she does accept that she would have been there certainly
21 over part of the period that you are talking about, but
22 that between 1956 and 1975 she said that she would have
23 estimated that she worked in Nazareth Lodge for less
24 than half of that period, and if she totalled up all the
25 period she says she would have worked, it would have

1 been between seven and nine years in total --

2 **A. Yes.**

3 Q. -- throughout those -- that effectively 20-year period.

4 **A. Yes. Then that would basically take my five years in as**
5 **such, but, I mean, if she is going to be splitting**
6 **shares with respect to the five years I have sort of**
7 **concentrated on, it is five years of my life that**
8 **I recall that I had trouble with her.**

9 Q. She does accept, HIA21, that she would have been -- it
10 is possible that she would have worked in your group for
11 a period of time and that she would have been there in
12 part of the time that you would have been there. So she
13 does accept she was there at the same time as you but
14 not necessarily throughout the five years.

15 **A. Well, we are going to be splitting hairs, but if I can**
16 **just recall, I was, first of all, in the Sacred Heart's**
17 **group, which was then SR 172 was the nun, and**
18 **when SR172 had arrived in I think it might have been**
19 **'66/'67 as Mother, she transferred me into the Marions**
20 **group, which NL4 was in charge of it. So NL4 would have**
21 **known me before I went to the Marions. So therefore**
22 **I was in Sacred Heart's at least four years where I**
23 **remember NL4 and then I stayed in the Marions for two**
24 **years thereafter before I left in '68.**

25 Q. Well, just coming back to what you say about what she

1 did to you in your statement, you go on at paragraph 5
2 there to describe:

3 "During the summer holidays we used to go every year
4 to Ballyhornan near Downpatrick, which was our holiday
5 home. This time of the year we always looked forward
6 to. There were six holiday huts, of which four were
7 allocated to each group, St. Joseph's, Our Lady's,
8 Sacred Heart's and the Marions. We had communal four
9 dormitories whereby each room had two bunk beds, which
10 contained four children. One night NL4 dragged me out
11 of my bed by the hair and brought me into her single
12 room. I suspect the reason behind this was that we were
13 messing around having pillow fights, because we weren't
14 tired. It was still daylight when we were put to bed at
15 7.00 pm.

16 She obviously had a dislike for [you] for whatever
17 reason and properly blamed me for the carry-on, so I
18 wasn't surprised when she picked me out. She summoned
19 me into her room and pinned me against the bedroom wall
20 and banged my head against the wall. She punched me in
21 the stomach and she stamped on my bare feet, which
22 caused my big toe to bleed.

23 The torture lasted for about fifteen minutes. My
24 body was shivering, as I was only wearing swimming
25 trunks. She escorted me back to my communal bedroom and

1 got me to lie down on the cold stone floor between the
2 bunk beds with blood from my toe still bleeding. She
3 told me not to move. Some time had passed, whereby upon
4 she returned, which seemed like an eternity, and told me
5 to get back into bed. I was cold and crying. The other
6 lads were fast asleep. I was petrified. The next
7 morning I could hardly walk because of my injured toe.
8 My bed sheet was stained with blood and this resulted in
9 being beaten again by NL4. Because of this, I was put
10 into a cold shower. Having left the washing area, the
11 nun SR172", who was there with you in Ballyhornan, "saw
12 me hopping along the narrow corridor and asked me what
13 happened. Before I could say a thing NL4 said, 'Oh, he
14 staved his toe against the wall'. NL4 made sure she was
15 in control and she was always on hand to offer
16 a plausible explanation. SR172 actually dressed the
17 wound and told me to take it easy. I had to go to the
18 local hospital, where I received further treatment."

19 Now just -- I have used the designation, but you
20 know which nun we are talking about.

21 **A. Yes, yes.**

22 Q. I should say that in her statement she does accept that
23 she would have gone on holiday with the boys and with
24 sisters. If she was working in Nazareth home at the
25 time, she would have gone on holiday to Ballyhornan with

1 you, but she does not accept the allegations that you
2 make. I will come back to read out in total what she
3 does say about it, HIA21, but if we can just go on, you
4 were talking here about the boys being divided into four
5 groups, and they were coloured coded. In what way were
6 they colour coded, HIA21?

7 **A. Well, as well as given names they were colour coded as**
8 **in Our Lady's was red, Sacred Heart's was blue, the**
9 **Marions was green and St. Joseph's was yellow. That's**
10 **just the way it was, because in our communal dining room**
11 **our crockery was the colour of the -- that's the reason**
12 **why we got the colours. So blue delft for Sacred**
13 **Heart's and red for Our Lady's. So red, blue, green,**
14 **yellow.**

15 Q. Were the colour codes used in any other way in the home?

16 **A. No.**

17 Q. Just for the crockery (inaudible) you to go to that
18 table and that's why you'd go there.

19 **A. Oh, yes, because they were divided into four sections,**
20 **so all the different colour codes.**

21 Q. You have explained here how you were originally attached
22 to the Sacred Hearts, but when SR172 came, for some
23 unexplained reason you were transferred into the Marion
24 group, to which NL4 was attached. You say that was your
25 worst nightmare and for the remainder of your time until

1 you left in August of '68 abuse was dished out on
2 a daily basis.

3 You talked about one occasion where you had gone to
4 bed and you tried to jump out of a toilet area window
5 some two floors high and other boys had to force you
6 down, but you were at your wits' end, because you wanted
7 to end the nightmare.

8 **A. Yes.**

9 Q. At paragraph 9 you talk about going to mass on Sunday
10 morning at 10 o'clock. The mass was -- the chapel was
11 in the home. I am just being clear. Apart from the
12 trips out at Christmas, the two times a year that you
13 went to the cinema, when you had to go to the doctor and
14 when you had to go to the dentist, you and the boys
15 spent your entire life within the Nazareth Lodge
16 complex.

17 **A. Yes, I was confined to the home itself. I have to say**
18 **in most times those were happier times in a sense. The**
19 **biggest factor for me was when I was transferred from**
20 **Sacred Heart to St. Marion -- to the Marions was the**
21 **start of my nightmare, because I knew what NL4 was like**
22 **before. To be actually under her wing was actually**
23 **going to be devastating and it proved to be the point.**

24 Q. I should have said that you also went out to foster
25 families. That was another time when you got outside

1 the home as well.

2 **A. Yes, yes.**

3 Q. You just say -- you go on about mass and you say this
4 was another example of NL4 abusing children. You saw
5 a young boy whom you name there, NL72, who was slightly
6 older and who had learning difficulties. He was being
7 subjected to a torrent to verbal abuse minutes after
8 mass for apparently no other reason. She pushed him
9 down the stairs and the Reverend Mother happened to be
10 at the bottom ground floor when NL72 landed. She was
11 taken aback and helped the boy to his feet. The child
12 was crying. NL4 made excuses and said that he couldn't
13 hold on to the banister and she had tried to catch him.
14 Many of the boys who witnessed this were in total shock
15 and full of fear and you couldn't report the incident.
16 You also felt that the nuns might not believe you.

17 **A. Yes.**

18 Q. Any opportunity you did get a chance to talk to the nuns
19 NL4 was always present and you say it was purely a fear
20 factor.

21 **A. Very much so. This person as far as I'm concerned,**
22 **I mean, was totally unsuitable to look after children**
23 **and the fact that we as children were in fear of her,**
24 **I mean, you could see it in our eyes. I had great**
25 **difficulty in liaising with her in any shape or form or**

1 even warming to her, because there was a vicious streak
2 in her. I actually think she was a psychopath, that
3 she'd a split personality. The fact she had left the
4 home on numerous occasions would tell you there is
5 something different there. I felt it was an opportunity
6 for the nuns at any time when she did leave whether to
7 let her back or not. The fact she was allowed back was
8 detrimental to the children who were left behind.

9 Q. You go on to describe her as cunning and an opportunist
10 and say the nuns were always out of sight and that's
11 when she was most devious.

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. You say:

14 "During recreational periods lay staff would
15 supervise the boys, as the nuns were normally attending
16 church prayers or going to meal times, and that window
17 of opportunity meant that she could be in total control
18 and did what she pleased. You just knew someone was
19 going to get it."

20 You then go on to describe other lay people who were
21 in the home and describe them as great people. Their
22 names are given there as NL73, NL74 and NL75. You are
23 not sure if they knew what was going on, but suspect
24 that they didn't. Most likely they didn't know simply
25 because she worked alone and didn't have much in common

1 with the lay staff in general. She was not well liked
2 both by the children and equally by fellow lay staff.

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. Now, as I've said to you, the Sisters have prepared
5 a response, and what they say about the staff is at
6 paragraph 2 of their response statement on page 2000.

7 It says that:

8 "The staff of Nazareth Lodge were employed by the
9 Sisters with the utmost faith in their ability to ensure
10 the needs of the children were met. The congregation is
11 devastated to consider that a member of staff would
12 perform such cruel acts on a child under our care. The
13 congregation would not accept any abuse, physical or
14 mental, of a child by a member of staff as appropriate
15 or defensible. The congregation endeavoured to provide
16 a safe and loving home for children and it is a matter
17 of deep regret that any resident under the care of the
18 Sisters of Nazareth has suffered at the hands of a staff
19 member."

20 You talk in paragraph 17 of your statement, HIA21,
21 about the mixed feelings that you had when it came your
22 turn to move from Nazareth Lodge to Rubane. You say:

23 "It was joyful, but also a sad occasion. Leaving
24 behind my home after eleven years left me in tears.
25 While I had every reason to be bitter, the nuns for me

1 were my parents, whom I had a high regard for and the
2 boys were my brothers. Thirteen boys along with I were
3 leaving for good, and as we all said our goodbyes to the
4 nun at the front of the Lodge porch doors tears started
5 to flow. We all climbed on to the minibus which would
6 take us to Rubane home. It was an end of our time.
7 Despite this gladness (sic) I was ever so glad to be
8 away from NL4. The other boys felt much the same, such
9 was the negative impact she caused."

10 In the preceding paragraph you describe that on the
11 day that you were leaving you actually told her, "Thank
12 God we are escaping from you" or words to that effect.

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. She again punched you with her fist on your back,
15 slapped you on the face and kicked out at you. You say
16 you have always had problems with your back since then.

17 **A. That's right.**

18 Q. You describe the Lodge as a mainly happy environment
19 with the exception of this one member of staff.

20 **A. Yes. The last day that I --**

21 Q. Sorry, HIA21. Are you okay? HIA21, if you need to take
22 a break --

23 **A. It's okay. I know what happened to me as a child in**
24 **Nazareth Lodge and NL4 knows what happened to me. To**
25 **leave Nazareth Lodge to me was the biggest**

1 disappointment, because it was my home, and I was only
2 too glad to tell NL4 how I felt as a child that I was
3 leaving her behind me, and for that reason alone
4 I wanted to make sure she knew where I was coming from.
5 I actually ran into the bus after she hit me.

6 I mean, for the Order to recognise that they are
7 responsible for hiring staff such as NL4 and accept that
8 anybody hurt by staff would be totally inappropriate and
9 unacceptable is commendable, but nevertheless NL4
10 through the Order abused me for those years and I am
11 very disappointed that NL4 has taken the decision to
12 rebut these allegations that I'm making, knowing it
13 actually has impacted me even further to this day now.
14 It did happen to me. I actually feel sorry for her and
15 I pray for her.

16 Q. HIA21, you met this woman years later. You talk about
17 this at paragraph 18 of your statement.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Some years later -- you think it was the mid-'70s -- you
20 happened to meet her not far from where you were living,
21 and you felt the need to go across the street to talk to
22 her and challenge her. You asked her if she recognised
23 who you were and she said she didn't know you. You said
24 to her, "I am the guy you battered for five solid years
25 while I was in Nazareth Lodge" and gave her your name.

1 You further added, "You know every bone in my body.
2 I hope you can live with yourself", and then you just
3 walked away and that was the last time you saw her. You
4 describe her as evil and a psychopath and you believe if
5 she is still alive, she would be in her 70s.

6 **A. Yes. I remembered I lived up in . I never**
7 **thought I would meet this woman ever again, but hoping**
8 **one day I would. She was actually walking in the same**
9 **street that I lived, and I made a point of going see**
10 **her, because I felt I had to get it all off my chest.**
11 **I felt I had done it in a very controlled manner,**
12 **although I was an angry young man. I was 17, 18 or 19.**
13 **Nonetheless I made my point to her that she did leave**
14 **a mark on me, but she didn't recall me. She didn't even**
15 **remember my name. That says more about her than me.**

16 **Q. Well, as I said to you, she did make a statement. She**
17 **addresses in that statement the allegations that you**
18 **have made. I just want to confirm, HIA21, you never**
19 **complained to the police about this woman. Isn't that**
20 **correct?**

21 **A. Yes. There's a simple reason why I haven't. I mean,**
22 **I have a high regard for the people who actually looked**
23 **after me, which was the Nazareth nuns, and I felt if**
24 **I was to seek prosecution on this particular person, it**
25 **would be actually taking action against the Order, and**

1 for that alone. My respect for the Order is ultimate.
2 It is the same when I was in Kircubbin. I respected the
3 Order for the care they had given me. While it was
4 difficult, I still respected those people who genuinely
5 looked after me both in Nazareth and Rubane. NL4 knows
6 what she's done and the fact she has to live with that.

7 Q. Well, in her statement she says:

8 "I categorically deny all the allegations he has
9 made against me. In fact, I do not even recall him,
10 although it is possible I worked in his group for
11 a period of time."

12 She says she would accept that there were periods
13 during the time that you were in Nazareth Lodge that she
14 was working as a housemother. She says:

15 "In his statement he describes incidents in which he
16 was brought to the middle of the dining room in front of
17 all the other children and food was forced into his
18 mouth. During this time he alleges I was kicking and
19 punching him and he states all the children in the room
20 would have witnessed this. This did not happen. If
21 this activity had taken place in front of all the
22 children, then I would have thought others would have
23 come forward and described it when making statements to
24 the police.

25 He has described a serious assault during the summer

1 holidays in Ballyhornan and that his foot was bleeding
2 and he required to go to a local hospital for treatment.
3 However, he does not appear to have complained to
4 anybody about his allegations against me on this or any
5 other occasion, and in particular he never mentioned any
6 of this to the nuns, with whom he appeared to get on
7 well.

8 He describes another assault on the very day he was
9 leaving Nazareth Lodge, but I find it puzzling he would
10 not have gone to one of the nuns at that stage, since he
11 was about to leave Nazareth Lodge. I deny his
12 allegations."

13 I'm pausing there to say that she does not address
14 the allegation that you make about throwing a child down
15 the stairs.

16 **A. No, she wouldn't. Nor would she. The fact is what she**
17 **did to me in the dining room, and what she did to me in**
18 **Ballyhornan, and what she did to that child and what she**
19 **did to me on the day I left, of course she is going to**
20 **deny it. The fact that she has not recognised what she**
21 **did in Ballyhornan itself is testimony to her that --**
22 **the fact that she has ignored it because she done it.**
23 **The fact that I couldn't report or go to the nuns is**
24 **that was fear because of her. I mean, she was in charge**
25 **of my group. So I was with her 24/7. I didn't have the**

1 courage or conviction to go and face the nun, and
2 whether the nuns would believe me or not was neither
3 here nor there. The fact I was in fear of her as
4 a young child, vulnerable child. What else would you
5 expect other than a child who would suppress himself
6 into himself and that's exactly what I did.

7 So I am taken back a bit by the fact she is not
8 acknowledging what she has done on me. While she
9 acknowledged she may have known of me, it is just being
10 cosmetic. I mean, it is an insult to me and my
11 intelligence.

12 Q. HIA21, if I might move on just to paragraph 19 there,
13 because you talk about another lay staff member in
14 Nazareth Lodge, NL5. Again you know who we are talking
15 about.

16 **A. Yes.**

17 Q. She is in her 80s. She contacted you when this Inquiry
18 was set up. You have had contact with her many times
19 since you left Nazareth Lodge in 1968.

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. You went to see her in January of 2010 on one of these
22 occasions. There was a memorial service for one of the
23 boys who had died during the Troubles.

24 **A. Yes.**

25 Q. Some time later you dropped into her home and she told

1 you that she was worried about the Inquiry. You told
2 her that she had seen NL4, the other woman, abuse you
3 and many of the other boys and that she had done nothing
4 about that.

5 **A. That's right.**

6 Q. "She replied in saying she didn't witness the abuse
7 either to me or to others",
8 and you told her that you found that inconceivable.
9 You also told her that she was no angel in the Lodge and
10 that she was strict.

11 "She did slap us across the face and lifted us off
12 the ground from our sideburns."

13 You said, "What's that all about?" to her.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. Now we have not as yet received this lady's statement,
16 but just to be clear, having spoken to her
17 representative just before you came into the chamber,
18 HIA21, she has said that she had very good relations and
19 always attended reunions and things for the Lodge and
20 received a standing ovation from the boys whom she had
21 looked after. Would you accept that?

22 **A. No, I would accept that. I mean, the fact that this**
23 **particular person -- the reason why I have her in my**
24 **statement is that she saw NL4 punishing me or physically**
25 **assaulting me, and I was more annoyed at the fact while**

1 she had maybe done nothing there and then, she should
2 have reported to the powers that be to have her removed,
3 and for that alone I had trouble with NL 5 in that
4 regard, that she had ownership on her part to take some
5 responsibility for what this other person was doing to
6 me.

7 Certainly many years later and even prior to
8 Christmas I and another friend had called to see her,
9 because she is a frail, old woman, and I am very much
10 mindful of her that she is vulnerable in many ways and
11 she is maybe left in isolation even from the legal team,
12 but she is not the crux of my --

13 Q. Complaint.

14 A. -- compliant here as such. While she would be
15 an observant of what happened to me on occasions, I feel
16 for her, because I think she is been tarnished because
17 of NL4.

18 Q. Would she have worked alongside NL4 in the home?

19 A. They impossibly could not have been. They had to,
20 certainly in the dining room and if not in the
21 recreational side as well. I think if NL 5 was to say
22 something to the contrary, then I would contradict that.
23 She certainly would have in that capacity of overseeing
24 when the nuns -- either at prayer time or meal time. In
25 respect of what NL 5 is saying in regard to the

1 reunions, yes, by all means many of the boys would have
2 appreciated NL 5, what she did for us, but equally we
3 would say she was very strict and we would leave it like
4 that.

5 Q. You describe the kind of things she would have done to
6 the boys. Was that a punishment, that she would have
7 been doing that because boys had stepped out of line, or
8 --

9 A. Yes, she would -- like, I used the term she was no angel
10 and maybe that's exaggerating to a certain extent, but
11 the fact she was a control freak as such, that
12 discipline was the essence of her curriculum, and
13 therefore if you didn't tow the line, NL 5 would put you
14 in the line. I think you have to accept that there has
15 to be some issue of being accountable. I think NL 5 was
16 doing that in relation to us.

17 Q. Well, just to be clear, she would say through her
18 lawyers to me, and I am putting it to you, that she
19 never slapped any child.

20 A. Well, NL 5 has to live with that. If that's what she is
21 prepared to give out through her statement, through her
22 solicitor, then that's what she has to do, but I know
23 NL 5 did slap including me and others, but, I mean, it
24 wasn't a big factor in my life compared to the likes of
25 NL4. No stretch of the imagination.

1 Q. Just coming back to what NL4 says in the final
2 paragraph that she deals with what you say, you say:

3 "He concludes..."

4 She says:

5 "He concludes his statement by describing meeting
6 both me and NL 5 in later years. I have no
7 recollection of meeting him in , as he has
8 alleged."

9 You talk about -- she says:

10 "I also note when he confronted NL5, she said she
11 was unaware that I was physically abusive to him or any
12 of the other boys."

13 **A. Yes. Well, first of all, Christine, I don't know how
14 she would know that other than she got through from my
15 statement.**

16 Q. She is talking about your statement, HIA21.

17 **A. Okay. So, therefore, just to keep it in that context,
18 in respect to NL 5 , NL 5 -- I spoke to NL 5 about this
19 many times years after in regard to NL4. So NL 5 is
20 very aware. I am sort of disappointed that if she
21 didn't see what was going on, you know. I have to
22 accept that that is what she believes, but I know what
23 I saw and I know what she saw as well.**

24 Q. Well, in paragraphs 20 and 21 here you go on to say:

25 "While I had some difficulties in Nazareth Lodge

1 during my time there, but equally I will always be
2 indebted to the Nazareth Sisters, who enriched my life.
3 The Lodge was my family home. NL4's influence
4 undoubtedly impacted the lives of many boys in the
5 negative aspect of Nazareth Lodge. My experiences of
6 Nazareth were of very good memories, but sadly very much
7 affected by NL4's ongoing abuse, which had a physical
8 and psychological impact."

9 Now in their response statement the Order have said,
10 HIA21, that they were pleased to read that your life had
11 been enriched by your time with the Sisters and that you
12 had very good memories of your time in the Lodge.

13 "However, we must offer HIA21 an unreserved and most
14 sincere apology for any treatment he received by any
15 staff member which fell below the acceptable standard."

16 **A. Christina, first of all, I accept the Order's apology,**
17 **however late it may be. I still accept it in the way**
18 **that it has been given. It's just disappointing that as**
19 **children, while the nuns certainly done their best, and**
20 **I know they did, the vast majority of them, and I could**
21 **name so many here, SR47, SR34, SR 71 , SR 156 , SR134,**
22 **SR 151 SR 62 -- SR 151 SR 62 -- they**
23 **are all different types of people, but the one primary**
24 **example was to look after children as best they could**
25 **under the circumstances and within the parameters that**

1 they had.

2 I just feel that for the nuns, the Order now, and
3 the ones who are picking up the pieces from the past,
4 I feel for them, because it must be hard for them to
5 listen to us, knowing that we are telling something, our
6 story. This is our story, and as much as we want to
7 suppress it, I think this opportunity that the Order
8 have recognised that we are voices and not silent voices
9 is to be commended.

10 Q. Well, HIA21, there is nothing further I want to ask you
11 about, but is there anything you feel we have not
12 covered or anything you want to say? I know this is the
13 second time you have been here --

14 A. Yes. Understood.

15 Q. -- and I'm not inviting you to repeat what you've said
16 on a previous occasion --

17 A. Oh, no.

18 Q. -- but if there is anything else that you want to add to
19 what you have said before, then please feel free to do
20 so.

21 A. Okay. Thanks, Christine. First of all, could I thank
22 the Panel and Judge Hart and his team and the counsel
23 people and the people in this establishment and in the
24 offices for their fantastic understanding and support
25 over these difficult times, not just for me but for all

1 of us who are coming through this particular aspect,
2 both through the Acknowledgment Forum and the statutory,
3 but it saddens me there is many voices that we won't
4 hear, who have sadly passed on, and there is many voices
5 are still alive but can't be heard, and that we think of
6 them and what we could do for them not today but
7 tomorrow and try to make their lives and enrich their
8 lives better. There is many people out there with great
9 difficulties, struggling with life and waiting to hear
10 the outcome of this Inquiry and what it is going to
11 bring or may not bring, and we are out putting ourselves
12 in a position where we are going to make their lives
13 better as such. It is a given hope, not false hope, but
14 hope, genuine hope and support that they need, and
15 I know through a friend of myself that I don't mind
16 mentioning, HIA 183 , and our support group, we'll do our
17 utmost to help as many that we can and we try to do, but
18 ultimately through Judge Hart that we need help now, not
19 2017, now. The support service is in place. It has all
20 the apparatus that we need to a certain extent from
21 the counselling point of view, consoling, visitations
22 and filling forms, but we need practical help as well,
23 and it would be a failing of me that I didn't convey
24 this, but to thank everybody here who has taken part,
25 because you alone have given us a voice, and for that

1 **alone we are very appreciative. Thank you.**

2 MS SMITH: Thank you very much, HIA21. I have nothing
3 further to ask, but the Panel Members may ask you some
4 questions.

5 Questions from THE PANEL

6 CHAIRMAN: HIA21, can I thank you for what you have said
7 about us, but ask you to go back to something you said
8 a few minutes ago about being taken out at weekends by a
9 married couple from ? Was this something that
10 happened, say, once a week, once a month, only in the
11 summer holidays? With what degree of regularity?

12 **A. About once a fortnight. Basically what happened was it**
13 **was mostly children who didn't have families or parents**
14 **who would call to see them, that they would be given the**
15 **option of going to foster homes as such for the**
16 **week-end. Initially I found that exciting, but I have**
17 **to say this: I did miss the hub of the Lodge, because**
18 **the boys I left behind, and while I appreciated it,**
19 **I was always glad to get back to the Lodge.**

20 Q. In a sense you at least partly answered the next
21 question I was going to ask. How many boys in your
22 group do you think were able to have that opportunity?
23 Was it just one or two of you? Were you one of the
24 fortunate ones or did everybody get the opportunity?

25 **A. No, certainly not. I would say I was probably one of**

1 the fortunate ones. In my group alone I think there
2 would have been roughly about twenty boys, and out of
3 the twenty, three or four might have went out for
4 weekends out of that group. It wasn't for everybody.
5 Some of the boys didn't want to go. So it wasn't --
6 they weren't coerced in being pushed out or whatever.
7 If you wanted to go to a foster home, you were given
8 that option. You were encouraged, of course, but you
9 didn't have to go if you didn't want to.

10 Q. I see. Thank you very much.

11 MS DOHERTY: Thanks very much, HIA21. Can I ask when you
12 were in Marions and NL4 was obviously in charge, were
13 there other staff around that were there regularly as
14 well?

15 A. There would have been staff on the next -- same level in
16 the Sacred Hearts, SR 156 and NL74 I think it
17 was, which was originally my group, which I missed
18 immensely. To be moved -- I don't know why. Only the
19 nuns can answer that, but I think maybe I might have
20 been boisterous. So it was maybe my own downfall, my
21 own fault.

22 In regard to N4 -- NL4 as far as I am concerned,
23 this woman knew exactly what she was doing, that when
24 the nun in my time, which was SR172, was in that
25 queue -- in that -- charge of that group, she would go

1 to prayer time or meal time, that NL4 -- it was like
2 changing a clock. She'd more faces than the Albert
3 Clock. She was ruthless. That's why I felt that I was
4 vulnerable, exposed.

5 Now the nuns didn't expose her to me deliberately.
6 They were not -- I don't think they were conscious of
7 what she was doing, and therefore only when she passed
8 -- when the nuns left that she would come in and
9 dominate our life or dominate certainly my life to the
10 extent she did.

11 Q. You talked about the fear in your eyes --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- and the fear in other children' eyes in relation.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Would that fear have been there even when the Mother was
16 around?

17 A. Yes, most likely it was, but I don't think in fairness
18 that any of the nuns could pick that up. Maybe they had
19 other chores or whatever, but the fact we were afraid to
20 talk to the nuns. I mean, I was able to talk to SR 173
21 SR 173 when I was in the Sacred Heart's group, and she
22 was a fantastic person. When she left, I mean, it just
23 broke my heart, you know, because she was like a mother
24 figure to me. Then you go to the likes of NL4, who are
25 the coldest and no love in her at all, but only just

1 **controlled in the physical sense. That in itself was**
2 **a factor in how we had fear in our eyes.**

3 Q. Okay. Thanks very much, HIA21.

4 **A. Thank you.**

5 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA21, you will be glad to hear those are
6 the only questions we want to ask you today. Thank you
7 very much for coming back to speak to us. I know it is
8 difficult each time, but, as we have explained, we have
9 to try and do this in stages. We are very grateful to
10 you and others who do come back to tell us again their
11 experiences. Thank you very much.

12 **A. Thank you very much. Thank you.**

13 MS SMITH: Thank you, HIA21.

14 **A. Thank you, Christine.**

15 **(Witness withdrew)**

16 MS SMITH: The next witness is to be taken by Mr Aiken,
17 Chairman. Maybe a five-minute break?

18 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We will take a short break anyway.

19 (2.55 pm)

20 (Short break)

21 (3.05 pm)

22 WITNESS HIA247 (called)

23 Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY

24 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, good afternoon.

25 The next witness today is HIA247, who is "HIA247", and

1 HIA247 gave evidence to the Inquiry about his time in
2 Rubane on Day 57 of the Inquiry, 8th October. On that
3 occasion HIA247 took the oath, and I have explained to
4 him that he remains under oath today, and HIA247 also
5 confirmed on that occasion that he wished to keep his
6 anonymity and that remains his position.

7 Coming up on the screen, therefore, HIA247, is the
8 first page of your statement, which you proved in the
9 Rubane module, but which we have now renumbered as part
10 of the Sisters of Nazareth, Belfast module. So that's
11 SNB-605. Can you just confirm that's the first page of
12 your witness statement?

13 **A. Yes.**

14 Q. If we move through to 610, please, can you just confirm,
15 HIA247, that's the last page and that, as you did in the
16 first Rubane module, can you confirm you have signed
17 that document?

18 **A. Yes.**

19 Q. And you adopt that as your evidence before the Inquiry?

20 **A. Yes.**

21 Q. Just bear with me, HIA247, for a moment until I give
22 some references to the Panel.

23 The response statement from the Sisters of Nazareth
24 can be found at SNB-1631 through to 1632. I have made
25 HIA247 aware in paragraph 7 that contains an unreserved

1 and sincere apology to him for any care that he received
2 that fell beneath an acceptable standard, and he felt
3 that was a positive thing that had been done.

4 The Health & Social Care Board provided a statement
5 in this module first at 5655 through to 5658 and that
6 statement was confirming for the second time to the
7 Inquiry that the Health & Social Care Board and its
8 trusts had not found material relating to HIA247, but in
9 a further response statement that is dated 5th December
10 that runs from SNB-5684 to 5687 and with exhibits that
11 then run from 5688 through to 5705 the Health & Social
12 Care Board confirms that it has now found a -- I believe
13 I said 5th December; 5th January -- has now found a file
14 relating to HIA247 and his family and their involvement
15 with the Belfast Welfare Authority.

16 Obviously that material has come late in the day as
17 a result of ongoing searches by the Health & Social Care
18 Board, and the circumstances of those searches and how
19 this has come about are matters that I have raised with
20 counsel for the Health & Social Care Board and they will
21 be looked into further as to why it has come at this
22 stage and what further material might arise for other
23 individuals that this module is dealing with.

24 Consequently it is only today I have had the
25 opportunity to speak to HIA247, and he is aware that on

1 have looked at, so as not to prolong you sitting where
2 you are at the moment, you went into the Nazareth Lodge
3 on 7th June 1958 aged 11. That's something we were able
4 to clarify today as a result of the material that we
5 received. You were there until 15th August 1959, when
6 you were aged 12. It was on that date in August '59
7 when you moved with the annual transfer of boys from
8 Nazareth Lodge to Rubane House in Kircubbin. So you
9 spent 14 months essentially in the Nazareth Lodge home.
10 During that period you sat what you might now describe
11 as the 11 Plus or transfer test, tech exam to move on to
12 a particular school, and we will come back and look at
13 that in the context of some of the material you
14 received.

15 But the circumstances where you come to be in
16 Nazareth Lodge at the age of 11 are because of
17 difficulties that arose in your home in that your father
18 had left and your mum had gone to find him and that was
19 in and , and in there were
20 six children, and your mum and dad took the view they
21 couldn't look after all of you in the accommodation they
22 were living in in . As a result , who
23 was your older sister, who was 15, you and your younger
24 brother **NL 64** were put on a train and a boat back to
25 Belfast to go to your grandfather's house.

1 **A. That's correct, yes.**

2 Q. And there your uncle was living as well, and your
3 grandfather and more so your uncle you feel on
4 reflection didn't feel able to look after you, and as
5 a result of that the material that's available now shows
6 that the Belfast Welfare Authority were asked to take
7 you into care, and your grandfather signed for you to be
8 taken into care through the Belfast Welfare Authority in
9 June of 1958.

10 **A. That's correct.**

11 Q. At the same time the material -- and I am not going to
12 go into it -- you refer to the NSPCC being involved. We
13 looked at the material that shows they were involved
14 because of your mum and dad sending three of their
15 children back on a train and a boat with a view to
16 taking proceedings against them for doing that to their
17 children, and then the view was ultimately taken that
18 the circumstances were such that they wouldn't pursue it
19 in that way and instead you moved into Nazareth Lodge
20 and remained there.

21 **A. That's correct.**

22 Q. You describe, HIA247 -- we will come back to some of the
23 other matters that arise from the material we have
24 received from the Board later, but you describe in
25 paragraph 3 then you and your brother, when you moved

1 into Nazareth Lodge, you found that upsetting and
2 I think you said to me earlier you had not done anything
3 wrong. Why did you have to be put into a place like
4 this?

5 You record in paragraph 3 that you tried to run away
6 on one occasion and the consequences of that was for
7 SR34 to beat you with a strap. I was asking you whether
8 you remembered was that a strap -- was it a belt that
9 was worn round her waist that she used or was it
10 a separate strap. Your recollection is both were
11 available, and you don't remember which was used.

12 **A. That's correct, yes.**

13 Q. I asked you where you had been hit and how often and
14 your response to me was you were hit anywhere.
15 Presumably the idea of this was to punish you
16 sufficiently that you didn't run away again.

17 **A. That's correct, yes.**

18 Q. You say at the top of paragraph 3 -- at the top of
19 page 606, just the last sentence of paragraph 3 if did
20 you something wrong, you were always beaten with
21 a strap. I want to ask you how many nuns did that? Was
22 it just SR34 used the strap to beat you or were there
23 other nuns who did the same on you or other boys?

24 **A. The other nuns done it as well. We were beaten.**

25 Q. Is there --

1 **A. I can't remember the names of the nuns. I think the**
2 **Sister in charge of our dormitory was SR47 I think her**
3 **name was.**

4 Q. SR47?

5 **A. Yes. I cannot remember all the names of the nuns, but**
6 **if you did something wrong, you were beaten with**
7 **a strap.**

8 Q. You say in paragraph 4 of your statement, HIA247, that
9 it was a tough regime. That's how you recall it.

10 **A. Sorry?**

11 Q. A tough regime.

12 **A. Yes, yes.**

13 Q. It was a difficult environment.

14 **A. That's right.**

15 Q. In paragraph 9 of your statement on 407 you say in the
16 context of not feeling able to ask for more food when
17 you were hungry that SR34 was very strict.

18 **A. That's correct, yes.**

19 Q. Now why did you feel unable to ask for more food? What
20 do you mean by "she was very strict"? Was that just the
21 atmosphere she created or what was it about her?

22 **A. I was just afraid of asking -- basically of asking for**
23 **more food. It was the fear of asking for more.**

24 Q. So you didn't do it?

25 **A. No, I didn't do it.**

1 Q. You then talk in paragraph 4, if we can go back to 606,
2 HIA247, about bedwetting. You say that it was your
3 brother NL 64 , who was your younger brother, who got
4 beaten for wetting the bed. You yourself didn't wet the
5 bed and weren't punished for that, but your brother
6 NL 64 was.

7 **A. That's correct.**

8 Q. You had to stand and watch. So was he in the same group
9 as you?

10 **A. He was in the same dormitory as me, yes.**

11 Q. Same dormitory as you.

12 **A. Yes.**

13 Q. So you witnessed him being punished for wetting the bed.

14 **A. Yes.**

15 Q. I was saying to you earlier that the Inquiry has now
16 heard evidence that as early as 1927 the Sisters had
17 been told by the Ministry that punishing for bedwetting
18 was counter-productive and it should stop. How
19 regularly did you see punishment being used for
20 bedwetting?

21 **A. It was a regular occurrence. For bedwetting you would
22 get punished.**

23 Q. So it wasn't just your brother NL 64 that this related
24 to?

25 **A. No. Any of the children that bedwettered, they got**

1 **punished for bedwetting.**

2 Q. You explain in paragraph 20 of your statement, if we can
3 go through, please, to 609, that -- if we just scroll
4 down a little, please -- that your brother -- you felt
5 life was harder for him. He was a little younger and
6 you say he was treated badly as a result of his
7 bedwetting. His life has not been as positive as yours.
8 You say to the Inquiry that the hardest thing for you
9 through your time in care was to witness the nuns in
10 Nazareth Lodge being physically abusive to him and the
11 fact you felt powerless to help him.

12 **A. That is correct, yes.**

13 Q. One of the records that's now available to the Inquiry
14 as a result of the Health & Social Care Board finding
15 further material relating to you and your family does
16 speak of that just a little. If we can turn, please, to
17 SNB-44829, and just to put this record -- if we can
18 scroll down, please, so we can see those of 20th and
19 21st, to put this in context, HIA247, you had by this
20 point moved to Kircubbin. You had gone in August of '59
21 and your brother **NL 64** had been fostered out with
22 a family, a _____ and _____, and again
23 no names should be used beyond the Inquiry chamber, and
24 subsequent to this the foster placement did not work for
25 **NL 64** and he goes back into Nazareth Lodge, but during

1 this period you can see on 21st April it is being
2 reported to the Welfare Officer that **NL 64** is having
3 a problem again wetting the bed, having nightmares at
4 night and wakes up pleading for someone to stop hitting
5 him.

6 **A. Yes.**

7 Q. For you that's consistent with him --

8 **A. Sorry. I will put my other glasses on. Sorry.**

9 Q. Are you all right? For you that's consistent with what
10 you recall happening to him in Nazareth Lodge.

11 **A. That's correct, yes.**

12 Q. But at the same time -- that's a very bad memory you
13 have relating to your brother and how he was treated,
14 and yet in your statement, if we go back to paragraph 4
15 of your statement on 606, please, there are some
16 positive memories that you have of your time in the
17 Lodge.

18 One of those, if we just scroll up a little, please,
19 was the sports activities, and you have a particular
20 positive memory of your -- I think he was your maths
21 teacher, **NL 65** , who was into sport, and because you
22 were into sport, that was you able to engage in Gaelic
23 and soccer and that was a very positive thing for you.

24 **A. That is correct, yes.**

25 Q. I think you said to me you got the opportunity to travel

1 down to Kilkeel to play another school from Kilkeel and
2 that was a positive thing --

3 **A. Yes.**

4 Q. -- apart from the sloping pitch.

5 **A. Sloping pitch, yes.**

6 Q. I was explaining to you there is lots of quality people
7 come from Kilkeel and playing on -- you are up the
8 mountains. So the pitches do slope from time to time.
9 You just have to deal with that.

10 You then have an even more positive memory of
11 NL 65 , because through your getting to know him, you
12 got to know his family --

13 **A. I did, yes.**

14 Q. -- and went out to stay on the NL 65 farm at .

15 **A. I did, yes.**

16 Q. That was again a positive experience. You went there
17 for weeks during the summer.

18 **A. That's correct, yes.**

19 Q. You point out in paragraph 6 that you remember cycling
20 on -- it is a long and winding road to -- on
21 the bicycle.

22 **A. That's correct, yes.**

23 Q. And those are -- that's a relationship with that family
24 that's continued. I think you have seen or talked to
25 him in more recent years.

1 **A.** **Yes.** I went to a wedding when my sister's son got
2 married, and while we were in Belfast, I -- my
3 sister-in-law looked in the directory and there was
4 still the NL 65 name in the directory. So I -- just by
5 chance we found the number and his wife answered the
6 phone and she remembered me. She used to help out in
7 Nazareth Lodge with NL 65, and she remembered me and my
8 brother, and NL 65 was teaching in at the
9 time. She said, "Well, I will pass the information on
10 to him, give him your phone number and he will get back
11 to you". So eventually NL 65 did phone me up again and
12 he asked me how I got on in life, and I spoke to him
13 about many of the boys that used to be in the home with
14 me, and he was still in contact with some of the boys,
15 and I thanked him for the help that he did for me all
16 the time while I was in Kircubbin and taking me to his
17 mother's house and making me feel like one of the family
18 really.

19 **Q.** In addition to that you point out in paragraph 6,
20 HIA247, that you were taught Irish dancing.

21 **A.** **That's correct, yes.**

22 **Q.** And, in fact, one of the reasons why there was confusion
23 over 1958 or June '58 as the date for going in is you
24 and your wife have been able to trace a newspaper
25 picture of you and others winning the cup --

1 **A. Yes.**

2 Q. -- during 1958 for Irish dancing.

3 **A. That's correct, yes.**

4 Q. That's a positive recollection you have of your time.

5 **A. Yes, it was good.**

6 Q. To characterise it, HIA247, is it fair to say that it
7 was a strict regime and the physical punishment is a bad
8 memory you have, and how your brother was treated is
9 a very bad memory you have, but there were other
10 positive aspects of your time that you do recollect with
11 a fondness?

12 **A. There were the good times, yes, the dancing and the**
13 **Gaelic football. They were the positive things,**
14 **counteracted the other side of it.**

15 Q. What I wanted to ask you then, HIA247, there is some
16 matters that have come out of the Welfare Authority
17 material that the Inquiry has been given. If we can
18 bring, please, SNB-44823. You touch on this a little in
19 your statement and then this material brings it out into
20 much greater detail, that -- we can see in that first
21 entry:

22 "I told ", who was a relation of yours who
23 lived in Belfast, "that HIA247 was sitting his
24 technical exam and otherwise have to move to Kircubbin."

25 The discussion there is reflecting an attempt by her

1 to encourage to let you live with her if you
2 get into I think it is Harding Street School.

3 If we just scroll down, please, to the entry of
4 22nd May, we can see further discussions about
5 passing the exams and getting into school. Your
6 recollection is that you and your friend
7 were put forward to do this particular exam.

8 **A. That's correct, yes.**

9 Q. I think you said to me earlier your expectations -- you
10 were expected to succeed.

11 **A. Yes, that's correct.**

12 Q. You went out of the home to another school to sit the
13 exam.

14 **A. That's correct.**

15 Q. You said to me you were training morning, noon and night
16 for it, but when it came to the exam, you turned over
17 the paper and you had been taught the wrong things. The
18 things you had been taught weren't things that were on
19 the paper. Is that --

20 **A. Well, I am not saying it was wrong, but what we were**
21 **taught at the home -- I mean, we studied for quite**
22 **a while every evening after school, and what we were**
23 **taught -- we were doing quite well. When we went for**
24 **the exam, the paperwork what we got, some of it was the**
25 **same, but there was quite a bit of it that wasn't --**

1 **that we hadn't covered. So obviously that was the**
2 **reason for failure.**

3 Q. It seems, HIA247, from this entry that -- this material,
4 so you know, will be of great assistance to the Inquiry,
5 because it shows the extent of a welfare officer's
6 involvement and shows interaction not only with you but
7 with SR34, who is the person being contacted here, and
8 the engagement with your family to try and bring you all
9 back together and attempts to foster and board out. So
10 it demonstrates the type of work being done in the late
11 '50s/early '60s by the welfare authorities, at least
12 this one in Belfast.

13 It seems that -- you can see the entry -- that SR34
14 thought that although you hadn't passed this exam, she
15 thought she might be able to get you into this school in
16 any event, and that as a result the Welfare Officer is
17 saying she thinks she will be able to get you a place
18 with your aunt in . Then there is a line that
19 says:

20 "SR34 always thinks she knows best."

21 So there seems to have been some element of
22 disagreement as to what was going to happen, but you
23 can't remember. This was news to you that these efforts
24 were being made to get you in even without the exam.

25 **A. I had no knowledge of any of this until today.**

1 Q. And ultimately that for whatever reason -- and the
2 records available at the moment don't seem to disclose
3 it -- the aim didn't work out and you didn't go to that
4 Harding Street School and instead did go to Rubane.

5 **A. That's correct.**

6 Q. I was indicating to you that it appears that -- if we
7 look at 44828, which is the entry of July '59, it seems
8 that SR34, whatever her harshness towards you for
9 punishing you when you were running away, had a very
10 positive view of you. We can see in the entry at
11 2nd July, the second paragraph:

12 "SR34 would very much like to see a fostering
13 arrangement made for HIA247. She says he is
14 an exceptionally nice boy and very helpful and
15 cooperative and a good mixer."

16 Your recollection is the reason why a fostering
17 arrangement couldn't ever be achieved -- there was one
18 from a family, a well-to-do family in
19 you recall, but it couldn't ultimately happen because
20 your mum and dad were still involved in trying to have
21 you ultimately go back to them.

22 **A. They had this family come. They used to have families**
23 **come on week-end visits and all. That family you just**
24 **mentioned, they wanted to take me out of the home and in**
25 **the foreseeable future to foster, and as far as I'm**

1 aware this was -- this was going happen, and then I was
2 given the bad news that it wasn't going to happen, and
3 they didn't really explain why. I just assumed that it
4 is because of my parents. You know, your father and
5 mother is still alive. You can't be fostered out.
6 That's the only reason I could think of.

7 Q. Ultimately you go off then to Kircubbin and you have
8 explained some very difficult experiences you had in
9 terms of abuse in Kircubbin, and I was saying to you
10 earlier normally the boys stayed in Kircubbin until they
11 were 15. You left when you were 13.

12 We now have a record that explains -- if we look at
13 44825, this explains and confirms something that you
14 understand to have happened, which is that your
15 grandfather had his son, who had also settled in
16 , so your uncle -- arranged for you to go back
17 to to live with him and then reconnect with
18 your mum, and that's ultimately what happened and you
19 went back at 13 in the August of 1960.

20 **A. That's correct, yes.**

21 Q. We looked at -- and I am not going to bring them up now
22 -- but we looked at -- in this material are letters from
23 your mum being written to the Welfare Authority
24 explaining the difficulty over accommodation and the
25 desire to have you and NL 64 back with her, and

1 ultimately that is what happens in that she is writing
2 again for NL 64 after you have returned in '61 and
3 ultimately that is what takes place.

4 **A. That's correct, yes.**

5 Q. You explained to me that you then looked after your mum,
6 because unfortunately your dad left again and you were
7 the breadwinner for a long period of time until you
8 married.

9 **A. That's correct. When I left school, I looked after my
10 mother, because I was the breadwinner. So ...**

11 Q. The material that is available obviously covers both
12 your life and NL 64 life, and the Panel has the
13 opportunity to consider that. I've shown one particular
14 record, but they are aware of your view about how his
15 life was blighted by the way in which he was treated and
16 how his life after care was much more of a struggle than
17 yours was.

18 **A. Uh-huh.**

19 Q. HIA247, what I want to do, as you know, we ask each
20 person towards the end of their evidence two further
21 questions. One is about at the end of the Inquiry's
22 work it has to consider recommendations it might make to
23 the Northern Ireland Executive about three general
24 areas: about an apology, a memorial or some other form
25 of redress. We ask each person whether there's anything

1 they want to say about that.

2 I think the point you made to me earlier is you
3 would rather just leave that to the Panel to make its
4 determinations as to what's appropriate.

5 **A. That's correct, yes.**

6 Q. The last question, HIA247, that we ask each witness is
7 this is your opportunity to say to the Inquiry what you
8 would like to say about your time in Nazareth Lodge, and
9 it may be I have not covered something sufficiently or
10 correctly, or I have not covered it at all, and you'd
11 like to make reference to it. Now is your opportunity
12 to do that if there's anything else you want to say
13 about your time in Nazareth Lodge or anything else you
14 want to say to the Inquiry.

15 **A. Well, as you have already explained, there was good**
16 **times and the bad times in Nazareth Lodge. Fortunately**
17 **I wasn't in there that long, but the football, the**
18 **dancing. I used to serve mass. I learnt how to speak**
19 **Latin. I served mass when one of the senior nuns died.**
20 **I served mass when the priest was ordained, and you had**
21 **to learn different parts of the Latin. It was different**
22 **to the normal mass type of thing, which was a good thing**
23 **to learn, you know, good experience for me, and, of**
24 **course, I served mass when I went to Kircubbin as well.**

25 **The worst part for me at Nazareth Lodge was mainly**

1 my brother. He was younger than me, and it was hard,
2 like I said, watching him getting beaten for doing
3 something that he obviously had got no control over, and
4 in later years when he got fostered out, he was still
5 doing it. He was having nightmares about getting beat.
6 Them were the bad times, but in general my time in
7 Nazareth Lodge was good, and there was bad times as
8 well, but ... That is basically all I've got to say.

9 Q. HIA247, I am not going to ask you any more questions.
10 You have come twice to talk to the Inquiry and we are
11 grateful for that. If you just remain where you are for
12 a moment, the Panel Members may want to ask you
13 something. Just bear with us for a short time.

14 A. Thank you.

15 **Questions from THE PANEL**

16 MR LANE: Thank you for your evidence. When you were at
17 Nazareth Lodge, were there any older boys there or did
18 they all go to Rubane?

19 A. There was probably some older boys, but obviously me
20 being 11 years of age, I was one of the older ones
21 anyway. Some of them, I think they left there the same
22 as me when they were 12 to go to Kircubbin.

23 Q. As an 11-year-old were you ever made responsible for
24 younger boys?

25 A. Not really, no.

1 Q. Thank you.

2 CHAIRMAN: Well, HIA247, I am sure you will be relieved to
3 hear that we don't have any more questions for you. We
4 appreciate very much the fact you have come a second
5 time across the water from NL 64 to speak to us. I am
6 sorry you had to come twice, but it is very difficult to
7 deal with different institutions if they're all mixed in
8 together. So that's why we have had to do this, but
9 again thank you and your wife for coming. I know it's
10 not easy to have to relive these experiences, but we are
11 very grateful to you for taking the time and trouble to
12 come to do it for us. Thank you.

13 A. Thank you.

14 (Witness withdrew)

15 MR AIKEN: Chairman, Members of the Panel, that concludes
16 the evidence for today and indeed this week.

17 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, we will resume on Monday of next week
18 at the usual time.

19 (3.37 pm)

20 (Hearing adjourned until 10 o'clock
21 on Monday, 12th January 2015)

22 --ooOoo--

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

WITNESS HIA307 (called - by2
videolink)
Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY3
Questions from THE PANEL40
WITNESS HIA183 (called)43
Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY43
Questions from THE PANEL72
WITNESS HIA21 (called)75
Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY75
Questions from THE PANEL110
WITNESS HIA247 (called)113
Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY113
Questions from THE PANEL133